COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

Room 400, City Hall Philadelphia, Pennsylvania Tuesday, April 1, 2014 10:30 a.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCIL PRESIDENT DARRELL L. CLARKE
COUNCILWOMAN JANNIE BLACKWELL
COUNCILMAN W. WILSON GOODE, JR.
COUNCILMAN WILLIAM K. GREENLEE
COUNCILMAN BOBBY HENON
COUNCILMAN KENYATTA JOHNSON
COUNCILMAN DENNIS O'BRIEN
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH
COUNCILMAN BRIAN J. O'NEILL
COUNCILMAN BRIAN J. O'NEILL
COUNCILMAN MARIAN BLONDELL REYNOLDS BROWN
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA
COUNCILWOMAN MARIAN B. TASCO

BILLS 140144, 140145, and 140146 RESOLUTION 140159

- - -

1	
2	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good
3	morning. This is the public hearing on
4	the Committee of the Whole regarding
5	Bills No. 140144, 140145, 140146, and
6	Resolution No. 140159.
7	Ms. Lewis, would you please
8	read the titles of the bills and
9	resolution.
10	MS. LEWIS: Bill No. 140144, an
11	ordinance to adopt a Capital Program for
12	the six Fiscal Years 2015 through 2020
13	inclusive.
14	Bill No. 140145, an ordinance
15	to adopt a Fiscal 2015 Capital Budget.
16	Bill No. 140146, an ordinance
17	adopting the Operating Budget for Fiscal
18	Year 2015.
19	And Resolution No. 140159,
20	providing for the approval by the Council
21	of the City of Philadelphia of a Revised
22	Five Year Financial Plan for the City of
23	Philadelphia covering Fiscal Years 2015
24	through 2019, and incorporating proposed
25	changes with respect to Fiscal Year 2014,

		3
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	which is to be submitted by the Mayor to	
3	the Pennsylvania Intergovernmental	
4	Cooperation Authority (the "Authority")	
5	pursuant to the Intergovernmental	
6	Cooperation Agreement, authorized by an	
7	Ordinance of this Council approved by the	
8	Mayor on January 3rd, 1992 (Bill No.	
9	1563-A) by and between the City and the	
10	Authority.	
11	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
12	Thank you.	
13	Will the Administration please	
14	come forward.	
15	(Witnesses approached witness	
16	table.)	
17	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
18	First up on our list we'll have Finance.	
19	Good morning.	
20	MR. DUBOW: Good morning,	
21	Council President Clarke.	
22	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
23	Please proceed.	
24	MR. DUBOW: So you have the	
25	testimony. I won't read all of it, if	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	that's okay.
3	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: We
4	appreciate that.
5	MR. DUBOW: So I'll just read
6	the first couple paragraphs, and be happy
7	to answer questions.
8	I'm Rob Dubow, Director of
9	Finance, and I'm pleased to provide
10	testimony on the Department's proposed
11	FY15 Operating Budget. The proposed
12	budget supports a number of departmental
13	divisions, and representatives of those
14	divisions are here and are available to
15	answer your questions.
16	The budget provides the
17	necessary funding for the Office of
18	Director of Finance to accomplish its
19	objectives, and as proposed, the budget
20	totals \$1.955 billion. That's an
21	increase of about \$529 million. That's
22	caused mostly by an increase in fringe
23	benefits, primarily pension costs, and
24	primarily that's the appropriation for
25	the anticipated PGW sales contribution to

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	the Pension Fund. There's a decrease of
3	\$29 million in other fringe costs and a
4	decrease of 53.57 million in Class 500
5	costs, primarily because of the one-time
6	contribution to the School District in
7	'14.
8	In the direct General Fund
9	appropriations proposed for the Finance
10	Department core budget, it's 14 million.
11	It's an increase of about a million
12	dollars over FY14.
13	And with that, I'll conclude my
14	testimony and be happy to answer any
15	questions.
16	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
17	Thank you, Mr. Dubow. A couple of quick
18	questions.
19	On Page 4 of your testimony,
20	you state that the relatively narrow fund
21	balances in the Five Year Plan will limit
22	the City's financial flexibility and
23	require an emphasis on cash management.
24	Can you describe in a little more detail
25	challenges associated by reflecting low

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 balances in future years. 3 MR. DUBOW: Sure. So our fund balances get -- let me get out how low 4 they get. 5 So the fund balances get into 6 the low 20's or into the, I guess, mid 8 20's, which means there's very little 9 room for error. If there are any 10 unexpected costs, it can quickly drive us 11 negative. And as we've talked about in 12 earlier years, there are differences 13 between fund balance and cash, and if our 14 fund balance gets below a certain level, 15 we can go negative in cash, which means we might get into a place where we're 16 17 looking at what payments to hold up. 18 it can become really challenging. COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: 19 20 you kind of elaborate on why you project 21 these very thin lines of fund balances. MR. DUBOW: 22 Sure. I mean, a 23 couple of things happened kind of late in 24 our process that hit the fund balance 25 numbers. One was the wage tax numbers

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	came in weaker than we anticipated, so
3	that drove down fund balance numbers.
4	And the other is that the 47 settlement
5	also came kind of late in our budget
6	process. So both of those things meant
7	that the fund balances were lower than
8	what we had been working on earlier in
9	our budget process.
10	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: In
11	that analysis and projection, is it based
12	on revenues that would go towards
13	contracts, municipal contracts in
14	particular?
15	MR. DUBOW: So part of what is
16	in the Plan is assumptions on what
17	contracts will look like. So the DC47
18	contract is in there, and then there are
19	assumptions about pay increases for 33,
20	firefighters, and the FOP. So, yes, part
21	of it is for contracts.
22	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So
23	without asking you to negotiate the
24	contract, you say that there's the
25	likelihood of pay increases I thought

		8
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	I heard you say pay increases for 33.	
3	MR. DUBOW: Yes.	
4	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Do	
5	you have projections for that? Is it the	
6	earlier version, the last offer?	
7	MR. DUBOW: Yes.	
8	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And	
9	if anything went beyond that, what would	
10	happen?	
11	MR. DUBOW: We'd have to go	
12	back and look at the Plan and figure out	
13	how to get the Plan balanced if there	
14	were higher costs for any of the	
15	arbitration awards or collective	
16	bargaining agreements.	
17	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So	
18	have you done a projection that reflected	
19	47's award for 33?	
20	MR. DUBOW: Yeah. I think the	
21	additional costs are 175 million over the	
22	Plan.	
23	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: If	
24	it were 3, 2 and a half, and 3 versus	
25	what the last offer was?	

		9
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	MR. DUBOW: Yes.	
3	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
4	Okay. Other than cash management, are we	
5	looking to do anything else to enhance	
6	revenues?	
7	MR. DUBOW: Well, I mean, we	
8	are	
9	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
10	Other than raising taxes.	
11	MR. DUBOW: Yeah. I mean, the	
12	Revenue Department is aggressively	
13	looking at ways to improve collections,	
14	and that's a way to increase taxes. And	
15	the assumptions in the Plan is that we'll	
16	have more property tax collections this	
17	year as a result of those aggressive	
18	collections.	
19	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
20	Anything else out of the box? I mean,	
21	non-traditional strategies for growing	
22	the base.	
23	MR. DUBOW: For growing the tax	
24	base?	
25	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yes.	

		Τ0
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	MR. DUBOW: I mean, we think	
3	that the tax reductions that we have in	
4	the Plan and the tax changes on the BIRT	
5	side will help grow the base over time.	
6	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Why?	
7	MR. DUBOW: Why? Because the	
8	lower costs for businesses to do business	
9	in the City, and we think that will help	
10	generate more jobs.	
11	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And	
12	you base that on what?	
13	MR. DUBOW: Based that on	
14	analyses done by economists, by the	
15	results of the two Tax Reform	
16	Commissions. Both said the same thing,	
17	that reducing the cost of doing business	
18	through reducing taxes increases the	
19	number of jobs in the City.	
20	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And	
21	they also said enhancing the education	
22	MR. DUBOW: They did, and	
23	enhancing services. That's right.	
24	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
25	enhancing the quality of life and	

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   MR. DUBOW:
                                That's right.
 3
         can't --
                   COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
 5
         dealing with the criminal activity in
         certain neighborhoods that we have
 6
 7
         challenges creating businesses.
                   MR. DUBOW:
 8
                                That's exactly
 9
         right, and that's --
10
                   COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
11
         I'm trying to like give you a lead-in.
12
         So there's more than just reducing taxes.
13
         There's a lot of things that we need to
14
         be doing.
15
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               Yes.
                                      Improving
16
         services, improving quality of life,
17
         improving amenities, that's right. Yes.
                   COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
18
19
                On Page 60 of your budget details,
         it estimates that $41 million will be
20
21
         paid out for indemnities claims and
22
         awards by the end of '14, which is 11
23
         million more than the amount paid in '13.
         Then this number is proposed to be
24
25
         reduced by 7.34. Can you describe in
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	detail the reason for the spike in claims	
3	to pay for this current year?	
4	MR. DUBOW: Yeah. There were a	
5	couple of large settlements and there was	
6	some catchup from earlier years'	
7	indemnities. So we think some of that is	
8	one time and will go away for next year.	
9	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Some	
10	past claims?	
11	MR. DUBOW: Yes.	
12	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And	
13	we're paying the piper now.	
14	MR. DUBOW: Exactly.	
15	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I	
16	never knew what that term meant, but it	
17	always sounded good. What is the piper?	
18	Anyway, I'm sorry.	
19	And then on Page 65, again,	
20	budget details, Section 11, it appears	
21	that the health and medical expenses are	
22	projected to decrease by approximately 33	
23	million in FY15. As a proud supporter of	
24	the ACA, could that possibly be why we	
25	are projecting?	

		1
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	MR. DUBOW: It could be, but	
3	it's not.	
4	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I'm	
5	trying to get a democratic sound byte for	
6	the mid-year elections. Philadelphia,	
7	ACA is working.	
8	MR. DUBOW: That's right.	
9	Everyone is going into an exchange and	
10	No. It's the firefighter	
11	payment in '14 through the one-time	
12	payment.	
13	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All	
14	right. You can't blame me for trying.	
15	Thank you.	
16	The Chair recognizes Councilman	
17	Goode.	
18	COUNCILMAN GOODE: Thank you,	
19	Mr. President.	
20	Good morning, Mr. Dubow.	
21	MR. DUBOW: Good morning.	
22	COUNCILMAN GOODE: Does the	
23	Administration support the Lump Sum	
24	Budget adopted by the School Reform	
25	Commission?	

		Ι-
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	MR. DUBOW: We do, yes.	
3	COUNCILMAN GOODE: So who is	
4	going to pay for it?	
5	MR. DUBOW: Well, we hope that	
6	there's a split of the payment the way	
7	that the School District has requested,	
8	which would include state, city, and	
9	labor cost reductions.	
10	COUNCILMAN GOODE: So there's	
11	no money in the Operating Budget for next	
12	year for the schools, is there,	
13	additional money?	
14	MR. DUBOW: No. Our assumption	
15	is that the cigarette tax will pass in	
16	Harrisburg and that will provide \$75	
17	million in additional support for the	
18	District from local taxpayers.	
19	COUNCILMAN GOODE: And so you	
20	anticipate any money coming from the	
21	Operating Budget to go to the schools?	
22	MR. DUBOW: Any additional	
23	money, that's right.	
24	COUNCILMAN GOODE: So I guess	
25	the question really leading to is, who	

4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
shouldn't have to pay for it?
MR. DUBOW: Who should have to
pay for it?
COUNCILMAN GOODE: Who
shouldn't have to pay for it?
MR. DUBOW: Who should not have
to pay for it?
COUNCILMAN GOODE: Who should
not have to pay for it? In anticipation
that the cigarette tax may not go
through, in anticipation that the split
may not be \$120 million going to the
schools from the sales tax extension, as
we look toward the end of the budget
process when we may be looking for more
money for schools, who should be excluded
from having to pay for schools?
MR. DUBOW: So, I mean, our
strong preference is that it not come
from the General Fund, that it not be at
the expense of other services to the
City.
COUNCILMAN GOODE: So it should
not come from the General Fund.

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               That would be our
 3
         preference, yes.
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE: In terms of
         other sources of where it should not come
 5
         from, does that include any other groups,
 6
         like developers, businesses, new
         residents?
 8
 9
                               I'm not exactly --
                   MR. DUBOW:
10
         I don't know that I completely understand
11
         that part of the question.
12
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE:
                                      When we get
13
         to the end of the budget process and
14
         we're looking for revenue for schools,
15
         there are measures that Council may
         support that the Administration may not
16
17
         support. You told me what you do support
18
         in terms of schools, which is cigarette
         tax and the sales tax extension. I'm not
19
20
         sure what you're planning on doing if the
21
         cigarette tax doesn't go through and the
22
         schools are actually counting on 120 from
         the sales tax extension. So my question
23
         is, as we look toward other vehicles to
24
```

fund the schools, does the Administration

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 have a sense of who should not have to 3 pay? MR. DUBOW: I think other than not being supportive of coming from the 5 General Fund and not being supportive of 6 a broad-based tax increase like a real estate tax increase, I don't think we've 8 9 gone in more depth than that. 10 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Okay. Are 11 you currently conducting a study on the 12 tax abatement program? MR. DUBOW: We are. 13 14 COUNCILMAN GOODE: And it's a firm out of New York? 15 16 MR. DUBOW: It's Jones Lang 17 LaSalle. 18 COUNCILMAN GOODE: And why are 19 you conducting that study? 20 MR. DUBOW: We had a request 21 from a Councilmember under the 22 economic -- there was legislation that 23 required fiscal impact studies if we got 24 requests. We got a request from a 25 Councilmember, and that's what started

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	the study.
3	COUNCILMAN GOODE: And that is
4	not something that could be done
5	internally?
6	MR. DUBOW: No, because we
7	wanted to really understand the economic
8	impact, and that's not something
9	COUNCILMAN GOODE: So what
10	specifically is being studied?
11	MR. DUBOW: What's being
12	studied is the impact of the abatement on
13	development and then, as a result, the
14	impact on tax revenues both for the City
15	and the School District.
16	COUNCILMAN GOODE: I still
17	don't necessarily understand the scope of
18	the analysis. Are you examining past
19	abatements and are you examining if there
20	were no abatement program versus there
21	being an abatement program?
22	MR. DUBOW: We're looking at,
23	yes, what would happen with development
24	if and it's looking at kind of the
25	history and seeing kind of what the break

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	point is on returns for development
3	projects, how it changed in abatement to
4	either eliminate it or I think the bill
5	eliminated the School District portion,
6	to see what impact that would have on
7	development and, as a result, what impact
8	that would have on revenues.
9	COUNCILMAN GOODE: So I'm
10	asking are you doing an analysis of a
11	modified tax abatement?
12	MR. DUBOW: Yes.
13	COUNCILMAN GOODE: And how can
14	you actually do that analysis if there
15	was not a modified tax abatement in the
16	past and if there's not and hasn't
17	taken hasn't been implemented yet? So
18	how can you do an analysis into the
19	future?
20	MR. DUBOW: So what the
21	analysis does is look at what returns are
22	required on development projects, takes a
23	break point, and then looks at how
24	modifying the abatement would affect
25	returns on developments and see how

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         that --
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE: How would
 3
 4
         you possibly know that?
 5
                   MR. DUBOW: Well, I think they
 6
         looked at developments -- we can actually
         show you -- we'll show you the study so
 8
         you can see exactly how it was done, and
         we can actually also -- we can have the
9
10
         person who did it walk with you how they
11
         did the study.
12
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE: We had this
13
         discussion last year -- and I know my
14
         time is up.
15
                   COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
                                               No.
16
         Councilman.
17
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE: I just want
18
         to frame this in a different way. Let's
19
         say there was never an abatement of
20
         schools for taxes. How would you know
21
         what would have happened in terms of
22
         development? I mean, if you've talked to
23
         your consultant, can you explain that to
24
         me?
                               Yeah. So what the
25
                   MR. DUBOW:
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	consultant looked at is if you looked at
3	developments and what yield they needed
4	to actually move ahead with their
5	development. So 7 percent return, for
6	example, on their investment. Then
7	looked at cost of development in general.
8	And if it's a rental property, what kind
9	of return, what kind of rent you
10	typically get, and then look at whether
11	that meets the return. And then change
12	the cost of development based on what
13	taxes you would pay with or without an
14	abatement or with a modified abatement.
15	COUNCILMAN GOODE: That still
16	doesn't necessarily answer my question.
17	Can you actually go back in time and know
18	which projects would or would not have
19	proceeded without 100 percent abatement?
20	MR. DUBOW: I think what he's
21	doing is assuming that a project wouldn't
22	have happened if they didn't get a
23	certain yield because they didn't have
24	the abatement.
25	COUNCILMAN GOODE: So that's an

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         assumption.
 3
                   MR. DUBOW: Oh, yeah, it's
 4
         definitely --
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE:
 5
                                       So it's
         actually a waste of money, then.
 6
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               No. I think the
         assumption is based on observing when
 8
         projects were done.
9
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE: There's no
10
11
         way to go back in time or go into the
12
         future and know what would have happened
         if we didn't abate schools for taxes
13
         and/or if we don't abate schools for
14
15
                 There's no way to know that.
         taxes.
16
                   MR. DUBOW: We know, though,
17
         what kind of returns people look for in a
18
         project.
19
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE: I know
20
         people want 100 percent abatement.
21
                   MR. DUBOW: And you know then
         how a different level abatement affects
22
23
         that return.
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE: You don't
24
         know how different levels of abatement
25
```

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- 2 affect that return.
- 3 MR. DUBOW: Sure you do,
- 4 because it changes the cost.
- 5 COUNCILMAN GOODE: It does not
- 6 change the cost. There could be other
- 7 incentives that are offered and other
- 8 ways to finance the project.
- 9 MR. DUBOW: There could be, but
- 10 that wasn't -- the bill doesn't have
- 11 those other things in it, right? The
- 12 request that we got was to study the
- impact of this bill.
- 14 COUNCILMAN GOODE: A bill
- that's not even going to be considered
- 16 now. So it's definitely a waste of
- money.
- MR. DUBOW: Well, this is the
- first I'm hearing the bill is not going
- to be considered.
- 21 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Thank you,
- 22 Mr. President.
- 23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
- 24 Thank you, Councilman.
- Mr. Dubow, real quickly, is

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	there anticipated a revision of the sales
3	tax revenues over the course of the next
4	several years or next couple of years?
5	MR. DUBOW: From what's in the
6	Plan already?
7	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yes.
8	MR. DUBOW: Not at this point.
9	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So
10	the projections that we've had actually
11	prior to the Plan, this particular Plan,
12	were relatively robust.
13	MR. DUBOW: Yeah. This Plan's
14	projections are slightly different from
15	last year's, but
16	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Not
17	significantly.
18	MR. DUBOW: There are a
19	little so to give you an example, if
20	you look at the amounts that would go to
21	the Pension Fund in the first year from
22	the additional 1 percent, it's slightly
23	lower in this year's Plan than it was in
24	last year's.
25	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: But

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         the 120 is required to go --
 3
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               Yes.
                   COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
         to schools under the existing version of
 5
         the state's legislation.
 6
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               Yes.
                   COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
                                               All
 8
9
         right. And real estate?
10
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               So real estate, in
11
         large part where that winds up is
12
         probably going to depend on the pace of
13
         how appeals are heard. What we assume in
14
         the Plan is that those appeals will be
15
         done by the end of next fiscal year,
16
         which the issue -- and I think
17
         Mr. McKeithen will probably talk about
         this later a little more -- is that
18
         they're really focused on the appeals
19
         process, which has slowed down doing new
20
21
         assessments, which means that the
22
         growth -- for example, the growth we have
23
         for '15 is now lower than we projected
         last year because we didn't do another
24
25
                               So until they can
         year of assessments.
```

		26
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	go back to doing assessments and focus	
3	less on appeals, it's likely that they'll	
4	continue to be hit on the growth of	
5	property tax.	
6	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
7	Okay. Thank you.	
8	Any other questions of this	
9	witness?	
10	The Chair recognizes Councilman	
11	Henon.	
12	COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you.	
13	Thank you, Chairman.	
14	Good morning.	
15	MR. DUBOW: Good morning.	
16	COUNCILMAN HENON: Let me get	
17	some of the easier questions out of the	
18	way. So in the Finance Department, you	
19	represent the Bureau BAA, Office of	
20	Budget, Budget Evaluation Bureau, Office	
21	of Administration Review, Risk	
22	Management, Office of Property Data. And	
23	if I missed a couple	
24	MR. DUBOW: Yeah. I always	
25	miss a couple too.	

		27
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	COUNCILMAN HENON: So my	
3	question is a little more on where and	
4	I'm going to ask these questions	
5	generally. Well, specific questions for	
6	all the offices.	
7	MR. DUBOW: Okay.	
8	COUNCILMAN HENON: So where are	
9	they located? Are they all in	
10	MR. DUBOW: So some	
11	COUNCILMAN HENON: Public	
12	Property or are they leased space or are	
13	they City-owned buildings?	
14	MR. DUBOW: It's a combination.	
15	Some are in City-owned buildings; some	
16	are in leased space.	
17	COUNCILMAN HENON: So I'm	
18	looking for a profile of each department,	
19	where they are located, if we own them or	
20	if we lease, what the space utilization	
21	is of each department.	
22	MR. DUBOW: Okay.	
23	COUNCILMAN HENON: What	
24	percentage of the building or floor space	
25	that you have is for the employees and	

		20
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	what percentage of the space utilization	
3	is for storage, do they all work or	
4	co-locate in one location.	
5	MR. DUBOW: For each office you	
6	mean, right?	
7	COUNCILMAN HENON: For each	
8	office. How many square feet per office	
9	and if it's separated or if it's not, and	
10	likewise, like I said, for the material	
11	storage and paperwork.	
12	MR. DUBOW: Okay.	
13	COUNCILMAN HENON: Does the	
14	and I don't know if this is Finance or	
15	Procurement. Do you oversee all the	
16	purchases at the departments of the City	
17	of Philadelphia?	
18	MR. DUBOW: They all	
19	COUNCILMAN HENON: Do you	
20	oversee the numbers, or how do the	
21	departments purchase their supplies?	
22	MR. DUBOW: Mostly Procurement.	
23	COUNCILMAN HENON: On the	
24	Procurement side. So is all that out of	
25	the Procurement Office?	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MR. DUBOW: Yeah. We do
3	professional service contracts.
4	COUNCILMAN HENON: All right.
5	So L&I or Revenue, do they have any other
6	purchase contract or professional service
7	contracts separately or does everything
8	
	come through Finance? So if a department
9	or agency needs a professional service,
10	do they have to go through Finance or can
11	they
12	MR. DUBOW: It goes through the
13	ACIS system, which Finance oversees. So
14	any professional service contract goes
15	through that process.
16	COUNCILMAN HENON: So the
17	Finance Department has a is it the
18	modernization project?
19	MR. DUBOW: Yes.
20	COUNCILMAN HENON: So can you
21	explain that and how it's set up and what
22	they have accomplished.
23	MR. DUBOW: Yeah. I'm going to
24	ask Judi Cassel, who runs that project,
25	to come up and talk about it.

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   (Witness approached witness
 3
         table.)
                   MS. CASSEL: Good morning,
         Councilman Henon and members of City
 5
         Council. I'm Judi Cassel and I'm the
 6
         Project Director for the OnePhilly
         project, formerly known as Administrative
 8
         Systems Modernization project.
 9
10
                   Could you repeat the question?
11
         I'm sorry.
12
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                       Can you
13
         explain to me a little bit about the
14
         OnePhilly project and what its
15
         accomplishments have been and its goals
16
         moving forward and what the deliverables
17
         are to date.
18
                   MS. CASSEL: Absolutely. Sure.
19
         So the OnePhilly project is going to
         replace the various stand-alone Legacy
20
21
         systems that run the City's
22
         administrative systems that support our
23
         workforce management. So we have HR
         systems. We have a stand-alone payroll
24
25
         system. We have a stand-alone pension
```

system. These are Legacy systems that are, according to OIT, past their supportable lives. Our project will replace those systems with an integrated software system that will support all those processes, from employee hire to employee retire. I'm actually really excited to say that as of this morning, we posted a notice of intent to award a contract to a firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
are, according to OIT, past their supportable lives. Our project will replace those systems with an integrated software system that will support all those processes, from employee hire to employee retire. I'm actually really excited to say that as of this morning, we posted a notice of intent to award a contract to a firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	2	
supportable lives. Our project will replace those systems with an integrated software system that will support all those processes, from employee hire to employee retire. I'm actually really excited to say that as of this morning, we posted a notice of intent to award a contract to a firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.		
replace those systems with an integrated software system that will support all those processes, from employee hire to employee retire. I'm actually really excited to say that as of this morning, we posted a notice of intent to award a contract to a firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.		
software system that will support all those processes, from employee hire to employee retire. I'm actually really excited to say that as of this morning, we posted a notice of intent to award a contract to a firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.		supportable lives. Our project will
those processes, from employee hire to employee retire. I'm actually really excited to say that as of this morning, we posted a notice of intent to award a contract to a firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	5	replace those systems with an integrated
I'm actually really excited to say that as of this morning, we posted a notice of intent to award a contract to a firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	6	software system that will support all
J'm actually really excited to say that as of this morning, we posted a notice of intent to award a contract to a firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	7	those processes, from employee hire to
say that as of this morning, we posted a notice of intent to award a contract to a firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	8	employee retire.
notice of intent to award a contract to a firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	9	I'm actually really excited to
firm. The name of the firm is Cyber. They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	10	say that as of this morning, we posted a
They will be the firm that comes in and works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	11	notice of intent to award a contract to a
works with a team of City employees to actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	12	firm. The name of the firm is Cyber.
actually implement and configure the system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	13	They will be the firm that comes in and
system. So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	14	works with a team of City employees to
So once they're on board, it's about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	15	actually implement and configure the
about a two-year implementation project with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	16	system.
with a six-month stabilization period after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	17	So once they're on board, it's
after we go live. There's six months of stabilization before the City finally accepts the system that they implement.	18	about a two-year implementation project
21 stabilization before the City finally 22 accepts the system that they implement.	19	with a six-month stabilization period
accepts the system that they implement.	20	after we go live. There's six months of
	21	stabilization before the City finally
OOINGII MANI HENONI	22	accepts the system that they implement.
25 COUNCILMAN HENON: SO WE do	23	COUNCILMAN HENON: So we do
have a lot of systems here	24	have a lot of systems here
MS. CASSEL: Correct, we do.	25	MS. CASSEL: Correct, we do.

4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
COUNCILMAN HENON: in the
City of Philadelphia, and most of them
are antiquated, and by the time we put
all the snails in place, they get it up
and running, it is outdated and we need
to upgrade our systems.
Is this the attempt to do away
with the silo system that we've been
talking about for years?
MS. CASSEL: Yes. That is
correct. Now, this will replace the silo
systems that support workforce management
operations in the City. So this isn't
addressing financials and procurement,
but we're working on the HR applications.
COUNCILMAN HENON: So how has
the modernization project when was
that started?
MS. CASSEL: Gosh.
COUNCILMAN HENON: Or put in
place? And how long did it take to put
in place, if you can recall, the best of
your recollection?
MS. CASSEL: So I would say, so

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         I started about two years ago as the
 3
         Project Director.
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                      Welcome.
 5
                   MS. CASSEL:
                                I think that prior
         to that, it was an idea that had been
 6
         much discussed. So I'm not sure how far
         back that dates, but I would say my --
 8
 9
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               Real activity
10
         started when Judi was brought in.
11
                   MS. CASSEL:
                                So about two years
12
               We worked with the planning vendor
         ago.
         to help us think about how we want to do
13
14
         our business, how we want our operations
15
         to work. So right now we have a very
         manual paper-based system. We're using
16
17
         Legacy systems that have green screens.
18
         We haven't refreshed our processes for
19
         probably decades. And so what we wanted
         to do was not just implement a new system
20
21
         that would mimic what we're doing now,
22
         because right now we're very limited by
         the old technology that we have. What we
23
         wanted to do was use this as an
24
25
         opportunity, probably a
```

		JI
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	once-in-several-decades opportunity, to	
3	think about how we want to do business	
4	and to plan that out and to then	
5	implement new technology that would	
6	support that.	
7	COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. So	
8	are we operating now off of the old	
9	antiquated, you got to get out of one	
10	screen to get into another screen?	
11	MS. CASSEL: Yes. Correct.	
12	COUNCILMAN HENON: But it was	
13	called and I don't mean this in a	
14	negative connotation, but it was called	
15	the modernization project?	
16	MS. CASSEL: Yes.	
17	COUNCILMAN HENON: But it	
18	wasn't necessarily modernization. Was	
19	the modernization project a period of	
20	time where we were coming up with the	
21	concept?	
22	MS. CASSEL: Yeah. So we	
23	originally called it administrative	
24	systems modernization, and as the project	
25	developed and we went through a planning	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	phase and worked with a lot of
3	departments to get their input, we
4	decided to rename the project to
5	something that was a little easier to
6	talk about, OnePhilly. So we're really
7	the continuation of that project that
8	started about two years ago. We're going
9	to implement Oracle software, Oracle and
10	PeopleSoft software, so that there'll be
11	an integrated system to replace the
12	stand-alone systems now where you have to
13	push F12 and go out of one screen and
14	then log in to another entirely different
15	system to get
16	COUNCILMAN HENON: So in
17	concept and the goal, the end goal, would
18	be how would that collaboratively work
19	with the other departments? I mean,
20	would everybody be under the same system?
21	MS. CASSEL: Yes. Correct.
22	COUNCILMAN HENON: So in two
23	years, L&I, Revenue, Finance, Streets,
24	everybody will be operating off of
25	OnePhilly; is that correct?

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MS. CASSEL: That's correct, as
3	it relates to workforce management, yes.
4	So, in other words, all hiring, all time
5	keeping, all payroll, all employee data
6	and records will be in a single system.
7	Correct.
8	COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay.
9	Great. And is this a part of Finance
10	budget or is this coming out of the
11	Capital Budget?
12	MR. DUBOW: Both. I mean,
13	there's a lot that's in Capital, but
14	there's also some that's in Operating.
15	So it's both a Capital and Operating
16	cost.
17	COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. Thank
18	you. I appreciate it.
19	MS. CASSEL: You're welcome.
20	COUNCILMAN HENON: That's good
21	news. We are doing away with the old
22	silos, Mr. Chairman.
23	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good
24	stuff, sir.

COUNCILMAN HENON: Do you want

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         me to hold off? I have some other --
 3
                   COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
 4
         Councilman, it's all yours.
 5
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                      Okay.
         can I speak with the -- I have some CVN
 6
         questions. I guess that would be OAR.
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               That would.
8
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: So I don't
9
10
         know if you want to bring them up.
11
                   MR. DUBOW: Sure.
12
                   (Witness approached witness
         table.)
13
14
                   MS. WEISS: Good morning.
15
         Paula Weiss, Executive Director, Office
16
         of Administrative Review.
17
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: Good
18
         morning.
                  How are you? Thank you.
19
                   MS. WEISS: I'm good. How are
20
         you today?
21
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: Great.
22
         Great.
23
                   Just questions I'll probably
         ask you to provide to the Chair. So I'm
24
25
         going to -- I'm just going to get them
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 out there, because I think --3 MR. DUBOW: That's permission 4 to not answer now. 5 MS. WEISS: I got to start writing down. 6 COUNCILMAN HENON: So what was it, about a year, year and a half ago 8 Council passed legislation which allows 9 or was an offer -- I believe which allows 10 11 appeals and payment electronically; is 12 that correct? 13 MS. WEISS: For payment 14 electronically? 15 COUNCILMAN HENON: Well, to 16 make payments, make appeals online. 17 MS. WEISS: That's actually the 18 BAA. 19 MR. DUBOW: Are you talking about for --20 21 COUNCILMAN HENON: Is that the 22 BAA? So my question --23 MS. WEISS: Although we have

implemented that at the OAR as well.

People can now file their appeals for

24

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         code violations and false alarm
 3
         violations through a web upload process,
 4
         and that's online by the phila.gov
         website, but that's not in the
 5
         legislation.
                       That was just something we
 6
         initiated.
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                      That's
         administrative.
 9
10
                   MS. WEISS:
                               Yes.
11
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                      Great.
12
         Congratulations. How is that going?
13
                   MS. WEISS:
                               It's only been in
14
         place for about three weeks now, quite
15
         honestly, and we've had about 40 appeals
16
         to date and we have been able to go
17
         through them. People seem to be able to
18
         upload the documents and provide us with
         the text and information that we need.
19
20
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                      That's
21
         great. Is it all types of CVN appeals or
         are there certain types?
22
23
                   MS. WEISS: No. It's all CVNs
24
         and false alarm violations.
25
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                       Okay.
```

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         Great. Great. So 40 people. Do you
 3
         see -- well, it's only 40, so I guess
         I'll ask it for --
 4
 5
                               Ask me next year.
                   MS. WEISS:
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: I'll ask if
 6
         it works a little bit later to see what
 8
         types of appeals are kind of consistent
 9
         with coming in. But you wouldn't know
10
         that anyway by people.
11
                   What is a consistent appeal
12
         from the old process where you have to
13
         mail it in where people --
14
                   MS. WEISS: For in-person
15
         hearings?
16
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                       In-person.
                               Well, you know, it
17
                   MS. WEISS:
         really does vary depending on the time of
18
         year, for example. Right now we are
19
20
         seeing quite a number of appeals for
21
         tickets people receive for not shoveling
         snow on time or properly. During the
22
23
         summer, we're more likely to see
         violations related to dumpster areas not
24
25
         being clean in the hot weather or trash
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	not being put out properly. And then
3	during the past year, because this was
4	something relatively new that the Streets
5	Department implemented, we spent a lot of
6	time on a new CVN for people who or
7	actually businesses or property owners
8	who are subject to the refuse collection
9	fee. The Streets Department implemented
10	a new code violation notice for people
11	who had not paid that fee, but were
12	putting out trash anyway. So it was an
13	unauthorized set-out. And so we did
14	spend a lot of time on appeals for those
15	property owners who were appealing
16	whether or not they were subject to that
17	refuse collection fee and whether that
18	unauthorized set-out CVN was appropriate.
19	COUNCILMAN HENON: Right.
20	MS. WEISS: So it really does
21	vary according to what other departments
22	are doing since we don't issue the CVNs.
23	We just process and collect and do the
24	appeals.
25	COUNCILMAN HENON: Did you see

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	a difference over this past year? There
3	was a change in the trash set-out early
4	times just during, for all intents and
5	purposes, give or take a few days or a
6	week, during daylight savings. Have you
7	seen a difference in returns or can you
8	check?
9	MS. WEISS: I can check. I
10	don't know the number
11	COUNCILMAN HENON: Just to do a
12	comparable, just to see I want to make
13	sure that the program is working, because
14	we're offering the good service to the
15	City of Philadelphia, especially seniors.
16	And that was the intent of the trash out
17	early, making sure that they're not
18	subject to violations when it could be a
19	little more dangerous and they may not be
20	feeling safe, plus the visibility putting
21	the trash out after 7 o'clock at
22	nighttime.
23	MS. WEISS: So just to be sure
24	that I know what you're asking. So
25	obviously there was a change that allows

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	people now to put their trash out after
3	5:00 p.m. as opposed to after 7:00 p.m.
4	Do you want to see the difference in the
5	number of issuance from last year to this
6	year?
7	COUNCILMAN HENON: Right. I
8	just want to see if there's a change,
9	yes, of the issuance. I want to see from
10	a data perspective to see if the program
11	is working.
12	MS. WEISS: Sure.
13	COUNCILMAN HENON: I want to
14	make sure that people were indeed so
15	you have a two-hour difference. I mean,
16	I don't want them to set their trash out
17	at 3:00. And now we're back at 7:00
18	because of daylight savings and people
19	are going to feel a little safer putting
20	the trash out at 7 o'clock.
21	So what I'll do is, I have some
22	questions for OAR, which I'll submit to
23	you in writing, and this way, I don't
24	have to go on with 20 questions here at
25	the hearing publicly. But I'll submit

		44
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	some questions to you, and I think OAR	
3	is I think you guys are doing a really	
4	good job.	
5	How many masters do you have?	
6	MS. WEISS: We have one full	
7	time and three part time.	
8	COUNCILMAN HENON: And they	
9	handle all the how many cases a year?	
10	MS. WEISS: Well, they handle a	
11	variety of things. This year we have	
12	scheduled over 31,000 code violation	
13	appeals and 67,000 alarm violation	
14	appeals. Some of them also handle Tax	
15	Review Board appeals, red light camera	
16	violation appeals, reserved parking for	
17	residents of disability appeals from the	
18	Parking Authority process. What else do	
19	we do? EMS appeals, though not so many	
20	of those these days. So our hearing	
21	masters are most of them are	
22	cross-trained to do all of the appeals.	
23	COUNCILMAN HENON: Great.	
24	Thank you.	
25	Is there anybody up on the	

	45
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	queue?
3	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yes.
4	COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. I'll
5	yield my time and come back. Thank you.
6	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
7	Thank you.
8	The Chair recognizes Councilman
9	Oh.
10	COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you very
11	much, Council President.
12	Good morning.
13	MR. DUBOW: Good morning.
14	COUNCILMAN OH: I just want to
15	first start by checking some of my
16	numbers with your numbers. If you don't
17	have them off the top of your head,
18	that's fine. I don't want to belabor it.
19	MR. DUBOW: Okay.
20	COUNCILMAN OH: In 2003, the
21	pension obligation was 7 percent of the
22	budget.
23	MR. DUBOW: That sounds about
24	right.
25	COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. And in

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 2013, it increased by 10 percent to 17 3 percent of the budget. MR. DUBOW: That sounds about right. So it's definitely in the mid 5 6 teens. COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. So at this point in time with the continued 8 increase of total liability as of 2013, 9 the total liability was 9.36 billion and 10 11 the total assets were 4.5 billion, which 12 left an unfunded liability of 4.86 13 billion. Does that sound about right? 14 MR. DUBOW: It sounds right. Ι 15 think it's a little -- maybe a little 16 higher now, the unfunded, but that's 17 about right. 18 COUNCILMAN OH: So this was 19 last year. 20 MR. DUBOW: Right. 21 COUNCILMAN OH: And we did not 22 have a -- well, we were following the 23 Governmental Accounting Standards Board's annual required contribution up until the 24 25 year 2004.

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MR. DUBOW: We were following
3	the funding policy set by the Pension
4	Board until 2004. Since then, we've been
5	following the minimum municipal
6	obligation set by state law.
7	COUNCILMAN OH: So when you say
8	set by the Pension Board, did the Pension
9	Board set their own kind of annual
10	required contribution or were they
11	following, if you know, the Governmental
12	Accounting Standards Board's?
13	MR. DUBOW: They set their
14	funding policy and then the actuary
15	analyzes how much that costs, and I'm
16	sure he also makes sure that it's
17	consistent with whatever requirements
18	there are from governing boards.
19	COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. So now
20	at this point in time, in 2010 and 2011,
21	we as a city opted not to make
22	contribution, so we were given
23	permission, authorized to do that.
24	MR. DUBOW: We were given
25	permission to defer a part of our

	-
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	obligation, not the full obligation. I
3	think it may have been about a third of
4	the total obligation over the two years.
5	We've repaid that deferral with interest.
6	The interest was the earnings assumption
7	at the time the deferral was made, which
8	is actually higher than the assumed
9	earnings right now, because we've been
10	lowering the assumed earnings rate.
11	COUNCILMAN OH: That was about
12	\$230 million?
13	MR. DUBOW: That's correct.
14	COUNCILMAN OH: And was that
15	paid back this year? I mean, was that
16	contribution made?
17	MR. DUBOW: I think the final
18	repayment was this year.
19	COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. So at
20	this point in time, in your opinion,
21	would we continue with the MMO or would
22	we go back to what was the policy prior
23	to the MMO?
24	MR. DUBOW: If we went back to
25	the policy prior to the MMO, the annual

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 payment would be something like \$200 3 million a year higher. So it would obviously create an enormous challenge 4 for our budget, to put it mildly. 5 don't think we will go back to that. 6 We are looking, as you know, a couple of ways to increase funding to the 8 Pension Fund, one through the sales tax 9 and the other through the proceeds of a 10 11 potential PGW sale. 12 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. So if the sales tax and the sale of PGW do not 13 14 go through, then the -- as you noted, the 15 liability is about 200 million, four more per year, which is kind of depending on 16 17 things, but anyway, there's a large 18 unfunded liability and an increasing 19 unfunded liability without some shift in the policy. Do you think or do you have 20 21 an opinion on that? 22 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. A couple of things. So the payments we make under 23 the MMO are from an actuarial analysis 24 25 done by the Pension Fund's actuary that

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 pays off the entire unfunded liability. 3 It's a third-year amortization. So if the assumptions that we use are accurate, 4 it would eventually get paid off. 5 would take a while, but it would get paid 6 off. But we believe that in addition to looking for ways to put additional revenues into the fund, we should also 9 look at changes to benefit and 10 11 contribution structure. I mean, that's 12 why when we reached an agreement with 47, 13 there were changes in contributions, and 14 we will look for that in any collective 15 bargaining or arbitration award that we 16 get. So we think that you need to see 17 changes both on the benefits and contribution side and then on the 18 19 revenues going in. 20 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. In terms 21 of best practices, is the current configuration of the Pension Board best 22 practices? 23 24 MR. DUBOW: I'm not really 25 I mean, you mean having sure.

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	Administration members, members from
3	COUNCILMAN OH: A lot of
4	ex-officios, a lot of persons by title on
5	the Pension Board as opposed to by area
6	of expertise.
7	MR. DUBOW: Yeah, and I think
8	the idea for that ex-officios is that
9	those titles bring a certain level of
10	expertise and that's why the people who
11	wrote the Charter thought that made
12	sense, and then I think they thought it
13	made sense to have employees who
14	obviously have a big interest on the
15	Board.
16	COUNCILMAN OH: So because the
17	policy is set by the Pension Board on
18	issues like MMO or
19	MR. DUBOW: Well, the Pension
20	Board doesn't set that. That's a
21	decision made actually by the
22	Administration
23	COUNCILMAN OH: Okay.
24	MR. DUBOW: to pay the MMO.
25	COUNCILMAN OH: So how does

4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
that work? The Administration makes the
decision and then what does does the
Pension Board how do they respond
to what is their role in this process?
MR. DUBOW: So their primary
kind of day-to-day role is overseeing
investments and overseeing the
administration of benefits.
COUNCILMAN OH: So they deal
with the day-to-day kind of
MR. DUBOW: Well, they really
deal with the policies on administration
of benefits and investments. We actually
have a fairly active role in investments.
So the Chief Investment Officer makes
investment recommendations to the Board,
and then the Board approves those
recommendations or disapproves them.
COUNCILMAN OH: So
theoretically they make the decisions.
MR. DUBOW: Yeah. And then
they also make decisions on things like
what the earnings assumptions will be and
assumptions about things like mortality,

		<i>J</i> .
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	salary increases. In the meeting this	
3	month, we got an updated experience study	
4	from our actuary, and now based on that,	
5	we'll have to make decisions about the	
6	assumptions underlying the funding	
7	policy.	
8	COUNCILMAN OH: So can you	
9	clarify for me, because I don't	
10	understand this portion and maybe just	
11	how it was said, but you said the	
12	Administration makes decisions on policy	
13	and	
14	MR. DUBOW: I said on paying	
15	the MMO. That wasn't a Pension Board	
16	decision.	
17	COUNCILMAN OH: So at the time,	
18	the Administration, they made the	
19	decision to go to municipal monthly	
20	minimum obligation, and the Pension Board	
21	cannot say no, they just say they have	
22	no input on that?	
23	MR. DUBOW: They can't override	
24	that decision.	
25	COUNCILMAN OH: They cannot	

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         override that decision?
                   MR. DUBOW: Right.
 3
                                       Now,
 4
         what -- they can't override that
         decision.
 5
                   COUNCILMAN OH: How does that
 6
         work?
                Because it's written in the
 8
         Charter that way?
                   MR. DUBOW: I would -- I think
 9
10
         that's right, but it's probably a Law
         question rather than -- I try not to be a
11
12
         lawyer.
                   COUNCILMAN OH: So the kind of
13
14
         curiosity I have is, there's people on
15
         the Pension Board. They are in a
16
         fiduciary responsibility to maintain the
17
         retirement funds of the employees. At a
18
         certain point in time, an administration,
19
         any administration, can say we're not
20
         going to contribute any more. The policy
21
         of the Board, we're going to go to the
22
         minimum allowed by law.
23
                   MR. DUBOW: Right. So there's
24
         state law that sets the requirement, and
25
         that requirement is designed to ensure
```

		5
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	that if you have an unfunded liability,	
3	it's paid off over time.	
4	COUNCILMAN OH: You mean the	
5	minimum?	
6	MR. DUBOW: Yeah.	
7	COUNCILMAN OH: But the minimum	
8	leads to greater unfunded liability to	
9	the point where we are now, 4.86 or 5	
10	billion unfunded.	
11	MR. DUBOW: It's not the	
12	minimum that led us there. It's a whole	
13	bunch of things that happened over time.	
14	COUNCILMAN OH: Yes.	
15	MR. DUBOW: It's not the fact	
16	that we're paying the MMO. We'd be	
17	slightly higher if we it was actually	
18	a question at a Council hearing years	
19	ago, and I think we'd be maybe 4 or 5	
20	percent higher funded, but we wouldn't be	
21	at the funding levels we want to be at	
22	even if we were paying at the funding	
23	policy.	
24	COUNCILMAN OH: Would we be in	
25	better shape if we followed the General	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	Accounting Standards Board's annual
3	contribution?
4	MR. DUBOW: I think I know what
5	you're talking about, but what they
6	talked about is a reporting requirement
7	as opposed to a funding requirement. So
8	it's not they haven't said this is the
9	amount you should fund. They said this
10	is how we want you to report on the
11	health of your Pension Fund.
12	COUNCILMAN OH: So to my
13	knowledge, they have a recommended
14	contribution amount corresponding to the
15	obligations that you have to pay.
16	MR. DUBOW: My understanding is
17	that they have a way they want you to
18	report on your obligations and that there
19	is an earnings assumption that goes with
20	that that then would drive a higher
21	liability shown on your books, but it's
22	different from funding.
23	COUNCILMAN OH: Okay.
24	MR. DUBOW: That's kind of one
25	of the issues, is that you've now

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	separated your reporting requirement from
3	the funding requirement.
4	COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. All
5	right. I understand what you're saying,
6	and I'll have to check that, but there
7	is
8	MR. DUBOW: I think your
9	question is if we were putting more money
10	into the Pension Fund, would it be at a
11	higher funding percentage.
12	COUNCILMAN OH: Right.
13	MR. DUBOW: And the answer is
14	yes. The more money you put in, the
15	higher the funding percent is going to
16	be.
17	COUNCILMAN OH: Right. So at
18	this point in time, we have a large
19	unfunded, and possibly growing, liability
20	and we are continuing with the MMO, which
21	was apparently put in by the
22	Administration, not necessarily by the
23	Pension Board, and outside of cigarette
24	tax and the sale of PGW, is there a Plan
25	B?

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MR. DUBOW: Well, as I said, I
3	mean, part of Plan B is what we're trying
4	to do through collective bargaining and
5	arbitration awards, and the other part is
6	that if you look at the actuary's
7	projections, the funding percent goes up
8	over time, not down. It increases. It's
9	just that we'd like to see it increase
10	more quickly, and that's why we've
11	proposed these additional sources of
12	revenue and changes on the collective
13	bargaining side.
14	COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. Thank
15	you very much.
16	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: The
17	Chair recognizes Councilwoman Tasco.
18	COUNCILWOMAN TASCO: I just
19	want to go back to at some point in time
20	during the Rendell Administration, they
21	borrowed money for the Pension Fund.
22	MR. DUBOW: Yes.
23	COUNCILWOMAN TASCO: What was
24	the impact of that and are we still
25	paying the debt?

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MR. DUBOW: Yes, we are still
3	paying the debt on the pension obligation
4	bonds. There was a large infusion into
5	the Pension Fund, which increased the
6	funding percent substantially.
7	Unfortunately, there was then a downturn
8	in the market, so we lost some of the
9	benefit of having made that large
10	contribution. But still if we had not
11	done the pension obligation bonds, the
12	funding percent would be lower now.
13	COUNCILWOMAN TASCO: Thank you.
14	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
15	Thank you, Councilwoman.
16	The Chair recognizes Councilman
17	Henon.
18	COUNCILMAN HENON: The FTA
19	I'm sorry; FTI. In your testimony
20	regarding Class 200 funds and the
21	increase because of the FTI contract, it
22	seems to be based on the contingent cycle
23	of funding, but you put it in the it
24	was in the budget anyway.
25	MR. DUBOW: Yes.

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	COUNCILMAN HENON: Why wouldn't
3	we and just more out of curiosity. I
4	mean, since it's based on a deliverable
5	in cost savings, why wouldn't we just
6	make like a mid-term transfer based on
7	the results or some sort of
8	appropriations transfer as opposed to
9	putting it in the budget? Are we
10	confident that FTI is going to
11	MR. DUBOW: Yeah. We assume
12	that there will be savings. We started
13	the process that will provide those
14	savings. So we thought it would make
15	sense to actually have the appropriation
16	up front so that as the year went by and
17	savings came in, we could make payments.
18	COUNCILMAN HENON: So is it
19	based on a performance phasing process in
20	which they are paid for the services?
21	MR. DUBOW: Yeah.
22	MS. PASTER: It's not the
23	services. It's actually based on the
24	revenue savings.
25	COUNCILMAN HENON: Revenue

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                  So you're quantifying the
         savings.
 3
         savings?
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               Yes.
                   (Witness approached witness
 5
         table.)
 6
                   MS. RHYNHART:
                                  Hi.
                                        Rebecca
         Rhynhart, Budget Director. Good morning,
 8
         Councilman.
 9
10
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                       Good
11
         morning.
12
                   MS. RHYNHART: FTI is,
13
         according to their contract, paid 3
14
         percent of the savings from their various
15
         initiatives or 3 percent of additional
16
         revenues collected as a direct result of
17
         implementing their recommendations.
18
         those are currently being measured right
19
         now monthly, and the idea is to review
         the full Fiscal '14 year for success in
20
21
         order to determine the amount of payment
22
         that would go to them out of that
23
         700,000. Seven hundred thousand is their
               So that would be measured and
24
         max.
         calculated by my office.
25
```

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: Can you --
 3
         and I'm sorry. I apologize in advance if
         I missed the very beginning. Did you
 4
         talk about FTI? Because I came in like
 5
         ten minutes a little late.
 6
                   MS. RHYNHART: No, we haven't.
                   MR. DUBOW:
 8
                               No.
                                    No.
 9
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: Can you
10
         explain what their assignment is and how
11
         they intend on saving us monies on
12
         expenditures and services and processes.
13
                   MS. RHYNHART:
                                  Sure.
                                          They
14
         spent a significant amount of time here
15
         at the City prior to actually last year's
16
         budget in which they made -- they studied
17
         our processes and made a series of
         recommendations, both on the revenue side
18
         in terms of collections as well as the
19
20
         expense side in terms of various expenses
21
         from telecom charges to hedging fuel
22
         purchases.
                     They looked at a variety of
         different categories, and we've been
23
         going through the process during this
24
25
         year of implementing those
```

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         recommendations.
 3
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: So in last
         year's budget, if I recall, there was a
 4
         significant increase in the Revenue
 5
         Department enhancing their collections,
 6
         because delinquency collections were not
         as robust or as well as this body at
         least would like to see it. Is it from
 9
10
         their recommendations that you had
         additional monies set aside for a call
11
12
         center, new technology, and the process
13
         from which we collect our delinquencies?
14
                   MS. RHYNHART: There was an
15
         internal working group in Finance that
         worked on many of those recommendations,
16
17
         but FTI had agreed with the way the plan
18
         that was set up for the Revenue
         Department. So that wasn't -- FTI won't
19
20
         get paid based on the Revenue
21
         Department's increased collections,
22
         because that was an in-house project that
23
         was already started when FTI came on
         board, but they agreed with -- they
24
```

reviewed the recommendations and agreed

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	with them on the revenue side. Their
3	recommendations focused more on the
4	non-tax side. So on EMS collections,
5	which were only about 50 percent at the
6	time, commercial trash fee collection
7	rates, various different fees and charges
8	on the non-tax side that we could do a
9	better job on.
10	COUNCILMAN HENON: So
11	everything in Finance's under the
12	purview of the Finance Department.
13	Anything in Procurement that they're
14	taking a look at?
15	MS. RHYNHART: No. It was
16	actually across the City. So they did
17	have recommendations on Procurement, and
18	we have been meeting with Procurement to
19	work through some of them. One of their
20	main recommendations on Procurement was
21	to simplify the process for businesses
22	that were bidding and go through our
23	terms and conditions, which we've been
24	doing with our Law Department, to
25	simplify it, because we have a lot of

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         requirements that sometimes hinder small
 3
         businesses or just any -- a lot of
         businesses from wanting to bid and
         wanting to work with the City.
 5
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: So they
 6
         would -- when you're cross-analyzing
         multiple departments, it goes to my
 8
         question earlier about maybe -- not
 9
         professional services, but other vendors,
10
11
         that each department has their own
12
         autonomy. Did they take a look at some
13
         of the purchases -- I know this is more
14
         Procurement than not -- to see if there's
15
         duplicity or could we get better value in
16
         bulk purchases and things like that?
17
         instead of a department or an agency
18
         ordering their own, we as a city could
         purchase in bulk and save costs that way.
19
20
         I mean --
21
                   MS. RHYNHART:
                                  No.
                                        That's a
22
         good point.
23
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: -- I think
24
         you could save a significant amount of
25
         money.
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MS. RHYNHART: That's a good
3	point. There already are some contracts
4	like that across the City, but FTI did
5	make the recommendation to have category
6	buyers or category people focusing on
7	different categories of types of
8	purchases in the City, and that's
9	something that we're working on with
10	Procurement.
11	COUNCILMAN HENON: So, for
12	example, paper products or toiletries or
13	paper clips. I mean, something that is
14	universal that you know it's going to be
15	a necessity for an office.
16	MS. RHYNHART: Right. And that
17	we could get a better price by having
18	yeah. That was one of the things that
19	they had looked at and also on the
20	professional services side.
21	COUNCILMAN HENON: Are you
22	going to could you share some of that
23	analysis or not here, but at another
24	time, what they've taken a look at,
25	because I am interested in making sure

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 that we take a look at some of our bulk 3 sales. MS. RHYNHART: Yeah. T'd be happy to -- it was provided maybe a year 5 ago, but that was a while ago, so I'll 6 give it to you, yeah. 8 COUNCILMAN HENON: Because I 9 think we're getting to the way -- with the lack -- if revenues are down, or it's 10 11 been over the past several years since 12 the recession. I mean, I think we should 13 be even entertaining maybe a zero-based 14 budget moving forward and say, Hey, this 15 is where we need -- this is the direction we're headed in instead of piecemealing 16 17 it. I think maybe we should start 18 talking about that and start moving towards how we can be a little more 19 20 efficient on our savings. 21 MS. RHYNHART: I agree with 22 that, and I think that we have been -two things on what you just said. One is 23 we've been working through the FTI 24

recommendations. We grouped them into

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	Phase 1 and Phase 2. So Phase 1, since
3	there were a lot of them in terms of how
4	to improve our operations, so Phase 1
5	were the things that we needed to do
6	immediately and then Phase 2 were items
7	that we were going to do in like the next
8	quarter or the next few quarters. So
9	Procurement fits some of those
10	Procurement items fit into that. So it
11	would be good to continue that discussion
12	with you.
13	COUNCILMAN HENON: Right. And
14	then
15	MS. RHYNHART: And then on
16	zero-based budgeting
17	COUNCILMAN HENON: Correct.
18	That's where I'm headed.
19	MS. RHYNHART: And I like that
20	enthusiasm for that, because we are
21	actually implementing a new budgeting
22	system for the next budget year and we're
23	moving from our 2000 Excel spreadsheets
24	to a real system, and then we're also
25	going to be moving towards program-based

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         budgeting. So each department will be --
 3
         will need to work to determine the cost
         of each program and then we'll evaluate
 4
         programs. So there will be a lot more
 5
         information in terms of how to evaluate
 6
         what's successful and what isn't.
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: Well, I am
         in favor of moving in that direction.
 9
                                                 Ι
         think it's about time we've moved in that
10
11
         direction, and I think the advance in our
12
         technology which helps collaborate with
13
         multi-departments, I mean, just -- I
14
         mean, things that you've heard year after
15
         year needs to come to fruition.
16
         think if all these new processes and
         systems are in place, then there's no
17
18
         reason why we don't at least come up with
19
         a hybrid zero-based budget or zero-based
         budget process, because I think that's
20
21
         the direction that -- I believe that's
         where we should be.
22
                   MS. RHYNHART: Well, that's the
23
         philosophy of even using performance and
24
25
         program-based budgeting, is judging each
```

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         dollar spent and seeing how successful
 3
         that is, and then making decisions based
         on that, not based on what departments
 4
         got the year before.
 5
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
 6
                                       Is there
         somebody in the Finance Department
         that -- since you're the head arm of
 8
         government when it comes to finances.
 9
                                                 Is
         there somebody that takes a look at --
10
11
         maybe it's an outside professional vendor
12
         or services or somebody in-house
13
         hopefully -- take a look at duplicity in
14
         processes and purchasing and any kind of
15
         expenditures where -- is somebody
16
         assigned in Finance to take a look at
17
         that as the budgets come in? So in the
18
         state, I think they call it a re-budget
19
         or something. You would know, Rob.
20
         at the end of the year when you're
21
         preparing for budget season, which we are
22
         now in, the departments are putting their
         budget together and -- so I'm not sure if
23
24
         somebody reviews that from your
25
         department --
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MS. RHYNHART: Well, we review
3	every
4	COUNCILMAN HENON: and takes
5	a look at duplicities.
6	MS. RHYNHART: We review every
7	budget and spending during the year. So
8	when there are any items of duplicity
9	and they have arisen in terms of either
10	positions or types of responsibilities
11	that's something that we would right away
12	bring to the forefront and discuss in
13	terms of avoiding that, because we've
14	gone through, as you know, we've gone
15	through several years of deep cuts during
16	the recession and so there's not room for
17	that.
18	COUNCILMAN HENON: So the
19	paradigm would change with the zero-based
20	budget. Instead of the Administration
21	saying this is your budget, this is what
22	you had last year, this is your budget
23	this year, try to reduce costs, it will
24	be reversed at first glance coming under
25	the operation of a zero-based budget.

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   MS. RHYNHART:
                                  That's the true
 3
         zero-based budget. What we're going
 4
         to be doing --
 5
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                       The true
 6
         policy on paper.
                   MS. RHYNHART: -- is called
 8
         performance-based budgeting, which is
         actually how successful have you been
 9
         with these dollars and so where should we
10
         put additional dollars and where does it
11
12
         make sense to put dollars. If for every
13
         additional few dollars that we give to
14
         any service, what is the performance rate
15
         and how will that move the needle on that
16
         measurement.
17
                   So that's what we're moving
18
         towards, and that will be for -- we'll
         see some of it has been -- there were
19
         pilots done in this Five Year Plan for
20
21
         program-based budgeting in the Streets
22
         Department, and it's highlighted in the
23
         Five Year Plan for recycling and trash
         collection and a few other pilots as well
24
25
         we're running. For CLIP there was a
```

	7	73
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	pilot, for Tommy Conway's program. And	
3	if we	
4	COUNCILMAN HENON: We all love	
5	CLIP and the Streets Department.	
6	MS. RHYNHART: But that plans	
7	to be extended in Fiscal '16, so you'll	
8	get much more of that data for next	
9	year's budget cycle.	
10	COUNCILMAN HENON: Great.	
11	Council President, is there	
12	anybody else left in the queue? I have	
13	one last question.	
14	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yes.	
15	COUNCILMAN HENON: There are	
16	people in the queue?	
17	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: One	
18	question?	
19	COUNCILMAN HENON: One	
20	question.	
21	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
22	There is one.	
23	COUNCILMAN HENON: Office of	
24	property data, how are they making out on	
25	the lines of the OnePhilly project, I	

	74
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	think a similar type of processes and
3	systems. Can you have they had any
4	movement? Have there been successes in
5	it, and where are they as far as their
6	functionality?
7	MR. DUBOW: They're kind of
8	dependent on us getting through the first
9	assessment and appeals process
10	effectively. So that's kind of been held
11	up by that. So we're doing kind of the
12	prep work to be ready to go once we're
13	ready, but it won't really kick in fully
14	until probably a little bit later.
15	COUNCILMAN HENON: And their
16	budget is the same?
17	MR. DUBOW: Their budget is the
18	same, that's right.
19	COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. Thank
20	you.
21	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
22	Thank you, Councilman.
23	The Chair recognizes Councilman
24	Goode.
25	COUNCILMAN GOODE: Thank you,

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         Mr. President.
 3
                   Just a quick followup. At what
         point during the budget process will the
 4
         Administration consider a Plan B on
 5
         school funding? Did I understand your
 6
         testimony in response to a question to be
         that the only things that won't be on the
 8
 9
         table are, one, general operating dollars
10
         and, two, a broad property tax increase?
11
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               Yeah. And I think
12
         the timing on that really depends on what
13
         happens in the state and when that
14
         happens. So I think we want to see what
15
         happens up --
16
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE:
                                      Well, we did
17
         that last year and it didn't work out too
18
         well. So at what point during our budget
         process will the Administration consider
19
         a Plan B?
20
21
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               I think it will be
22
         fairly late in our process. I mean,
23
         obviously it has to be during the
         process, but I think that will be late in
24
25
         the process.
```

		'/6
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	COUNCILMAN GOODE: Well, last	
3	year our process concluded before	
4	Harrisburg took action. So at what point	
5	during our budget process will the	
6	Administration consider a Plan B on	
7	school funding?	
8	MR. DUBOW: Like I said, I	
9	think it will be probably towards the end	
10	of the process.	
11	COUNCILMAN GOODE: Okay. Thank	
12	you.	
13	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
14	Thank you.	
15	No one else is teed up. So	
16	with that, I will thank you very much for	
17	your testimony.	
18	And next up we have the City	
19	Treasurer.	
20	(Witnesses approached witness	
21	table.)	
22	MS. WINKLER: Good morning,	
23	Council President Clarke and members of	
24	City Council. My name is Nancy Winkler.	
25	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good	

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         morning.
 3
                   MS. WINKLER:
                                 I am the City
         Treasurer. I'm joined by James Lanham,
 4
         Deputy City Treasurer, and there are
 5
         members of my team here in the audience,
 6
         and we're here to present testimony on
 8
         the Treasurer's proposed Operating Budget
         for Fiscal '15. I'll just give you a
 9
10
         summary.
                   The Treasurer's Office budget
11
12
         remains essentially unchanged from last
13
         year.
14
                   I'd like to highlight a few
15
         activities. One, a significant level of
         effort during the course of the last
16
         several years has been refundings for
17
18
         savings. The Treasurer's Office has
         generated General Fund debt service cash
19
         flow savings of 14.4 million in Fiscal
20
```

21

22

23

24

25

General Fund savings over the entire term

Fiscals '13 and '14 will produce total

'13 and 17 million in Fiscal '14.

transactions that were executed in

refundings and letter of credit

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         of the bonds of 87.2 million.
 3
                   Airport, Water, and PGW
         transactions, refunding transactions,
 4
 5
         sold in Fiscals '13 and '14 produced
         savings over the entire term of 25.5
 6
         million.
                   We also held an investor
         conference with over 100 attendees to
 9
         help attract more investors into the
10
11
         City's bonds.
12
                   We have been seeking savings in
13
         the treasury operations, and beginning in
14
         this calendar year, Fiscal '14, we have
15
         competitively procured contracts for
16
         banking services that are estimated to
17
         save approximately $400,000 a year in
18
         banking fees.
                   Working with the Board of
19
         Pensions and Retirement, we have
20
21
         increased the percentage of pension
22
         checks going out through direct deposit
         to 90.3 percent from 87 percent in Fiscal
23
         '11.
24
25
                   We have recovered over $435,000
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	in unclaimed money from the Commonwealth,
3	and we've opened lock boxes to facilitate
4	the Revenue Department's efforts in the
5	collection of delinquent revenues.
6	We have successfully procured,
7	tested, and on-boarded a new networked
8	debt management system which is being
9	done in collaboration with the Accounting
10	Department and with Water, PGW, and
11	Airport, which substantially improves our
12	analytical capabilities and substantially
13	reduces risk. We've also led the effort
14	to obtain General Fund obligation bond
15	rating upgrades from Standard and Poor's
16	to A+ in December of 2013, which we
17	estimate on the last City GO bond issue
18	produced \$10 million in lifetime interest
19	cost savings. The City now has a
20	category ratings for the first time, from
21	all three rating agencies, for the first
22	time since the '70s.
23	We have some other initiatives
24	planned this year. Continued bond
25	issues, four bond transactions and four

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	letter of credit replacements this year
3	as well as managing the commercial paper
4	program for the Airport. We are working
5	with Finance and Budget to develop a fund
6	balance policy. We are working to revamp
7	the City's debt policy, investment
8	policy, and Treasurer's website. We
9	continue to develop post-issuance
10	compliance database for City
11	bond-financed projects. We are providing
12	some support for the potential sale of
13	PGW, and we plan to continue to sell the
14	City's annual cash flow bonds known as
15	the TRAN on a competitive basis which we
16	believe generates savings.
17	On the investment and cash flow
18	side, we hope to implement a networked
19	treasury management system and we'll be
20	planning for that this year. We are
21	going to continue to track the City's
22	cash flow position and discuss that with
23	our outside cash managers. We will
24	update the City's investment policy, and
25	we are competitively procuring money

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	managers for investments of the City's
3	short-term cash.
4	That concludes my testimony.
5	I'm happy to answer any questions you may
б	have.
7	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
8	Thank you very much.
9	I had a quick question. It was
10	relating to, to some degree, something
11	that we're currently working on. We
12	talked about the proceeds from the
13	transaction, soon to be realized
14	proceeds, on the Love Park Garage, and we
15	don't necessarily know how much it will
16	ultimately be in terms of what we will
17	use, and my question was centered around
18	the retirement of any bonds this year.
19	Do we anticipate the retirement of any
20	bonds, outstanding bonds, this year?
21	MS. WINKLER: Well, it's my
22	understanding that there are several
23	different possible uses. I haven't been
24	directly involved in the planning for the
25	use of the proceeds of the Love Park.

		0 2
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
3	Well, just generally, not necessarily for	
4	that.	
5	MS. WINKLER: Well, we pay debt	
6	service	
7	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
8	That's in the early stages of	
9	conversation.	
10	MS. WINKLER: We pay debt	
11	service each year. We budget in the	
12	Operating Budget to pay debt service,	
13	regularly scheduled debt service, and	
14	that's budgeted for and provided for. So	
15	the way I think about it conceptually is	
16	there's many different ways to use, say,	
17	one-time revenues, as we might obtain	
18	here, just for kind of conceptually to	
19	think about it. If you were to take	
20	one-time revenues and use that to fund	
21	capital projects which we would otherwise	
22	have to borrow for, that might give us an	
23	investment return, let's say, of around 5	
24	percent, because that's about what we	
25	might borrow at. Whereas if we were to	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	just use it to defease like to invest
3	some money and use it to pay off next
4	year's bonds debt service, we can only
5	earn about maybe we can earn about,
6	say, 20 basis points, which is two-tenths
7	of 1 percent. So that's a much lower
8	investment return on that money.
9	So I think there's a lot of
10	different ways, but that's just an
11	example of how to maybe conceptually
12	think about options.
13	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
14	Okay. So since we're talking about Love
15	Park, then if we didn't use any money
16	that was borrowed for Love Park, which I
17	believe we were anticipating using some,
18	then based on what you're suggesting,
19	that if we use if we use monies
20	generated from proceeds for the entire
21	refurbishment or restoration of Love
22	Park, then it would probably be a more
23	fiscally prudent process option.
24	MS. WINKLER: It would.
25	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: As

		84
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	opposed to	
3	MS. WINKLER: Presumably it	
4	would generate a longer term return	
5	rather than paying off short term.	
6	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
7	Right. So as opposed to borrowing	
8	capital dollars to do the park, we would	
9	just take the proceeds and use that money	
10	to restore the park and not borrow	
11	money	
12	MS. WINKLER: I haven't done a	
13	return-on-investment analysis. I don't	
14	know if someone has.	
15	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
16	Conceptually.	
17	MS. WINKLER: But conceptually,	
18	that makes sense to me, yes.	
19	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
20	Okay. All right. Thank you. I'm	
21	actually good.	
22	Any other questions for this	
23	witness?	
24	(No response.)	
25	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         Thank you very much.
 3
                   MS. WINKLER:
                                  Thank you.
                   COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
         Thank you.
 5
                   Next up we have Sinking Fund.
 6
                   (Witnesses approached witness
         table.)
 8
 9
                   MR. JONES:
                               Good morning,
         Mr. President, members of City Council.
10
         I'm Charlie Jones.
                             I'm the Executive
11
12
         Director of the Sinking Fund Commission
13
         and I'm pleased to be here in the
14
         morning. Normally I get shunted back to
15
         the afternoon, so this is nice.
16
                   I'm here to request from City
17
         Council the budget for the Sinking Fund
18
         Commission. To refresh your memory, the
19
         Sinking Fund Commission pays all the debt
         service on the City's bonds.
20
                                        The City
21
         has outstanding approximately $8.6
22
         billion of bonds at the end of February,
23
         and today I am requesting from City
         Council in the neighborhood of $616.4
24
         million to service that debt in Fiscal
25
```

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         Year '15.
 3
                   The Sinking Fund Commission
 4
         pays debt on the General Fund, the Water,
 5
         Aviation, and car rental tax, and I'm
         going to go over each one of them
 6
         quickly.
                   The General Fund, I'm
 8
         requesting about $248 million.
9
                                          It's
         comprised of two classes: Class 200,
10
11
         which is for City service agreements and
12
         lease payments, and Class 700, which is
         for debt service for the General Fund.
13
14
         The Class 200 request is about $111
15
         million. That's about a $14 and a half
16
         million increase, and that's due mainly
17
         to budgeting for the repayment of the
         loan on the School District.
18
19
                   The Class 700 request of about
         $136 and a half million is mainly -- is
20
21
         an increase of $7.8 million.
                                        It's on
22
         payment of -- principal payments on the
23
         City's debt and about $3 million increase
         on the interest on the City's TRAN.
24
25
                   COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
                                               I'm
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	sorry, sir. I'm just working on
3	adjusting the schedule.
4	MR. JONES: The next item is
5	the Water Fund. The Water Fund is
6	approximately \$213 million. This
7	represents a \$16 and a half million
8	increase from last year, and it's mainly
9	for additional interest expense on both
10	existing debt and new issues.
11	The Aviation Fund I'm
12	requesting \$149 and a half million. It's
13	all Class 700 debt service, and this is
14	approximately \$10.8 million over last
15	year. This increase is due to increases
16	in both interest expense and principal
17	payment due to higher level of expected
18	borrowings at the Airport.
19	And the car rental tax is
20	approximately \$6 million. That's to
21	provide for lease revenue bond payments
22	on the sports stadiums. That's generated
23	from vehicle rental tax revenues.
24	I'd be more than happy to
25	answer any questions from City Council,

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	if there are any.
3	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
4	Thank you so much.
5	Just quickly, since the line of
6	questioning, I'm assuming the answer is
7	positive. Basically you concur with
8	Ms. Winkler's assessment on borrowing
9	versus defeasing bonds. Because that is
10	a part of your
11	MR. JONES: We're talking about
12	the \$30 million generated from Love Park?
13	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
14	Yeah. Yeah. You know, my position was
15	that I don't like borrowing money if we
16	don't have to borrow money, and then we
17	came to an agreement with the
18	Administration on maybe a hybrid
19	approach, but based on Ms. Winkler's
20	testimony, it seems like from a long-term
21	investment, it might be more prudent to
22	just use proceeds to spend on the park as
23	opposed to borrowing money.
24	MR. JONES: I would agree with
25	both of you, except that if we stop

		89
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	borrowing money, I'd be out of a job.	
3	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I	
4	understand. I understand.	
5	MR. JONES: So keep on	
6	borrowing.	
7	In this instance, I would tend	
8	to agree with you. I'd rather use the	
9	money.	
10	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: It's	
11	kind of like our job. If there were no	
12	problems in the City of Philadelphia, I'm	
13	sure we'd be out of a job pretty quickly	
14	too. All right. Thank you.	
15	Any other questions?	
16	(No response.)	
17	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
18	Thank you very much for your testimony,	
19	sir.	
20	We're going to actually	
21	we're actually going to adjust the	
22	schedule a little bit. We're having	
23	Pensions come over in about five minutes.	
24	So we'll just do Pensions and take a	
25	small break for OPA.	

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 So just for the record, we're 3 taking a ten-minute recess until Pensions 4 gets here. 5 (Short recess.) COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: 6 Good afternoon. MR. BIELLI: Good afternoon, Council President. How are you? 9 10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: 11 can proceed. 12 MR. BIELLI: Good afternoon, Council President Clarke, members of 13 14 Council. My name is Francis Bielli. I'm the Executive Director of the Board of 15 Pensions. With me is Sumit Handa, Chief 16 17 Investment Officer, and our new Deputy Director, Shamika Taliaferro, as of 18 today, April 1st. 19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: 20 21 Welcome. 22 MR. BIELLI: I was going to 23 tell you we were a hundred percent funded, April fools, but I decided not to 24 25 do that.

	7-
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
3	Thank you very much for your testimony.
4	MR. BIELLI: So you have my
5	testimony. Our budget request is the
6	same as it was last year. You see the
7	demographics for our staff, 79 percent
8	female, 60 percent African American, 5
9	percent Asian American, and our executive
10	staff is 57 percent female and 71 percent
11	minority.
12	Our funding percentage is down
13	slightly from last year. It's at 47.4
14	percent. It was at 48.1 percent. The
15	main reason for the decline, according to
16	our actuary, is the reduction of ten
17	basis points in the assumption rate and
18	also accounting for a 0.54 percent
19	liability load due to the Pension
20	Adjustment Fund. So adding those two
21	together account for the reduction in the
22	funding level.
23	The investment return was at
24	12.1 percent on a market rate and 10.94
25	percent on an actuarial rate.

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	And our OEO numbers, we are
3	again making progress in that area. You
4	may remember back in FY12 we were 9.33
5	percent of fees paid. FY13 that
6	increased to 13.18 percent, which was a
7	41 percent increase, and through the
8	first quarter thus far of FY14, we're at
9	17.65 percent of fees paid, a 34 percent
10	increase over FY13 and an 88 percent
11	increase over that FY12 number.
12	Part of our efforts in the OEO
13	area was again we conducted the
14	utilization study through Evestment
15	Alliance, which showed that 12.1 percent
16	of firms qualified as minority or
17	female-owned firms pursuant to our
18	investment guideline. So we are above
19	that 12.1 percent, but we're not
20	satisfied with where we are, even with
21	the 17.65 percent of fees. We think we
22	can do much better, and we anticipate
23	approximately an additional \$120 million
24	going to both female-owned and minority
25	firms through the rest of the calendar

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	year, and a large part of that is due to
3	how we reorganized the opportunity fund,
4	expanding from the areas of equity and
5	fixed income into the areas of private
6	equity, hedge funds, and real estate,
7	which were not part of the opportunity
8	set prior to this.
9	So, again, we would ask that
10	you approve our budget, and we're happy
11	to answer any questions that you may
12	have.
13	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
14	Thank you.
15	Quick question. On Page 4 of
16	your testimony, you state that the
17	assumed rate of return on the fund is now
18	7.85, reduced from 7.95. Given that the
19	market rates are at historical lows, do
20	you think that that's reasonable to think
21	that we will still be, although reduced,
22	at 7.85?
23	MR. BIELLI: Do we think we'll
24	be able to meet that?
25	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yes.

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MR. BIELLI: Well, the
3	historical since inception, since
4	we've been tracking our return, which is
5	1988, the average return that we have is
6	7.91. So we have exceeded that
7	assumption rate even dating back to 1988,
8	which includes the 2001 dot-com meltdown,
9	includes the 2008 meltdown. So even
10	considering those, the average return has
11	been 7.91. So I think it's definitely
12	something that we can achieve.
13	I also would point out that we
14	are below the median assumption rate if
15	you look at large pension plans from
16	throughout the country, and the
17	experience study that we received just
18	last Thursday, there's a chart which says
19	the median assumption rate of large plans
20	throughout the country is 7.9 percent.
21	So reducing it 90 basis points over the
22	last six years has gotten our fund below
23	the median, which is really a good
24	achievement. So, yeah, I think we can
25	meet that return.

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
3	Okay. That's actually good news, I
4	guess, in this environment.
5	There's the potential for a
6	number of things to happen over the next
7	year as it relates to the fund, potential
8	PGW sale, potential sales tax, and who
9	knows what else might come up,
10	particularly when you're dealing with
11	Harrisburg. You just never really know.
12	It would be helpful to us if
13	you gave us some direct likelihoods in
14	terms of various scenarios, the ones that
15	are out there. Obviously you can't do it
16	based on the unknown, but right now there
17	are a number of scenarios. So it would
18	be helpful to City Council if that
19	information came directly from you to us
20	on the potential activity that might
21	happen over the next year. Can you do
22	that for us?
23	MR. BIELLI: Yes. And much of
24	that work will be done through our
25	actuary, but, yes, we could do that.

		96
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: That	
3	would be very helpful to us.	
4	Thank you. I actually don't	
5	have anything else.	
6	Any other members have	
7	questions of this witness?	
8	(No response.)	
9	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
10	Thank you very much for your testimony.	
11	MR. BIELLI: Thank you. Have a	
12	good day.	
13	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:	
14	We're breaking records today, I'll tell	
15	you.	
16	Council will stand in recess	
17	until 1:30.	
18	(Short recess.)	
19	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Can I	
20	have your attention, please. Why don't	
21	we get started. Hopefully other	
22	Councilmembers will be coming in.	
23	Mr. McKeithen.	
24	Our next department is the	
25	Office of Property Assessment.	

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   (Witness approached witness
 3
         table.)
                   COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Good
         afternoon.
 5
 6
                   MR. McKEITHEN: Good afternoon,
         sir.
                   Good afternoon, Council
         President, members of City Council.
 9
                                               I'm
         Richie McKeithen, Chief Assessment
10
         Officer for the Office of Property
11
         Assessment. Here with me today are eight
12
13
         members of my senior management team.
14
         They are Michael Piper, Deputy Chief
15
         Assessment Officer; James Aros, Jr., Real
16
         Property Assistant Administrator; Marc
17
         Candidi, Real Property Assistant
18
         Administrator; Jay Devine, Real Property
19
         Assistant Administrator; Joseph Solomon,
         Real Property Assistant Administrator;
20
21
         Katherine Drayer, Assistant
22
         Administrator; Veronica Daniel,
23
         Administrative Services Director; Kevin
         Keene, Administrator of Mass Appraisal
24
25
         Analysis; Tom Dougherty, Business Analyst
```

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         Manager; and Drew Aldinger, Legal Counsel
 3
         for OPA.
                   We are here to testify on the
         proposed Fiscal 2015 year Operating
 5
                  The Office of Property
 6
         Budget.
         Assessment, commonly known as OPA, is
         primarily responsible for discovering,
 8
         listing, and valuing all real property in
 9
10
         the City of Philadelphia in a fair and
11
         equitable manner. Additionally, the
12
         Office of Property Assessment is charged
13
         with providing a response to real
14
         property tax appeal cases, applying real
15
         property tax exemptions, and
         administering the real property tax
16
17
         abatement program.
18
                   There are approximately 579,000
19
         parcels of real property in the City of
                        These include residential;
20
         Philadelphia.
21
         condominium; multi-family; large
22
         apartment complexes; retail; hospitality;
         office; industrial; warehouse; hospital;
23
24
         government, city, state, and federal;
25
         religious; exempt; and non-exempt
```

```
4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
1
 2
         property uses.
                   As a short-term goal, the
 3
         Office of Property Assessment plans to
 4
         respond to any outstanding first-level
 5
         review and Board of Revision of Taxes
 6
         appeal cases that have been filed.
         Additionally, OPA will conduct an audit
 8
         of all exempt parcels located throughout
 9
10
         the City.
11
                   As a long-term goal, OPA will
12
         continue to collect valuable data on the
13
         characteristics of parcels located
14
         throughout the City in an effort to keep
15
         all parcel records current.
16
                   For Fiscal Year 2015, we are
17
         requesting from Council a General Fund
18
         budget of $13,727,918.
19
                   Fiscal Year 2015 OPA's budget
20
         request continues to support full
21
         staffing targeted at 217 positions.
22
         Class 100 obligations are anticipated at
23
         $10,158,928. There are only slight
24
         changes to the department's Class 300 and
25
         Class 400 budget. The combined class for
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	300 and 400 Fiscal Year 2015 budget
3	request total \$794,600.
4	OPA will continue to support
5	the implementation of AVI and maintenance
6	of the comprehensive changes to the
7	property tax system. The Fiscal 2015
8	budget request includes an overall
9	increase of \$401,642 to fully finance
10	property reassessment activities. OPA's
11	total Fiscal 2015 budget request amounts
12	to \$13,727,918.
13	I would like to thank you for
14	this testimony and I will handle any
15	questions at this time.
16	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
17	you, Mr. McKeithen.
18	Let me start out. Page 2 of
19	your testimony, you state that there are
20	still 37 unfilled positions in your
21	department; is that correct?
22	MR. McKEITHEN: Yes, sir.
23	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Could you
24	describe the challenges you have in
25	hiring and do you realistically

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         anticipate being able to hire all those
 3
         vacant positions in the next fiscal year?
                   MR. McKEITHEN: We have gone
         through great challenges as far as our
 5
 6
         hiring. We've most recently, as
         approximately, I would say, two months
         ago, gone before the Civil Service
         Commission and spoken with them. We've
 9
10
         been working with the HR department about
11
         things we can do to invoke a more intense
12
         hiring process. We've looked at our
13
         salaries. We've looked at revising some
14
         of the qualifications, things of this
15
         nature, to get more people in.
16
                   We continue to test and we
17
         continue to try to seek individuals.
                                                Ι
         can't say for sure that we'll be able to
18
19
         hire 37, but we'll continue that effort.
20
                   COUNCILMAN GREENLEE:
                                          But
21
         that's still your goal?
22
                   MR. McKEITHEN: That's the
23
         goal, right.
24
                   COUNCILMAN GREENLEE:
                                          I had
         some other questions, but since
25
```

```
1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
```

- 2 Councilman Goode beat me here, I'll
- 3 respect that and recognize Councilman
- 4 Goode.
- 5 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Thank you,
- 6 Mr. Chairman.
- 7 Good afternoon.
- MR. McKEITHEN: Good afternoon,
- 9 sir.
- 10 COUNCILMAN GOODE: In the
- 11 testimony you say OPA will conduct an
- 12 audit of all exempt parcel located
- throughout the City. Can you tell me the
- scope of that audit.
- 15 MR. McKEITHEN: Sure. I'll
- 16 have Mike Piper, my Deputy Assessor, talk
- 17 to you about that.
- 18 MR. PIPER: Good afternoon,
- 19 Councilman Goode, members of Council.
- 20 I'm Michael Piper, Deputy Chief
- 21 Assessment Office of the Office of
- 22 Property Assessment.
- Our intent is to conduct a
- 24 complete audit of all the statutorily
- 25 exempt properties within the City of

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	Philadelphia, weeding out the ones that
3	are owned by governmental entities, and
4	we've actually at this point come up with
5	a form. We've come up with some ways of
6	identifying the taxable status in the
7	eyes of the IRS; in other words, being
8	able to determine whether or not some of
9	these entities have a 501(c)(3) or have
10	had one and have lost it in the interim.
11	So we've identified what it is that we're
12	going to do to try to determine whether
13	or not the entities are eligible for
14	exemption, and that's the first thing.
15	The second part of the process
16	is, we're going to conduct a separate
17	audit to look at the properties
18	themselves to see if they're being if
19	they're continuing to be used for the
20	purposes that was stated when they
21	acquired the exemption in the first
22	place.
23	COUNCILMAN GOODE: Okay.
24	Before that audit is complete, of the
25	579,000 parcels, do we know how many are

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         abated and how many are exempt?
 3
                   MR. PIPER: About 22,000 or so.
 4
         Again, that would include -- some of
         those would include different
 5
         governmental entities, Commonwealth of
 6
         Pennsylvania, federal government, but
         about 22. If you take out the
 8
         governmental entities, it's a lot less
 9
         than that. It's probably closer to about
10
11
         maybe 15,000.
12
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE:
                                      Can you
13
         provide us up-to-date information on the
14
         number and value of exempt properties and
         the number and value of abated
15
16
         properties.
17
                   MR. PIPER: We can.
                                        We can
18
         provide that.
19
                   COUNCILMAN GOODE: Another
         technical question which I know the
20
21
         answer to but I have to ask for the
22
         record. Can the owner of a tax-abated
23
         property receive a homestead exemption?
24
                               No. Let me revise
                   MR. PIPER:
25
         that.
                Let me --
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 MR. McKEITHEN: Let me ask Kate 3 Drayer, who is our homestead 4 specialist -- well, Drew, come on. 5 Sorry. MR. ALDINGER: Good afternoon, 6 Councilman Goode, members of Council. There's new legislation that 8 9 was recently adopted that will prohibit 10 tax-abated properties from benefiting 11 from the homestead exemption starting in 12 tax year 2015. 13 COUNCILMAN GOODE: So it was 14 adopted too late. That's right. 15 MR. ALDINGER: 16 It was adopted too late for 2014, but it 17 will be in effect for 2015. 18 COUNCILMAN GOODE: So for the first year of AVI, there are actually 19 20 tax-abated owners that are only taxed on 21 land and we're knocking \$30,000 off that land as well? 22 23 MR. ALDINGER: That is correct. 24 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Okay. Thank 25 you.

		±00
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	Thank you, Mr. Chair.	
3	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank	
4	you, Councilman.	
5	Mr. McKeithen, I know this was	
6	a challenging year, to say the least.	
7	The initial reviews and I know there's	
8	still how many approximately left to do?	
9	MR. McKEITHEN: We have	
10	approximately, I would say, 3,000 or less	
11	FLRs to actually	
12	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Three	
13	thousand? Wow. Okay.	
14	Now, I'm not asking this	
15	critically, because, again, I'll repeat	
16	that I know this was a challenging year,	
17	but I know originally we heard that I	
18	think it was like the fall last year that	
19	you thought you'd be finished with a lot	
20	of these or most of these.	
21	MR. McKEITHEN: Right.	
22	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: And	
23	obviously we're way past that. Kind of	
24	discuss what's been the challenge, what's	
25	been the problem, the staffing, whatever.	

		Τ(
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure.	
3	Naturally, staffing is always a challenge	
4	and an issue, but we would more than	
5	likely be complete with the FLRs, but the	
6	Board of Revision of Taxes' season kicked	
7	in and so we have to respond to the Board	
8	of Revision of Taxes and the appeals that	
9	are filed with them. And so we had to	
10	slack off of the FLRs, because any time	
11	you have a Board case and an FLR, the	
12	actual Board decision is going to	
13	actually render the consequence as far as	
14	the value is concerned ultimately. So we	
15	had to sort of gear it more towards the	
16	Board of Revision of Taxes' cases and	
17	slack off of the FLRs.	
18	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: So if	
19	somebody put in an FLR and then appealed	
20	to the BRT and I'm sure a lot of	
21	people did both, right?	
22	MR. McKEITHEN: Right.	
23	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Was it	
24	the ones that appealed to the Board that	
25	you slacked off, to use your term, or did	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	you not match it up like that?
3	MR. McKEITHEN: Well, we
4	attempted to see what actually had a
5	Board case, because once the Board season
6	kicked in, which started I believe in
7	January, those dates that we actually did
8	receive are solid. So we had to address
9	them I don't know if this is answering
10	your question, but anything that had an
11	FLR was looked at immediately if it had a
12	Board case filed, because oftentimes
13	you're going to have a similar outcome as
14	far as OPA's perspective. And so we
15	rushed to look at those cases first and
16	get those cases settled, because we might
17	even be able to the intent was to get
18	as many withdrawals from the Board
19	hearings if they had actually filed an
20	FLR. So we went down that path.
21	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Because I
22	know that was the original thought, that
23	it would cut down on the appeals to BRT.
24	MR. McKEITHEN: Right.
25	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: You take

4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 1 2 care of the FLRs -- and I know you want 3 to do the due diligence. Does it seem to me that, because I'm just hearing in the 4 area where I live, where the ones that 5 6 appeared to have the best argument seemed to be the ones getting the answers later? Like the answers that people have been 9 getting more recently, at least in the 10 ones I'm aware of, have been getting more favorable responses on the FLRs. 11 12 a coincidence or is that just... 13 Well, that MR. McKEITHEN: might just be coincidence. 14 I mean, 15 initially we took the approach of let's handle the biggest volume of FLRs that we 16 17 could handle in the shortest amount of time, because we did want to get this 18 19 settled as much as possible. And so we 20 did look at cases initially where 21 individuals did not necessarily prove a 22 case to us. So we got a lot of FLRs that 23 were filed where people just seem to just 24 be angry in general about a lot of 25 different things in City government.

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: We heard
3	from a few of them ourselves.
4	MR. McKEITHEN: And so we
5	attempted to knock as many of those out
6	first, because to get to the latter
7	cases, you have to set up schedules to go
8	out and meet with the taxpayers. They
9	have to be home, and that takes a little
10	bit more time. And so our initial
11	approach was to knock out as many of the
12	ones that did not have a credible case as
13	far as their filing and get those handled
14	and then work our way through everything
15	else.
16	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: And as
17	far as the personal the visitation of
18	the properties, what did you base that
19	on? Was that something the homeowner
20	asked for or depending on what argument
21	they made, like that kind of thing?
22	MR. McKEITHEN: It was a little
23	bit of both. If a homeowner had a
24	situation where we really needed to get
25	inside to see damage and things like

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	that, we naturally attempted to go out
3	and see those. If a homeowner had a case
4	where they weren't talking about anything
5	interior or there was no real argument
6	about anything other than maybe some
7	sales or activity or anything in the
8	neighborhood that didn't necessarily
9	revolve around real estate, we didn't
10	attempt to schedule an appointment for
11	those.
12	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.
13	Now, as far as properties that I'm
14	sure there were some put in for the
15	initial review, were turned down, but are
16	appealing to the Board obviously, right?
17	MR. McKEITHEN: Yes.
18	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: If the
19	Board rules in the homeowner's favor; in
20	other words, brings it down, how does
21	that affect because are you still
22	planning to assess every year?
23	MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. The goal
24	initially when I first arrived and
25	started testifying to you as a Council

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 was to reassess every year. That's 3 ultimately the goal, because you want to 4 keep your assessments as current as 5 possible. Now, what we have encountered, 6 not due to any circumstance in OPA, are some challenges. Naturally, one as I mentioned always was staffing, but more recently, the relation with the Board as 9 far as the actual Board of Revision cases 10 being scheduled, we actually getting a 11 12 schedule. 13 In the assessment world, when you get to appeals, everything is done in 14 a cycle, and so you're doing various 15 things every time every year to get ready 16 17 for the next year's reassessment. we've been challenged in doing this 18 19 because we haven't been able to get a 20 full schedule, say, for example, six 21 months out, from the actual Board. 22 it's kind of hard for us to plan on a 23 regular basis from day to day, week to week what our activities will be. 24 25 we have to take the approach of just

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 handling and answering nothing else but 3 appeals until we can actually get a schedule and have something where we can 4 plan and work around. And that's been 5 our challenge. 6 And so, yeah, my initial plan 8 upon arrival here was to reassess every 9 year, and I still intend on doing that as 10 much as I can, but challenges along the 11 way could prevent that. 12 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: And I'll 13 turn it over to the other members, but 14 the point I was trying to get at is, if 15 the BRT brings down -- just to give a figure, the property was put by OPA at 16 \$300,000. They appealed. It was brought 17 18 down to \$200,000. Next year how will 19 that decision affect if you do reassess 20 that property? I mean, would you be --21 because obviously the assessor thought it 22 was a higher amount. You follow what I'm 23 saying? 24 MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. I got 25 Every assessment year stands on its you.

	_
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	own. So a property can be reduced by the
3	Board in one particular year and then
4	revised by OPA the following year.
5	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Even if
6	nothing has changed, it's still
7	MR. McKEITHEN: Even if nothing
8	in the property has changed, because what
9	the Board would be looking at are sales
10	activity from a period that is different
11	from what OPA would be using to look at
12	it for the following reassessment. And
13	so that's why in the assessment world and
14	our industry every year stands on its
15	own.
16	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: All
17	right. There's some Councilmembers that
18	want to ask questions. I won't belabor
19	that.
20	Councilman Johnson.
21	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Thank you,
22	Mr. Chair.
23	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: And since
24	there's a number of people, we'll go with
25	the five-minute rule to start. Okay?

	115
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Sure.
3	Thank you, Mr. Chair.
4	How are you, Richie?
5	MR. McKEITHEN: How are you
6	doing, sir?
7	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: I'm doing
8	pretty good. Can't complain.
9	I just wanted to do additional
10	followup. Now, last year when we talk
11	about I think for your staff this year
12	you're hiring how many new people?
13	MR. McKEITHEN: Well, we have
14	approximately 37 positions open.
15	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON:
16	Thirty-seven open?
17	MR. McKEITHEN: Yes.
18	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: How many
19	are being filled to date?
20	MR. McKEITHEN: We're
21	constantly trying to fill positions.
22	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So in
23	terms of actually excuse me. In terms
24	of the information that your team is
25	actually collecting, right, and I know

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	last year you talked about the lack of
3	technology and the issue of human error
4	in terms of actually individuals
5	inputting information. Have we moved
6	toward a level of technology that will
7	help us actually record the data, the
8	assessment data?
9	MR. McKEITHEN: What we're
10	doing is, we're looking to move in the
11	near future, we're looking to move to a
12	much more automated system. Now, we have
13	to go through a process, City process,
14	with an RFP and things like that, and
15	we're at a point now of attempting to
16	hire someone to help us write the
17	requirements for that.
18	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: What's the
19	timeframe?
20	MR. McKEITHEN: The timeframe
21	is, we have been meeting. I would
22	expect and probably have to get the
23	individual who is in charge of the actual
24	project, but the timeframe is for us to
25	move on this right now. We have put

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	together some items to have looked at by
3	the Law Department, I believe, so we can
4	move forward.
5	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Are we
6	going to be working with the Office of
7	Information Technology as well?
8	MR. McKEITHEN: Surely. We're
9	working with OIT. Adel Ebeid is one of
10	the people that's on our committee for
11	this as well as several people in my
12	office who work for OIT.
13	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So in
14	terms of the RFP process, the timeframe
15	you think in terms of writing the RFP
16	process
17	MR. McKEITHEN: I would say
18	within the next year.
19	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: In the
20	next year?
21	MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah.
22	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Just one
23	other question. Give me an idea and I
24	think you kind of alluded to now we're
25	looking at post-AVI, right? AVI has been

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	implemented. Assessments have gone out.
3	I don't want to be redundant in terms of
4	how many first-level reviews that have
5	come in, how many have been granted, how
6	many have been denied, because I know
7	that information has already been
8	discussed, but give us an idea of how
9	you're going to move forward in terms of
10	the actual assessment process. Will it
11	be every year, every other year?
12	MR. McKEITHEN: Our goal is
13	naturally to reassess every year, and
14	when I say "reassess," that does not
15	necessarily mean that every parcel will
16	get a change in value. What that means
17	is that we'll review the values where
18	they are and see if there needs to be any
19	revisions to the values.
20	I would anticipate that we'll
21	never have what we had initially with AVI
22	where everything had to be changed as
23	drastically as it was, because we had
24	never done a comprehensive reassessment
25	citywide before and now we have that

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	accomplished. We'll be looking at the
3	City typically on an annual basis, but
4	I'm quite sure we'll never have a
5	situation where everything changed like
6	it did before.
7	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So every
8	individual household will be reassessed
9	under the new
10	MR. McKEITHEN: It will be
11	reviewed, yes. It will be reviewed, and
12	some of them will change, some of them
13	will not. Only the areas that are still
14	constantly, what we call, hot.
15	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Like Point
16	Breeze?
17	MR. McKEITHEN: The areas that
18	continue to have a lot of activity will
19	get a change in assessed value, but the
20	areas that pretty much are where the
21	sales and assessments are right on point,
22	you won't see changes neighborhood-wide
23	in those areas.
24	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So we can
25	expect this in 2015?

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	MR. McKEITHEN: Once again, I'm	
3	challenged right now until I can get the	
4	appeal situation handled with the Board	
5	of Revision of Taxes. I'm trying to get	
6	a schedule now of all of the cases and I	
7	can plan and do some things. You know,	
8	that's my biggest challenge about trying	
9	to get something for 2015.	
10	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So there	
11	may be a possibility?	
12	MR. McKEITHEN: It's a little	
13	early to tell right now. I'll be	
14	hesitant to say definitely one way or	
15	another, but that is one of my biggest	
16	challenges.	
17	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Okay.	
18	Thank you, Mr. Chair.	
19	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: You're	
20	welcome, Councilman. We're lucky we live	
21	where we do, aren't we?	
22	Councilwoman Reynolds Brown.	
23	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Thank you,	
24	Mr. Chairman.	
25	Good afternoon.	

		121
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	MR. McKEITHEN: Good afternoon.	
3	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: It's very	
4	interesting because my questions are	
5	my line of questions are very much	
6	similar to Councilman Johnson, but let me	
7	first back up to this staffing issue,	
8	because these ideals and strategies are	
9	great, but they mean nothing if you don't	
10	have the staff to make it happen.	
11	So what's your thinking you	
12	stated in your testimony it has been	
13	difficult to attract and retain	
14	evaluators. So just speak more about why	
15	you think that's so. To the extent that	
16	that's real, what strategies have you	
17	thought about to arrest that manpower	
18	issue?	
19	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure.	
20	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: And what	
21	entities have you thought about in terms	
22	of partnerships that could help you get	
23	to those persons who possess some	
24	facsimile of that skill, like HAPCO or	
25	BOMA or Building Industry Association?	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	And my thinking is government can no
3	longer work in silos, because we end up
4	with circumstances like this, and to the
5	extent that we can facilitate working
6	relationships with other professionals
7	who may indeed be in the private industry
8	but that can assist us, following proper
9	protocols, there may be opportunity. So
10	I'm just curious to know where the
11	thinking is about how you fix that
12	dilemma.
13	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure. First of
14	all, I'll start and then I'll have my HR
15	person, Ms. Daniel, and Michael Piper
16	come up, because they've been side by
17	side with me in trying to offset this
18	challenge.
19	First things first, I think our
20	salaries are really low as far as being
21	competitive. For a city in Pennsylvania
22	that is actively doing reassessment work
23	and doing it the way we're having to do
24	it and doing it, you know, on an annual
25	basis, I think our salaries are really

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
               Matter of fact, I looked on the
 3
         Internet. I've been in other localities,
         DC, Richmond, places like that.
 4
                                           Their
 5
         starting salaries in Richmond are higher
         than what we have here.
 6
                   COUNCILWOMAN BROWN:
                                         Is that
 8
         right?
 9
                   MR. McKEITHEN: And so that's a
         big problem.
10
11
                   We sat down with the HR
12
         department. We were able to try to look
13
         at some nuances. We did actually get the
14
         ability to increase our salaries
15
         somewhat, but I still think it's a
16
         challenge.
17
                   We met with the Civil Service
18
         Commission, because one of the things we
19
         have as far as being challenged of hiring
20
         people in the area is that we have a
21
         mandatory residency requirement. And so
22
         we met with the Civil Service Commission,
23
         and the result of that was that we got
24
         the ability to have people have to move
25
         into the City ten years after they have
```

124 1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 accepted a position. 3 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: How many 4 years? 5 Ten years after MR. McKEITHEN: 6 they --COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: They have 8 ten years to move into the City? 9 MR. McKEITHEN: Yes. 10 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Help me 11 understand that logic. 12 MR. McKEITHEN: Well, this is 13 what we got back from the Civil Service 14 Commission. However, the challenge was 15 individuals who were looking at coming to 16 work for us had a problem with the 17 residency requirement. 18 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: I need to 19 make sure I understand that. So they can 20 accept a position and they can live where 21 they are up to nine years and 11 months, 22 but in ten years they have to move into 23 the City? 24 MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. 25 Ms. Daniel, do you want to walk

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         through.
 3
                   MS. DANIEL:
                                Hi.
                                      I'm Veronica
         Daniel, the Administrative Services
 4
         Director for the Office of Property
 5
 6
         Assessment.
                   The answer is, yes, they do.
         So, again, as Mr. McKeithen stated, we
 8
         did have a discussion with the OHR
 9
         department. We talked with the Director
10
11
         and we met with the group that was OHR
12
         and OPA and the Civil Service Commission,
13
         and they agreed to give our employees or
14
         new hires who don't live in the City a
15
         ten-year residency waiver.
16
                   MR. McKEITHEN: So with that,
17
         we thought that we might get an influx of
18
         people. We go to meetings out in Telford
         and places like this, and individuals
19
         look at our situation and they're
20
21
         curious. However, we haven't begun to
22
         see a wealth of people who have applied
23
         to come in.
24
                   COUNCILWOMAN BROWN:
                                         Could I
25
         please ask my follow-up question on that
```

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- 2 issue.
- 3 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Since you
- 4 said please so nicely.
- 5 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: So having
- 6 worked from the higher ed part of the
- 7 column for a long time, knowing that
- 8 college students -- we have the richest
- 9 mix of college students in the region,
- 10 and too many of them come, get their
- education, and fly. Could we examine the
- 12 possibility of sitting with the
- 13 appropriate personnel in some of our
- 14 higher ed institutions -- there are only
- 15 99 in the area, in the region -- and look
- 16 to see -- first look at the skill sets
- 17 required, knowing that young people come
- out of college typically flatfooted
- because they can't get a gig, and look to
- 20 see where we can make a match and create
- 21 a pipeline for these type of young
- 22 professionals because the salaries are so
- challenging?
- MR. PIPER: Sure. Good
- 25 afternoon, Councilwoman Reynolds Brown.

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Good
 3
         afternoon.
                               We actually, at the
                   MR. PIPER:
         behest of the Civil Service Commission
 5
         when they saw that we were having these
 6
         problems hiring, we actually met with
         Community College of Philadelphia a
 8
         couple times and had some familiarity
 9
10
         with the business programs over there.
                                                  Ι
11
         knew they did actually have a real estate
         program. And we talked to them about the
12
13
         possibility of putting together a program
         in which a student would come out with
14
15
         either a certificate or a two-year degree
16
         that would make them have all the
17
         qualifications we need, and it sounded
18
         like a good idea to them and to us and to
         the Civil Service Commission. I think
19
20
         where we got a little stuck was most
21
         people that are looking to get involved
22
         in real estate, young people, they're
23
         looking at the different possibilities,
24
         sales but maybe what we do, appraisal,
25
         and for most things you don't need a
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 college degree. So the conversation I 3 quess got a little stuck when it came to what type of demand there would be so 4 Community College could sell this 5 6 program. We're still going to have some more discussions with them because we 8 9 thought that was a good idea. We would 10 like to see people come into a program 11 and finish with real estate fundamentals, 12 appraisal skills, writing skills, basic 13 algebra and calculus. So we are going to 14 continue to discuss that with Community 15 College and see what develops. 16 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: I would urge you to do that. They do have a new 17 18 President coming, but you'll have to wait 19 until leadership is in place to move an 20 idea that makes sense. So I would urge 21 you to resume those discussions, because 22 you're talking about a real J-O-B at the end of a certificate program, and too 23 24 many young people who have families are

looking for work.

1	4/1/14
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MS. DANIEL: Also, Councilwoman
3	Brown, when we advertise for our
4	positions, one of the places that I
5	one of the organizations that I reach out
6	to is Temple University's Real Estate
7	Institute.
8	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Very good.
9	MS. DANIEL: So I work very
10	closely with Barbara Korns, who is the
11	Director I think of that institution. So
12	we do let them know any time we have
13	the any time the exam is announced, I
14	send her a direct communication giving
15	her all of the details of that position.
16	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. So,
17	finally, I would say adding to your
18	protocols the practice of informing
19	Councilpeople. We get approached all the
20	time about where can I find work, and
21	knowing that this is a place in
22	government where there's opportunity
23	pending, you have the appropriate
24	credentials, you know, it becomes an
25	additional piece of information we can

		130
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	give to people who are desperate for	
3	work.	
4	MS. DANIEL: We appreciate	
5	that, and I will do so in the future.	
6	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Thank you.	
7	Thank you, Mr. Chairman, very	
8	much.	
9	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank	
10	you, Councilwoman.	
11	Councilman Henon.	
12	COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you.	
13	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: We didn't	
14	forget about you.	
15	COUNCILMAN HENON: I hope you	
16	have a Snickers bar.	
17	Good afternoon.	
18	MR. McKEITHEN: Good afternoon.	
19	COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you.	
20	So let me figure out where to start here.	
21	We were talking about the positions that	
22	were available. What are the different	
23	tiers? You're showing three different	
24	tiers. Did you discuss that?	
25	MR. McKEITHEN: No, we haven't	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	discussed that. For evaluator, there's a
3	series that runs Evaluator 1, Evaluator
4	2, and Evaluator 3, and then we have the
5	Supervisory Evaluator clear on up to the
6	actual Chief of Assessments.
7	COUNCILMAN HENON: And you were
8	going through the entire City sending out
9	evaluators for the real on-site
10	assessment, is that correct, on site?
11	MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah,
12	inspections.
13	COUNCILMAN HENON: Every GMA,
14	every parcel was visited by or drove by
15	by an evaluator; is that correct?
16	MR. McKEITHEN: The goal was
17	for all residential parcels to get a
18	field inspection.
19	COUNCILMAN HENON: So a field
20	inspection. Were you at full staffing
21	levels when that took place?
22	MR. McKEITHEN: We didn't
23	COUNCILMAN HENON: I think, if
24	I recall from last year, 100 you were
25	looking to have, and I know you were

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	struggling, because I think you were
3	struggling to fill some of these
4	positions.
5	MR. McKEITHEN: We've never had
6	217 positions, which is what we would
7	consider full staff.
8	COUNCILMAN HENON: How many did
9	you have when you were evaluating the
10	City, when they were out there, before
11	this was implemented by City Council,
12	authorized?
13	MS. DANIEL: I'm not sure of
14	the exact number at that time, but I'll
15	be more than happy to provide you with
16	that information.
17	COUNCILMAN HENON: If you could
18	provide that to the Chair, that would be
19	helpful. Thank you.
20	So one of the things that jumps
21	out at me is in your testimony and in
22	data that you provided, you provided
23	information by zip codes, right, wasn't
24	it?
25	MR. McKEITHEN: Well, I think

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	that was the homestead.
3	COUNCILMAN HENON: The
4	homestead by zip codes?
5	MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. If
6	you're looking at what was sent to you as
7	far as what City Council received, you're
8	looking at the homestead.
9	COUNCILMAN HENON: So the
10	homestead was broken down by zip codes.
11	So my question to that is just more of an
12	observation. Why would we be reporting
13	homestead information back to
14	Councilmembers by zip codes when
15	everything from the beginning was broken
16	down to GMAs?
17	MR. McKEITHEN: Well, the
18	homestead Kate Drayer will come up and
19	tell you exactly why, but when you're
20	talking about GMAs, you're talking about
21	valuation things, activity, sales,
22	inspections. It works better for our
23	valuation process as far as GMAs are
24	concerned because that's normally how an
25	assessment jurisdiction will operate

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         through neighborhoods, through GMAs,
 3
         through things like that. When you're
         talking about programs -- and the
 4
         homestead is a program -- that typically
 5
         across the country isn't held in the
 6
         assessor's office. They may use zip
         codes.
 8
 9
                   But, Kate, you want to...
10
                   MS. DRAYER: Good afternoon.
11
         I'm Kate Drayer and I've been managing
12
         the homestead exemption program.
13
                   Councilman, to answer your
14
         question, we had just done it by zip code
15
         just for this information, but we can
16
         certainly break it down.
17
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                       The only
         reason I say it, it's a bit confusing
18
19
         when we -- or at least I'm going to speak
20
         for myself. I adjusted GMAs and started
21
         to understand the reasoning for GMAs,
22
         although there's still a lot of
         unanswered -- I would say there were
23
         still a lot of questions about different
24
25
         parts in the GMA, and then having it
```

		133
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	reported back on zip codes, it broadens	
3	it a little more and it takes me out of	
4	my focusing on the district and the	
5	neighborhoods. So for my purpose and the	
6	people I represent, I would prefer to	
7	have GMAs.	
8	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure.	
9	COUNCILMAN HENON: As weird as	
10	that may sound, it helps me when I'm	
11	trying to figure out trends and why there	
12	are some neighborhoods that are pretty	
13	good with homestead and some	
14	neighborhoods that were lacking. I mean,	
15	I had a concerted effort and coordination	
16	with your office and the Council	
17	President in trying to communicate with	
18	every homeowner who qualified for a	
19	homestead, and I want to continue to do	
20	that. You know, we're are you on the	
21	queue?	
22	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Yeah.	
23	There's people who haven't had a chance	
24	yet.	
25	COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. Well,	

```
1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
```

- 2 I'll come back and finish, because I
- 3 still have some further homestead
- 4 questions.
- 5 MR. McKEITHEN: Sure.
- 6 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thanks.
- 7 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
- 8 you, Councilman.
- 9 Councilman O'Neill.
- 10 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Yes. I
- 11 understand I missed the ten-year
- residency. We won't talk about that, but
- hopefully we don't hear about that too
- 14 much anymore.
- 15 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: No, not
- 16 really. No.
- 17 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Let's get
- 18 past that.
- I just have a question. I
- think under the circumstances the people
- in your office did a phenomenal job. I
- just -- I can tell from complaints, and
- 23 particularly up against the clock,
- 24 understaffed and all that.
- Where they didn't do so well

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 wasn't in the average house or business, 3 as I saw it. It was where something was unusual about the property, a swim club 4 zoned residential on five acres and it's 5 all non-profit, everybody buys a little 6 7 membership and has a share in the place and families go there, walk, most of them, or drive a very short distance. 9 10 They get a bill that is like five times 11 what their taxes were. And if you could 12 build houses on the whole property some 13 day, it would be worth that, except they 14 have only X amount of street frontage, so 15 they really can't do a whole lot with the property. A volunteer organization that 16 17 is being judged commercial. 18 Maybe about four or five of There's not a lot that have come 19 these. 20 to my attention anyway. Some people may 21 have gone right to their appeal after the informal review. But is there a 22 23 structure where I can bring this to 24 somebody's attention? Because these are kind of mom and pop things, you know, 25

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         we'd call them if they were a store.
 3
         Everybody there is on limited income.
         They're volunteering. And they have a
 4
         good case. This is not something
 5
         where -- and in some cases, they were
 6
 7
         reduced, but not by any -- by the
         assessor, but not by anybody's
 8
         imagination where they think they should
 9
10
         be or closer to where they were and
11
         probably should be under the new system.
12
                   What can I as a District
13
         Councilman do or any Councilman do to
14
         bring this to somebody's attention like
15
         yourself or somebody at a higher level
         that can maybe save somebody $5,000,
16
17
         $10,000, $15,000, $20,000 going to the
         Board a year from now or at least tell
18
19
         them that you got to spend the money,
20
         sorry, everybody has sat down and this is
21
         it.
22
                   You're not talking a lot of
23
                 I'm talking I got 160,000 people
         cases.
         in my district, probably about 60,000
24
25
         properties, and I'm talking about maybe
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	five that have come to my attention. One
3	was a commercial piece. I don't think
4	it's hardly anybody has gotten to the
5	Board. It's a commercial piece, small
6	shopping center. Their model is and
7	they buy shopping centers all around the
8	region. They buy them cheap at very low
9	prices, below market. They're rescue
10	things where they're in Bensalem, South
11	Jersey, Philadelphia, Delaware County,
12	and they put lower priced stores in as a
13	result. They can charge a lot less. The
14	guy explained it to me very well. And
15	they knew their taxes were going up,
16	because they were doing a refinancing,
17	but they weren't being quadrupled.
18	They talked to the assessor.
19	The assessor said, Well, this is the
20	price. We base all this on sales, square
21	footage, and all that.
22	They said, We understand,
23	except everybody else in Northeast
24	Philadelphia; for instance, all the other
25	shopping centers you're comparing, are

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 full price. They get full price and 3 that's it. We get 70 percent of that because we do Big Lots, we do this. 4 carry these around with us, these 5 different clients in our different 6 7 centers, because they'll come in at a lower number. 8 9 The assessor agreed with him, 10 but said that that is -- You're right, I 11 made a mistake. I was using a general 12 rule. It wasn't making a mistake himself, but he realized they were a 13 14 special case, but they were told, But I 15 can't do anything for you. I've been told that's the way it is. You got to go 16 17 through your appeal. Now, that's a business guy. 18 19 I'm not too concerned about that person in terms of being able to handle that 20 21 legal thing and all, even though they 22 shouldn't have to, but I just wanted to bring one of those kind of cases in. 23 24 Then I've got a couple that 25 live on a large parcel of ground that has

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         no access.
                     It's off the Woodhaven
 3
         Expressway near I-95. They have Franklin
         Mills on one side.
                             They were boxed in.
 4
         They had their taxes go up because at one
 5
         time after they both finished work -- or
 6
         he finished work, she was a stay-at-home,
 8
         they ran a seasonal nursery business on
 9
         their property. So somebody -- they have
10
         not run it. They're in their -- they're
         up there in years, let's just say that.
11
12
         They discontinued their business.
                                             It's
         no longer there. They don't have a
13
14
         business privilege anymore or anything
15
         like that. It's closed off. And there's
         three little parcels, almost no value.
16
17
         mean, when I say "no value," maybe half a
         million, a million dollars if somebody
18
19
         could do something with it, but boxed in,
20
         no frontage that you can get to. You got
21
         to go around the gas station to get to
22
         it.
23
                   But they are in the process
24
         of -- they've had their informal review,
25
         and let's just say they went from, you
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 know, \$13,000 in taxes to like 85,000 or 3 something. It was some enormous number. Their valuation was brought 4 down by the assessor, but brought down 5 from like 8 million to 5 million, and 6 7 they hope their property has enough value to provide them in -- but they have a 9 small house on it, very little access. 10 They'd have to have the perfect -- as of 11 right, you can put like five houses that 12 nobody wants to live in, because you're facing Franklin Mills Mall and a 13 14 driveway. You're on their property just 15 about. And pretty soon you're going to be looking right at a Walmart. 16 17 I'd hate to see these people have to spend \$10,000, \$20,000 to go to 18 19 the Board, have to wait, have the anxiety 20 of all that, if there was somebody could 21 look at this, you know, with a little 22 more precision and say, You know what, 23 you got to pay more than you were paying, 24 that's fine. Maybe they were a little

underassessed, but nowhere near what this

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	so-called middle ground was.
3	That's what I'm interested in
4	right now. I mean, I know there's bigger
5	questions about staffing, and everybody
6	is going to be supportive of that because
7	we need it. Training, if we can do it
8	locally, hire locally to the extent
9	possible, move people in where we can't
10	hire local. But these kind of cases that
11	slip through the cracks, the unintended
12	consequences of moving quickly, being
13	understaffed, but there should be some
14	review before the Board gets it a year
15	from now or whatever, because these are
16	the little people cases that have big
17	implications. And I'll just set that
18	commercial property aside, because it
19	shows how things can happen like that.
20	But what could I tell them that
21	would be helpful to them and make me feel
22	better about it as well?
23	MR. McKEITHEN: Thank you. I
24	don't know if I can necessarily make you
25	feel better, but I can tell you that if

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         our people looked at it and it came
 3
         through the FLR process, we've given it
         every consideration that we would give it
 4
 5
         from an appraisal, a mass appraisal,
 6
         viewpoint.
                     We set up the process --
                   COUNCILMAN O'NEILL:
                                         If that's
         your answer, let's stop there.
 9
         bring one of them to you as the boss,
10
         because if these were water customers,
11
         I'd be in the Water Commissioner's
12
         office. Let me bring one to you and show
         it to you, have you tell me -- I'm not
13
14
         saying the person wasn't doing their job.
15
         Some of these are just more sophisticated
         type of appraisals than 99.9 percent are,
16
17
         and that's why I've got five out of
         60,000. That's not a high percentage I'm
18
19
         asking about.
20
                   I will bring one to you.
                                              Ιf
21
         you tell me that they followed everything
22
         and this is the right number, I won't
         bring you the other four or talk about
23
24
         again, okay? It would be easier for
25
         me -- because we don't work that way
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 around here. Well, they did their job 3 and that's it. We know people make mistakes. 4 We know sometimes they're in a little bit 5 over their head, every worker. 6 I'm in a little over my head a lot. 8 There's got to be a way of 9 doing it informally where somebody isn't 10 paying gobs of money to an attorney and 11 an appraiser who is going to testify and 12 do all that, and then who knows what 13 happens at that point, when this may have 14 a simple solution. If I told you I had 15 500 cases --16 I was going to MR. McKEITHEN: 17 say --18 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: -- I'd say 19 let them go. 20 MR. McKEITHEN: I was going to 21 say when they file with the Board, we 22 actually see it again. So we give it a second look when it's filed --23 24 COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: They've already filed with the Board before your 25

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         people gave them the --
 3
                   MR. McKEITHEN: So we'll see it
         again. If they filed with the Board,
 4
 5
         once the case -- and this gets back to
         the scheduling. Once the case is
 6
 7
         scheduled, we'll actually see it again
         and then we'll --
 8
 9
                   COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Well, see,
         it's different. I want to be involved in
10
11
         this, because I'm going to be asked to
12
         vote on whether you should have more
13
         money, more staff, whether you're doing
14
         the good job I think you're doing under
15
         limited circumstances and how I think
         your operation runs. If I think your
16
17
         operation is very computerized and
         bureaucratic and doesn't have room for
18
19
         the little guy to get heard, I may vote
         differently than I would if I thought
20
21
         there was some caring and some sympathy
         and some recognition that -- some pegs
22
         are square and our holes are all round,
23
24
         and they need special attention. That's
```

all.

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   Again, I'm not in here on
 3
         behalf of Franklin Mills Mall.
         behalf of people that are struggling.
 4
         And we all try to help people that are
 5
         struggling, and to the extent that I can
 6
7
         help just a few, I'd appreciate it.
 8
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                   Okay.
 9
                   COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: So I want
10
         to deal with you. I'll just take one in.
11
         If you don't like the one, I won't bring
12
         you the other four, because I'll be
13
         wasting my time.
14
                   These are slam dunks.
                                           These
15
         are not -- and they're waiting and
         they're out there and they're worrying
16
17
         and they're being told there's no
18
         exceptions to this, even though I
19
         understand. They're being told, Well,
         there was commercial on one of your three
20
         little parcels. Two are worthless, and
21
22
         the one that's probably worth, on a
         really good day, $400,000, $500,000 has
23
24
         got the commercial designation. So over
25
         12 acres, most of which is either
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 floodplain, not reachable, not buildable. 3 They were reduced like 2 million from 8 million. This property, if they can get 4 a million dollars on their best day, 5 they're thrilled. 6 I will show you that. If you tell me that people did the right thing, 9 we won't go any further. But I think you 10 have to understand how this system of our 11 trying to represent our constituents 12 works, and that is -- you're the court of 13 last resort for us. We don't go over to the Board of Revision and ask them to 14 15 review something in advance and could they save people money. You work for the 16 17 City. They're an independent body. 18 So I would like the opportunity 19 to bring something in to you and you give 20 it a fresh review and -- with your senior 21 people. Give it to one of your senior 22 people. I don't care. I just think there's four or five cases that I've seen 23

where the facts are pretty clear and the

reductions are in order and could avoid

24

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         somebody spending a lot of money to go to
 3
         the Board of Revision of Taxes.
                                           Is that
 4
         okay?
 5
                                    Can we talk
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
         offline?
 6
                   COUNCILMAN O'NEILL:
                                         Yeah.
 8
         Sure.
 9
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                    Okay.
10
                   COUNCILMAN GREENLEE:
                                          Okay?
11
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                    Thank you.
12
                   COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: But it's
13
         okay?
                   If you don't do this, I don't
14
15
         want to burden you with something you
         don't do. If you don't do it -- I can go
16
         to the Water Commissioner, I can go to
17
18
         the Revenue Commissioner, I can go to the
         Finance Director with a kind of similar
19
20
         thing. And if I can't go to OPA, then I
21
         just want to know it, that's all, and I
22
         go back to those people and I'll say,
23
         Sorry, I did everything I could.
                                            I went
24
         right to the top of OPA, and OPA, if they
25
         looked at it and they studied it and they
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 concluded they were right in OPA's -- the 3 boss of OPA's opinion. So everybody else gets a review. 4 I've had water bills, \$50,000 5 too high. Councilman Henon has more of 6 it than I have where we have to deal with 8 people at the top to get them to understand that there's exceptions that 9 10 have to be looked at so people can stay 11 afloat. And we don't always get the 12 answer we expect, but we get the hearing and the consideration and the review that 13 14 we expect. That's all. I mean, I don't 15 have to go offline to find out whether you're willing to do that or not. 16 17 discussion will be offline, but I don't 18 expect to go offline to find out when 19 you're on the witness stand whether 20 you're willing to just hear one of my 21 cases. I've described a couple of them. It will be one of those. It won't be the 22 23 business guy. I don't care about that 24 too much in terms of priority, but the 25 little people, yes.

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                   We'll look at
 3
         it again, but the point I wanted to make
         was --
 5
                   COUNCILMAN O'NEILL:
                                         It's
         always the "but" that we look out for.
 6
                   MR. McKEITHEN: We set up a
 8
         process.
 9
                   COUNCILMAN O'NEILL:
         understand that.
10
11
                   MR. McKEITHEN: But I'll look
12
         at this particular case.
13
                   COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: I have a
14
         process in my office for handling simple
15
         constituent complaints, except there's
         always an exception to every process that
16
17
         I have to get into the weeds and deal
18
         with, because there are always
19
         exceptions. There's always exceptions.
         Otherwise we wouldn't have elected
20
21
         officials. We would just have everybody
22
         on a computer and everything would get --
23
         okay.
                That's it.
24
                   But anyway, so I look forward
25
         to it, and there are callbacks and we'll
```

	-
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	take care of this in time for callbacks,
3	if that's necessary.
4	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.
5	COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: Thank you.
6	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
7	you, Councilman. Thank you.
8	Councilman Squilla, you haven't
9	had a chance yet. I knew you'd be down
10	here.
11	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,
12	Mr. Chair.
13	Good afternoon.
14	MR. McKEITHEN: Good afternoon.
15	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Just to
16	follow up a little bit with Councilman
17	O'Neill's question. It is true that you
18	do review it again before it goes to the
19	BRT, so you get a chance to do that, but
20	that's after, especially these big cases,
21	after everybody spent a whole lot of
22	money preparing for the BRT case to get
23	it ready. So even though you call them
24	back later, say, Listen, you're going to
25	the BRT, we'll reduce it a little
1	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	further, will you take the deal, and then
3	they may take it or may not, but they
4	already have really engaged either an
5	attorney or got their property assessed,
6	especially if it was a larger valued
7	property. So that's the difference I
8	think, if you understand that part.
9	MR. McKEITHEN: I'm not saying
10	I don't understand it. I'm just saying
11	the process that we set up was set up so
12	we would it's like none other same
13	process everywhere else in the country.
14	We set it up for people to have an
15	opportunity to grieve with us and then to
16	grieve at the next level and then
17	ultimately to grieve in court. And so I
18	didn't want to have a situation where
19	everything that we looked at initially we
20	got to look at again, because that goes
21	outside the confines of us setting up an
22	initial process. But I understand.
23	COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: If I could
24	have a point of order, please.
25	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: I know

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	what you were going to say. Go ahead.
3	COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: The way
4	this sounded to me when you were setting
5	it up and the way it's sounding now
6	and I know it's not the case is that
7	somebody is going to get a chance to talk
8	to somebody. People don't get a chance
9	to present their case. It's done by
10	e-mail or in writing, and that's a
11	totally different thing than sitting down
12	with somebody and and I understand you
13	don't always have the time for it. But
14	when I talk to people, I thought for sure
15	they had a sit-down, they went over
16	things. Oh, no, no. They submitted some
17	stuff and the answer came back, and that
18	was it. And that is different than a
19	process of true review, because and I
20	understand because why, but when I'm
21	giving you five out of 60,000, I actually
22	find it disrespectful that somebody
23	wouldn't be willing to listen to five
24	cases out of 60,000 that might take a
25	half an hour if I did all five of them

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	and just explained them to you the way
3	that person wished they were able to
4	explain them to the assessor, but the
5	assessor doesn't have time and the system
6	doesn't handle it.
7	So I'm actually being a filter
8	for you, because I'm telling you that
9	59,995 cases look pretty good. These
10	five, could you take another look at. I
11	don't want to make this more than it is.
12	I don't want to sound like we have our
13	processes and we don't go outside. We
14	all go outside our processes when the
15	case calls for it. I just want to
16	present something to you that I think is
17	one or two or three of those cases.
18	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: An
19	unusual kind of case.
20	COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: I'm taking
21	Councilman Squilla's time.
22	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: That's
23	okay. You're excited. I don't want to
24	stop you.
25	COUNCILMAN O'NEILL: No, no.

- 1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 That's all right. 3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I have a 4 couple questions. 5 Basically the assessment process that was done was completed and 6 then you had the first-level review. First-level review is almost done for 8 9 everybody or is it now complete? 10 MR. McKEITHEN: We're 11 practically finished first-level review. We have 3,000 or less cases. 12 13 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: 14 thousand more to do? 15 MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. But we 16 could have -- as I stated earlier, we 17 could have been done with those cases, 18 but we had to jump in and handle the Board of Revision of Taxes cases. 19
 - yeah. We couldn't wait until you were
 done to start them or we would never get
 done, right?

20

MR. McKEITHEN: Well, we could have been done had we had -- we had an

COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well,

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	issue with scheduling, and so without us
3	having a schedule, we have to handle all
4	of the cases, as many as possible, versus
5	what we know will be scheduled and heard.
6	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Didn't you
7	meet with the BRT now to come up with an
8	arrangement for scheduling of cases in
9	the future?
10	MR. McKEITHEN: We met with
11	the the last time OPA met with the BRT
12	was it was about a month, maybe a
13	month and a half ago, but we still
14	haven't seen a schedule for six months.
15	We understand that they may be attempting
16	to put something together, but we still
17	haven't seen one.
18	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So you
19	want a six-month schedule out?
20	MR. McKEITHEN: We need a
21	six-month schedule, because in the
22	assessment field, you get that so you can
23	plan your activities around what's going
24	to be heard. So you can address the
25	other things that need to be addressed in

4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 1 2 the assessment profession. 3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So right now you're getting -- are you getting a 4 schedule a week ahead of time, two weeks 5 ahead of time? 6 MR. McKEITHEN: We have cases that are going -- we have a date or two 9 in May, but we don't have the actual 10 cases. So it fluctuates. We might get 11 them a month ahead of time. We might get 12 them a couple weeks ahead of time. 13 fluctuates. 14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Because 15 it's true too now that you guys are doing that and I think the BRT is now hopefully 16 17 coordinating with OPA, because as you do these cases, as they give you them, do 18 19 you review them again and maybe call the 20 resident and say, Well, listen, we can 21 lower this before you go into the BRT to

22

23

not have them go in front of the Board?

MR. McKEITHEN:

Well, typically

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	through and they filed a Board case,
3	we'll review it again and we'll see if
4	there's anything that we might have
5	missed. Oftentimes the biggest
6	difference is that we'll actually get a
7	field inspection. We'll get the
8	opportunity for the property owner to let
9	us in the property and we'll get to see
10	things that
11	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And will
12	you make a deal with them to maybe lower
13	their assessment before the BRT?
14	MR. McKEITHEN: If there is any
15	reduction that can be made, any
16	adjustment, we'll make it then, and
17	they'll determine whether they want to
18	withdraw their Board case or not.
19	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So have
20	you done that to date? Has there been
21	any cases where the OPA has actually
22	contacted the person who is going in
23	front of the BRT and actually made the
24	case so they didn't have to go?
25	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure. We've

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	had situations like that.
3	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So that
4	may really curtail or limit the number of
5	cases in front of the Board, correct?
6	MR. McKEITHEN: Well, once
7	again, that may, but we need what
8	would be more efficient, if we had the
9	schedule, we could reach out to those
10	people and
11	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I agree.
12	So now if you go out six months out and
13	you get to them and you make a deal with
14	them ahead of time, they may withdraw
15	five months earlier and then the BRT
16	could then schedule more people for those
17	days and have hearings.
18	MR. McKEITHEN: Possibly, yes.
19	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So we can
20	get through the number quicker, because
21	our goal is to get as many appeals heard
22	as possible.
23	MR. McKEITHEN: Now, I don't
24	want to speak for them and what they will
25	be able to do or not.

		161
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Point of	
3	information, please.	
4	MR. McKEITHEN: But I know that	
5	we'll be able to look at those properties	
6	ahead of time and possibly get them to	
7	withdraw from the BRT.	
8	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay.	
9	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: If we	
10	could go back around. Councilman Johnson	
11	is next anyway.	
12	Councilman Johnson.	
13	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Yes. I	
14	just want to also I want to piggyback	
15	off of what Councilman Squilla just said.	
16	So do you have actual data of	
17	residents who you contacted who received	
18	a decrease, right, and there was no need	
19	for them to go in front of BRT in terms	
20	of them appealing their taxes? Do we	
21	have that information documented of like	
22	how many per district?	
23	MR. McKEITHEN: We could get	
24	some data like that.	
25	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: If you	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	could provide that to the Chair, please.
3	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure.
4	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: And the
5	reason why, although this was Councilman
6	Squilla's statement, we meet countless
7	constituents who are in a holding
8	pattern. One, they're either waiting for
9	their response for, one, their appeal and
10	then, two, trying to figure out do you
11	move forward on their old assessment tax
12	bills.
13	Under my understanding, you
14	don't have to pay I think under
15	Councilman Squilla's last bill, you will
16	actually pay your old tax bill until you
17	find out if your tax bill has been
18	appealed I mean the ruling based upon
19	your appeal, correct?
20	MR. McKEITHEN: I believe
21	that's how it works. I can't speak to
22	any billing issues.
23	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: That's
24	correct.
25	Mr. Dubow, that's correct, am I

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         right, Mr. Dubow?
 3
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               Yeah. You don't
 4
         pay interest or penalties.
 5
                   COUNCILMAN JOHNSON:
                                        So we just
         hold off and pay the old one?
 6
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               In the end, you
         don't have to pay any interest and
9
         penalties on any amount.
10
                   COUNCILMAN JOHNSON:
                                         And so
         moving forward, you talk about processes,
11
12
         and there's a process for review based
13
         upon national standards, correct?
14
                   MR. McKEITHEN: Correct.
15
                   COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So in
         moving forward, what's going to be the
16
17
         exact process to make sure that the
18
         assessments -- and you talked about doing
19
         them yearly. That's still a
         possibility -- that we address the
20
21
         accuracy of the assessment. Like I'm
         glad my colleague from the Great
22
         Northeast talked about having some issues
23
24
         in his area, because primarily separate
25
         from Councilman Clarke and Squilla and
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	Blackwell, we know we're like bombarded
3	with this issue significantly because of
4	our increase in property values, but
5	nevertheless, you talk about processes of
6	review using national standards. Can you
7	lay out to Council and let's say we
8	move beyond the numbers at the BRT,
9	because you said I can't tell you what
10	we're going to do for 2015 until we find
11	out let's assume you have the numbers
12	from BRT. Let's lay out what these
13	yearly assessments will look like and
14	what will be the national best practices
15	that you will be using, because you
16	talked about national processes
17	MR. McKEITHEN: Right.
18	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: for
19	review. What are we going to be using
20	for the accuracy of the assessments
21	moving forward? I just want to give one
22	small example.
23	When we would hold town hall
24	meetings, not only in Point Breeze but in
25	other parts of my district, Southwest,

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	Center City, Graduate Hospital, some
3	parts of Packer Park, people would talk
4	about how there were inaccuracies on how
5	they believe that their houses were
6	actually assessed. So, for instance, a
7	homeowner 2000 block of Federal Street is
8	assessed at 400,000 on one side of the
9	street, but on the opposite side this
10	is a hypothetical scenario, but on the
11	opposite side of the street, at a lower
12	value, because we would see that
13	countless times, and those were the calls
14	we would receive.
15	Moving forward, though, because
16	it's already implemented, what are we
17	going to be doing to assure the accuracy
18	to address such type of issues moving
19	forward and your best practices? Because
20	you talked about you probably don't want
21	to review those five because we have a
22	process based upon a national standard
23	that we use for people to review their
24	case-by-case issues.
25	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure. In our

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	typical reassessment practice, we
3	constantly have periods where we review
4	things. After every step; for example,
5	when we do sales validation, we have
6	supervisors, and a lot of them are
7	sitting back here. They consistently
8	review what was done by their particular
9	units. We get down to our reassessments
10	and then we look at the reassessments
11	versus the sales and the current
12	assessments, and we have measurements.
13	And we went through a lot of this last
14	year when we talked about the
15	co-efficient of dispersion and all of
16	that and all the statistical measures.
17	So we have some very valid national
18	standards that we use, but I think the
19	key that you'll have in the next
20	reassessment that we talked about last
21	year was, the next reassessment will be
22	audited by someone that Council
23	recommends. We only ask that it's
24	someone that is IAAO and that's the
25	International Association of Assessing

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	Officers meets their standard.
3	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Is this
4	the property assessment consultant?
5	MR. McKEITHEN: The entire
6	reassessment will be audited, and then
7	you'll get a report on what they found
8	and their measurements and things like
9	that.
10	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So there's
11	an expense for a million dollars for
12	property assessments.
13	MR. McKEITHEN: No, no, no.
14	That's something different.
15	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So
16	elaborate on that property assessment
17	consultant. What is their job going to
18	be for a million dollars?
19	MR. McKEITHEN: That is for
20	someone to come in what I'd like to do
21	is enhance our system. I'd like to start
22	down a process of giving our system
23	things that you might not see now that
24	you can see in the future, and a good
25	example of that would be pictures of

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	properties, sketches of properties, some
3	of your more difficult properties. I'd
4	like to start down the path of one day
5	having a sketch and a picture for every
6	at least residential parcel throughout
7	the City, and that's for the consultant
8	to start that type of work.
9	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So the
10	million dollars is for? I'm trying to
11	wrap so this is one person, this is a
12	firm?
13	MR. McKEITHEN: It's a firm.
14	Typically it's a firm that will come out
15	and take a set of parcels. For example,
16	that we had 20,000 parcels, and I say,
17	Well, I want you to go out and measure
18	and sketch 20,000 residential parcels
19	throughout the City and take a snapshot.
20	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: How is
21	that separate from the actual assessors
22	who went out and did the assessment? How
23	will that be different moving forward?
24	MR. McKEITHEN: Well, the
25	assessors go out to capture

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	characteristics that are put in a model.
3	The firm
4	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: But the
5	million dollar firm will take pictures.
6	MR. McKEITHEN: will measure
7	and take pictures so I can do things like
8	load it up, possibly load it up in an
9	application and start down that process.
10	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So can't
11	you get a more experienced group of
12	assessors that would actually do both?
13	It seems like if one group is going out
14	to do characteristics, this group is
15	doing data collection I'm not going to
16	be smart and just say take pictures, but
17	data collections, which includes taking
18	pictures, that's two separate operations,
19	but it seems like doing somewhat of the
20	same thing.
21	MR. McKEITHEN: Somewhat, but
22	not all. You have to understand there
23	are certain skill sets in measuring
24	certain types of properties. Like we
25	have some very difficult properties here

	<u> </u>
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	in the City that have all types of
3	corners and things like that that I would
4	like to get measured and sketched and get
5	an actual snapshot of those parcels and
6	start down the process with those before
7	I start to spread it out citywide on a
8	citywide basis.
9	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: And just
10	one last thing. What's the actual dollar
11	amount that's going to be going into the
12	RFP for the upgrading of technology?
13	MR. McKEITHEN: I'd have to get
14	that for you.
15	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So we have
16	the million dollar number for the
17	snapshot, picture taking.
18	MR. McKEITHEN: The million
19	dollars is for a measurement, sketch, and
20	snapshot. The RFP is for an entire
21	system that will encompass a lot of that
22	within it possibly. We'll have to see.
23	COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Okay.
24	Thank you, Mr. Chair.
25	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	you. Thank you, Councilman.
3	If I could sneak one question
4	in here. In your first go-around with
5	Councilman Johnson, you talked about
6	you're particularly going to concentrate
7	on the reassessment where there was
8	activity. Is that a fair statement?
9	MR. McKEITHEN: I'm going to
10	concentrate on the whole City, but
11	normally what happens is that property
12	values won't change for areas where
13	there's no
14	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: No sales,
15	right?
16	MR. McKEITHEN: Right.
17	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: So you're
18	looking at sales.
19	MR. McKEITHEN: Where there
20	aren't sales that are higher than the
21	assessments.
22	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: But those
23	sales, you'll be raising the assessment
24	for where the property was sold, but
25	probably that whole block or that whole

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- 2 area?
- 3 MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah, that
- 4 entire area. Normally activity happens
- 5 in an area. So if an area gets hot; for
- 6 example, he mentioned Point Breeze. I'm
- 7 not saying everybody at Point Breeze will
- be -- so everybody don't call me today,
- 9 but if we hypothetically take Point
- 10 Breeze. If Point Breeze got extremely
- 11 hot and people start buying properties
- 12 and access --
- 13 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: It's
- there.
- 15 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: It didn't
- 16 get there. It's there.
- 17 MR. McKEITHEN: -- the current
- assessments, then those assessments will
- 19 have to go up.
- 20 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: For
- 21 everyone.
- MR. McKEITHEN: For everybody,
- yeah.
- 24 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE:
- 25 Councilwoman Reynolds Brown.

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	Thank you.	
3	Councilwoman.	
4	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Thank you,	
5	Mr. Chairman.	
6	Quick followup on the staffing	
7	issue and then I'm curious to hear more	
8	about the relationship between your	
9	office and the BRT.	
10	What specific qualifications or	
11	credentials are required, minimum, for	
12	the tax assessors?	
13	MR. PIPER: At this point what	
14	the City of Philadelphia has done is	
15	raised the level of qualification to at	
16	least that of what's required in the rest	
17	of the State of Pennsylvania. As of	
18	1992, you needed to be certified by the	
19	Pennsylvania State Board of Certified	
20	Real Estate Appraisers to be an assessor	
21	to do appraisals for tax purposes	
22	anywhere in Pennsylvania. Philadelphia	
23	and Pittsburgh were exempted from that	
24	originally. The exemption has been	
25	lifted from Pittsburgh, I want to say,	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	about eight or nine years ago, and we see
3	pending legislation all the time to lift
4	it from Philadelphia. We got ahead of
5	that and made it a requirement within the
6	City of Philadelphia. So within two
7	years of hire, an entry-level evaluator
8	has to have the same certification, the
9	CPE.
10	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: I see.
11	MR. PIPER: We've committed to
12	paying for that certification for the
13	courses needed, for the licensing fees,
14	and for the continuing education going
15	forward.
16	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Really?
17	MR. PIPER: Yes.
18	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Wow. With
19	that said, speak more thoroughly about
20	the relationship with the Board of
21	Revision of Taxes. And let me make sure
22	I understand. It's your responsibility
23	to do the assessment and it's their
24	responsibility to assess or evaluate,
25	examine all appeals, correct?

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MR. McKEITHEN: Right. We set
3	the actual assessments. We set the
4	values for the assessments and then we
5	have a review process called the first
6	level. But when a formal appeal is
7	filed, it's handled by the Board of
8	Revision of Taxes, and the Board of
9	Revision of Taxes has to give us a
10	schedule to say on May 2nd, 20 cases are
11	filed and these are the addresses.
12	Without the addresses, we don't know what
13	to prepare for.
14	Now, in an assessment industry,
15	once the appeals are filed and everything
16	is laid out, you get a schedule of at
17	least several months as to what is going
18	to occur on what date. Because of the
19	issue with how many cases and things like
20	that that the Board will hear, we haven't
21	been able to garnish that schedule. So
22	I'm having to prepare for everything
23	that's filed, not knowing when it's going
24	to be heard, which removes me from any
25	ability to do any work for next year's

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	reassessment.
3	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: I see.
4	Okay. Speak now to the relationship with
5	the Sheriff Department. Speaking
6	actually with a staffer of the Sheriff
7	Department, their number of evictions has
8	upticked, and they are not sure of the
9	they don't want to say that it's an exact
10	consequence of what we're going through
11	with regards to OPA, but they expect to
12	once they come to offer testimony. So
13	what is the current working relationship
14	with the Sheriff Department?
15	MR. McKEITHEN: We haven't
16	heard anything from we haven't heard
17	anything from the Sheriff Department. We
18	heard a lot of theories on the fact that
19	AVI has caused this, that, and the other,
20	but we haven't naturally we don't
21	think that all of them are necessarily,
22	but we haven't heard anything from the
23	Sheriff Department.
24	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay.
25	Since the money collected through the

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	property taxes is critically important
3	for the funding of the schools, what
4	method do you use to project revenue
5	accurately considering the appeals, the
6	LOOP program, and the senior tax freezes?
7	(Witness approached witness
8	table.)
9	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Hello.
10	MR. DUBOW: OPA actually
11	doesn't have anything to do with the tax
12	revenue projections. Those come from
13	Budget working with Revenue, and in
14	building the budget, we made an
15	assumption about the level of appeals and
16	actually how long they would take and
17	made assumptions about how many
18	homesteads there would be.
19	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Stop right
20	there, as Steve Harvey would say. And so
21	did your presumptions stack up to the new
22	reality we're reckoning with?
23	MR. DUBOW: So the original
24	assumptions did not. We modified them
25	for this year's Plan. We assumed that

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	appeals would be heard more quickly than
3	they were. So we've adjusted that
4	assumption now and we assumed that
5	appeals will really go through the end of
6	next fiscal year. If they go longer than
7	that, that will create kind of a hole for
8	our budget.
9	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: And is it
10	fair to assume that those assumptions
11	were made in collaboration with the
12	office that is principally responsible
13	for, Revenue and OPA, for hitting those
14	targets as you just described them?
15	MR. DUBOW: So we talked to OPA
16	about kind of what a typical level of
17	appeals would be and what typical results
18	of appeals would be, but they didn't
19	have they weren't involved in actually
20	putting the projections together. We use
21	them kind of as experts to help us frame
22	what the projections would be, but they
23	didn't have anything to do with the
24	projections.
25	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. And

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         so are you surprised at what we know now
 3
         to be the case?
                   MR. DUBOW: I think that doing
 5
         570,000 new assessments and getting
 6
         22,000 appeals isn't that surprising.
                                                 Ι
         mean, it's not a larger number than we
 8
         anticipated. I think we're surprised at
         how long it's taking, but I think there
 9
10
         may be some progress on that front.
11
                   COUNCILWOMAN BROWN:
                                         Okay.
12
         bell has rung, so we'll honor the bell.
13
                   COUNCILMAN GREENLEE:
                                          Thank
14
         you, Councilwoman.
15
                   Councilman Henon.
16
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
17
         Mr. Chairman.
                   Mr. Dubow, if you would,
18
19
         please. So just going over quickly some
         numbers from the union electrician, now
20
21
         elected official who represents the 6th
         District. So my numbers may be off a
22
23
         little bit. But taking a look at -- just
24
         going back to as we started the process
25
         with AVI and shift from commercial to
```

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- 2 residential, and I'm reading off of a
- 3 chart, so just from what the chart is.
- 4 So commercial seen a decrease in tax
- 5 revenues of \$55 million and the burden
- 6 shifted over to residential and like \$71
- 7 million in revenues as far as --
- MR. DUBOW: There was a shift.
- 9 COUNCILMAN HENON: So there was
- a shift, and I think we all agreed upon
- 11 that.
- MR. DUBOW: Yes.
- COUNCILMAN HENON: By the way,
- I want to state for the record I also
- 15 think that we all agreed that the system
- 16 was broken and it needed to be reassessed
- 17 and we needed to have a fair and
- 18 equitable system.
- MR. DUBOW: And we attempted to
- 20 put some protections in on the
- 21 residential side.
- 22 COUNCILMAN HENON: And the
- 23 responsible protections are in. And
- right now we're tweaking some of these
- 25 things responsibly.

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	So my question is, so just from
3	my review of the FLRs initial results, we
4	have a decrease approximately of real
5	property of like a billion dollars,
6	right? So how is that how do we make
7	up that money in the overall aggregate
8	come this year? Is it going to be
9	through the 3 to 3 and a half percent
10	increase of property values? How do we
11	make up that kind of money when and
12	what's concerning with me is the trend of
13	the reviews. Sixteen percent of the
14	reviews were only in favor of where the
15	burden was shifted towards residents, and
16	the commercial end of it was in excess of
17	40 to 50 percent in favor of commercial
18	and industrial and stores and things like
19	that. And I get some of the small
20	businesses and everything. I mean, I'm
21	sure they're valid outcomes, which is
22	great, but it just seems like there's
23	such a large disparity. And let me get
24	back to my original question. How do we
25	make up that rate?

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   MR. McKEITHEN: Can I start on
 3
         why, if I may.
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               That's fine.
 5
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                   Part of the
         reason you're seeing that difference in
 6
         the shift is because when a commercial
         first level is heard, we're now getting
 8
 9
         the information that we asked for prior
10
         to the reassessment. And so people tend
11
         to come in and give you income and
12
         expense documents, rent rolls and things
13
         like that. In Pennsylvania, you don't
14
         have to give that prior to a
15
         reassessment. In other states you do.
         So we're making those types of
16
17
         adjustments once we actually get the
         documentation, the documentation that we
18
19
         ask for up front in hand, but go ahead.
20
                   MR. DUBOW: So we had the
21
         results of most of those first-level
22
         reviews as we were putting the budget
         together so that that level of change is
23
24
         actually already built into the budget.
25
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                       So it's
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	already built into the budget?
3	MR. DUBOW: Yes.
4	COUNCILMAN HENON: So we don't
5	have to make up whatever calculation that
6	is for the revenue that we for the
7	overall aggregate? So if we have \$1.3
8	billion in property revenue coming in and
9	we have a decrease of several millions
10	MR. DUBOW: So that's built
11	into the budget. If the BRT appeals go
12	differently from how we projected in the
13	budget, that's either going to be an
14	increase or a loss against the budget,
15	and then we'd have to look at how to make
16	up for that. But this part we've already
17	accounted for, first-level reviews.
18	COUNCILMAN HENON: Maybe when
19	we catch up maybe offline, you can at
20	another time.
21	My other question I know we
22	have a lot, so I want to at least get my
23	two questions in on this. It was more of
24	the bigger concern that I've had
25	question.

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 And the other one is when we're 3 talking about the amount for homestead. So there was -- to my calculation, we 4 have roughly about 70,000 qualified 5 homeowners who have not either applied or 6 were granted homestead. I think applied. MR. DUBOW: Yeah. I think it 8 9 may be a little more than that. I think about 90. 10 11 COUNCILMAN HENON: It's about 12 90. So 90,000 Philadelphians who were 13 eligible for homestead exemptions have 14 not filled out their paperwork --15 MR. DUBOW: Right. 16 COUNCILMAN HENON: -- for 17 review. 18 Do we know how many of them are seniors? Because that's a concern. 19 20 That's a concern of mine and if you were 21 collaborating with the Mayor's Office of 22 Aging, because I think the number -although the senior tax freeze increased, 23 I think that's the ongoing continued 24 25 pressure of the combination of

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 Councilmembers and their district and 3 knowing them, as well as OPA and some of the grassroots efforts we have trying to 4 communicate with our senior groups. 5 I'm just becoming increasingly concerned 6 7 that a large portion of those 90,000 are seniors. 8 9 MS. DRAYER: Well, we did have 10 the -- of the 232,000 that were approved, 2,046 were approved through the senior 11 12 tax freeze. So that's something that we could continue to work with Revenue as 13 14 far as the people that they have enrolled 15 in the program, but --COUNCILMAN HENON: 16 And T 17 think -- and I said this last year at last year's budget. I mean, we're an old 18 19 city. I mean, we're on old commonwealth. 20 But as far as the City is concerned, I 21 mean, I have 55 percent of my district is 22 55 and older, and that was a few years ago. So as we move forward -- and there 23 24 was only a small part of the City seniors 25 that were receiving any kind of services

	100
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	that we provide. So I'm just concerned
3	that we in addition to the senior
4	freeze, that they haven't filled out
5	their homestead exemption, and for some
6	reason, I don't know if it's bad service
7	or what, we just need to target the
8	seniors a little more aggressively I
9	think with the remaining homestead
10	opportunities that we have.
11	MS. DRAYER: I agree.
12	COUNCILMAN HENON: Great.
13	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
14	you.
15	Actually, while you're there,
16	is there any other targeted group that
17	you might be looking at to try to find
18	those other homestead applicants?
19	MS. DRAYER: Well, based on the
20	way that we've been able to map it,
21	knowing the approvals and then the people
22	that we believe are eligible but have not
23	yet applied, there's definitely I think a
24	language barrier.
25	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: I was

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- just going to ask about the language,
- 3 yeah.
- 4 MS. DRAYER: So we had created
- 5 materials in several other languages as
- 6 well as our call center, which callers
- 7 can conduct a call in any language. But
- 8 I think now that we kind of can isolate
- 9 this population of people who haven't
- 10 applied, as well as I think more
- 11 low-income residents that could certainly
- benefit from this, I think we'll be able
- 13 to direct our efforts to them.
- 14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: So you're
- 15 still looking at that kind of stuff.
- MS. DRAYER: Even more.
- 17 Correct.
- 18 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.
- 19 Thank you.
- 20 Councilman Squilla.
- 21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,
- 22 Mr. Chair.
- During the appeal process, I
- know you guys have the assessors going
- out. Now, when they go, does the BRT use

		100
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	assessors to determine what they think	
3	the value is?	
4	MR. McKEITHEN: Okay. When we	
5	have BRT hearings, they may ask us to go	
6	out and make an inspection or they may	
7	ask us what we think about the property.	
8	Is that what you mean?	
9	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Yes.	
10	MR. McKEITHEN: I mean, they'll	
11	ask	
12	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So they	
13	don't really have their own assessors.	
14	They just go by what you tell them, why	
15	you came up with this particular	
16	assessment?	
17	MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. Our ask,	
18	how we came up with a value, we'll	
19	explain it. We give comparables, and	
20	then they ask certain questions of us and	
21	they appeal it.	
22	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Right now	
23	I guess are you in the process of what	
24	is the date we will receive new	
25	assessments for next year?	

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	MR. McKEITHEN: If you got new
3	assessments next year, it would be
4	February, the week of February 15th. It
5	would be mid February.
6	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: The same?
7	MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. My goal
8	is to have them come out every year at
9	the same time. That way people get
10	familiar with when this happens.
11	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So next
12	year around February 15th we should get
13	most of the everybody will get new
14	assessments? Because I know
15	MR. McKEITHEN: If your
16	assessment changes, you'll get if we
17	have a reassessment, okay, that's the
18	first thing. But if we do, if your
19	assessment changes, then you'll get a
20	notice. If it doesn't change, you won't
21	get a notice.
22	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Last year
23	at the budget weren't we told that you're
24	going to reassess the City every year?
25	MR. McKEITHEN: That was the

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         goal, but that was prior to us having
 3
         things occur such as the situation with
 4
         the Board.
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
 5
                                         Right.
 6
         Well, we didn't believe it last year
7
         either, so...
                                    Well, I tried.
 8
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
 9
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: It would
10
         have been impossible. If you did it --
11
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                    Some things are
12
         out of my control. I tried.
13
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: -- you may
14
         have been flying around the room if you
15
         were able to do that.
16
                   So if they do get reassessed
17
         next year, it would be just changes.
18
         right now you're concentrating I guess
19
         just on the appeals at this point?
20
                   MR. McKEITHEN: Right. All I
21
         can do right now is just address the
         appeals, because I don't know what's
22
         scheduled for when going forward in
23
24
         enough time, and so all I can do is just
25
         address appeals.
```

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
 3
         you're not actively going out reassessing
         anywhere in the City this year?
 4
                   MR. McKEITHEN: No. We haven't
 5
 6
         done anything reassessment-wise yet for
         next year.
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
                                         So our
 9
         goal at this point moving forward is in
10
         2015, very unlikely will there be many
11
         changes to assessments?
12
                   MR. McKEITHEN: Going forward,
13
         period. Now that we've done AVI, I doubt
14
         very seriously that -- and our initial
15
         goal was for every neighborhood that
16
         because the assessments were so
17
         drastically different from what they were
18
         selling for, but now that we're closer,
         only the areas that are significantly, I
19
20
         would say, moving will actually see a lot
21
         of increases, because our assessments, if
22
         they hold true and the market doesn't
23
         move rampantly -- and I doubt very
         seriously it moves like it did in the
24
25
         early 2000's -- short of that happening,
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 the assessments and the sale prices in a 3 lot of areas will still be pretty much the same and we won't have to make any 4 5 changes in those areas. 6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So there's not going to be -- I know like last year 8 the goal was to do it every year, do the 9 whole City every year. 10 MR. McKEITHEN: Right. 11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: That was 12 the goal, which was really hard to reach. 13 And then we had thought maybe is it 14 possible to do assessments if you're 15 going to be citywide to go through and assess certain areas that you can do. 16 17 Maybe every four years you would get reassessed depending on there. 18 19 MR. McKEITHEN: No. See, we 20 can't do it that way. When I say we're 21 doing a reassessment, that means the entire City is being looked at, but only 22 23 the areas that need changes will change. 24 We can't just look at one area and not 25 look at the entire City. Any time we do

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         a reassessment, it will be a
 3
         comprehensive citywide reassessment, so
         no one will unfairly not be looked at
 4
         versus someone else.
 5
 6
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
                                         So unless
         you do a citywide reassessment, nobody
         will be changed.
 8
 9
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                    That's right.
10
         Unless they have things like new
11
         construction or tear down or some
12
         significant permanent work or
13
         subdivision, things like that, nobody
14
         will be changed.
15
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right.
16
         Because it would be illegal to do just --
17
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                   It would be
18
         illegal to just itemize someone out just
         because their area was hot and not
19
20
         attempt to get the rest of the City.
21
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right.
22
         At this point I know the question was
23
         asked before, but out of the, I guess,
24
         people that go to the BRT or have
25
         appealed to the BRT, do you know how many
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 people you were able to change before it 3 got to the Board at this point? MR. McKEITHEN: We'd have to 5 get that. That's a similar report that Mr. --6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Johnson asked? 8 9 MR. McKEITHEN: -- Councilman 10 Johnson asked. So we'd have to get that 11 for you. 12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay. Can I ask more? I'll come 13 back? 14 15 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: If you 16 could, because we have people that lined 17 up again. Councilman Goode. 18 19 COUNCILMAN GOODE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. 20 21 Quick question for the record. 22 During the assessment process, do you 23 know if a property is tax abated or in 24 proximity to another property that's tax

abated?

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 MR. McKEITHEN: We'll know if 3 there is an abatement on the property. I'll have to ask Mr. Piper to come up and 4 talk about that, but I don't know that we 5 know if it's near something that has an 6 abatement. (Witness approached witness table.) 9 So if you're asking 10 MR. PIPER: 11 about a specific property, we can find 12 out if the --COUNCILMAN GOODE: During the 13 14 assessment process in general as 15 properties were assessed, did you know 16 whether a property was tax abated or in 17 proximity to another property that was tax abated? 18 19 MR. PIPER: No. 20 COUNCILMAN GOODE: So you do 21 not know the effect of tax-abated 22 properties on the value of other 23 properties? 24 MR. McKEITHEN: No. We wouldn't know that, I'll be honest. 25 When

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	we do a reassessment, we're just looking
3	at properties that have sold, the current
4	market versus the current assessments,
5	and if a property has an abatement, its
6	assessment will increase. But as far as
7	what is located by a property being
8	located something with an abatement, we
9	wouldn't pay that any
10	COUNCILMAN GOODE: Have you
11	heard the contention that tax-abated
12	properties have land values that are
13	lower than they should be?
14	MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. I've
15	heard some contention about land values
16	in general, but yes. And that's
17	something that we were looking to look to
18	address going forward. We knew that we
19	had gotten questions about the land, and
20	so we knew in some areas we had to look
21	at that.
22	COUNCILMAN GOODE: So exactly
23	how will you handle the analysis of how
24	tax-abated properties affect the
25	assessment system in terms of the

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	properties themselves and/or their
3	proximity to tax-abated properties?
4	MR. McKEITHEN: If a property
5	has an abatement, typically it will have
6	a different condition code, because
7	oftentimes those are newer properties.
8	And so its condition code will be
9	different relative to everything else on
10	the particular block. And so generally
11	speaking, going forward, we'll make sure
12	that those properties have a condition
13	code that they warrant and hypothetically
14	they would normally have a higher
15	assessment, hypothetically. It depends
16	on the market, but typically they would
17	have a higher assessment.
18	Now, things that are around it,
19	you know, we don't do any analysis on
20	what's around it, because every property
21	stands on its own. And so we don't do an
22	analysis on whether a property had an
23	abatement and what's around it. We just
24	do whether that individual property's
25	value was what it could sell for and

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	whether it's equalized, whether it makes
3	sense relative to the rest of the block.
4	COUNCILMAN GOODE: You've
5	worked in other jurisdictions where there
6	was a tax abatement program?
7	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure.
8	COUNCILMAN GOODE: And did you
9	see an impact of the tax abatement
10	program on the value of properties?
11	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure.
12	Richmond, Virginia is a good example.
13	They had a very active abatement program
14	and it was targeted, though, in areas
15	that they wanted to revitalize.
16	COUNCILMAN GOODE: It was done
17	right?
18	MR. McKEITHEN: And so it was
19	very effective as far as getting those
20	areas back up to par, that and the
21	market.
22	COUNCILMAN GOODE: So the
23	policy was strategic?
24	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure. Yes,
25	sir. And they even since I left I've

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	been gone for almost ten years now
3	they have taken it away from areas that
4	they felt they reduced the amount of
5	the abatement for certain properties.
6	COUNCILMAN GOODE: Okay. Thank
7	you.
8	Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
9	COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
10	you, Councilman.
11	Councilwoman Reynolds Brown.
12	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Yes.
13	Forgive me for beating a dead horse on
14	this staffing matter, but I have a couple
15	of ideas that I have to work on after I
16	get additional information.
17	What are the minimum
18	requirements prior to enrolling in the
19	certification program?
20	MR. McKEITHEN: Ms. Daniel will
21	come up and share those.
22	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Sure. The
23	general skill set that one should come to
24	the table with prior to enrolling in the
25	program.

```
1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
```

- 2 (Witness approached witness
- 3 table.)
- 4 MS. DANIEL: The position is,
- 5 as you know, a Civil Service position, so
- 6 the specs on that job, it's three
- qualifiers. One is to have a Bachelor's
- 8 degree.
- 9 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: A
- 10 Bachelor's degree? That is required,
- okay.
- MS. DANIEL: That's one
- 13 qualification. A Bachelor's degree and
- one year of experience in the real estate
- industry. And I think -- I'm not sure of
- the exact specifics, but I think it's
- 17 like in a bank or mortgage company or
- 18 something like that.
- The other is, I think, six
- 20 years with a jurisdiction. This is no
- 21 degree, and it's six years in another
- taxing jurisdiction like ours. I think
- that's six years. And then the other
- is six years as a salesperson, and that's
- 25 also without a degree.

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- 2 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Without a
- 3 degree?
- 4 MS. DANIEL: Without. So there
- 5 are three qualifiers. One is with a
- 6 degree and one year experience and the
- 7 other is very specific either real estate
- 8 experience or taxing jurisdiction
- 9 experience.
- 10 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Okay. All
- 11 right, then. That's helpful. Thank you.
- The last question I have here,
- we have gotten -- my office has gotten a
- 14 number of cases around vacant land. Can
- 15 you share with us how vacant land is
- 16 assessed and what factors are considered
- in the final assessment, number one? And
- number two, point me in the direction of
- the staffer, professional, that handles
- 20 subdivides. What do you call it?
- MR. PIPER: Subdivisions.
- 22 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Thank you
- very much.
- MR. McKEITHEN: All right. The
- 25 staffer that handled subdivisions is

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 Vincent Battestelli. So we'll get you --3 Vincent Battestelli, Jr. is an individual who handles subdivisions, but if you send 4 us something, we'll get whatever you need 5 down to him. 6 Vacant land was looked at with a model that was for residential 9 specifically, was looked at with a model 10 that was provided by Dr. Gillen. 11 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Doctor? 12 MR. McKEITHEN: Dr. Kevin 13 Gillen. He helped us with that. And the 14 theory of his model was that vacant 15 land -- well, land values should be looked at not just whether they're vacant 16 but whether they're improved or not. 17 18 so sales were looked at starting from 19 Center City and moving out towards the actual neighborhoods, and he devised 20 21 rates based on sales for, I think, like a five-year period and time-adjusted them 22 23 to determine what any particular rate 24 should be for any particular area. 25 then after that, we looked at them to try

```
4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 1
 2
         to make sure that they were as equitable
 3
         as possible.
                   Our biggest problem with vacant
 4
         land going forward -- and we've already
 5
         worked on some of this -- is issues with
 6
         the zoning. When you're looking at
         vacant land, you want to look at what
 9
         it's zoned, and he has a theory, and I
10
         would somewhat agree, that if you can get
         a zoning variance with no problem, then
11
12
         zoning really doesn't have as much of an
         effect as it normally would, and that's a
13
         big challenge.
14
15
                   Commercially speaking, we
         looked at sales starting in -- depending
16
17
         on what type of property it was, what
         type of vacant site it was, whether it's
18
19
         industrial, retail, downtown commercial,
         and we looked at what has sold over the
20
21
         last couple years and devised rates based
22
         on those sales.
23
                   COUNCILWOMAN BROWN:
                                         Okay.
                                                So,
24
         lastly, given this one-year -- given,
25
         first of all, that you had a tall
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	mountain to climb, unprecedented in
3	nature, and so there are a lot of lessons
4	learned when it's the first time out the
5	door. What top three lessons learned arm
6	you for what you do differently going
7	forward?
8	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure. Time
9	is we like to attempt to get the
10	maximum amount of effort out of our time
11	going forward, which is why I keep
12	discussing this issue with the Board, not
13	being able to plan. Once again, our
14	processes have been greatly enhanced from
15	what we were doing in the past to what
16	we're doing now and what we will be doing
17	in the future. And our resources,
18	getting the people.
19	COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Lack
20	thereof.
21	MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. Getting
22	the people. One good person can do the
23	work of three that aren't working as
24	well, and if I can continue I don't
25	want to just infuse my office with people

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         for the sake of having bodies.
                                          I want
 3
         people to be intelligent, knowledgeable,
         credentialed, and come in willing to work
 4
         and ready to work. And those are the
 5
         three things that I think gear us toward
 6
         success going forward, continuing
                   And I'll go so far as to say we
 8
         success.
 9
         had a monumental challenge, I think
         people don't really realize, coming --
10
11
                   COUNCILWOMAN BROWN:
                                         To scale.
12
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                    Yeah, coming
13
         from never having doing assessments
14
         comprehensively citywide at all, going to
15
         100 percent of market value.
                                        That has
         never been done before, and educating
16
17
         people on the process and things like
18
         that versus us now already having a
19
         certain knowledge base, experience.
         even as a city with the citizens and
20
21
         everyone having a certain knowledge base
22
         of how this thing works will go
         monumentally towards our next
23
24
         reassessment, whenever that is.
25
                   COUNCILWOMAN BROWN:
                                         Okay.
```

```
1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
```

- Well, thank you. I would not want to
- 3 walk in your shoes. It's important work.
- 4 MR. McKEITHEN: I got rough
- 5 shoes, yeah. It's the roughest
- 6 assignment. It's really rewarding, but
- 7 it's a very rough assignment. But I
- 8 cherish it, I mean, because what we've
- 9 done here is historical.
- 10 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Yes, it
- 11 is.
- MR. McKEITHEN: And I'm very
- proud of what we've been able to do and
- people sitting behind me who work blood,
- 15 guts, and glory every day to get this
- done for everyone.
- 17 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: Sure.
- MR. McKEITHEN: Thank you for
- 19 your support.
- 20 COUNCILWOMAN BROWN: You're
- 21 welcome.
- Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
- 23 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
- 24 you, Councilwoman.
- 25 Councilman Henon.

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- 2 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,
- 3 Mr. Chairman.
- 4 Sounds like a movie.
- 5 MR. McKEITHEN: It looks like
- 6 one some days.
- 7 COUNCILMAN HENON: We should be
- 8 talking to some producers, and we can
- 9 make it here. We can make it here.
- 10 And I know this is historic.
- 11 You're doing a total reassessment. And I
- think as Councilman O'Neill has said and
- other Councilmembers, you have a
- tremendous amount of work that you have
- 15 done and need to continue to do. So I
- 16 commend everybody that's been working
- 17 real hard dealing with people like us,
- drilling you, but we're in response to
- 19 the citizens.
- 20 MR. McKEITHEN: Sure. I
- 21 understand.
- 22 COUNCILMAN HENON: So I think
- 23 that you're doing a great job.
- One of the things that I sat
- and thinking about as we're reassessing

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         the entire City is how this kind of
 3
         communication is being used to our
         advantage. Are we using this opportunity
 4
         to update the contact information from
 5
         the owners and particularly vacant and
 6
         commercial property where there's
         misclassification, there's vacant
 9
         property or abandoned property? Some
10
         properties could be commercial since 1968
         and here there's multi -- it's a
11
12
         multi-residential unit.
13
                   So are we using this
14
         opportunity to update our contact
15
         information as a city since we have the
         technology and we have the, for all
16
17
         intents and purposes, the feet on the
18
         street?
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
19
                                    We share
20
         information with other departments.
                                               Ι
21
         think the Streets Department is one.
22
                   MR. PIPER:
                                Streets, Revenue.
23
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                    Streets,
24
         Revenue.
                   So as we gain data -- we go out
25
         in the field, we gain data, and every
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	time we do a reassessment that involves
3	field inspections, our data gets better.
4	Other departments' data gets better also.
5	So it's sort of a spillover effect. So
6	we share that information as efficiently
7	as we possibly can to everyone.
8	COUNCILMAN HENON: And my
9	follow-up question to that was as we get
10	the new value and by the way of
11	first-level review or some of the
12	assessors that are out on the street, do
13	you communicate with other departments,
14	and you said yes. And hopefully when you
15	give it to Revenue, we can get the tax
16	delinquencies that are out there,
17	especially with vacant land.
18	Viewed as separate groups now,
19	does the accepted and rejected FLRs share
20	common traits, like housing types, lot
21	size, location, use? And I'm getting
22	somewhere with this. So do they all
23	share some commonalities as a result of
24	the first-level reviews? People
25	separately now think they're rejected and

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	cases that are rejected and cases that
3	have a positive outcome, I mean, are
4	there commonalities in traits that are
5	similar that you could see as we frame a
6	model moving forward for the reassessment
7	so when you go back out and assess again?
8	MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. We have
9	some common issues that and as I spoke
10	last year, I stated to Councilman Squilla
11	and Councilman Johnson that we learn a
12	lot during the first-level process.
13	That's why we go through it, because we
14	get an opportunity oftentimes, not every
15	time but oftentimes, to share information
16	with the taxpayer about their particular
17	properties. And so the things that we
18	learn in this particular process will go
19	a long way. And I would belabor and have
20	one of my assistant administrators come
21	up, but I don't they can tell you that
22	we learn a lot of things that we can
23	infuse into the next reassessment. It's
24	a constant learning process.
25	COUNCILMAN HENON: So we're

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 adjusting the fee to the models moving 3 forward? We're adjusting 4 MR. McKEITHEN: the characteristics of the property, and 5 we know when a model performs better than 6 in other places and we know where we will have to make adjustments. 9 COUNCILMAN HENON: Now, would 10 you anticipate fewer appeals next time out due to these adjustments, 11 12 hypothetically? 13 MR. McKEITHEN: Hypothetically, that's a key word, because I don't want 14 15 to prod everybody to just think that they should just go out -- but, yes, I knew 16 17 just from an experience background that we would have a lot of appeals. Now, we 18 19 got less than what an industry might say 20 is typical for even doing something like 21 this, which is well over 10 percent when 22 we got under that first level. Overall, 23 I don't think that we may ever get this 24 many, but I don't want to, you know, poke 25 at the hornet's nest, so to speak, and

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         think people -- encourage people to
 3
         appeal just because I said that.
         Historically or hypothetically, you won't
 4
         get as many appeals because the values --
 5
 6
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                       It's the
         initial.
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                    Right.
 9
         again, the market rarely will move in a
10
         great fashion and people will see that
11
         their assessment is what they think they
12
         could get for it.
13
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: So the COD
14
         is a measure of the overall uniformity of
15
         the model, right?
16
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                    Yes.
17
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: Are there
         ways to test the uniformity in
18
19
         neighborhoods?
20
                   MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah.
                                           We can
21
         do -- or what we're attempting to do
         going forward is look at CODs throughout
22
23
         the particular GMAs through the
24
         neighborhoods. And so as we do the next
25
         reassessment, we will set up things so we
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	can look at CODs in those particular
3	areas.
4	COUNCILMAN HENON: Have any of
5	these areas that identified where the
6	model seems particularly error prone and
7	where we might take a look at some of
8	these outside circumstances to what is
9	happening to to my colleague's point
10	over here, there are some outside
11	circumstances that would tend to, I
12	guess, influence an error or influence
13	another outcome in a positive way.
14	MR. McKEITHEN: Sure. And
15	that's what I was speaking of when I was
16	saying I haven't been able to get to the
17	reassessment work that I normally would
18	because we are only addressing appeals.
19	Once the appeals get settled and we can
20	get a handle on them and the schedule and
21	things like that, then we'll be more
22	readily available to doing some analysis
23	to see what's going on in particular
24	areas going forward.
25	COUNCILMAN HENON: But I think

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 you phrased it as outliners, right? 3 MR. McKEITHEN: Right. Well, 4 we look at outliners and we want to look at typically what is the core of any 5 particular area. So we'll be able to do 6 more of those things if we could get to 8 our annual assessment work, but just 9 can't right now. 10 COUNCILMAN HENON: Got to get 11 through all these appeals first. 12 MR. McKEITHEN: Got to get a 13 schedule, got to get through the appeals. 14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank 15 you, Councilman. 16 Councilman Squilla. 17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you, Mr. Chair. 18 19 Two things. One, you had said about hopefully you will assess areas 20 21 that are hot, that are going to change. 22 You do the whole city, but you're looking 23 at them. How about areas that are declining? 24 25 MR. McKEITHEN: Those too.

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- 2 Those will be areas that we would look
- 3 at. We're going to look at anything that
- 4 is not at, for example, hypothetically,
- 5 97 percent of market value or has a COD
- 6 outside of the realm of what's
- 7 acceptable. So those are areas that will
- 8 be declining. Those are areas that are
- 9 increasing as well.
- 10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So you
- 11 would have to -- somehow you have it
- 12 broken down into quadrants?
- MR. McKEITHEN: Right. We have
- it broken down into -- we'll set up our
- 15 system if we can look at it from a GMA
- 16 perspective.
- 17 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: That's
- 18 small, though, right?
- MR. McKEITHEN: Right, that's
- small, and we'll branch it out and then
- 21 we'll do citywide for all particular
- types of properties.
- 23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: But you
- haven't figured that out yet at this
- 25 point?

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                   Right.
 3
         can't do any of that work until we get
         through these appeals.
 4
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
 5
                                        And I know
 6
         we had asked for that report.
                                         If you can
         break that down by district, the report
 8
         about the appeals --
 9
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                   Okay.
10
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: -- that
11
         would be great.
12
                   Now, when we go and we talk
13
         with the PRA and VPRC and we're trying to
14
         look at the land values and values of
15
         properties, is there a reason why our
         City departments don't use OPA and they
16
17
         say OPA values are wrong?
18
                                   Well, they may
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
         look at -- what another department looks
19
20
         at and how they analyze what they look at
21
         and why might be different from what
22
         we're doing. We're an agency that looks
23
         at things for tax purposes and we have
24
         certain, as I was stating earlier,
25
         guidelines and things like that that we
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 have to consider. Other agencies; for example, in any given city, a 3 Redevelopment Authority might be looking 4 at land, but they might be looking at it 5 for what they want to develop it for, not 6 for its current highest and best use. And these are where some of the 9 differences can come in. And so, you 10 know, people don't understand that, by and large, and they might say that, Well, 11 12 OPA and the assessor's office should have this value because this is what we have 13 14 on it. Well, you have to understand that we have to look at things from our 15 professional perspective on what we do, 16 17 which is mass appraisal. And we're going to look at the current use, the highest 18 19 and best use, and we're going to look at 20 things that have sold, not what a 21 developer said he would be willing to pay 22 for it but hasn't yet, things like that. 23 So those are areas where some of the differences come in, and that's where we 24 have a lot of the void. 25

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I mean, it
 3
         seems like when we go -- because we have
         that issue now, we're selling a lot of
 4
         City-owned properties and going through,
 5
         and it seems like -- we say, Well, how
 6
         much is it worth? We look it up on OPA,
 8
         and they say, No, it's not worth that,
 9
         it's worth a lot more than that. And so,
10
         I mean, that's a concern to us too,
11
         because if it is worth more than that
12
         and --
13
                   MR. McKEITHEN: Can I give you
14
         a good example of that?
15
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
                                         Yeah.
                                   A great example
16
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
17
         would be a school. A school on our books
         right now is a vacant school. It's
18
19
         bricks, it's mortar, it's this amount of
20
         square feet, and it's in terrible
21
         condition. But when a development
22
         authority or somebody looks at it,
         they're looking at it from the
23
         perspective of, I'm going to get the
24
25
         zoning change, I'm going to do this, I'm
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2 9	going to do that, and I'm going to ask
3 1	for this and that. And so when they
4 .	start doing that and when they have done
5 t	that, then we will revise the value. But
6 6	a lot of conversations I had in a lot of
7	cities about potentially doing things to
8 8	a lot of properties and if we acted upon
9 t	that without it actually occurring, then
10	you have the opposite, a lot of furious
11 r	people about a lot of properties that
12 n	never developed and we value them as
13 t	though they had been already, and that
14 7	would be wrong, from our professional
15 g	perspective.
16	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So you
17	were saying basically you would error on
18 t	the side of low.
19	MR. McKEITHEN: We're going to
20	error on the side of what is it right now
21 8	and we're going to error on the side of
22 7	what is its zoning and what is it legally
23	able to be right now, and that's a
24	vacant, boarded-up school.

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 was a lot, a vacant lot, or an abandoned 3 house. So if a vacant lot was there and the City was looking at it to sell it, 4 say it was maybe City-owned or maybe it's 5 owned by an individual who is not paying 6 7 taxes on it, your assessment of that lot is just an empty lot. So if the City 8 wanted to sell it, we would what? 9 10 MR. McKEITHEN: What we look at 11 with that empty lot is, is it 12 residentially zoned like all the other properties on the block, it just happens 13 14 to be empty; what are the values of all 15 of the similar zoned properties that are similar size and everything on that 16 17 particular block; what are the sales that have occurred in that area to dictate to 18 us what that value could be from sales 19 20 that have occurred in the past. 21 somebody else might look at it is, Well, 22 we're going -- we got a verbal commitment from such-and-such to sell these at this 23 24 particular rate, and that's where they'll 25 start, but we don't have that yet,

```
4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
1
 2
         because it hasn't happened yet.
 3
                   An assessment is driven, by and
         largely, on a lot of instances as to what
 4
         has happened in the past and what
 5
         potentially can happen through its zoning
 6
         and things like that. For example, a
         boarded-up house, if boarded-up houses
 9
         are selling because people think that
10
         that neighborhood is going to take off,
11
         then they're buying boarded-up houses at
12
         that rate. But they're buying them at
         that rate, not at the rate five years
13
14
         from now that people think they'll be.
15
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right.
         So one last thing before you move on.
16
17
         the end of the day, you're not assessing
         it for what you think it could be sold
18
         for?
19
20
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                    We're assessing
21
         it for what we think it could be sold for
22
         based on information that has occurred
         already, not for what --
23
24
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
                                         What I'm
25
         trying to get at is, it seems like you're
```

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         basing it for what it could be sold for.
 3
         When the City goes to sell it, totally
         disagrees with your numbers on
 4
         everything. So I'm trying to understand
 5
         when we're doing it for the tax purposes
 6
         and people paying taxes, they're saying,
 8
         Yeah, but that's what OPA says, so we
 9
         have to pay that amount, but when the
10
         City goes to sell it, they're saying, You
         can't go by OPA's number, we have a LAMA
11
12
         system, we have a system that does a
13
         better job, and we go through there and
14
         we'll have an exact number that we want
15
         for that property. That's the confusing
         part when -- we're telling the residents
16
         one thing, but then we're telling other
17
         people something different when the City
18
19
         wants to sell something.
20
                   MR. McKEITHEN:
                                   We looked at --
21
         I know in one particular instance we
22
         looked at a model that was devised by one
         of the agencies, and they had things in
23
24
         there that we typically would not
25
         consider as a profession.
                                     So those are
```

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 some of the things that would make the 3 difference in what an actual price would 4 be. 5 Another good example would be When people come in, you 6 speculation. got a high price buyer who is just trying to buy up a block and he's got to have 8 that block. I don't want to spill that 9 10 rate over into everybody else in the 11 neighborhood. 12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: You're not 13 spilling --14 MR. McKEITHEN: But that's what 15 we have to consider. Equalization as 16 well as sale price mean a lot in our 17 profession. 18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Why don't 19 we just -- if the City is coming up with values for their parcels of what it's 20 21 worth, why don't we just use that? 22 MR. McKEITHEN: I just got some 23 appraisals of some schools that are being discussed, and so we're looking at those 24 25 appraisals, and there's a good chance

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 we'll use the data for those appraisals. 3 And, you know, two professions, two different professions, looking at things 4 5 for two different reasons that mean two different values. We're for tax 6 purposes. 8 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: But we 9 want to pay taxes on -- this AVI was a 10 fair, accurate system, correct? 11 MR. McKEITHEN: Yes. 12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So we want to pay taxes on the fair, accurate value 13 14 of a property. That's the goal. 15 MR. McKEITHEN: But also understand too that this was the first 16 17 year of AVI, and we have some things that 18 we know --19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I wanted 20 to try to give you four years, if you 21 remember. It didn't work out. 22 MR. McKEITHEN: We want to make 23 it -- it will get better year after year. 24 As we do reassessments, it will get

better as we learn and as we are able to

```
1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
```

- 2 obtain things to help us with those
- 3 values.
- 4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you.
- 5 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.
- 6 Thank you, Councilman.
- 7 Councilman Henon.
- 8 COUNCILMAN HENON: Last
- 9 question. Thank you, Chairman.
- Just last question. It's just
- over the applications for homestead and
- the LOOP. I had a few people, not too
- many, but a few people told me that they
- 14 were denied filling out their basic
- 15 information. Their basic information is
- 16 pretty basic. It's simple. How is this
- information inputted into the computer
- 18 system where they are either -- it's
- 19 either accepted or denied? Is it scanned
- in or is it physically data-inputted into
- a computer system?
- MS. DRAYER: The applications
- are scanned in and then we manually
- review the application.
- 25 COUNCILMAN HENON: Manually

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- 2 review. So there's a few folks that had
- 3 contacted my office, and I know more so
- 4 in other districts have been refused
- because, let's just say, maybe the
- 6 scanner didn't read it correctly. So if
- 7 somebody put in January 4th as opposed to
- 8 1/4, it was denied or it was unfounded or
- 9 rejected. I mean, I don't remember what
- 10 the terminology is that you use. One,
- 11 has that been brought to your attention?
- 12 And, two, if it is, is the system
- 13 correcting itself?
- MS. DRAYER: Well, that's why
- we manually review since we know that the
- scanning does a fairly good job of
- 17 picking up handwriting, but sometimes
- even the applicant could put the wrong
- 19 OPA number. So that's why we manually
- 20 review each application, just to make
- 21 sure if they're being denied for
- 22 incomplete --
- 23 COUNCILMAN HENON: Incomplete,
- that's it.
- MS. DRAYER: -- something

```
4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
1
 2
         required has been left off. But, again,
 3
         that's what we're going through the
         application for.
 4
 5
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                      And, again,
         as I stated earlier, I'm just really
 6
         concerned with the seniors in the City
         filling out -- even though it's basic
 9
         information, you know, maybe their
10
         writing isn't as it was when they filled
11
         out other applications previous, but it's
12
         not reading -- it's coming out incomplete
         and they're being denied because of it.
13
14
         And I know that the information may be
15
         there, because it's simple and it's
         basic. It's just not being read
16
17
         correctly by the program.
18
                   MS. DRAYER: Well, I mean, so
19
         it does -- the information gets scanned
20
         in and it's populated into a spreadsheet,
21
         but then we actually have the actual
         image of the application.
22
                                    So that's
23
         helpful. If something doesn't look right
24
         on the spreadsheet, we can go to the
         actual image and that captures --
25
```

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: So when it's
 3
         brought to our attention, we just call
         the office and we just have you guys take
 4
         a look at the micro picture of it.
 5
 6
                   MS. DRAYER:
                                Right. And I know
         we've worked with many Council offices.
 8
         I don't doubt that there are, you know,
 9
         applications that perhaps we've missed
10
         something, and that's why we're always
11
         happy to work with the offices and
12
         review.
13
                   COUNCILMAN HENON:
                                       In your free
14
         time.
15
                   MS. DRAYER:
                                Right.
16
                   COUNCILMAN HENON: I would hope
17
         you get a chance to just take a look at
18
         those who come out incomplete. So you
19
         probably have that data ready and
20
         available. So you review all those who
21
         are incomplete. Because I know some of
22
         the seniors and it's a generational thing
23
         or most people don't fight for
         themselves, and that's what we're here to
24
25
              We're here to help fight for people
```

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- 2 to make sure that things are looked at
- 3 thoroughly, and it could be a simple
- 4 oversight, of course.
- 5 MS. DRAYER: And that is one of
- 6 the reasons we've also pushed -- we have
- 7 pushed the hotline, that it's
- 8 particularly helpful for seniors or for
- 9 people who perhaps English is not their
- 10 first language, that they can do the
- 11 application over the phone. And I know
- that was helpful for a lot of seniors
- that they could -- they didn't have to do
- the actual paper application.
- 15 COUNCILMAN HENON: I'm just
- looking on one of the budget pages here.
- 17 It has your Integrated Property Valuation
- and Information Systems. Is that the
- 19 system that you're dealing with in the
- office? It's just a major objective.
- MR. McKEITHEN: I'm sorry.
- What is that?
- 23 COUNCILMAN HENON: It's just a
- simple major objective.
- 25 MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah. That's

```
1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
```

- the system that I'm talking about about
- 3 us getting the RFP and everything.
- 4 COUNCILMAN HENON: Oh, that is?
- 5 MR. McKEITHEN: Yeah.
- 6 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay.
- 7 Great. Well, thank you.
- 8 MS. DRAYER: Sure.
- 9 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
- 10 you.
- Ma'am, don't go anywhere for a
- 12 second. Let me follow up on that.
- Were you finished? I'm sorry,
- 14 Councilman.
- 15 COUNCILMAN HENON: Yes,
- 16 finally. Thank you.
- 17 Thank you all for your time.
- 18 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: What I
- 19 wanted to -- just so I'm clear, so
- 20 anything that is first -- if it's
- rejected by the computer, it is gone over
- 22 manually?
- MS. DRAYER: It is.
- 24 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Before a
- denial or an incomplete notice is sent

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.

- 2 out?
- 3 MS. DRAYER: It is, only
- 4 because we found that while the scanning,
- 5 like I said, it does pick up the
- 6 information fairly well, there may be an
- 7 area if perhaps the handwriting is not
- 8 clear or it doesn't read the information
- 9 correctly that we're taking a look that
- it may not be picking up the information.
- 11 So that's why we --
- 12 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: No. I
- think it's good that you're doing it, but
- 14 I think we were told earlier that's not
- the way it was. So anything before it's
- sent out as incomplete, it's gone over
- 17 manually? Real eyes are looking at it;
- is that what you're saying?
- 19 MS. DRAYER: That's correct.
- 20 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank
- 21 you.
- 22 Councilman Squilla.
- 23 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Yes. Real
- 24 quick too, just to piggyback on
- 25 Councilman Henon's. Your office has been

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	great, because we drive you crazy over
3	there with constant e-mails and calls,
4	and you get back to us. Not always the
5	answers we want, but at least you get
6	back to us and help us out to help the
7	constituents.
8	I know initially it seemed like
9	the problems were with commas and other
10	things associated with certain forms. I
11	mean, that was basically with the LOOP.
12	And nobody knew you weren't supposed to
13	put these added things in there, so they
14	were getting rejected. But now it seems
15	like we're getting a good handle on how
16	that works.
17	Initially, though, weren't the
18	letters just going out automatically from
19	the system to the individuals?
20	MS. DRAYER: Is this for the
21	homestead or for LOOP?
22	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: For LOOP.
23	MR. McKEITHEN: Ms. Waxman will
24	come up and answer that.
25	(Witness approached witness

```
1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
```

- 2 table.)
- 3 MS. WAXMAN: Hi. I'm Marisa
- 4 Waxman. I'm an Assistant Finance
- 5 Director and Manager of the LOOP program.
- 6 And, yes, initially we were
- 7 automating part of that process for the
- 8 first couple of batches. About three
- 9 weeks into the processing, we realized
- that we wanted to look at everything that
- 11 was flagged incomplete manually before we
- then went out, so we figured out what
- 13 exactly was incomplete. That let us
- 14 catch things, not so much the commas but
- 15 sometimes to do the calculation of
- 16 meeting household income, we needed a
- 17 number for the number of people in
- 18 household and a number for your income,
- and it's very hard for us to divide me,
- 20 my two daughters, and my cat by Social
- 21 Security and a pension. And so we were
- able -- that really tripped up the
- computer. But now anything that comes in
- incomplete has been eyeballed by our
- 25 staff.

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: We do
 3
         appreciate that, because I know it was
         causing major concerns early on.
 4
         people were getting rejected, we were
 5
         getting a ton of calls, but, again, you
 6
         have been great getting back to us.
 8
         know you think we're a pain.
 9
                   MS. WAXMAN:
                                No. You guys are
10
         great.
11
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
                                         You guys
12
         are doing your job over there, and we do
13
         appreciate it.
14
                   MS. WAXMAN:
                                Thanks.
                                          And one
15
         more thing to add about the incompletes.
         Any of the denials that have been sent
16
17
         out since the deadline, if the reason for
18
         denial was incomplete, we included an
19
         application amendment to give folks
         another shot at filling that out, and we
20
21
         have sort of increased the training at
22
         our call center to really walk folks
         through step by step. Your staff has
23
         been tremendous. All the Councilmembers'
24
25
         staffs have come to the trainings,
```

1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	watched the training videos, so that as
3	many people as possible have been able to
4	help folks figure out exactly what needs
5	to go on those forms so we can get them
6	into the program.
7	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And wasn't
8	it only ten days, though, you had ten
9	days to get it back?
10	MS. WAXMAN: To get an
11	application amendment back, and that's
12	because as much as possible, we were
13	trying to get folks an answer before
14	yesterday's real estate tax due date of
15	whether or not they'd been approved or
16	denied. The further we pushed the
17	processing on those, the longer it will
18	be before folks know exactly how much
19	they need to pay. So we're very mindful
20	of that. If folks do have a problem,
21	they do still have the option of
22	appealing to the Tax Review Board, and
23	they have 60 days from the date of their
24	denial to do that. So if something falls
25	outside that ten-day window, they do

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         still have another option.
 3
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right.
         Thank you. Thank you for putting up with
 4
         us too, because I know we can probably be
 5
         a little demanding on your time.
 6
                   But one last question.
                                            I know
         over the Five Year Plan it was calculated
 9
         sort of an increase at 3 percent each
10
         year in real estate revenue coming in.
11
         Is that something that we're looking to
12
         continue with this year?
13
                   MR. DUBOW:
                                In '15?
14
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
                                         Yes.
15
                   MR. DUBOW:
                               In '15 the
         complication goes back to the appeals
16
17
         question. So because the appeals
18
         prevented us -- appeals process prevented
19
         us from doing a full assessment, we're
20
         really not counting on the 3 percent
21
         growth. The actual growth in the base is
22
         about 1.3 percent, and that's just from
23
         new construction and major improvements.
24
         We do think, though, that what you'll see
25
         in terms of growth in the budget, the net
```

```
1
           4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
 2
         will be higher than that because some of
 3
         the appeals will be resolved next year,
         and we kind of counted them as all lost
 4
         for this year. So to the extent that
 5
 6
         they're not completely granted, you'll
         see some gain in market value, which will
         get the total, I think, up to like 2.7,
 8
 9
         in that range.
10
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
                                         Now, I
11
         know we had calculated -- we had included
12
         in the budget for appeal losses.
13
         have an estimate moving forward what we
14
         believe the appeal losses may be
15
         considering the number of appeals?
16
                   MR. DUBOW:
                                I think you will
17
         probably go back to the old -- yeah.
18
         kind of back to where the level of appeal
         losses used to be before -- we assumed a
19
20
         50 percent increase for '14, and starting
21
         in '16, we'll go back to the old level of
22
         appeal losses.
23
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
                                         And that
24
         was?
25
                                Like 20 million.
                   MR. DUBOW:
```

		238
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.	
2	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: About 20	
3	million?	
4	MR. DUBOW: Yes.	
5	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And so we	
6	added 30 million for this year, correct?	
7	MR. DUBOW: Yes.	
8	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And do you	
9	think we'll hit that?	
10	MR. DUBOW: We will I think	
11	because people who have appealed will pay	
12	the amount from last year instead of this	
13	year's amount. So I think we'll probably	
14	go beyond the 30 this year.	
15	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: But	
16	hopefully if we get most of these	
17	hearings done and we get the coordination	
18	done so that OPA could reach out to some	
19	of these folks and get that all done,	
20	they will eventually pay	
21	MR. DUBOW: They should come	
22	back probably in '15, right.	
23	COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Well, by	
24	the end of this year. You're talking	
25	you would have everything by June 30th?	

```
4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
1
 2
                               In the original
                   MR. DUBOW:
 3
         projection.
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So that
 5
         we're using that money up until June
                That will be used from the budget
 6
         30th.
         for the appeal losses, that money will be
8
         used up?
9
                   MR. DUBOW: Right.
10
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA:
                                        And how
11
         about as far as the homestead? What was
12
         the --
13
                               The original
                   MR. DUBOW:
14
         assumption was about 270,000 homesteads.
15
         Now we're about 230. So that helps
16
         offset some of the loss from the appeals.
17
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And how
         about as far as the LOOP?
18
19
                   MR. DUBOW: LOOP we had 20
20
         million. Right now we're looking like
21
         we're in the $12 to $13 million range.
22
                   COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So that's
         also --
23
24
                   MR. DUBOW: That will also help
25
         offset the appeal loss. They won't
```

- 1 4/1/14 WHOLE BILL 140144, etc.
- totally offset it. I mean, there will
- 3 still be some loss.
- 4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And wasn't
- 5 there \$10 million for commercial?
- 6 MR. DUBOW: I think there were
- discussions about that. I don't think
- 8 that ever --
- 9 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Because I
- think originally there was going to be, I
- think it was, \$30 million for LOOP or
- 12 gentrification and they knocked it down
- to 20 and threw 10 in for commercial.
- MR. DUBOW: And I think there
- may have been some tradeoff with
- homestead, but it was homestead plus 20
- is where we wound up.
- 18 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: The total
- 19 homestead was how much?
- 20 MR. DUBOW: It was 270,000
- times like \$400 was the original.
- 22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay. So
- 23 now that has to be in the budget every
- 24 year, correct?
- MR. DUBOW: That's correct.

1 4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc. 2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Will there 3 be an increase added, a couple percentage points, each year for people who didn't 4 make it or you don't know yet? 5 I think we've kind 6 MR. DUBOW: of held it flat, but that may go up over time. 8 9 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay. Because obviously the gentrification will 10 11 drastically go down. I don't think we're 12 going to see, unless Mr. McKeithen is 13 going to go in and triple assessment next 14 year, I don't think we'll see that. 15 won't be --16 MR. DUBOW: We won't see more. 17 But people who are already in it will 18 stay. We won't see an increase. 19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: So that will not increase. 20 21 MR. DUBOW: I don't think so. 22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Okay. 23 right. Well, thank you very much. 24 you for your time and appreciate your 25 help.

	
1	4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
2	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
3	Thank you, Councilman.
4	Councilman Greenlee, I want to
5	thank you for sitting in. I had some
6	very important meetings that we had to
7	have.
8	I have about 28 questions I
9	need to ask you. I'm just kidding.
10	MR. DUBOW: That was the
11	meanest April Fool's joke of the day.
12	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
13	April Fool's. No. I'm sure pretty much
14	every question imaginable has been asked
15	today. So there are no other names teed
16	up, so I want to thank you very much for
17	your testimony.
18	MR. McKEITHEN: Thank you, sir.
19	COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE:
20	Thank you.
21	Council will stand in recess
22	until Wednesday, April 2nd, at 10:00
23	a.m., at which time we will reconvene in
24	Room 400.
25	Thank you.

```
243
        4/1/14 - WHOLE - BILL 140144, etc.
1
2
                  (Committee of the Whole
      recessed at 3:55 p.m.)
 3
4
 5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

CERTIFICATE I HEREBY CERTIFY that the proceedings, evidence and objections are contained fully and accurately in the stenographic notes taken by me upon the foregoing matter, and that this is a true and correct transcript of same. MICHELE L. MURPHY RPR-Notary Public (The foregoing certification of this transcript does not apply to any reproduction of the same by any means, unless under the direct control and/or supervision of the certifying reporter.)

A	accounted 183:17	added 232:13	30:8,22 34:23	agreed 63:17,24
abandoned 208:9	accounting 46:23	238:6 241:3	37:16 39:9	63:25 125:13
220:2	47:12 56:2 79:9	adding 91:20	97:23 125:4	140:9 180:10,15
abate 22:13,14	91:18	129:17	Administrator	agreement 3:6
abated 104:2,15	accuracy 163:21	addition 50:7	97:16,18,19,20	50:12 88:17
194:23,25	164:20 165:17	186:3	97:22,24	agreements 8:16
195:16,18	accurate 50:4	additional 8:21	administrators	86:11
abatement 17:12	224:10,13	14:13,17,22	210:20	ahead 21:4 154:2
18:12,20,21	accurately 177:5	24:22 50:8	adopt 2:11,15	158:5,6,11,12
19:3,11,15,24	244:5	58:11 61:15	adopted 13:24	160:14 161:6
20:19 21:14,14	achieve 94:12	63:11 72:11,13	105:9,14,16	174:4 182:19
21:19,24 22:20	achievement	87:9 92:23	adopting 2:17	Airport 78:3
22:22,25 98:17	94:24	115:9 129:25	advance 62:3	79:11 80:4
195:3,7 196:5,8	ACIS 29:13	199:16	69:11 148:15	87:18
197:5,23 198:6	acquired 103:21	Additionally	advantage 208:4	alarm 39:2,24
198:9,13 199:5	acres 137:5	98:11 99:8	advertise 129:3	44:13
abatements 18:19	147:25	address 108:8	affect 19:24 23:2	Aldinger 98:2
ability 123:14,24	acted 219:8	157:24 163:20	111:21 113:19	105:6,15,23
175:25	action 76:4	165:18 190:21	196:24	algebra 128:13
able 39:16,17	active 52:15	190:25 196:18	afloat 150:11	Alliance 92:15
93:24 101:2,18	198:13	addressed 157:25	African 91:8	allowed 54:22
103:8 108:17	actively 122:22	addresses 175:11	afternoon 85:15	allows 38:9,10
112:19 123:12	191:3	175:12	90:7,8,12 97:5,6	42:25
140:20 155:3	activities 77:15	addressing 32:15	97:8 102:7,8,18	alluded 117:24
160:25 161:5	100:10 112:24	213:18	105:6 120:25	amendment
175:21 186:20	157:23	Adel 117:9	121:2 126:25	234:19 235:11
187:12 190:15	activity 11:5 33:9	adjust 89:21	127:3 130:17,18	amenities 11:17
194:2 204:13	95:20 111:7	adjusted 134:20	134:10 152:13	American 91:8,9
206:13 213:16	114:10 119:18	178:3	152:14	amortization 50:3
214:6 219:23	133:21 171:8	adjusting 87:3	agencies 79:21	amount 11:23
224:25 233:22	172:4	211:2,4	217:2 222:23	56:9,14 61:21
235:3	actual 107:12	adjustment 91:20	agency 29:9 65:17	62:14 65:24
Absolutely 30:18	112:10,21	159:16	216:22	109:17 113:22
ACA 12:24 13:7	116:23 118:10	adjustments	aggregate 181:7	137:14 163:9
accept 124:20	131:6 158:9	182:17 211:8,11	183:7	170:11 184:3
acceptable 215:7	161:16 168:21	administering	aggressive 9:17	199:4 204:10
accepted 124:2	170:5,10 175:3	98:16	aggressively 9:12	207:14 218:19
209:19 225:19	202:20 223:3	administration	186:8	222:9 238:12,13
accepts 31:22	227:21,25	3:13 13:23	Aging 184:22	amounts 24:20
access 141:2	229:14 236:21	16:16,25 26:21	ago 33:2,12 35:8	100:11
142:9 172:12	actuarial 49:24	51:2,22 52:2,9	38:8 55:19 67:6	analyses 10:14
accomplish 4:18	91:25	52:13 53:12,18	67:6 101:8	analysis 7:11
accomplished	actuary 47:14	54:18,19 57:22	157:13 174:2	18:18 19:10,14
29:22 119:2	49:25 53:4	58:20 71:20	185:23	19:18,21 49:24
accomplishments	91:16 95:25	75:5,19 76:6	agree 67:21 88:24	66:23 84:13
30:15	actuary's 58:6	88:18	89:8 160:11	97:25 196:23
account 91:21	add 234:15	administrative	186:11 203:10	197:19,22
			l	

213:22	40:10 41:12	application 169:9	approved 3:7	146:11 182:9
Analyst 97:25	49:17 59:24	225:24 226:20	185:10,11	193:23 194:8,10
analytical 79:12	137:20 151:24	227:4,22 229:11	235:15	216:6 242:14
analyze 216:20	161:11	229:14 234:19	approves 52:18	asking 7:23 19:10
analyzes 47:15	apartment 98:22	235:11	approximately	42:24 106:14
and/or 22:14	apologize 62:3	applications	12:22 78:17	144:19 195:10
197:2 244:22	apparently 57:21	32:16 225:11,22	85:21 87:6,14	assess 111:22
angry 109:24	appeal 40:11	227:11 228:9	87:20 92:23	174:24 192:16
announced	98:14 99:7	applied 125:22	98:18 101:7	210:7 214:20
129:13	120:4 137:21	184:6,7 186:23	106:8,10 115:14	assessed 119:19
annual 46:24 47:9	140:17 162:9,19	187:10	181:4	153:5 165:6,8
48:25 56:2	175:6 187:23	apply 244:20	April 1:7 90:19	195:15 201:16
80:14 119:3	188:21 212:3	applying 98:14	90:24 242:11,13	assessing 166:25
122:24 214:8	237:12,14,18,22	appointment	242:22	221:17,20
answer 4:7,15	239:7,25	111:10	arbitration 8:15	assessment 74:9
5:14 21:16 38:4	appealed 107:19	appraisal 97:24	50:15 58:5	88:8 96:25
57:13 81:5	107:24 113:17	127:24 128:12	area 51:5 92:3,13	97:10,12,15
87:25 88:6	162:18 193:25	144:5,5 217:17	109:5 123:20	98:7,12 99:4
93:11 104:21	238:11	appraisals 144:16	126:15 163:24	102:21,22
125:7 134:13	appealing 41:15	173:21 223:23	172:2,4,5,5	112:13 113:25
144:8 150:12	111:16 161:20	223:25 224:2	192:24 193:19	114:13 116:8
154:17 232:24	235:22	appraiser 145:11	202:24 214:6	118:10 125:6
235:13	appeals 25:13,14	Appraisers	220:18 231:7	131:10 133:25
answering 108:9	25:19 26:3	173:20	areas 40:24 93:4	156:5 157:22
113:2	38:11,16,25	appreciate 4:4	93:5 119:13,17	158:2 159:13
answers 109:7,8	39:15,21 40:8	36:18 130:4	119:20,23	162:11 163:21
232:5	40:20 41:14,24	147:7 234:3,13	171:12 191:19	167:4,16 168:22
anticipate 14:20	44:13,14,15,16	241:24	192:3,5,16,23	171:23 174:23
81:19 92:22	44:17,19,22	approach 88:19	196:20 198:14	175:14 188:16
101:2 118:20	74:9 107:8	109:15 110:11	198:20 199:3	189:16,19
211:10	108:23 112:14	112:25	213:3,5,24	194:22 195:14
anticipated 4:25	113:3 160:21	approached 3:15	214:20,23 215:2	196:6,25 197:15
7:2 24:2 99:22	174:25 175:15	30:2 37:12 61:5	215:7,8 217:23	197:17 201:17
179:8	177:5,15 178:2	76:20 85:7 97:2	argument 109:6	212:11 214:8
anticipating	178:5,17,18	129:19 177:7	110:20 111:5	220:7 221:3
83:17	179:6 183:11	195:8 200:2	arisen 71:9	236:19 241:13
anticipation	190:19,22,25	232:25	arm 70:8 204:5	assessments
15:10,12	211:10,18 212:5	appropriate	Aros 97:15	25:21,25 26:2
antiquated 32:4	213:18,19	41:18 126:13	arrangement	112:4 118:2
34:9	214:11,13 216:4	129:23	157:8	119:21 131:6
anxiety 142:19	216:8 236:16,17	appropriation	arrest 121:17	163:18 164:13
anybody 44:25	236:18 237:3,15	4:24 60:15	arrival 113:8	164:20 166:12
73:12 139:4	239:16	appropriations	arrived 111:24	167:12 171:21
anybody's 138:8	appeared 109:6	5:9 60:8	Asian 91:9	172:18,18 175:3
anymore 136:14	appears 12:20	approval 2:20	aside 63:11	175:4 179:5
141:14	applicant 226:18	approvals 186:21	143:18	188:25 189:3,14
anyway 12:18	applicants 186:18	approve 93:10	asked 110:20	191:11,16,21

	 		l	l
192:2,14 196:4	204:9	award 8:19 31:11	base 9:22,24 10:5	benefiting 105:10
205:13	attempted 108:4	50:15	10:12 110:18	benefits 4:23
assessor 102:16	110:5 111:2	awards 8:15	139:20 205:19	50:17 52:9,14
113:21 138:8	180:19	11:22 58:5	205:21 236:21	Bensalem 139:10
139:18,19 140:9	attempting	aware 109:10	based 7:11 10:13	best 32:23 50:21
142:5 155:4,5	116:15 157:15	a.m 1:7 242:23	21:12 22:8 53:4	50:22 109:6
173:20	212:21		59:22 60:4,6,19	148:5 164:14
assessors 168:21	attendees 78:9	B	60:23 63:20	165:19 217:7,19
168:25 169:12	attention 96:20	B 1:15 57:25 58:3	70:3,4 83:18	better 55:25 64:9
173:12 187:24	137:20,24	75:5,20 76:6	88:19 95:16	65:15 66:17
188:2,13 209:12	138:14 139:2	BAA 26:19 38:18	162:18 163:12	92:22 133:22
assessor's 134:7	146:24 226:11	38:22	165:22 186:19	143:22,25 209:3
217:12	228:3	Bachelor's 200:7	202:21 203:21	209:4 211:6
assets 46:11	attorney 145:10	200:10,13	221:22	222:13 224:23
assigned 70:16	153:5	back 8:12 21:17	basic 128:12	224:25
assignment 62:10	attract 78:10	22:11 26:2 33:8	225:14,15,16	beyond 8:9 164:8
206:6,7	121:13	43:17 45:5	227:8,16	238:14
assist 122:8	audience 77:6	48:15,22,24	basically 88:7	bid 65:4
assistant 97:16,17	audit 99:8 102:12	49:6 58:19	156:5 219:17	bidding 64:22
97:19,20,21	102:14,24	85:14 92:4 94:7	232:11	Bielli 90:8,12,14
210:20 233:4	103:17,24	121:7 124:13	basing 222:2	90:22 91:4
associated 5:25	audited 166:22	133:13 135:2	basis 80:15 83:6	93:23 94:2
232:10	167:6	136:2 146:5	91:17 94:21	95:23 96:11
Association	authority 3:4,4,10	149:22 152:24	112:23 119:3	big 51:14 123:10
121:25 166:25	44:18 217:4	154:17 161:10	122:25 170:8	140:4 143:16
assume 25:13	218:22	166:7 179:24	batches 233:8	152:20 203:14
60:11 164:11	authorized 3:6	181:24 194:14	Battestelli 202:2	bigger 143:4
178:10	47:23 132:12	198:20 210:7	202:3	183:24
assumed 48:8,10	automated	232:4,6 234:7	beat 102:2	biggest 109:16
93:17 177:25	116:12	235:9,11 236:16	beating 199:13	120:8,15 159:5
178:4 237:19	automatically	237:17,18,21	becoming 185:6	203:4
assuming 21:21	232:18	238:22	beginning 62:4	bill 2:10,14,16 3:1
88:6	automating 233:7	background	78:13 133:15	3:8 4:1 5:1 6:1
assumption 14:14	autonomy 65:12	211:17	begun 125:21	7:1 8:1 9:1 10:1
22:2,8 48:6	available 4:14	bad 186:6	behalf 147:3,4	11:1 12:1 13:1
56:19 91:17	130:22 213:22	balance 6:13,14	behest 127:5	14:1 15:1 16:1
94:7,14,19	228:20	6:24 7:3 80:6	belabor 45:18	17:1 18:1 19:1,4
177:15 178:4	average 94:5,10	balanced 8:13	114:18 210:19	20:1 21:1 22:1
239:14	137:2	balances 5:21 6:2	believe 38:10 50:7	23:1,10,13,14
assumptions 7:16	AVI 100:5 105:19	6:4,6,21 7:7	69:21 80:16	23:19 24:1 25:1
7:19 9:15 50:4	117:25 118:21	bank 200:17	83:17 108:6	26:1 27:1 28:1
52:24,25 53:6	176:19 179:25	banking 78:16,18	117:3 162:20	29:1 30:1 31:1
177:17,24	191:13 224:9,17	bar 130:16	165:5 186:22	32:1 33:1 34:1
177:17,24	Aviation 86:5	Barbara 129:10	190:6 237:14	35:1 36:1 37:1
assure 165:17	87:11	bargaining 8:16		
	avoid 148:25	50:15 58:4,13	bell 179:12,12 benefit 50:10 59:9	38:1 39:1 40:1 41:1 42:1 43:1
attempt 32:8		barrier 186:24		
111:10 193:20	avoiding 71:13	Nation 100.27	187:12	44:1 45:1 46:1
	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>

47:1 48:1 49:1	159:1 160:1	183:8	boards 47:18	113:15
50:1 51:1 52:1	161:1 162:1,15	bills 1:17 2:5,8	Board's 46:23	broad 75:10
53:1 54:1 55:1	162:16,17 163:1	150:5 162:12	47:12 56:2	broadens 135:2
56:1 57:1 58:1	164:1 165:1	BIRT 10:4	BOBBY 1:12	broad-based 17:7
59:1 60:1 61:1	166:1 167:1	bit 30:13 40:7	bodies 205:2	broken 133:10,15
62:1 63:1 64:1	168:1 169:1	74:14 89:22	body 63:8 148:17	180:16 215:12
65:1 66:1 67:1	170:1 171:1	110:10,23	BOMA 121:25	215:14
68:1 69:1 70:1	172:1 173:1	134:18 145:5	bombarded 164:2	brought 33:10
71:1 72:1 73:1	174:1 175:1	152:16 179:23	bond 79:14,17,24	113:17 142:4,5
74:1 75:1 76:1	176:1 177:1	Blackwell 1:10	79:25 87:21	226:11 228:3
77:1 78:1 79:1	178:1 179:1	164:2	bonds 59:4,11	Brown 1:14
80:1 81:1 82:1	180:1 181:1	blame 13:14	78:2,11 80:14	120:22,23 121:3
83:1 84:1 85:1	182:1 183:1	block 165:7	81:18,20,20	121:20 123:7
86:1 87:1 88:1	184:1 185:1	171:25 197:10	83:4 85:20,22	124:3,7,10,18
89:1 90:1 91:1	186:1 187:1	198:3 220:13,17	88:9	125:24 126:5,25
92:1 93:1 94:1	188:1 189:1	223:8,9	bond-financed	127:2 128:16
95:1 96:1 97:1	190:1 191:1	BLONDELL	80:11	129:3,8,16
98:1 99:1 100:1	192:1 193:1	1:14	books 56:21	130:6 172:25
101:1 102:1	194:1 195:1	blood 206:14	218:17	173:4 174:10,16
103:1 104:1	196:1 197:1	board 31:17	borrow 82:22,25	174:18 176:3,24
105:1 106:1	198:1 199:1	44:15 47:4,8,9	84:10 88:16	177:9,19 178:9
107:1 108:1	200:1 201:1	50:22 51:5,15	borrowed 58:21	178:25 179:11
109:1 110:1	202:1 203:1	51:17,20 52:4	83:16	199:11,12,22
111:1 112:1	204:1 205:1	52:17,18 53:15	borrowing 84:7	200:9 201:2,10
113:1 114:1	206:1 207:1	53:20 54:15,21	88:8,15,23 89:2	201:22 202:11
115:1 116:1	208:1 209:1	57:23 63:24	89:6	203:23 204:19
117:1 118:1	210:1 211:1	78:19 90:15	borrowings 87:18	205:11,25
119:1 120:1	212:1 213:1	99:6 107:6,7,11	boss 144:9 150:3	206:10,17,20
121:1 122:1	214:1 215:1	107:12,16,24	box 9:20	BRT 107:20
123:1 124:1	216:1 217:1	108:5,5,12,18	boxed 141:4,19	108:23 113:15
125:1 126:1	218:1 219:1	111:16,19 112:9	boxes 79:3	152:19,22,25
127:1 128:1	220:1 221:1	112:10,21 114:3	branch 215:20	157:7,11 158:16
129:1 130:1	222:1 223:1	114:9 120:4	break 18:25 19:23	158:21 159:13
131:1 132:1	224:1 225:1	138:18 139:5	89:25 134:16	159:23 160:15
133:1 134:1	226:1 227:1	142:19 143:14	216:7	161:7,19 164:8
135:1 136:1	228:1 229:1	145:21,25 146:4	breaking 96:14	164:12 173:9
137:1,10 138:1	230:1 231:1	148:14 149:3	Breeze 119:16	183:11 187:25
139:1 140:1	232:1 233:1	156:19 158:22	164:24 172:6,7	188:5 193:24,25
141:1 142:1	234:1 235:1	158:25 159:2,18	172:10,10	budget 2:15,17
143:1 144:1	236:1 237:1	160:5 173:19	BRIAN 1:14	4:11,12,16,19
145:1 146:1	238:1 239:1	174:20 175:7,8	bricks 218:19	5:10 7:5,9 11:19
147:1 148:1	240:1 241:1	175:20 190:4	bring 37:10 51:9	12:20 13:24
149:1 150:1	242:1 243:1	194:3 204:12	71:12 137:23	14:11,21 15:15
151:1 152:1	billing 162:22	235:22	138:14 140:23	16:13 26:20,20
153:1 154:1	billion 4:20 46:10	boarded-up	144:9,12,20,23	36:10,11 45:22
155:1 156:1	46:11,13 55:10	219:24 221:8,8	147:11 148:19	46:3 49:5 59:24
157:1 158:1	85:22 181:5	221:11	brings 111:20	60:9 61:8 62:16

63:4 67:14	11:7 16:7 41:7	108:12 109:22	center 63:12	challenged
68:22 69:19,20	64:21 65:3,4	110:12 111:3	139:6 165:2	112:18 120:3
70:21,23 71:7	181:20	138:5 140:14	187:6 202:19	123:19
71:20,21,22,25	buy 139:7,8 223:8	146:5,6 151:12	234:22	challenges 5:25
72:3 73:9 74:16	buyer 223:7	152:22 154:6,9	centered 81:17	11:7 100:24
74:17 75:4,18	buyers 66:6	155:15,19	centers 139:7,25	101:5 112:7
76:5 77:8,11	buying 172:11	158:25 159:2,18	140:7	113:10 120:16
80:5 82:11,12	221:11,12	159:24 179:3	certain 6:14 11:6	challenging 6:18
85:17 91:5	buys 137:6	cases 44:9 98:14	21:23 39:22	106:6,16 126:23
93:10 98:6	byte 13:5	99:7 107:16	51:9 54:18	chance 135:23
99:18,19,25		108:15,16	169:23,24	152:9,19 154:7
100:2,8,11	C	109:20 110:7	188:20 192:16	154:8 223:25
177:13,14 178:8	calculated 61:25	112:10 120:6	199:5 205:19,21	228:17
182:22,24 183:2	236:8 237:11	138:6,23 140:23	216:24 232:10	change 21:11 23:6
183:11,13,14	calculation 183:5	143:10,16	certainly 134:16	42:3,25 43:8
185:18 189:23	184:4 233:15	145:15 148:23	187:11	71:19 118:16
229:16 236:25	calculus 128:13	150:21 152:20	certificate 127:15	119:12,19
237:12 239:6	calendar 78:14	154:24 155:9,17	128:23 244:2	171:12 182:23
240:23	92:25	156:12,17,19	certification	189:20 192:23
budgeted 82:14	call 63:11 70:18	157:4,8 158:7	174:8,12 199:19	194:2 214:21
budgeting 68:16	119:14 138:2	158:10,18	244:19	218:25
68:21 69:2,25	152:23 158:19	159:21 160:5	certified 173:18	changed 19:3
72:8,21 86:17	172:8 187:6,7	175:10,19	173:19	114:6,8 118:22
budgets 70:17	201:20 228:3	201:14 210:2,2	CERTIFY 244:3	119:5 193:8,14
build 137:12	234:22	case-by-case	certifying 244:23	changes 2:25 10:4
buildable 148:2	callbacks 151:25	165:24	Chair 13:16 26:10	23:4 50:10,13
building 27:24	152:2	cash 5:23 6:13,15	37:24 45:8	50:17 58:12
121:25 177:14	called 34:13,14,23	9:4 77:19 80:14	58:17 59:16	99:24 100:6
buildings 27:13	72:7 175:5	80:17,22,23	74:23 106:2	119:22 189:16
27:15	callers 187:6	81:3	114:22 115:3	189:19 190:17
built 182:24 183:2	calls 155:15	Cassel 29:24 30:4	120:18 132:18	191:11 192:5,23
183:10	165:13 232:3	30:6,18 31:25	152:12 162:2	characteristics
bulk 65:16,19	234:6	32:11,20,25	170:24 187:22	99:13 169:2,14
67:2	camera 44:15	33:5,11 34:11	214:18	211:5
bunch 55:13	Candidi 97:17	34:16,22 35:21	Chairman 26:13	charge 116:23
burden 149:15	capabilities 79:12	36:2,19	36:22 102:6	139:13
180:5 181:15	capital 2:11,15	cat 233:20	120:24 130:7	charged 98:12
Bureau 26:19,20	36:11,13,15 82:21 84:8	catch 183:19	173:5 179:17	charges 62:21
bureaucratic		233:14	194:20 199:8	64:7
146:18	capture 168:25 captures 227:25	catchup 12:6	206:22 207:3	Charlie 85:11
business 10:8,17	captures 227:23 car 86:5 87:19	categories 62:23	225:9	chart 94:18 180:3
33:14 34:3	care 109:2 148:22	66:7	challenge 49:4	180:3
97:25 127:10	150:23 152:2	category 66:5,6	106:24 107:3	Charter 51:11
137:2 140:18	caring 146:21	79:20	113:6 120:8	54:8
141:8,12,14	carry 140:5	caused 4:22	122:18 123:16	cheap 139:8
150:23 businesses 10:8	case 107:11 108:5	176:19	124:14 203:14 205:9	check 42:8,9 57:6
Dusinesses 10.8	cuse 107.11 100.3	causing 234:4	203.9	checking 45:15
			l	l

		I		I
checks 78:22	217:3 220:4,8	242:19	64:6 72:24 79:5	commas 232:9
cherish 206:8	222:3,10,18	class 5:4 59:20	169:15	233:14
Chief 52:16 90:16	223:19 227:7	86:10,12,14,19	collections 9:13	commend 207:16
97:10,14 102:20	citywide 118:25	87:13 99:22,24	9:16,18 62:19	commercial 64:6
131:6	170:7,8 192:15	99:25,25	63:6,7,21 64:4	80:3 137:17
cigarette 14:15	193:3,7 205:14	classes 86:10	169:17	139:3,5 143:18
15:11 16:18,21	215:21	clean 40:25	collective 8:15	147:20,24
57:23	City's 5:22 30:21	clear 131:5	50:14 58:4,12	179:25 180:4
circumstance	78:11 80:7,14	148:24 230:19	college 126:8,9,18	181:16,17 182:7
112:6	80:21,24 81:2	231:8	127:8 128:2,5	203:19 208:7,10
circumstances	85:20 86:23,24	clients 140:6	128:15	240:5,13
122:4 136:20	City-owned 27:13	climb 204:2	column 126:7	Commercially
146:15 213:8,11	27:15 218:5	CLIP 72:25 73:5	combination	203:15
cities 219:7	220:5	clips 66:13	27:14 184:25	Commission
citizens 205:20	Civil 101:8	clock 136:23	combined 99:25	13:25 85:12,18
207:19	123:17,22	closed 141:15	come 3:14 15:20	85:19 86:3
city 1:2,6 2:21,22	124:13 125:12	closely 129:10	15:25 16:5 29:8	101:9 123:18,22
3:9 10:9,19 14:8	127:5,19 200:5	closer 104:10	29:25 45:5	124:14 125:12
15:23 18:14	claims 11:21 12:2	138:10 191:18	69:15,18 70:17	127:5,19
28:16 30:5	12:10	club 137:4	89:23 95:9	Commissioner
31:14,21 32:3	clarify 53:9	COD 212:13	103:4,5 105:4	149:17,18
32:14 42:15	Clarke 1:10 2:2	215:5	118:5 122:16	Commissioner's
47:21 62:15	3:11,17,21,22	code 39:2 41:10	125:23 126:10	144:11
64:16 65:5,18	4:3 5:16 6:19	44:12 134:14	126:17 127:14	Commissions
66:4,8 76:18,24	7:10,22 8:4,8,17	197:6,8,13	128:10 133:18	10:16
77:3,5 79:17,19	8:23 9:3,9,19,25	codes 132:23	136:2 137:19	commitment
80:10 85:10,16	10:6,11,20,24	133:4,10,14	139:2 140:7	220:22
85:20,23 86:11	11:4,10,18 12:9	134:8 135:2	157:7 167:20	committed
87:25 89:12	12:12,15 13:4	CODs 212:22	168:14 176:12	174:11
95:18 97:9	13:13 20:15	213:2	177:12 181:8	committee 1:3 2:4
98:10,19,24	23:23 24:7,9,16	coincidence	182:11 189:8	117:10 243:2
99:10,14 102:13	24:25 25:4,8	109:12,14	194:13 195:4	common 209:20
102:25 109:25	26:6 36:23 37:3	collaborate 69:12	199:21,23 205:4	210:9
116:13 119:3	45:3,6 58:16	collaborating	210:20 217:9,24	commonalities
122:21 123:25	59:14 73:14,17	184:21	223:6 228:18	209:23 210:4
124:8,23 125:14	73:21 74:21	collaboration	232:24 234:25	commonly 98:7
131:8 132:10,11	76:13,23,25	79:9 178:11	238:21	commonwealth
133:7 148:17	81:7 82:2,7	collaboratively	comes 31:13 70:9	79:2 104:6
165:2 168:7,19	83:13,25 84:6	35:18	233:23	185:19
170:2 171:10	84:15,19,25	colleague 163:22	coming 14:20	communicate
173:14 174:6	85:4 86:25 88:3	colleague's 213:9	17:5 34:20	135:17 185:5
185:19,20,24	88:13 89:3,10	collect 41:23	36:10 40:9	209:13
189:24 191:4	89:17 90:6,10	63:13 99:12	71:24 96:22	communication
192:9,22,25	90:13,20 91:2	collected 61:16	124:15 128:18	129:14 208:3
193:20 202:19	93:13,25 95:2	176:25	183:8 205:10,12	Community
205:20 208:2,15	96:2,9,13	collecting 115:25	223:19 227:12	127:8 128:5,14
214:22 216:16	163:25 242:2,12	collection 41:8,17	236:10	company 200:17

comparable	133:24 140:19	considering 94:10	66:3 78:15	6:10 8:14,21
42:12	185:6,20 186:2	177:5 237:15	contribute 54:20	10:8 47:15
comparables	227:7	consistent 40:8,11	contribution 4:25	65:19 71:23
188:19	concerning	47:17	5:6 46:24 47:10	Council 1:2,10
comparing	181:12	consistently 166:7	47:22 48:16	2:2,20 3:7,11,17
139:25	concerns 234:4	constant 210:24	50:11,18 56:3	3:21,22 4:3 5:16
competitive 80:15	concerted 135:15	232:3	56:14 59:10	6:19 7:10,22 8:4
122:21	conclude 5:13	constantly 115:21	contributions	8:8,17,23 9:3,9
competitively	concluded 76:3	119:14 166:3	50:13	9:19,25 10:6,11
78:15 80:25	150:2	constituent	control 190:12	10:20,24 11:4
complain 115:8	concludes 81:4	151:15	244:22	11:10,18 12:9
complaints	concur 88:7	constituents	conversation 82:9	12:12,15 13:4
136:22 151:15	condition 197:6,8	148:11 162:7	128:2	13:13 16:15
complete 102:24	197:12 218:21	232:7	conversations	20:15 23:23
103:24 107:5	conditions 64:23	construction	219:6	24:7,9,16,25
156:9	condominium	193:11 236:23	Conway's 73:2	25:4,8 26:6 30:6
completed 156:6	98:21	consultant 20:23	Cooperation 3:4	36:23 37:3 38:9
completely 16:10	conduct 99:8	21:2 167:4,17	3:6	45:3,6,11 55:18
237:6	102:11,23	168:7	coordinating	58:16 59:14
complexes 98:22	103:16 187:7	contact 208:5,14	158:17	73:11,14,17,21
compliance 80:10	conducted 92:13	contacted 159:22	coordination	74:21 76:13,23
complication	conducting 17:11	161:17 226:3	135:15 238:17	76:24,25 81:7
236:16	17:19	contained 244:5	core 5:10 214:5	82:2,7 83:13,25
comprehensive	conference 78:9	contention 196:11	corners 170:3	84:6,15,19,25
100:6 118:24	confident 60:10	196:15	correct 31:25	85:4,10,17,24
193:3	configuration	contingent 59:22	32:12 34:11	86:25 87:25
comprehensively	50:22	continuation 35:7	35:21,25 36:2,7	88:3,13 89:3,10
205:14	configure 31:15	continue 26:4	38:12 48:13	89:17 90:6,9,10
comprised 86:10	confines 153:21	48:21 68:11	68:17 100:21	90:13,14,20
computer 151:22	confusing 134:18	80:9,13,21	105:23 131:10	91:2 93:13,25
225:17,21	222:15	99:12 100:4	131:15 160:5	95:2,18 96:2,9
230:21 233:23	Congratulations	101:16,17,19	162:19,24,25	96:13,16 97:8,9
computerized	39:12	119:18 128:14	163:13,14	99:17 102:19
146:17	connotation	135:19 185:13	174:25 187:17	105:7 111:25
concentrate 171:6	34:14	204:24 207:15	224:10 231:19	132:11 133:7
171:10	consequence	236:12	238:6 240:24,25	135:16 164:7
concentrating	107:13 176:10	continued 46:8	244:8	166:22 228:7
190:18	consequences	79:24 184:24	correcting 226:13	242:2,12,19,21
concept 34:21	143:12	continues 99:20	correctly 226:6	Councilman 1:11
35:17	consider 75:5,19	continuing 57:20	227:17 231:9	1:11,12,12,13
conceptually	76:6 132:7	103:19 174:14	corresponding	1:13,14,15
82:15,18 83:11	217:2 222:25	205:7	56:14	13:16,18,22
84:16,17	223:15	contract 7:18,24	cost 10:17 14:9	14:3,10,19,24
concern 183:24	consideration	29:6,14 31:11	21:7,12 23:4,6	15:5,9,24 16:4
184:19,20	144:4 150:13	59:21 61:13	36:16 60:5 69:3	16:12 17:10,14
218:10	considered 23:15	contracts 7:13,13	79:19	17:18 18:3,9,16
concerned 107:14	23:20 201:16	7:17,21 29:3,7	costs 4:23 5:3,5	19:9,13 20:3,12

			i	i
20:16,17 21:15	105:18,24 106:3	179:13,15,16	242:3,4	233:8 241:3
21:25 22:5,10	106:4,12,22	180:9,13,22	Councilmember	course 24:3 77:16
22:19,24 23:5	107:18,23	182:25 183:4,18	17:21,25	229:4
23:14,21,24	108:21,25 110:2	184:11,16	Councilmembers	courses 174:13
26:10,12,16	110:16 111:12	185:16 186:12	96:22 114:17	court 148:12
27:2,8,11,17,23	111:18 113:12	186:13,25	133:14 185:2	153:17
28:7,13,19,23	114:5,16,20,21	187:14,18,20,21	207:13 234:24	covering 2:23
29:4,16,20 30:5	114:23 115:2,7	188:9,12,22	Councilpeople	co-efficient
30:12 31:23	115:15,18,22	189:6,11,22	129:19	166:15
32:2,17,21 33:4	116:18 117:5,13	190:5,9,13	Councilwoman	co-locate 28:4
34:7,12,17	117:19,22 119:7	191:2,8 192:6	1:10,14,15	CPE 174:9
35:16,22 36:8	119:15,24	192:11 193:6,15	58:17,18,23	cracks 143:11
36:17,20,25	120:10,17,19,20	193:21 194:7,9	59:13,15 120:22	crazy 232:2
37:4,5,9,17,21	121:6 126:3	194:12,15,18,19	120:23 121:3,20	create 49:4
38:7,15,21 39:8	130:9,11,12,13	195:13,20	123:7 124:3,7	126:20 178:7
39:11,20,25	130:15,19 131:7	196:10,22 198:4	124:10,18	created 187:4
40:6,16 41:19	131:13,19,23	198:8,16,22	125:24 126:5,25	creating 11:7
41:25 42:11	132:8,17 133:3	199:6,9,10	127:2 128:16	credentialed
43:7,13 44:8,23	133:9 134:13,17	206:23,25 207:2	129:2,8,16	205:4
45:4,8,10,14,20	135:9,22,25	207:7,12,22	130:6,10 172:25	credentials
45:25 46:7,18	136:6,7,8,9,10	209:8 210:10,11	173:3,4 174:10	129:24 173:11
46:21 47:7,19	136:15,17	210:25 211:9	174:16,18 176:3	credible 110:12
48:11,14,19	138:13,13 144:7	212:6,13,17	176:24 177:9,19	credit 77:22 80:2
49:12 50:20	145:18,24 146:9	213:4,25 214:10	178:9,25 179:11	criminal 11:5
51:3,16,23,25	147:9 149:7,10	214:14,15,16,17	179:14 199:11	critically 106:15
52:10,20 53:8	149:12 150:6	215:10,17,23	199:12,22 200:9	177:2
53:17,25 54:6	151:5,9,13	216:5,10 218:2	201:2,10,22	cross-analyzing
54:13 55:4,7,14	152:4,5,6,7,8,11	218:15 219:16	202:11 203:23	65:7
55:24 56:12,23	152:15,16	219:25 221:15	204:19 205:11	cross-trained
57:4,12,17	153:23,25 154:3	221:24 223:12	205:25 206:10	44:22
58:14 59:16,18	155:18,20,21,22	223:18 224:8,12	206:17,20,24	curiosity 54:14
60:2,18,25 61:9	155:25 156:3,13	224:19 225:4,5	Counsel 98:2	60:3
61:10 62:2,9	156:20 157:6,18	225:6,7,8,25	counted 237:4	curious 122:10
63:3 64:10 65:6	158:3,14 159:11	226:23 227:5	counting 16:22	125:21 173:7
65:23 66:11,21	159:19 160:3,11	228:2,13,16	236:20	current 12:3
67:8 68:13,17	160:19 161:2,8	229:15,23 230:4	countless 162:6	50:21 99:15
69:8 70:6 71:4	161:9,10,12,13	230:6,9,14,15	165:13	112:4 166:11
71:18 72:5 73:4	161:15,25 162:4	230:18,24	country 94:16,20	172:17 176:13
73:10,15,19,23	162:5,15,23	231:12,20,22,23	134:6 153:13	196:3,4 217:7
74:15,19,22,23	163:5,10,15,25	231:25 232:22	County 139:11	217:18
74:25 75:16	164:18 167:3,10	234:2,11 235:7	couple 4:6 5:17	currently 17:11
76:2,11 96:19	167:15 168:9,20	236:3,14 237:10	6:23 12:5 24:4	61:18 81:11
97:4 100:16,23	169:4,10 170:9	237:23 238:2,5	26:23,25 49:8	curtail 160:4
101:20,24 102:2	170:15,23,25	238:8,15,23	49:22 127:9	customers 144:10
102:3,5,10,19	171:2,5,14,17	239:4,10,17,22	140:24 150:21	cut 108:23
103:23 104:12	171:22 172:13	240:4,9,18,22	156:4 158:12	cuts 71:15
104:19 105:7,13	172:15,20,24	241:2,9,19,22	199:14 203:21	CVN 37:6 39:21
, -	, , , <u>, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , </u>	, , ,		
			1	1

41:6,18	day-to-day 52:7	127:15 128:2	4:10 63:21 79:4	difference 42:2,7
CVNs 39:23	52:11	200:8,10,13,21	99:24	43:4,15 153:7
41:22	DC 123:4	200:25 201:3,6	depend 25:12	159:6 182:6
Cyber 31:12	DC47 7:17	Delaware 139:11	dependent 74:8	223:3
cycle 59:22 73:9	dead 199:13	delinquencies	depending 40:18	differences 6:12
112:15	deadline 234:17	63:13 209:16	49:16 110:20	217:9,24
	deal 52:10,13	delinquency 63:7	192:18 203:16	different 20:18
D	147:10 150:7	delinquent 79:5	depends 75:12	22:22,25 24:14
damage 110:25	151:17 153:2	deliverable 60:4	197:15	35:14 56:22
dangerous 42:19	159:12 160:13	deliverables	deposit 78:22	62:23 64:7 66:7
Daniel 97:22	dealing 11:5	30:16	depth 17:9	81:23 82:16
122:15 124:25	95:10 207:17	demand 128:4	Deputy 77:5	83:10 104:5
125:3,4 129:2,9	229:19	demanding 236:6	90:17 97:14	109:25 114:10
130:4 132:13	debt 58:25 59:3	democratic 13:5	102:16,20	127:23 130:22
199:20 200:4,12	77:19 79:8 80:7	demographics	describe 5:24	130:23 134:24
201:4	82:5,10,12,13	91:7	11:25 100:24	140:6,6 146:10
DARRELL 1:10	83:4 85:19,25	denial 230:25	described 150:21	154:11,18
data 26:22 36:5	86:4,13,23	234:18 235:24	178:14	167:14 168:23
43:10 73:8,24	87:10,13	denials 234:16	designation	191:17 197:6,9
99:12 116:7,8	decades 33:19	denied 118:6	147:24	216:21 222:18
132:22 161:16	December 79:16	225:14,19 226:8	designed 54:25	224:4,5,6
161:24 169:15	decided 35:4	226:21 227:13	desperate 130:2	differently 146:20
169:17 208:24	90:24	235:16	detail 5:24 12:2	183:12 204:6
208:25 209:3,4	decision 51:21	DENNIS 1:13	details 11:19	difficult 121:13
224:2 228:19	52:3 53:16,19	department 5:10	12:20 129:15	168:3 169:25
database 80:10	53:24 54:2,5	9:12 26:18	determine 61:21	dilemma 122:12
data-inputted	107:12 113:19	27:18,21 29:8	69:3 103:8,12	diligence 109:3
225:20	decisions 52:21	29:17 41:5,9	159:17 188:2	direct 5:8 61:16
date 30:17 39:16	52:23 53:5,12	63:6,19 64:12	202:23	78:22 95:13
115:19 158:8	70:3	64:24 65:11,17	develop 80:5,9	129:14 187:13
159:20 175:18	decline 91:15	69:2 70:7,25	217:6	244:22
188:24 235:14	declining 214:24	72:22 73:5	developed 34:25	direction 67:15
235:23	215:8	79:10 96:24	219:12	69:9,11,21
dates 33:8 108:7	decrease 5:2,4	100:21 101:10	developer 217:21	201:18
dating 94:7	12:22 161:18	117:3 123:12	developers 16:7	directly 81:24
daughters 233:20	180:4 181:4	125:10 176:5,7	development	95:19
DAVID 1:13	183:9	176:14,17,23	18:13,23 19:2,7	Director 4:8,18
day 96:12 112:23	deep 71:15	208:21 216:19	19:22 20:22	30:7 33:3 37:15
112:23 137:13	defease 83:2	departmental	21:5,7,12	61:8 85:12
147:23 148:5	defeasing 88:9	4:12	218:21	90:15,18 97:23
168:4 206:15	defer 47:25	departments	developments	125:5,10 129:11
221:17 242:11	deferral 48:5,7	28:16,21 35:3	19:25 20:6 21:3	149:19 233:5
daylight 42:6	definitely 22:4	35:19 41:21	develops 128:15	disability 44:17
43:18	23:16 46:5	65:8 70:4,22	Devine 97:18	disagrees 222:4
days 42:5 44:20	94:11 120:14	208:20 209:4,13	devised 202:20	disapproves
1 40 17 607 4	186:23	216:16	203:21 222:22	52:19
160:17 207:6				
160:17 207:6 235:8,9,23	degree 81:10	department's	dictate 220:18	discontinued

			I	I
141:12	145:9 146:13,14	Dubow 3:20,24	238:7,10,21	efficiently 209:6
discovering 98:8	158:15 163:18	4:5,8 5:17 6:3	239:2,9,13,19	effort 77:16 79:13
discuss 71:12	165:17 169:15	6:22 7:15 8:3,7	239:24 240:6,14	99:14 101:19
80:22 106:24	169:19 179:4	8:11,20 9:2,7,11	240:20,25 241:6	135:15 204:10
128:14 130:24	192:21 204:15	9:23 10:2,7,13	241:16,21	efforts 79:4 92:12
discussed 33:7	204:16,16	10:22 11:2,8,15	242:10	185:4 187:13
118:8 131:2	205:13 207:11	12:4,11,14 13:2	due 86:16 87:15	eight 97:12 174:2
223:24	207:23 211:20	13:8,20,21 14:2	87:17 91:19	either 19:4 71:9
discussing 204:12	213:22 216:22	14:5,14,22 15:3	93:2 109:3	127:15 147:25
discussion 20:13	219:4,7 222:6	15:7,19 16:2,9	112:6 211:11	153:4 162:8
68:11 125:9	231:13 234:12	17:4,13,16,20	235:14	183:13 184:6
150:17	236:19	18:6,11,22	dumpster 40:24	190:7 201:7
discussions 128:8	dollar 70:2 169:5	19:12,20 20:5	dunks 147:14	225:18,19
128:21 240:7	170:10,16	20:25 21:20	duplicities 71:5	elaborate 6:20
disparity 181:23	dollars 5:12 72:10	22:3,7,16,21	duplicity 65:15	167:16
dispersion 166:15	72:11,12,13	23:3,9,18,25	70:13 71:8	elected 151:20
disrespectful	75:9 84:8	24:5,8,13,18		179:21
154:22	141:18 148:5	25:3,7,10 26:15	E	elections 13:6
distance 137:9	167:11,18	26:24 27:7,10	earlier 6:12 7:8	electrician 179:20
district 5:6 14:7	168:10 170:19	27:14,22 28:5	8:6 12:6 65:9	electronically
14:18 18:15	181:5	28:12,18,22	156:16 160:15	38:11,14
19:5 86:18	door 204:5	29:2,12,19,23	216:24 227:6	eligible 103:13
135:4 138:12,24	dot-com 94:8	33:9 36:12 37:8	231:14	184:13 186:22
161:22 164:25	doubt 191:13,23	37:11 38:3,19	early 42:3,17 82:8	eliminate 19:4
179:22 185:2,21	228:8	45:13,19,23	120:13 191:25	eliminated 19:5
216:7	Dougherty 97:25	46:4,14,20 47:2	234:4	emphasis 5:23
districts 226:4	downtown 203:19	47:13,24 48:13	earn 83:5,5	employee 31:7,8
divide 233:19	downturn 59:7	48:17,24 49:22	earnings 48:6,9	36:5
divisions 4:13,14	Dr 202:10,12	50:24 51:7,19	48:10 52:24	employees 27:25
Doctor 202:11	drastically 118:23	51:24 52:6,12	56:19	31:14 51:13
documentation	191:17 241:11	52:22 53:14,23	easier 26:17 35:5	54:17 125:13
182:18,18	Drayer 97:21	54:3,9,23 55:6	144:24	empty 220:8,11
documented	105:3 133:18	55:11,15 56:4	Ebeid 117:9	220:14
161:21	134:10,11 185:9	56:16,24 57:8	economic 17:22	EMS 44:19 64:4
documents 39:18	186:11,19 187:4	57:13 58:2,22	18:7	encompass
182:12	187:16 225:22	59:2,25 60:11	economists 10:14	170:21
doing 10:17 11:14	226:14,25	60:21 61:4 62:8	ed 126:6,14	encountered
16:20 19:10	227:18 228:6,15	74:7,17 75:11	educating 205:16	112:5
21:21 25:20	229:5 230:8,23	75:21 76:8	education 10:21	encourage 212:2
26:2 33:21	231:3,19 232:20	162:25 163:2,3	126:11 174:14	engaged 153:4
36:21 41:22	Drew 98:2 105:4	163:7 177:10,23	effect 105:17	English 229:9
44:3 64:24 72:4	drilling 207:18	178:15 179:4,18	195:21 203:13	enhance 9:5
74:11 112:15,18	drive 6:10 56:20	180:8,12,19	209:5	167:21
113:9 115:6,7	137:9 232:2	182:4,20 183:3	effective 198:19	enhanced 204:14
116:10 122:22	driven 221:3	183:10 184:8,15	effectively 74:10	enhancing 10:21
122:23,24	driveway 142:14	236:13,15	efficient 67:20	10:23,25 63:6
139:16 144:14	drove 7:3 131:14	237:16,25 238:4	160:8	enormous 49:4

	I	1		I
142:3	evaluator 131:2,3	exchange 13:9	155:2	favor 69:9 111:19
enrolled 185:14	131:3,4,5,15	excited 31:9	Expressway	181:14,17
enrolling 199:18	174:7	155:23	141:3	favorable 109:11
199:24	evaluators 121:14	excluded 15:17	extended 73:7	February 85:22
ensure 54:25	131:9	excuse 115:23	extension 15:14	189:4,4,5,12
entertaining	eventually 50:5	executed 77:23	16:19,23	federal 98:24
67:13	238:20	executive 37:15	extent 121:15	104:7 165:7
enthusiasm 68:20	everybody 35:20	85:11 90:15	122:5 143:8	fee 41:9,11,17
entire 50:2 77:25	35:24 137:6	91:9	147:6 237:5	64:6 211:2
78:6 83:20	138:3,20 139:23	exempt 98:25	extremely 172:10	feel 43:19 143:21
131:8 167:5	143:5 150:3	99:9 102:12,25	ex-officios 51:4,8	143:25
170:20 172:4	151:21 152:21	104:2,14	eyeballed 233:24	feeling 42:20
192:22,25 208:2	156:9 172:7,8	exempted 173:23	eyes 103:7 231:17	fees 64:7 78:18
entirely 35:14	172:22 189:13	exemption 103:14	e-mail 154:10	92:5,9,21
entities 103:3,9	207:16 211:15	103:21 104:23	e-mails 232:3	174:13
103:13 104:6,9	223:10	105:11 134:12		feet 28:8 208:17
121:21	Evestment 92:14	173:24 186:5	F	218:20
entry-level 174:7	evictions 176:7	exemptions 98:15	facilitate 79:3	felt 199:4
environment 95:4	evidence 244:4	184:13	122:5	female 91:8,10
Equalization	exact 132:14	existing 25:5	facing 142:13	female-owned
223:15	163:17 176:9	87:10	facsimile 121:24	92:17,24
equalized 198:2	200:16 222:14	expanding 93:4	fact 55:15 123:2	fewer 211:10
equitable 98:11	exactly 11:8 12:14	expect 116:22	176:18	fiduciary 54:16
180:18 203:2	16:9 20:8	119:25 150:12	factors 201:16	field 131:18,19
equity 93:4,6	133:19 196:22	150:14,18	facts 148:24	157:22 159:7
error 6:9 116:3	233:13 235:4,18	176:11	fair 98:10 171:8	208:25 209:3
213:6,12 219:17	exam 129:13	expected 87:17	178:10 180:17	fight 228:23,25
219:20,21	examine 126:11	expenditures	224:10,13	figure 8:12
especially 42:15	174:25	62:12 70:15	fairly 52:15 75:22	113:16 130:20
152:20 153:6	examining 18:18	expense 15:22	226:16 231:6	135:11 162:10
209:17	18:19	62:20 87:9,16	fall 106:18	235:4
essentially 77:12	example 21:6	167:11 182:12	falls 235:24	figured 215:24
estate 17:8 25:9	24:19 25:22	expenses 12:21	false 39:2,24	233:12
25:10 93:6	40:19 66:12	62:20	familiar 189:10	file 38:25 145:21
111:9 127:11,22	83:11 112:20	experience 53:3	familiarity 127:9	filed 99:7 107:9
128:11 129:6	164:22 166:4	94:17 200:14	families 128:24	108:12,19
173:20 200:14	167:25 168:15	201:6,8,9	137:8	109:23 145:23
201:7 235:14	172:6 198:12	205:19 211:17	far 33:7 74:5 92:8	145:25 146:4
236:10	215:4 217:3	experienced	101:5 107:13	159:2 175:7,11
estimate 79:17	218:14,16 221:7	169:11	108:14 110:13	175:15,23
237:13	223:5	expertise 51:6,10	110:17 111:13	filing 110:13
estimated 78:16	exceeded 94:6	experts 178:21	112:10 122:20	fill 115:21 132:3
estimates 11:20	Excel 68:23	explain 20:23	123:19 133:7,23	filled 115:19
evaluate 69:4,6	exception 151:16	29:21 30:13	180:7 185:14,20	184:14 186:4
174:24	exceptions 147:18	62:10 155:4	196:6 198:19	227:10
evaluating 132:9	150:9 151:19,19	188:19	205:8 239:11,18	filling 225:14
Evaluation 26:20	excess 181:16	explained 139:14	fashion 212:10	227:8 234:20

filter 155:7 182:8 189:18 FLRs 106:11 164:21 165:15 functionality 74:6 fund(5:2,8:20 6:3) functionality 74:6 functionality 74:6 fund(5:2,8:20 6:3) functionality 74:6				_	. 1
finally 31:21 211:22 214:11 109:2,11,16,22 174:15 185:23 6:6,13,14,21,24 7:3,7 15:21,25 5:5,17 9:3,23	filter 155:7	182:8 189:18	FLRs 106:11	164:21 165:15	functionality 74:6
finally 31:21 211:22 214:11 109:2,11,16,22 174:15 185:23 66.6,13,14,21,24 7:3,7 15:21,25 5:21,21 15:61 15:61 15:61 16:21 20:23,25 17:23 15:61	final 48:17 201:17	203:25 204:4	107:5,10,17	165:19 168:23	fund 5:2,8,20 6:3
129/17/230:16 224:16/229:10 230:20/233:8 first-level/99:5 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 118:4/1567.8 129:24/10:12 135:23/36:9 183:17/209:11 150:29:24/210:12 150:29:29 150:29:24/210:12 150:29:29 150:29:24/210:12 150:29:29 150:29:24/210:12 150:29:29 150:29:24/25 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:24/25 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:24/25 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:24/25 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:24/25 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:24/25 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:24/25 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:24/25 150:29:29 150:29:29 150:29:24/25 150:29:29 150:29 150:29 150:29 150:29 15	finally 31:21	211:22 214:11	109:2,11,16,22	174:15 185:23	6:6,13,14,21,24
finance 3:18 4:9 230:20 233:8 first-level 9:5 fluctuates 158:10 196:18 197:11 16:25 17:6 24:21 49:9 50:9 4:18 5:9 23:8 26:18 28:14 118:41 56:7.8 first-level 9:5 158:13 203:52 204:7,11 24:21 49:9 50:9 24:21 49:9 50:9 24:21 49:9 50:9 56:9,11 57:10 24:21 49:9 50:9 56:9,11 57:10 24:21 49:9 50:9 56:9,11 57:10 24:21 49:9 50:9 56:9,11 57:10 24:21 49:9 50:9 56:9,11 57:10 24:21 49:9 50:9 56:9,11 57:10 24:21 49:9 50:9 56:9,11 57:10 24:21 49:9 50:9 56:9,11 57:10 24:21 49:9 50:9 56:9,11 57:10 205:7 210:6 66:9,11 57:10 66:9,11 57:10 66:3 64:3 77:19,25 79:14 66:3 64:3 64:3 79:25 137:18 86:3,4,8,13 87:5 85:21,21,7,19 86:3,4,8,13 87:5 85:12,17,19 93:3,17 94:22 93:3,17 94:22 93:3,17 94:22 93:3,17 94:22 93:3,17 94:22 93:3,17 94:22 93:3,17 94:22 93:3,17 94:22 17 95:19 17 90:24 100:2,7,11 11 49:21 16:01 91 13:21:16 230:12 17 90:24 17 90:24 17 90:24 17 90:24 17 90:24 17 90:24 17 90:24 17 11 <td< td=""><td></td><td>224:16 229:10</td><td>181:3 209:19</td><td>190:23 191:9,12</td><td>7:3,7 15:21,25</td></td<>		224:16 229:10	181:3 209:19	190:23 191:9,12	7:3,7 15:21,25
4:18 5:9 23:8 first-level 9:5 158:13 203:5 204:7,11 24:21 49:9 50:9 50:9	finance 3:18 4:9	230:20 233:8	fluctuates 158:10	196:18 197:11	
26:18 28:14 29:8,10,13,17 35:23 36:9 38:17 209:11 63:15 64:12 70:7,16 80:5 100:9 149:19 209:24 210:12 77:7,16 80:5 100:9 149:19 233:4 25:15 61:20 78:7,179,20,21 Finances 70:9 Finance's 64:11 financials 32:15 financial 2:22 98:5 99:16,19 100:2,7,11 101:3 178:6 final 192:20 final 2:22 150:15,18 154:22 162:17 164:10 186:17 164:10 186:17 164:10 186:17 164:10 186:17 164:10 186:17 165:11 136:2 finished 106:19 114:67, 156:11 136:2 finished 106:19 114:67, 156:11 230:13 115:20 firm 17:15 31:12 31:12,13 168:12 31:1	4:18 5:9 23:8	first-level 99:5			24:21 49:9 50:9
298.10.13.17 156:11 182:21 flying 190:14 211:3 212:22 57:19.25 79:14 60us 26:2 213:24 237:13 77:19.25 79:14 60us 26:2 79:25 137:18 86:34.81 87:5 79:27 14 79:20 148:23 19:217 93:31,7 94:22 99:31,7 94:22 99:79 97:17 fundamentals 120:5 100:27,11 100:3 178:6 filowed 55:25 142:13 147:3 142:					
35:23 36:9		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			*
63:15 64:12 70:7,16 80:5 100:9 149:19 233:4 22:3,25 17:23 23:35:1 100:9 149:19 23:36:1 25:15 61:20 73:7 77:9,20,21 78:14,23 85:25 75:22 100:2,7,11 financials 32:15 financials 32:15 financials 32:15 financials 32:15 financials 32:15 financials 64:11 10:3 178:6 financials 32:15 final 100:2,7,11 101:3 178:6 fiscall yill, 38:23 100:2,7,11 100:2,7,11 100:3 178:6 follow 113:22 152:16 230:12 five 2:22 5:21 47:2,5,11 114:4 114:12 122:8 freeze 184:23 137:5,10,18 followed 55:25 fire 47:2,5,11 114:4 financials 32:15 fire 48:10 five 2:22 5:21 47:2,5,11 114:4 financials 32:15 final 14:21 13:6:2 final 14:21 13:6:2 13:12 14:17 13:6:2 144:17 148:23 firefighter 13:10 firefighters 7:20 firm 17:15 31:12 31:12,13 168:12 31:12,13 168:12 116:15 firms 31:18 4:6 da:3 135:4 folous 13:24 folowed 13:24 five 2:22:5:3 followed 55:25 followed 55:25 followed 55:25 followed 55:25 fire 228:13 freeze 28:13 freeze 28:13 freeze 28:13 freeze 184:23 freeze 184:	, , ,		• 0		
To:7,16 80:5 100:9 149:19 2:23,25 17:23 2:23,25 17:23 2:23,25 17:23 2:23,25 17:23 2:33,24 2:51.5 61:20 73:7 77:9,20,21 78:14,23 85:25 135:4 144:23 147:12 98:5 99:16,19 238:19 224:20 98:5 99:16,19 238:19 100:27,11 238:19 100:27,11 238:19 100:27,11 144:21 144:21 144:21 144:21 144:21 144:21 144:21 144:21 144:21 144:21 144:21 144:21 144:21 136:2 137:5,10,18 136:2 137:5,10,18 136:2 136:2 141:23,25 156:11 230:13 156:21 221:13 156:21 221:13 156:21 221:13 156:21 221:13 156:21 221:13 156:21 221:13 166:21 221:13 166:21 221:13 166:21 221:13 166:21 221:13 166:21 221:13 169:5 16					'
100:9 149:19 2:23,25 17:23 25:15 61:20 73:7 77:9,20,21 78:14,23 85:25 78:14,23 85:25 78:14,23 85:25 78:14,23 85:25 78:14,23 85:25 78:14,23 85:25 78:14,23 85:25 78:14,22 192:17 98:5 99:16,19 235:13,18,20 238:19 100:2,7,11 101:3 178:6 financial 2:22 100:2,7,11 financial 2:20 100:13,178:6 fiscally 83:23 150:15,18 Fiscals 77:24 78:5 fit 68:10					
233:4	,				, ,
finances 70:9 73:7 77:9,20,21 folks 226:2 148:23 192:17 93:3,17 94:22 95:7 99:17 fundamentals financial 2:22 98:5 99:16,19 238:19 178:21 210:5 fundamentals final 29:20 fiscally 83:23 Fiscals 77:24 78:5 fit 68:10 fiscally 83:23 Francis 90:14 funded 55:20 150:15,18 Fiscals 77:24 78:5 fit 68:10 fits 68:9 followed 55:25 144:21 frame 20:18 128:11 funded 55:20 99:24 fine 45:18 142:24 fits 68:9 five 2:22 5:21 following 46:22 free 28:13 47:14 49:8 53:6 47:14 49:8 53:6 55:21,22 56:7 57:15 58:7 59:6 <			C		' ' '
Finance's 64:11 financial 2:22 78:14,23 85:25 98:5 99:16,19 234:19,22 235:4 224:20 frame 20:18 178:21 20:18 95:7 99:17 fundamentals 128:11 funded 55:20 5:22 financials 32:15 financials 32:15 find 129:20 fiscally 83:23 150:15,18 Fiscals 77:24 78:5 fit 68:10 fit 68:10 fit 68:10 fit 68:10 five 2:22 5:21 79:511 five 2:22 5:21 179:511 five 2:22 5:21 179:511 five 2:22 5:21 179:511 five 2:22 5:21 179:511 fine 45:18 142:24 172:20,23 89:23 179:51 179:512 179:512 179:512 179:513 179:512 179:513 179:5					*
financial 2:22 98:5 99:16,19 235:13,18,20 frame 20:18 fundamentals 5:22 100:2,7,11 238:19 178:21 210:5 128:11 financials 32:15 fiscally 83:23 fiscally 83:23 Francis 90:14 funded 55:20 150:15,18 Fiscals 77:24 78:5 fit 68:10 fit 68:10 fit 68:10 fits 68:9 fit 68:10 fits 68:9 fit 68:10 fits 68:9 following 46:22 free 28:13 free 28:13 47:14 49:8 53:6 following 4:17 47:3 freezes 184:23 55:21,22 56:7 47:25,11 114:4 185:12 186:4 55:21,22 56:7 57:15 58:7 59:6 57:15 58:7 59:6 57:15 58:7 59:6 57:15 58:7 59:6 57:15 58:7 59:6 57:15 58:7 59:6 57:15 58:7 59:6 57:15 58:7 59:6 57:15 58:7 59:6 freezes 177:6 freezes 177:6 freezes 177:6 57:15 58:7 59:6 freezes 177:6 freeze 184:23 freeze 184:23 freeze 184:23<					,
5:22 financials 32:15 100:2,7,11 101:3 178:6 fill 29:20 128:11 financials 32:15 fill 31:22 fix 63:12 178:21 210:5 Francis 90:14 funded 55:20 go:20 128:11 funded 55:20 go:20 150:15,18 fill 15:22 fill 15:15,18 fill 15:22 fill 15:22 fill 16:10 186:17 fill 16:10 186:19 fill 16:10 18:11 fill 16:10 18:10 fill 1		,	,		
financials 32:15 find 129:20 fiscally 83:23 follow 113:22 152:16 230:12 fiscally 83:23 Francis 90:14 Franklin 141:3 147:3 funding 4:17 47:3 142:13 147:3 free 228:13 142:13 147:3 free 228:13 142:13 147:3 free 228:13 free		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
find 129:20 fiscally 83:23 152:16 230:12 followed 55:25 Franklin 141:3 147:3 free 228:13 90:24 funding 4:17 47:3 154:22 162:17 164:10 186:17 195:11 fits 68:9 five 2:22 5:21 fits 68:9 five 2:22 5:21 following 46:22 freeze 184:23 47:14 49:8 53:6 55:21,22 56:7 182:4 182:4 182:4 136:2 72:20,23 89:23 137:5,10,18 139:2 142:11 114:12 122:8 followup 75:3 158:12 186:4 156:22 57:3,11 freeze 177:6 freese 177:6 freesh 148:20 59:12,23 75:6 followup 75:3 158:22 159:23 155:10 160:15 150:10 173:6 follow-up 125:25 follow-up 125:25 160:19 154:21,23,25 209:9 158:22 159:23 160:19 155:10 160:15 165:21 221:13 236:8 firefighter 13:10 firefighter 7:20 firefighters 7:20 firefighters 7:20 firefighters 7:20 firefighters 7:20 firefighters 9:216,17,25 five-year 202:22 fix 122:11 14:25 five-year 202:22 fix 122:11 14:25 firespoing 244:7 flat6oted 126:18 fires 9:16,17,25 firespoing 244:7 flatfooted 126:18 form 103:5 form 17:6 formal 175:6 formal 175:0 formal 175:0 formal 175:0 formal 175:0 formal 175:0 formal 175:0 formal 1					
150:15,18					
154:22 162:17		•			
164:10 186:17 195:11 five 2:22 5:21 47:2,5,11 114:4 185:12 186:4 56:22 57:3,11 57:15 58:7 59:6 182:4 137:5,10,18 139:2 142:11 136:2 144:17 148:23 154:21,23,25 155:10 160:15 165:21 221:13 165:21 231:14 165:21 231:14 160:5 161:19 175:10 182:19 160:5 161:19 175:10 182:19 175:1	′				\circ
195:11					
fine 45:18 142:24 72:20,23 89:23 114:12 122:8 freezes 177:6 57:15 58:7 59:6 finish 128:11 139:2 142:11 139:2 142:11 115:10 173:6 fringe 4:22 5:3 76:7 91:12,22 finished 106:19 144:6,7 156:11 230:13 155:10 160:15 fools 90:24 158:22 159:23 funds 54:17 59:20 firefighter 13:10 firefighters 7:20 five-minute FOP 7:20 frout and a finity funds 54:17 59:20 firefighters 7:20 five-minute FOP 7:20 frout and a finity funds 54:17 59:20 firefighters 7:20 five-minute FOP 7:20 frout and a finity funds 54:17 59:20 firefighters 7:20 five-minute FOP 7:20 frout and a finity funds 54:17 59:20 firefighter 13:10 five-minute footage 139:21 frout and a finity funds 54:17 59:20 firefighter 13:10 five-year 202:22 forefront 71:12 fruition 69:15 further 136:3 funds 54:17 59:20 firesh 148:20 forest 13:14 forest 13:14 forest 13:14 full 20 full 4:20 full 4:20 full 4:20 full 4:20			C		·
182:4 finish 128:11 137:5,10,18 followup 75:3 fresh 148:20 fringe 4:22 5:3 59:12,23 75:6 76:7 91:12,22 finished 106:19 141:6,7 156:11 230:13 154:21,23,25 155:10 160:15 209:9 fools 90:24 158:22 159:23 front 60:16 177:3 front 60:16 179:10 182:19 93:6 59:12,23 75:6 76:7 91:12,22 177:3 front 60:16 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 179:10 182:19 </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>•</td>					•
finish 128:11 139:2 142:11 115:10 173:6 fringe 4:22 5:3 76:7 91:12,22 finished 106:19 144:17 148:23 154:21,23,25 209:9 158:22 159:23 funds 54:17 59:20 141:6,7 156:11 155:10 160:15 fool's 242:11,13 169:24 2:11,13 179:10 182:19 93:6 firefighter 13:10 five-minute FOP 7:20 frontage 137:14 furious 219:10 firefighters 7:20 five-minute FOP 7:20 fruition 69:15 furious 219:10 31:12,13 168:12 five-year 202:22 forefront 71:12 foregoing 244:7 FTA 59:18 235:16 firms 92:16,17,25 flagged 233:11 flagged 233:11 forget 130:14 FTI 59:19,21 future 6:2 19:19 first 3:18 4:6 flat 241:7 flagged 233:11 formal 175:6 formal 175:6 for 24 for 24 FY12 92:4,11 FY12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 floodplain 148:2 formerly 30:8 formerly 30:8 forward 3:14 full 44:6 48:2 FY15 4:11 12:23 92:8 103:14,21 flow 77:20 80:14 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 G </td <td></td> <td>· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
136:2 144:17 148:23 follow-up 125:25 front 60:16 177:3 finished 106:19 141:6,7 156:11 155:10 160:15 209:9 158:22 159:23 funds 54:17 59:20 141:6,7 156:11 165:21 221:13 Fool's 242:11,13 179:10 182:19 93:6 firefighter 13:10 236:8 footage 139:21 frontage 137:14 furious 219:10 firefighters 7:20 five-minute FOP 7:20 furition 69:15 further 136:3 31:12,13 168:12 114:25 forefront 71:12 freation 69:15 future 6:2 19:19 169:5 fix 122:11 244:19 FTI 59:19,21 future 6:2 19:19 169:5 fix 241:7 flagged 233:11 form 103:5 63:23 66:4 for:24 fry12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 flatfooted 126:18 forms 232:10 full 44:6 48:2 fy14:9 92:5,10 92:8 103:14,21 flow 77:20 80:14 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 112:20 131:20 fry15 4:11 12:23 10:6 111:24 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 Gain 208:24,25 10:10:10:11 10:10:10 <			_		· ·
finished 106:19 154:21,23,25 209:9 158:22 159:23 funds 54:17 59:20 141:6,7 156:11 165:21 221:13 fools 90:24 160:5 161:19 93:6 firefighter 13:10 236:8 footage 139:21 frontage 137:14 furious 219:10 firefighters 7:20 five-minute forefront 71:12 fruition 69:15 furious 219:10 168:13,14 169:3 fix 122:11 244:19 fruition 69:15 148:9 153:2 169:5 fix 122:11 244:19 forget 130:14 future 6:2 19:19 169:5 fix 22:11 forget 130:14 form 103:5 form 103:5 first 3:18 4:6 flat 241:7 form 103:5 form 103:5 formal 175:6 for:24 fruit 62:21 fry12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 floodplain 148:2 forms 232:10 full 44:6 48:2 fy14 5:12 92:8 92:8 103:14,21 flow 77:20 80:14 forward 3:14 112:20 131:20 fr12 35:13 10:6 11:24 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 112:20 131:20 fr12 35:13 10:217 12:13,19 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:1				C	· ·
141:6,7 156:11 155:10 160:15 fools 90:24 160:5 161:19 93:6 230:13 165:21 221:13 fools 90:24 179:10 182:19 fund's 49:25 firefighter 13:10 236:8 footage 139:21 frontage 137:14 furious 219:10 firefighters 7:20 five-minute 114:25 forefront 71:12 fruition 69:15 148:9 153:2 31:12,13 168:12 fix 122:11 foregoing 244:7 FTA 59:18 235:16 168:13,14 169:3 fix 122:11 forget 130:14 forget 130:14 for 103:5 firest 3:18 4:6 flat 241:7 form 103:5 form 103:5 form 103:5 formal 175:6 formal 175:6 formal 175:6 formal 175:6 formerly 30:8 formerly 30:8 formerly 30:8 full 44:6 48:2 FY14 5:12 92:8 FY15 4:11 12:23 92:8 103:14,21 flow 77:20 80:14 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 132:7 140:2,2 Gain 208:24,25 106:11:24 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 fain 208:24,25			_		
230:13 165:21 221:13 Fool's 242:11,13 179:10 182:19 Fund's 49:25 firefighter 13:10 five-minute FOP 7:20 frontage 137:14 furious 219:10 firm 17:15 31:12 114:25 forefront 71:12 frontage 137:14 furition 69:15 further 136:3 31:12,13 168:12 five-year 202:22 foregoing 244:7 FTA 59:18 235:16 168:13,14 169:3 fix 122:11 foregoing 244:7 FTI 59:19,21 future 6:2 19:19 169:5 fix 122:11 foregt 130:14 foregoing 244:7 224:19 future 6:2 19:19 169:5 fix 49:25 foregoing 244:7 fruition 69:15 148:9 153:2 235:16 fix 122:11 foregoing 244:7 foregoing 244:7 for 10 61:12 169:5 fix 122:11 foregoing 244:7 for 10 61:12 22:12 116:11 169:5 flagged 233:11 form 103:5 63:23 66:4 for:24 FY12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 flexibility 5:22 floodplain 148:2 forms 232:10 full 44:6 48:2 FY14 5:12 92:8 92:8 103:14,21 80:17,22					
firefighter 13:10 236:8 footage 139:21 frontage 137:14 furious 219:10 firefighters 7:20 five-minute 114:25 forefront 71:12 fruition 69:15 148:9 153:2 31:12,13 168:12 fix 122:11 foregoing 244:7 FTA 59:18 235:16 168:13,14 169:3 fix 122:11 forget 130:14 f0:10 61:12 22:12 116:11 169:5 fixed 93:5 flagged 233:11 forget 130:14 f0:10 61:12 22:12 116:11 130:5 157:9 flat 241:7 flat 241:7 form 103:5 63:23 66:4 167:24 204:17 23:19 24:21 flatfooted 126:18 formal 175:6 formerly 30:8 full 44:6 48:2 FY12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 floodplain 148:2 flow 77:20 80:14 forward 3:14 112:20 131:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 flow 77:20 80:14 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 F12 35:13 110:6 111:24 80:17,22 17:4 118:9 236:19 gain 208:24,25 12:19 126:16 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25	*				
firefighters 7:20 five-minute FOP 7:20 141:20 further 136:3 31:12,13 168:12 114:25 forefront 71:12 fruition 69:15 148:9 153:2 168:13,14 169:3 169:5 fix 122:11 244:19 FTI 59:19,21 future 6:2 19:19 60:10 61:12 22:12 116:11 22:12 116:11 22:12 116:11 130:5 157:9 first 3:18 4:6 flat 241:7 florm 103:5 form 103:5 63:23 66:4 167:24 204:17 23:19 24:21 flatfooted 126:18 formal 175:6 formal 175:6 forms 232:10 full 44:6 48:2 FY12 92:4,11 92:8 103:14,21 floor 27:24 235:5 61:20 99:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 flow 77:20 80:14 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 235:13 110:6 111:24 80:17,22 FLR 107:11,19 117:4 118:9 122:19 126:16 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25			,		
firm 17:15 31:12 114:25 forefront 71:12 fruition 69:15 148:9 153:2 31:12,13 168:12 fix 122:11 244:19 FTA 59:18 235:16 169:5 fix 122:11 244:19 60:10 61:12 22:12 116:11 firms 92:16,17,25 flagged 233:11 Forgive 199:13 62:5 63:17,19 130:5 157:9 first 3:18 4:6 flat 241:7 form 103:5 63:23 66:4 167:24 204:17 23:19 24:21 flatfooted 126:18 formal 175:6 67:24 FY12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 flexibility 5:22 forms 232:10 full 44:6 48:2 FY14 5:12 92:8 92:8 103:14,21 floor 27:24 gloor 27:24 235:5 61:20 99:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 flow 77:20 80:14 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 F12 35:13 110:6 111:24 80:17,22 FLR 107:11,19 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25	0				
31:12,13 168:12 five-year 202:22 foregoing 244:7 FTA 59:18 235:16 168:13,14 169:3 fix 122:11 244:19 60:10 61:12 22:12 116:11 169:5 fixed 93:5 flagged 233:11 Forgive 199:13 62:5 63:17,19 130:5 157:9 first 3:18 4:6 flat 241:7 florm 103:5 63:23 66:4 167:24 204:17 23:19 24:21 flatfooted 126:18 formal 175:6 67:24 FY12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 floodplain 148:2 forms 232:10 full 44:6 48:2 FY14 5:12 92:8 92:8 103:14,21 flow 77:20 80:14 235:5 61:20 99:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 flow 77:20 80:14 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 G 121:7 122:13,19 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25	0				
168:13,14 169:3 fix 122:11 244:19 FTI 59:19,21 future 6:2 19:19 169:5 fixed 93:5 forget 130:14 60:10 61:12 22:12 116:11 firms 92:16,17,25 flagged 233:11 forgive 199:13 62:5 63:17,19 130:5 157:9 first 3:18 4:6 flat 241:7 form 103:5 63:23 66:4 167:24 204:17 23:19 24:21 flatfooted 126:18 formal 175:6 67:24 FY12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 floodplain 148:2 forms 232:10 full 44:6 48:2 FY14 5:12 92:8 92:8 103:14,21 flow 77:20 80:14 80:17,22 235:5 61:20 99:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 flow 77:20 80:14 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 G 12:17 122:13,19 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25					
169:5 fixed 93:5 forget 130:14 60:10 61:12 22:12 116:11 first 3:18 4:6 flat 241:7 form 103:5 63:23 66:4 167:24 204:17 23:19 24:21 flatfooted 126:18 form 103:5 67:24 FY12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 flexibility 5:22 formerly 30:8 fuel 62:21 FY13 92:5,10 74:8 79:20,21 floodplain 148:2 flow 77:20 80:14 forward 3:14 112:20 131:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 flow 77:20 80:14 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 F12 35:13 12:17 122:13,19 FLR 107:11,19 117:4 118:9 236:19 Gain 208:24,25 122:19 126:16 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25	· ·	•	0 0		
firms 92:16,17,25 flagged 233:11 Forgive 199:13 62:5 63:17,19 130:5 157:9 first 3:18 4:6 flat 241:7 form 103:5 63:23 66:4 FY12 92:4,11 23:19 24:21 flatfooted 126:18 formal 175:6 67:24 FY12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 flexibility 5:22 floodplain 148:2 forms 232:10 fuel 62:21 FY13 92:5,10 92:8 103:14,21 floor 27:24 gloor 27:24 flow 77:20 80:14 forward 3:14 112:20 131:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 F12 35:13 122:19 126:16 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25	· ·			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
first 3:18 4:6 flat 241:7 form 103:5 63:23 66:4 167:24 204:17 23:19 24:21 flatfooted 126:18 formal 175:6 67:24 FY12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 flexibility 5:22 floodplain 148:2 forms 232:10 full 44:6 48:2 FY13 92:5,10 74:8 79:20,21 floor 27:24 floor 27:24 flow 77:20 80:14			C		
23:19 24:21 flatfooted 126:18 formal 175:6 67:24 FY12 92:4,11 45:15 71:24 flexibility 5:22 formerly 30:8 fuel 62:21 FY13 92:5,10 74:8 79:20,21 floodplain 148:2 forms 232:10 full 44:6 48:2 FY14 5:12 92:8 92:8 103:14,21 flow 77:20 80:14 235:5 61:20 99:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 flow 77:20 80:14 30:16 67:14 112:20 131:20 F12 35:13 121:7 122:13,19 FLR 107:11,19 117:4 118:9 236:19 G 122:19 126:16 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25		00		,	
45:15 71:24 flexibility 5:22 formerly 30:8 fuel 62:21 FY13 92:5,10 74:8 79:20,21 92:8 103:14,21 floor 27:24 235:5 61:20 99:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 10w 77:20 80:14 30:16 67:14 112:20 131:20 F12 35:13 121:7 122:13,19 FLR 107:11,19 117:4 118:9 132:7 140:2,2 236:19 122:19 126:16 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25					
74:8 79:20,21 floodplain 148:2 forms 232:10 full 44:6 48:2 FY14 5:12 92:8 92:8 103:14,21 floor 27:24 235:5 61:20 99:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 flow 77:20 80:14 30:16 67:14 112:20 131:20 F12 35:13 112:7 122:13,19 FLR 107:11,19 117:4 118:9 236:19 236:19 Gain 208:24,25 122:19 126:16 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 full 44:6 48:2 FY14 5:12 92:8					, and the second
92:8 103:14,21 floor 27:24 235:5 61:20 99:20 FY15 4:11 12:23 105:19 108:15 flow 77:20 80:14 forward 3:14 112:20 131:20 F12 35:13 110:6 111:24 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 236:19 122:19 126:16 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25		· ·			,
105:19 108:15 flow 77:20 80:14 forward 3:14 112:20 131:20 F12 35:13 110:6 111:24 80:17,22 30:16 67:14 132:7 140:2,2 236:19 122:19 126:16 108:11,20 144:3 151:24 162:11 fully 74:13 100:9 gain 208:24,25	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	_			
110:6 111:24 121:7 122:13,19 122:19 126:16	· ·				
121:7 122:13,19 FLR 107:11,19 117:4 118:9 236:19 G gain 208:24,25					
122:19 126:16				· ·	G
200.00		· ·			
171.7 173.3		· ·			_
	1/1.71/3.3	150,25	103.11,10	277.3	
				<u> </u>	

	1	1	1	1
Garage 81:14	given 47:22,24	218:3 222:11,13	171:9 174:14	13:18,22 14:3
garnish 175:21	93:18 144:3	227:24 230:11	175:17,23	14:10,19,24
gas 141:21	203:24,24 217:3	235:5 237:17,21	176:10 179:19	15:5,9,24 16:4
gear 107:15 205:6	giving 129:14	238:14 241:7,11	179:24 181:8	16:12 17:10,14
general 5:8 15:21	154:21 167:22	241:13	183:13 187:2,24	17:18 18:3,9,16
15:25 17:6 21:7	glad 163:22	goal 35:17,17	189:24 190:23	19:9,13 20:3,12
55:25 75:9	glance 71:24	99:3,11 101:21	191:3,12 192:7	20:17 21:15,25
77:19,25 79:14	glory 206:15	101:23 111:23	192:15 196:18	22:5,10,19,24
86:4,8,13 99:17	GMA 131:13	112:3 118:12	197:11 203:5	23:5,14,21
109:24 140:11	134:25 215:15	131:16 160:21	204:6,11 205:7	74:24,25 75:16
195:14 196:16	GMAs 133:16,20	189:7 190:2	205:14 212:22	76:2,11 102:2,4
199:23	133:23 134:2,20	191:9,15 192:8	213:23,24	102:5,10,19
generally 27:5	134:21 135:7	192:12 224:14	214:21 215:3	103:23 104:12
82:3 197:10	212:23	goals 30:15	217:17,19 218:5	104:19 105:7,13
generate 10:10	go 6:15 7:12 8:11	gobs 145:10	218:24,25 219:2	105:18,24
84:4	12:8 14:21	goes 29:12,14	219:2,19,21	194:18,19
generated 77:19	15:11 16:21	56:19 58:7 65:8	220:22 221:10	195:13,20
83:20 87:22	21:17 22:11,11	152:18 153:20	227:3 232:18	196:10,22 198:4
88:12	24:20 25:2 26:2	222:3,10 236:16	240:10 241:12	198:8,16,22
generates 80:16	29:10 31:20	going 13:9 14:4	241:13	199:6
generational	35:13 39:16	15:13 23:15,19	good 2:2 3:19,20	Gosh 32:20
228:22	43:24 48:22	25:12 27:4	12:17 13:20,21	gotten 94:22
gentrification	49:6,14 53:19	29:23 30:19	26:14,15 30:4	139:4 196:19
240:12 241:10	54:21 58:19	35:8 37:25,25	36:20,23 37:14	201:13,13
getting 67:9 74:8	61:22 64:22	39:12 43:19	37:17,19 42:14	governing 47:18
109:7,9,10	74:12 79:17	50:19 54:20,21	44:4 45:12,13	government 70:9
112:11 158:4,4	86:6 110:7	57:15 60:10	61:8,10 65:22	98:24 104:7
179:5 182:8	111:2 114:24	62:24 66:14,22	66:2 68:11	109:25 122:2
198:19 204:18	116:13 125:18	68:7,25 72:3	76:22,25 84:21	129:22
204:21 209:21	137:8 140:16	78:22 80:21	85:9 90:6,8,12	governmental
230:3 232:14,15	141:5,21 142:18	86:6 89:20,21	94:23 95:3	46:23 47:11
234:5,6,7	145:19 148:9,13	90:22 92:24	96:12 97:4,6,8	103:3 104:6,9
gig 126:19	149:2,16,17,18	103:12,16	102:7,8,18	go-around 171:4
Gillen 202:10,13	149:20,22	107:12 108:13	105:6 115:8	Graduate 165:2
give 11:11 24:19	150:15,18 154:2	117:6 118:9	120:25 121:2	granted 118:5
42:5 67:7 72:13	155:13,14	128:7,13 131:8	126:24 127:2,18	184:7 237:6
77:9 82:22	158:21,22	134:19 138:17	128:9 129:8	grassroots 185:4
113:15 117:23	159:24 160:12	139:15 142:15	130:17,18	great 36:9 37:21
118:8 125:13	161:10,19	143:6 145:11,16	134:10 135:13	37:22 39:11,21
130:2 144:4	168:17,25	145:20 146:11	138:5 146:14	40:2,2 44:23
145:22 148:19	172:19 178:5,6	152:24 154:2,7	147:23 152:13	73:10 101:5
148:21 158:18	182:19 183:11	157:23 158:8	152:14 155:9	121:9 163:22
164:21 175:9	187:25 188:5,14	159:22 163:16	167:24 198:12	181:22 186:12
182:11,14	192:15 193:24	164:10,19	204:22 218:14	207:23 212:10
188:19 209:15	205:8,22 208:24	165:17 167:17	223:5,25 226:16	216:11 218:16
218:13 224:20	210:7,13,18	169:13,15	231:13 232:15	230:7 232:2
234:19	211:16 216:12	170:11,11 171:6	Goode 1:11 13:17	234:7,10
	-	-	-	-

			I	I
greater 55:8	128:3 188:23	213:9	78:10 116:7,16	184:11,16
greatly 204:14	190:18 193:23	happens 75:13,14	121:22 124:10	185:16 186:12
green 33:17	213:12	75:15 145:13	147:5,7 178:21	206:25 207:2,7
Greenlee 1:11	guideline 92:18	158:24 171:11	225:2 228:25	207:22 209:8
96:19 97:4	guidelines 216:25	172:4 189:10	232:6,6 235:4	210:25 211:9
100:16,23	guts 206:15	220:13	239:24 241:25	212:6,13,17
101:20,24 106:3	guy 139:14	happy 4:6 5:14	helped 202:13	213:4,25 214:10
106:12,22	140:18 146:19	67:5 81:5 87:24	helpful 95:12,18	225:7,8,25
107:18,23	150:23	93:10 132:15	96:3 132:19	226:23 227:5
108:21,25 110:2	guys 44:3 158:15	228:11	143:21 201:11	228:2,13,16
110:16 111:12	187:24 228:4	hard 112:22	227:23 229:8,12	229:15,23 230:4
111:18 113:12	234:9,11	192:12 207:17	helps 69:12	230:6,15
114:5,16,23		233:19	135:10 239:15	Henon's 231:25
120:19 126:3	H	Harrisburg 14:16	Henon 1:12 26:11	hesitant 120:14
130:9,13 135:22	half 8:24 38:8	76:4 95:11	26:12,16 27:2,8	Hey 67:14
136:7,15 149:10	86:15,20 87:7	Harvey 177:20	27:11,17,23	Hi 61:7 125:3
152:4,6 153:25	87:12 141:17	hate 142:17	28:7,13,19,23	233:3
155:18 161:9	154:25 157:13	head 45:17 70:8	29:4,16,20 30:5	high 144:18 150:6
162:23 170:25	181:9	145:6,7	30:12 31:23	223:7
171:14,17,22	hall 1:6 164:23	headed 67:16	32:2,17,21 33:4	higher 8:14 46:16
172:15,20,24	hand 182:19	68:18	34:7,12,17	48:8 49:3 55:17
179:13 186:13	Handa 90:16	health 12:21	35:16,22 36:8	55:20 56:20
186:25 187:14	handle 44:9,10,14	56:11	36:17,20,25	57:11,15 87:17
187:18 194:15	100:14 109:16	hear 136:13	37:5,9,17,21	113:22 123:5
199:9 206:23	109:17 140:20	150:20 173:7	38:7,15,21 39:8	126:6,14 138:15
214:14 225:5	155:6 156:18	175:20	39:11,20,25	171:20 197:14
230:9,18,24	157:3 196:23	heard 8:2 25:13	40:6,16 41:19	197:17 237:2
231:12,20 242:4	213:20 232:15	69:14 106:17	41:25 42:11	highest 217:7,18
grieve 153:15,16	handled 110:13	110:2 146:19	43:7,13 44:8,23	highlight 77:14
153:17	120:4 175:7	157:5,24 160:21	45:4 59:17,18	highlighted 72:22
ground 140:25	201:25	175:24 176:16	60:2,18,25	hinder 65:2
143:2	handles 201:19	176:16,18,22	61:10 62:2,9	hire 31:7 101:2,19
group 63:15	202:4	178:2 182:8	63:3 64:10 65:6	116:16 143:8,10
125:11 169:11	handling 113:2	196:11,15	65:23 66:11,21	174:7
169:13,14	151:14	hearing 2:3 23:19	67:8 68:13,17	hires 125:14
186:16	handwriting	43:25 44:20	69:8 70:6 71:4	hiring 36:4
grouped 67:25	226:17 231:7	55:18 109:4	71:18 72:5 73:4	100:25 101:6,12
groups 16:6 185:5	HAPCO 121:24	150:12	73:10,15,19,23	115:12 123:19
209:18	happen 8:10	hearings 40:15	74:15,19 130:11	127:7
grow 10:5	18:23 95:6,21	108:19 160:17	130:12,15,19	historic 207:10
growing 9:21,23	121:10 143:19	188:5 238:17	131:7,13,19,23	historical 93:19
57:19	221:6	hedge 93:6	132:8,17 133:3	94:3 206:9
growth 25:22,22	happened 6:23	hedging 62:21	133:9 134:17	Historically 212:4
26:4 236:21,21	20:21 21:22	held 74:10 78:8	135:9,25 136:6	history 18:25
236:25	22:12 55:13	134:6 241:7	150:6 179:15,16	hit 6:24 26:4
guess 6:7 14:24	221:2,5	Hello 177:9	180:9,13,22	238:9
37:7 40:3 95:4	happening 191:25	help 10:5,9 33:13	182:25 183:4,18	hitting 178:13

	Ī	1	Ī	·
hold 6:17 37:2	220:3 221:8	34:5 35:9 80:18	2:24	informally 145:9
163:6 164:23	household 119:8	implementation	increase 4:21,22	information
191:22	233:16,18	31:18 100:5	5:11 9:14 17:7,8	39:19 69:6
holding 162:7	houses 137:12	implemented	46:9 49:8 58:9	95:19 104:13
hole 178:7	142:11 165:5	19:17 38:24	59:21 63:5	115:24 116:5
holes 146:23	221:8,11	41:5,9 118:2	75:10 86:16,21	117:7 118:7
home 110:9	housing 209:20	132:11 165:16	86:23 87:8,15	129:25 132:16
homeowner	HR 30:23 32:16	implementing	92:7,10,11	132:23 133:13
110:19,23 111:3	101:10 122:14	61:17 62:25	100:9 123:14	134:15 161:3,21
135:18 165:7	123:11	68:21	164:4 181:10	182:9 199:16
homeowners	human 116:3	implications	183:14 196:6	208:5,15,20
184:6	hundred 61:23	143:17	236:9 237:20	209:6 210:15
homeowner's	90:23	important 177:2	241:3,18,20	221:22 225:15
111:19	hybrid 69:19	206:3 242:6	increased 46:2	225:15,17 227:9
homestead	88:18	impossible 190:10	59:5 63:21	227:14,19
104:23 105:3,11	hypothetical	improve 9:13	78:21 92:6	229:18 231:6,8
133:2,4,8,10,13	165:10	68:4	184:23 234:21	231:10
133:18 134:5,12	hypothetically	improved 202:17	increases 7:19,25	informing 129:18
135:13,19 136:3	172:9 197:13,15	improvements	8:2 10:18 53:2	infuse 204:25
184:3,7,13	211:12,13 212:4	236:23	58:8 87:15	210:23
186:5,9,18	215:4	improves 79:11	191:21	infusion 59:4
225:11 232:21		improving 11:15	increasing 49:18	initial 106:7
239:11 240:16	I	11:16,17	215:9	110:10 111:15
240:16,19	IAAO 166:24	inaccuracies	increasingly	113:7 153:22
homesteads	idea 33:6 51:8	165:4	185:6	181:3 191:14
177:18 239:14	61:19 117:23	incentives 23:7	indemnities 11:21	212:7
honest 195:25	118:8 127:18	inception 94:3	12:7	initially 109:15
honestly 39:15	128:9,20	include 14:8 16:6	independent	109:20 111:24
honor 179:12	ideals 121:8	98:20 104:4,5	148:17	118:21 153:19
hope 14:5 80:18	ideas 199:15	included 234:18	individual 116:23	232:8,17 233:6
130:15 142:7	identified 103:11	237:11	119:8 197:24	initiated 39:7
228:16	213:5	includes 94:8,9	202:3 220:6	initiatives 61:15
hopefully 70:13	identifying 103:6	100:8 169:17	individuals	79:23
96:21 136:13	illegal 193:16,18	inclusive 2:13	101:17 109:21	input 35:3 53:22
158:16 209:14	image 227:22,25	income 93:5	116:4 124:15	inputted 225:17
214:20 238:16	imaginable	138:3 182:11	125:19 232:19	inputting 116:5
hornet's 211:25	242:14	233:16,18	industrial 98:23	inside 110:25
horse 199:13	imagination	incomplete	181:18 203:19	inspection 131:18
hospital 98:23	138:9	226:22,23	industry 114:14	131:20 159:7
165:2	immediately 68:6	227:12 228:18	121:25 122:7	188:6
hospitality 98:22	108:11	228:21 230:25	175:14 200:15	inspections
hot 40:25 119:14	impact 17:23 18:8	231:16 233:11	211:19	131:12 133:22
172:5,11 193:19	18:12,14 19:6,7	233:13,24	influence 213:12	209:3
214:21	23:13 58:24	234:18	213:12	instance 89:7
hotline 229:7	198:9	incompletes	influx 125:17	139:24 165:6
hour 154:25	implement 31:15	234:15	informal 137:22	222:21
house 137:2 142:9	31:22 33:20	incorporating	141:24	instances 221:4

institution129:11in-person40:14161:25institutions40:16163:5,1126:14IRS 103:7164:18integrated31:5isolate187:835:11229:17issuance43:5,9169:4,1intelligent205:3issue25:1641:22170:15,intend62:1179:17107:4172:13113:9116:3121:7,18210:11intense101:11126:2157:2joinedintent31:1142:16164:3173:7102:23108:17175:19204:12	kidding 242:9 164:2 175:12 167:3,10 kind 6:20,23 7:5 179:2 183:21 168:9,20 18:24,25 21:8,9 184:18 186:6 0 170:9 22:17 40:8 47:9 187:24 189:14 ,23 171:5 49:16 52:7,11 190:22 192:7 194:7,10 54:13 56:24 193:22,25 70:14 74:7,10 194:23 195:2,5
institution 129:11 in-person 40:14 161:25 institutions 40:16 163:5,1 126:14 IRS 103:7 164:18 integrated 31:5 isolate 187:8 167:15 35:11 229:17 issuance 43:5,9 169:4,1 intelligent 205:3 issue 25:16 41:22 170:15, intend 62:11 79:17 107:4 172:13 113:9 116:3 121:7,18 210:11 intense 101:11 126:2 157:2 joined 77 intent 31:11 42:16 164:3 173:7 joke 242: 102:23 108:17 175:19 204:12 Jones 17	162:4 108:6 157:5 161:4 0,15 kidding 242:9 164:2 175:12 167:3,10 kind 6:20,23 7:5 179:2 183:21 168:9,20 18:24,25 21:8,9 184:18 186:6 0 170:9 22:17 40:8 47:9 187:24 189:14 ,23 171:5 49:16 52:7,11 190:22 192:7 194:7,10 54:13 56:24 193:22,25 70:14 74:7,10 194:23 195:2,5
institutions 40:16 163:5,1 126:14 IRS 103:7 164:18 integrated 31:5 isolate 187:8 167:15 35:11 229:17 issuance 43:5,9 169:4,1 intelligent 205:3 issue 25:16 41:22 170:15, intend 62:11 79:17 107:4 172:13 113:9 116:3 121:7,18 210:11 intense 101:11 126:2 157:2 joined 77 intent 31:11 42:16 164:3 173:7 joke 242: 102:23 108:17 175:19 204:12 Jones 17	0,15 kidding 242:9 164:2 175:12 179:2 183:21 179:2 183:21 18:24,25 21:8,9 18:24,25 21:8,9 187:24 189:14 194:7,10 24:13 56:24 70:14 74:7,10 194:23 195:2,5
126:14 IRS 103:7 164:18 integrated 31:5 isolate 187:8 167:15 35:11 229:17 issuance 43:5,9 169:4,1 intelligent 205:3 issue 25:16 41:22 170:15, intend 62:11 79:17 107:4 172:13 113:9 116:3 121:7,18 210:11 intense 101:11 126:2 157:2 joined 77 intent 31:11 42:16 164:3 173:7 joke 242: 102:23 108:17 175:19 204:12 Jones 17	167:3,10 kind 6:20,23 7:5 179:2 183:21 168:9,20 18:24,25 21:8,9 184:18 186:6 0 170:9 22:17 40:8 47:9 187:24 189:14 ,23 171:5 49:16 52:7,11 190:22 192:7 194:7,10 54:13 56:24 193:22,25 70:14 74:7,10 194:23 195:2,5
integrated 31:5 35:11 229:17 intelligent 205:3 intend 62:11 113:9 intense 101:11 intent 31:11 42:16 102:23 108:17isolate 187:8 issuance 43:5,9 issue 25:16 41:22 79:17 107:4 116:3 121:7,18 126:2 157:2 164:3 173:7 175:19 204:12167:15 170:15, 170:15, 169:4,1 170:15, 170:	168:9,20 18:24,25 21:8,9 184:18 186:6 0 170:9 22:17 40:8 47:9 187:24 189:14 ,23 171:5 49:16 52:7,11 190:22 192:7 194:7,10 54:13 56:24 193:22,25 70:14 74:7,10 194:23 195:2,5
35:11 229:17 issuance 43:5,9 issue 25:16 41:22 intend 62:11 79:17 107:4 172:13 113:9 116:3 121:7,18 intense 101:11 126:2 157:2 joined 77 intent 31:11 42:16 102:23 108:17 175:19 204:12 Jones 175	0 170:9 ,23 171:5 194:7,10 22:17 40:8 47:9 49:16 52:7,11 54:13 56:24 70:14 74:7,10 187:24 189:14 190:22 192:7 193:22,25 194:23 195:2,5
intelligent 205:3 issue 25:16 41:22 170:15, intend 62:11 79:17 107:4 172:13 113:9 116:3 121:7,18 210:11 intense 101:11 126:2 157:2 joined 77 intent 31:11 42:16 164:3 173:7 joke 242: 102:23 108:17 175:19 204:12 Jones 17	.23 171:5 49:16 52:7,11 190:22 192:7 .194:7,10 54:13 56:24 193:22,25 .70:14 74:7,10 194:23 195:2,5
intend 62:11 79:17 107:4 172:13 113:9 116:3 121:7,18 210:11 intense 101:11 126:2 157:2 joined 77 intent 31:11 42:16 164:3 173:7 joke 242: 102:23 108:17 175:19 204:12 Jones 17	194:7,10 54:13 56:24 193:22,25 194:23 195:2,5
113:9 116:3 121:7,18 210:11 intense 101:11 126:2 157:2 joined 77 intent 31:11 42:16 164:3 173:7 joke 242: 102:23 108:17 175:19 204:12 Jones 17	70:14 74:7,10 194:23 195:2,5
intense 101:11 126:2 157:2 joined 77 intent 31:11 42:16 164:3 173:7 joke 242: 102:23 108:17 175:19 204:12 Jones 17	
intent 31:11 42:16 164:3 173:7 joke 242: 102:23 108:17 175:19 204:12 Jones 17	
102:23 108:17 175:19 204:12 Jones 17	
intents 42:4 218:4 85:11 8	,
208:17 issues 51:18 56:25 88:11,2	
interest 48:5,6 79:25 87:10 Joseph 9	
51:14 79:18	
86:24 87:9,16 165:18,24 203:6 202:3	181:11 185:25 228:6,8,21
163:4,8 210:9 judged 1	
interested 66:25 item 87:4 judging 6	
143:3 itemize 193:18 Judi 29:2	
interesting 121:4 items 68:6,10 33:10	127:11 139:15 241:5
Intergovernme 71:8 117:2 jump 156	
3:3,5 I-95 141:3 jumps 13	
interim 103:10 June 238	
interior 111:5 J 339:5	knocked 240:12 knowledge 56:13
internal 63:15 J 1:14 jurisdict	
1 19	200:20 know 16:10 20:4 knowledgeable
International JANNIE 1:10 200:22	
166:25 January 3:8 jurisdict	,
Internet 123:3 108:7 226:7 198:5	22:21,25 28:14 98:7
invest 83:2 Jay 97:18 J-O-B 12	
investment 21:6	42:10,24 47:11 145:12
mi estiment 21.0	49:7 56:4 65:13 Korns 129:10
80:17,24 82:23 89:11,13 136:21 K 1:11	66:14 70:19
83:8 88:21 144:14 145:2 Kate 105	
	134:9,11 84:14 88:14 L 1:10 244:14
92:18 200:6 207:23 Katherir	
investments 52:8 222:13 226:16 Keene 97	
52:14,15 81:2 234:12 keep 89:5	
investor 78:8 jobs 10:10,19 112:4 2	
investors 78:10 Johnson 1:12 keeping 3	100.22 107.2
invoke 101:11	
involved 81:24	129:12,24 land 105:21,22
127:21 146:10 116:18 117:5,13 Kevin 97	127.12,2 .
178:19 117:19,22 119:7 202:12	137:25 142:2,21 201:14,15 202:7
1,0,12	19 211:14 142:22 143:4,24 202:15,15 203:5
in-house 63:22 120:10,17 121:6 kick 74:1	1
1	

216:14 217:5	lessons 204:3,5	40:7 42:19	66:24 67:2	218:23 220:4
Lang 17:16	letter 77:22 80:2	43:19 46:15,15	70:10,13,16	223:24 224:4
language 186:24	letters 232:18	62:6 67:19	71:5 94:15	229:16 231:17
187:2,7 229:10	let's 20:18 82:23	74:14 89:22	103:17 108:15	236:11 239:20
languages 187:5	109:15 136:17	110:9,22 120:12	109:20 114:11	looks 19:23 207:5
Lanham 77:4	141:11,25 144:8	127:20 128:3	123:12 125:20	216:19,22
large 12:5 25:11	164:7,11,12	135:3 137:6	126:15,16,19	218:22
49:17 57:18	226:5	141:16 142:9,21	142:21 145:23	LOOP 177:6
59:4,9 93:2	level 6:14 22:22	142:24 143:16	151:2,6,11,24	225:12 232:11
94:15,19 98:21	51:9 77:15	145:5,7 146:19	153:20 155:9,10	232:21,22 233:5
140:25 181:23	87:17 91:22	147:21 150:25	161:5 164:13	239:18,19
185:7 217:11	116:6 138:15	152:16,25	166:10 179:23	240:11
largely 221:4	153:16 173:15	179:23 184:9	183:15 192:24	loss 183:14
larger 153:6	175:6 177:15	186:8 236:6	192:25 196:17	239:16,25 240:3
179:7	178:16 182:8,23	live 31:20 109:5	196:20 203:8	losses 237:12,14
LaSalle 17:17	211:22 237:18	120:20 124:20	212:22 213:2,7	237:19,22 239:7
lastly 203:24	237:21	125:14 140:25	214:4,4 215:2,3	lost 59:8 103:10
late 6:23 7:5 62:6	levels 22:25 55:21	142:12	215:15 216:14	237:4
75:22,24 105:14	131:21	lives 31:4	216:19,20	lot 11:13 31:24
105:16	Lewis 2:7,10	load 91:19 169:8	217:15,18,19	35:2 36:13 41:5
law 47:6 54:10,22	liability 46:9,10	169:8	217.13,18,19	41:14 51:3,4
54:24 64:24	46:12 49:15,18	loan 86:18	227:23 228:5,17	64:25 65:3 68:3
117:3	49:19 50:2 55:2	local 14:18 143:10	231:9 233:10	69:5 83:9 104:9
lawyer 54:12	55:8 56:21	localities 123:3	looked 20:6 21:2	106:19 107:20
lay 164:7,12	57:19 91:19		21:2,7 62:22	100.19 107.20
leadership 128:19		locally 143:8,8 located 27:9,19	66:19 101:12,13	119:18 134:22
leading 14:25	licensing 174:13 life 10:25 11:16	99:9,13 102:12	108:11 117:2	134:24 137:15
leads 55:8		, and the second	123:2 144:2	137:19 138:22
	lifetime 79:18	196:7,8 location 28:4	149:25 150:10	139:13 145:7
lead-in 11:11	lift 174:3			149:2 152:21
learn 210:11,18	lifted 173:25	209:21	153:19 192:22	
210:22 224:25	light 44:15	lock 79:3	193:4 202:7,9	166:6,13 170:21
learned 204:4,5	likelihood 7:25	log 35:14	202:16,18,25	176:18 183:22
learning 210:24	likelihoods 95:13	logic 124:11	203:16,20	191:20 192:3
lease 27:20 86:12	likewise 28:10	long 32:22 126:7	222:20,22 229:2	204:3 209:20
87:21	limit 5:21 160:4	177:16 179:9	looking 6:17 9:5	210:12,22
leased 27:12,16	limited 33:22	210:19	9:13 15:16	211:18 217:25
led 55:12 79:13	138:3 146:15	longer 84:4 122:3	16:14 18:22,24	218:4,9 219:6,6
left 46:12 73:12	line 88:5 121:5	141:13 178:6	27:18 49:7 50:8	219:8,10,11
106:8 198:25	lined 194:16	235:17	114:9 116:10,11	220:2,2,3,7,8,11
227:2	lines 6:21 73:25	long-term 88:20	117:25 119:2	221:4 223:16
Legacy 30:20	list 3:18	99:11	124:15 127:21	229:12 Lota 140:4
31:2 33:17	listen 152:24	look 7:17 8:12	127:23 128:25	Lots 140:4
legal 98:2 140:21	154:23 158:20	15:15 16:24	131:25 133:6,8	love 73:4 81:14,25
legally 219:22	listing 98:9	19:21 21:10	142:16 171:18	83:14,16,21
legislation 17:22	little 5:24 6:8	22:17 24:20	186:17 187:15	88:12
25:6 38:9 39:6	24:19 25:18	50:10,14 58:6	196:2,17 203:7	low 5:25 6:4,7
105:8 174:3	27:3 30:13 35:5	64:14 65:12	214:22 217:4,5	122:20 123:2
		l		l

				202
139:8 219:18	231:17 233:11	132:25 133:5,17	232:23 241:12	64:18 116:21
lower 7:7 10:8	map 186:20	135:8 136:5	242:18	233:16
24:23 25:23	Marc 97:16	143:23 145:16	mean 6:22 9:7,11	meetings 125:18
59:12 83:7	MARIAN 1:15	145:20 146:3	9:20 10:2 15:19	164:24 242:6
139:12 140:8	Marisa 233:3	147:8 149:5,9	20:22 28:6	meets 21:11 167:2
158:21 159:12	MARK 1:15	149:11 151:2,7	34:13 35:19	meltdown 94:8,9
165:11 196:13	market 59:8	151:11 152:14	36:12 43:15	members 30:5
lowering 48:10	91:24 93:19	153:9 156:10,15	48:15 50:11,25	51:2,2 76:23
lows 93:19	139:9 191:22	156:24 157:10	50:25 55:4 58:3	77:6 85:10
low-income	196:4 197:16	157:20 158:7,23	60:4 65:20	90:13 96:6 97:9
187:11	198:21 205:15	159:14,25 160:6	66:13 67:12	97:13 102:19
lucky 120:20	212:9 215:5	160:18,23 161:4	69:13,14 75:22	105:7 113:13
Lump 13:23	237:7	161:23 162:3,20	109:14 113:20	membership
L&I 29:5 35:23	mass 97:24 144:5	163:14 164:17	118:15 121:9	137:7
	217:17	165:25 167:5,13	135:14 141:17	memory 85:18
M	masters 44:5,21	167:19 168:13	143:4 150:14	mentioned 112:8
mail 40:13	match 108:2	168:24 169:6,21	162:18 179:7	172:6
main 64:20 91:15	126:20	170:13,18 171:9	181:20 185:18	met 123:17,22
maintain 54:16	material 28:10	171:16,19 172:3	185:19,21 188:8	125:11 127:7
maintenance	materials 187:5	172:17,22 175:2	188:10 206:8	157:10,11
100:5	matter 123:2	176:15 182:2,5	210:3 218:2,10	method 177:4
major 229:20,24	199:14 244:7	188:4,10,17	223:16 224:5	Michael 97:14
234:4 236:23	max 61:24	189:2,7,15,25	226:9 227:18	102:20 122:15
making 42:17	maximum 204:10	190:8,11,20	232:11 240:2	MICHELE
66:25 70:3	Mayor 3:2,8	191:5,12 192:10	meanest 242:11	244:14
73:24 92:3	Mayor's 184:21	192:19 193:9,17	means 6:8,15	micro 228:5
140:12 182:16	Ma'am 230:11	194:4,9 195:2	25:21 118:16	mid 6:7 46:5
Mall 142:13 147:3	McKeithen 25:17	195:24 196:14	192:21 244:21	189:5
management 5:23	96:23 97:6,10	197:4 198:7,11	meant 7:6 12:16	middle 143:2
9:4 26:22 30:23	100:17,22 101:4	198:18,24	measure 168:17	mid-term 60:6
32:13 36:3 79:8	101:22 102:8,15	199:20 201:24	169:6 212:14	mid-year 13:6
80:19 97:13	105:2 106:5,9	202:12 204:8,21	measured 61:18	Mike 102:16
Manager 98:2	106:21 107:2,22	205:12 206:4,12	61:24 170:4	mildly 49:5
233:5	108:3,24 109:13	206:18 207:5,20	measurement	million 4:21 5:3,4
managers 80:23	110:4,22 111:17	208:19,23 210:8	72:16 170:19	5:10,11 8:21
81:2	111:23 113:24	211:4,13 212:8	measurements	11:20,23 12:23
managing 80:3	114:7 115:5,13	212:16,20	166:12 167:8	14:17 15:13
134:11	115:17,20 116:9	213:14 214:3,12	measures 16:15	48:12 49:3,15
mandatory	116:20 117:8,17	214:25 215:13	166:16	77:20,21 78:2,7
123:21	117:21 118:12	215:19 216:2,9	measuring 169:23	79:18 85:25
manner 98:11	119:10,17 120:2	216:18 218:13	median 94:14,19	86:9,15,16,20
manpower	120:12 121:2,19	218:16 219:19	94:23	86:21,23 87:6,7
121:17	122:13 123:9	220:10 221:20	medical 12:21	87:12,14,20
manual 33:16	124:5,9,12,24	222:20 223:14	meet 93:24 94:25	88:12 92:23
manually 225:23	125:8,16 130:18	223:22 224:11	110:8 157:7	141:18,18 142:6
225:25 226:15	130:25 131:11	224:15,22	162:6	142:6 148:3,4,5
226:19 230:22	131:16,22 132:5	229:21,25 230:5	meeting 53:2	167:11,18
	-	•	-	-

	•	1	•	
168:10 169:5	14:20,23 15:17	moved 69:10	111:8 118:15	164:5
170:16,18 180:5	22:6 23:17 57:9	116:5	143:24 176:21	new 16:7 17:15
180:7 237:25	57:14 58:21	movement 74:4	necessary 4:17	25:20 33:20
238:3,6 239:20	65:25 79:2	moves 191:24	152:3	34:5 41:4,6,10
239:21 240:5,11	80:25 83:3,8,15	movie 207:4	necessity 66:15	63:12 68:21
millions 183:9	84:9,11 88:15	moving 30:16	need 11:13 32:6	69:16 79:7
Mills 141:4	88:16,23 89:2,9	67:14,18 68:23	39:19 50:16	87:10 90:17
142:13 147:3	138:19 145:10	68:25 69:9	67:15 69:3	105:8 115:12
mimic 33:21	146:13 148:16	72:17 143:12	124:18 127:17	119:9 125:14
mindful 235:19	149:2 152:22	163:11,16	127:25 143:7	128:17 138:11
mine 184:20	176:25 181:7,11	164:21 165:15	146:24 157:20	177:21 179:5
minimum 47:5	239:5,7	165:18 168:23	157:25 160:7	188:24 189:2,13
53:20 54:22	monies 62:11	191:9,20 202:19	161:18 186:7	193:10 209:10
55:5,7,12	63:11 83:19	210:6 211:2	192:23 202:5	236:23
173:11 199:17	month 53:3	237:13	207:15 235:19	newer 197:7
minority 91:11	157:12,13	multi 208:11	242:9	news 36:21 95:3
92:16,24	158:11	multiple 65:8	needed 21:3 68:5	nice 85:15
minutes 62:6	monthly 53:19	multi-departme	110:24 173:18	nicely 126:4
89:23	61:19	69:13	174:13 180:16	nighttime 42:22
misclassification	months 31:20	multi-family	180:17 233:16	nine 124:21 174:2
208:8	101:7 112:21	98:21	needle 72:15	non-exempt
missed 26:23 62:4	124:21 157:14	multi-residential	needs 29:9 69:15	98:25
136:11 159:5	160:12,15	208:12	118:18 235:4	non-profit 137:6
228:9	175:17	municipal 7:13	negative 6:11,15	non-tax 64:4,8
mistake 140:11	monumental	47:5 53:19	34:14	non-traditional
mistake 140:11 140:12	monumental 205:9	47:5 53:19 MURPHY 244:14	34:14 negotiate 7:23	non-traditional 9:21
		MURPHY 244:14	= '	
140:12	205:9	MURPHY 244:14 N	negotiate 7:23	9:21
140:12 mistakes 145:4	205:9 monumentally	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood	9:21 normally 85:14
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9	205:9 monumentally 205:23	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24 90:14	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24 90:14	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15 213:6 222:22	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25 mortar 218:19	MURPHY 244:14 N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7 118:13 176:20	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood 119:22	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21 230:25
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15 213:6 222:22 models 211:2 modernization 29:18 30:9	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25 mortar 218:19 mortgage 200:17	N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7 118:13 176:20 nature 101:15	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood 119:22 nest 211:25 net 236:25 networked 79:7	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21 230:25 nuances 123:13 number 4:12 10:19 11:24
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15 213:6 222:22 models 211:2 modernization 29:18 30:9 32:18 34:15,18	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25 mortar 218:19 mortgage 200:17 mountain 204:2 move 21:4 72:15 116:10,11,25	N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7 118:13 176:20 nature 101:15 204:3	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood 119:22 nest 211:25 net 236:25 networked 79:7 80:18	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21 230:25 nuances 123:13 number 4:12 10:19 11:24 40:20 42:10
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15 213:6 222:22 models 211:2 modernization 29:18 30:9 32:18 34:15,18 34:19,24	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25 mortar 218:19 mortgage 200:17 mountain 204:2 move 21:4 72:15 116:10,11,25 117:4 118:9	N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7 118:13 176:20 nature 101:15 204:3 near 116:11 141:3	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood 119:22 nest 211:25 net 236:25 networked 79:7	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21 230:25 nuances 123:13 number 4:12 10:19 11:24
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15 213:6 222:22 models 211:2 modernization 29:18 30:9 32:18 34:15,18 34:19,24 modified 19:11,15	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25 mortar 218:19 mortgage 200:17 mountain 204:2 move 21:4 72:15 116:10,11,25	N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7 118:13 176:20 nature 101:15 204:3 near 116:11 141:3 142:25 195:6	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood 119:22 nest 211:25 net 236:25 networked 79:7 80:18	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21 230:25 nuances 123:13 number 4:12 10:19 11:24 40:20 42:10
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15 213:6 222:22 models 211:2 modernization 29:18 30:9 32:18 34:15,18 34:19,24 modified 19:11,15 21:14 177:24	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25 mortar 218:19 mortgage 200:17 mountain 204:2 move 21:4 72:15 116:10,11,25 117:4 118:9 123:24 124:8,22 128:19 143:9	N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7 118:13 176:20 nature 101:15 204:3 near 116:11 141:3 142:25 195:6 necessarily 18:17	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood 119:22 nest 211:25 net 236:25 networked 79:7 80:18 never 12:16 20:19 95:11 118:21,24 119:4 132:5	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21 230:25 nuances 123:13 number 4:12 10:19 11:24 40:20 42:10 43:5 92:11 95:6 95:17 104:14,15 114:24 132:14
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15 213:6 222:22 models 211:2 modernization 29:18 30:9 32:18 34:15,18 34:19,24 modified 19:11,15	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25 mortar 218:19 mortgage 200:17 mountain 204:2 move 21:4 72:15 116:10,11,25 117:4 118:9 123:24 124:8,22 128:19 143:9 162:11 164:8	N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7 118:13 176:20 nature 101:15 204:3 near 116:11 141:3 142:25 195:6 necessarily 18:17 21:16 34:18	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood 119:22 nest 211:25 net 236:25 networked 79:7 80:18 never 12:16 20:19 95:11 118:21,24 119:4 132:5 156:22 205:13	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21 230:25 nuances 123:13 number 4:12 10:19 11:24 40:20 42:10 43:5 92:11 95:6 95:17 104:14,15 114:24 132:14 140:8 142:3
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15 213:6 222:22 models 211:2 modernization 29:18 30:9 32:18 34:15,18 34:19,24 modified 19:11,15 21:14 177:24 modifying 19:24 mom 137:25	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25 mortar 218:19 mortgage 200:17 mountain 204:2 move 21:4 72:15 116:10,11,25 117:4 118:9 123:24 124:8,22 128:19 143:9 162:11 164:8 185:23 191:23	N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7 118:13 176:20 nature 101:15 204:3 near 116:11 141:3 142:25 195:6 necessarily 18:17 21:16 34:18 57:22 81:15	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood 119:22 nest 211:25 net 236:25 networked 79:7 80:18 never 12:16 20:19 95:11 118:21,24 119:4 132:5 156:22 205:13 205:16 219:12	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21 230:25 nuances 123:13 number 4:12 10:19 11:24 40:20 42:10 43:5 92:11 95:6 95:17 104:14,15 114:24 132:14 140:8 142:3 144:22 160:4,20
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15 213:6 222:22 models 211:2 modernization 29:18 30:9 32:18 34:15,18 34:19,24 modified 19:11,15 21:14 177:24 modifying 19:24	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25 mortar 218:19 mortgage 200:17 mountain 204:2 move 21:4 72:15 116:10,11,25 117:4 118:9 123:24 124:8,22 128:19 143:9 162:11 164:8	N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7 118:13 176:20 nature 101:15 204:3 near 116:11 141:3 142:25 195:6 necessarily 18:17 21:16 34:18	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood 119:22 nest 211:25 net 236:25 networked 79:7 80:18 never 12:16 20:19 95:11 118:21,24 119:4 132:5 156:22 205:13	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21 230:25 nuances 123:13 number 4:12 10:19 11:24 40:20 42:10 43:5 92:11 95:6 95:17 104:14,15 114:24 132:14 140:8 142:3
140:12 mistakes 145:4 mix 126:9 MMO 48:21,23 48:25 49:24 51:18,24 53:15 55:16 57:20 model 139:6 169:2 202:8,9 202:14 210:6 211:6 212:15 213:6 222:22 models 211:2 modernization 29:18 30:9 32:18 34:15,18 34:19,24 modified 19:11,15 21:14 177:24 modifying 19:24 mom 137:25	205:9 monumentally 205:23 morning 2:3 3:19 3:20 13:20,21 26:14,15 30:4 31:10 37:14,18 45:12,13 61:8 61:11 76:22 77:2 85:9,14 mortality 52:25 mortar 218:19 mortgage 200:17 mountain 204:2 move 21:4 72:15 116:10,11,25 117:4 118:9 123:24 124:8,22 128:19 143:9 162:11 164:8 185:23 191:23	N name 31:12 76:24 90:14 names 242:15 Nancy 76:24 narrow 5:20 national 163:13 164:6,14,16 165:22 166:17 naturally 107:3 111:2 112:7 118:13 176:20 nature 101:15 204:3 near 116:11 141:3 142:25 195:6 necessarily 18:17 21:16 34:18 57:22 81:15	negotiate 7:23 neighborhood 85:24 111:8 191:15 221:10 223:11 neighborhoods 11:6 134:2 135:5,12,14 202:20 212:19 212:24 neighborhood 119:22 nest 211:25 net 236:25 networked 79:7 80:18 never 12:16 20:19 95:11 118:21,24 119:4 132:5 156:22 205:13 205:16 219:12	9:21 normally 85:14 133:24 171:11 172:4 197:14 203:13 213:17 Northeast 139:23 163:23 noted 49:14 notes 244:6 notice 31:11 41:10 189:20,21 230:25 nuances 123:13 number 4:12 10:19 11:24 40:20 42:10 43:5 92:11 95:6 95:17 104:14,15 114:24 132:14 140:8 142:3 144:22 160:4,20

	İ	İ	ĺ	I
179:7 184:22	26:20,22 28:5,8	okay 4:2 9:4	30:19 35:6,25	33:25 34:2 93:3
201:14,17,18	28:8,25 37:15	11:19 17:10	73:25	93:7 122:9
222:11,14	61:25 66:15	26:7 27:7,22	ones 95:14 103:2	129:22 148:18
226:19 233:17	73:23 77:11,18	28:12 34:7 36:8	107:24 109:5,7	153:15 159:8
233:17,18	96:25 97:11	36:17 37:5	109:10 110:12	208:4,14 210:14
237:15	98:6,12,23 99:4	39:25 45:4,19	one-time 5:5	opposed 43:3 51:5
numbers 6:25,25	102:21,21 117:6	45:25 46:7	13:11 82:17,20	56:7 60:8 84:2,7
7:3 28:20 45:16	117:12 125:5	47:19 48:19	one-year 203:24	88:23 226:7
45:16 92:2	134:7 135:16	49:12 50:20	ongoing 184:24	opposite 165:9,11
164:8,11 179:20	136:21 144:12	51:23 56:23	online 38:16 39:4	219:10
179:22 222:4	151:14 173:9	57:4 58:14	on-boarded 79:7	opted 47:21
nursery 141:8	178:12 184:21	74:19 76:11	on-site 131:9	option 83:23
	201:13 204:25	83:14 84:20	OPA 89:25 98:3,7	235:21 236:2
0	217:12 226:3	95:3 103:23	99:8,11 100:4	options 83:12
OAR 37:7 38:24	228:4 229:20	105:24 106:13	102:11 112:6	Oracle 35:9,9
43:22 44:2	231:25	111:12 114:25	113:16 114:4,11	order 61:21
objections 244:4	Officer 52:16	120:17 129:16	125:12 149:20	148:25 153:24
objective 229:20	90:17 97:11,15	135:25 144:24	149:24,24	ordering 65:18
229:24	Officers 167:2	147:8 149:4,9	157:11 158:17	ordinance 2:11,14
objectives 4:19	offices 27:6 228:7	149:10,13	159:21 176:11	2:16 3:7
obligation 45:21	228:11	151:23 152:4	177:10 178:13	organization
47:6 48:2,2,4	official 179:21	155:23 161:8	178:15 185:3	137:16
53:20 59:3,11	officials 151:21	170:23 176:4,24	216:16,17	organizations
79:14	offline 149:6	178:25 179:11	217:12 218:7	129:5
obligations 56:15	150:15,17,18	187:18 188:4	222:8 226:19	original 108:22
56:18 99:22	183:19	189:17 194:12	238:18	177:23 181:24
observation	offset 122:17	199:6 200:11	OPA's 99:19	239:2,13 240:21
133:12	239:16,25 240:2	201:10 203:23	100:10 108:14	originally 34:23
observing 22:8	oftentimes 108:12	205:25 216:9	150:2,3 222:11	106:17 173:24
obtain 79:14	159:5 197:7	225:5 230:6	open 115:14,16	240:10
82:17 225:2	210:14,15	240:22 241:9,22	opened 79:3	outcome 108:13
obviously 42:25	Oh 1:13 22:3 45:9	old 33:23 34:8	operate 133:25	210:3 213:13
49:4 51:14	45:10,14,20,25	36:21 40:12	operating 2:17	outcomes 181:21
75:23 95:15	46:7,18,21 47:7	162:11,16 163:6	4:11 14:11,21	outdated 32:6
106:23 111:16	47:19 48:11,14	185:18,19	34:8 35:24	outliners 214:2,4
113:21 241:10	48:19 49:12	237:17,21	36:14,15 75:9	outside 57:23
occur 175:18	50:20 51:3,16	older 185:22	77:8 82:12 98:5	70:11 80:23
190:3 occurred 220:18	51:23,25 52:10	once 31:17 74:12	operation 71:25	153:21 155:13
	52:20 53:8,17	108:5 120:2	146:16,17	155:14 213:8,10
220:20 221:22 occurring 219:9	53:25 54:6,13	146:5,6 158:24	operations 32:14	215:6 235:25
OEO 92:2,12	55:4,7,14,24	160:6 175:15	33:14 68:4	outstanding
offer 8:6,25 38:10	56:12,23 57:4	176:12 182:17	78:13 169:18	81:20 85:21
176:12	57:12,17 58:14	204:13 212:8	opinion 48:20	99:5
offered 23:7	154:16 230:4	213:19	49:21 150:3	overall 100:8
offering 42:14	OHR 125:9,11	once-in-several	opportunities	181:7 183:7
office 4:17 26:19	OIT 31:3 117:9	34:2	186:10	211:22 212:14
Office 7.17 20.19	117:12	OnePhilly 30:7,14	opportunity	override 53:23
	l	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>

			Ī	
54:2,4	paragraphs 4:6	pattern 162:8	56:11 57:10,23	241:4,17
oversee 28:15,20	parcel 99:15	Paula 37:15	58:21 59:3,5,11	PeopleSoft 35:10
overseeing 52:7,8	102:12 118:15	pay 7:19,25 8:2	78:21 91:19	percent 21:5,19
oversees 29:13	131:14 140:25	12:3 14:4 15:2,4	94:15 233:21	22:20 24:22
oversight 229:4	168:6	15:6,8,10,18	Pensions 78:20	45:21 46:2,3
owned 103:3	parcels 98:19	17:3 21:13	89:23,24 90:3	55:20 57:15
220:6	99:9,13 103:25	51:24 56:15	90:16	58:7 59:6,12
owner 104:22	131:17 141:16	82:5,10,12 83:3	people 22:17,20	61:14,15 64:5
159:8	147:21 168:15	142:23 162:14	38:25 39:17	78:23,23 82:24
owners 41:7,15	168:16,18 170:5	162:16 163:4,6	40:2,10,13,21	83:7 90:23 91:7
105:20 208:6	223:20	163:8 196:9	41:6,10 43:2,14	91:8,9,10,10,14
O'BRIEN 1:13	park 81:14,25	217:21 222:9	43:18 51:10	91:14,18,24,25
o'clock 42:21	83:15,16,22	224:9,13 235:19	54:14 66:6	92:5,6,7,9,9,10
43:20	84:8,10 88:12	238:11,20	73:16 101:15	92:15,19,21
O'Neill 1:14	88:22 165:3	paying 12:13	107:21 109:8,23	94:20 140:3
136:9,10,17	parking 44:16,18	53:14 55:16,22	114:24 115:12	144:16 181:9,13
144:7 145:18,24	part 7:15,20	58:25 59:3 84:5	117:10,11	181:17 185:21
146:9 147:9	16:11 25:11	142:23 145:10	123:20,24	205:15 211:21
149:7,12 151:5	36:9 44:7 47:25	174:12 220:6	125:18,22	215:5 236:9,20
151:9,13 152:5	58:3,5 88:10	222:7	126:17 127:21	236:22 237:20
153:23 154:3	92:12 93:2,7	payment 13:11,12	127:22 128:10	percentage 27:24
155:20,25	103:15 126:6	14:6 38:11,13	128:24 130:2	28:2 57:11
207:12	153:8 182:5	49:2 61:21	135:6,23 136:20	78:21 91:12
O'Neill's 152:17	183:16 185:24	86:22 87:17	137:20 138:23	144:18 241:3
P	222:16 233:7	payments 6:17	142:17 143:9,16	perfect 142:10
	particular 7:14	38:16 49:23	144:2 145:4	performance
pace 25:12	24:11 114:3	60:17 86:12,22	146:2 147:4,5	60:19 69:24
Packer 165:3	151:12 166:8	87:21	148:8,16,21,22	72:14
Page 5:19 11:19	188:15 197:10	payroll 30:24	149:22 150:8,10	performance-b
12:19 93:15	202:23,24	36:5	150:25 153:14	72:8
100:18	210:16,18	pays 50:2 85:19	154:8,14 160:10	performs 211:6
pages 229:16	212:23 213:2,23	86:4	160:16 165:3,23	period 31:19
paid 11:21,23 41:11 48:15	214:6 215:21	pegs 146:22	172:11 182:10	34:19 114:10
	220:17,24	penalties 163:4,9	185:14 186:21	191:13 202:22
50:5,6 55:3	222:21	pending 129:23	187:9 189:9	periods 166:3
60:20 61:13	particularly	174:3	193:24 194:2,16	permanent
63:20 92:5,9	95:10 136:23	Pennsylvania 1:6	204:18,22,25	193:12
pain 234:8	171:6 208:6	3:3 104:7	205:3,10,17	permission 38:3
paper 66:12,13 72:6 80:3	213:6 229:8	122:21 173:17	206:14 207:17	47:23,25
229:14	partnerships	173:19,22	209:24 212:2,2	person 20:10
paperwork 28:11	121:22	182:13	212:10 217:10	122:15 140:19
184:14	parts 134:25	pension 4:23 5:2	219:11 221:9,14	144:14 155:3
paper-based	164:25 165:3	24:21 30:25	222:7,18 223:6	159:22 168:11
33:16	pass 14:15	45:21 47:3,8,8	225:12,13	204:22
par 198:20	passed 38:9	49:9,25 50:22	228:23,25 229:9	personal 110:17
par 198.20 paradigm 71:19	PASTER 60:22	51:5,17,19 52:4	233:17 234:5	personnel 126:13
parauigiii /1.17	path 108:20 168:4	53:15,20 54:15	235:3 238:11	persons 51:4
	l			l

121:23	102:20 104:3,17	55:9 57:18	109:19 112:5	23:22,23 24:7,9
perspective 43:10	104:24 122:15	58:19 65:22	143:9 157:4	24:16,25 25:4,8
108:14 215:16	126:24 127:4	66:3 75:4,18	160:22 192:14	26:6 36:23 37:3
217:16 218:24	173:13 174:11	76:4 94:13	203:3 235:3,12	45:3,6,11 58:16
219:15	174:17 195:4,10	103:4 113:14	possibly 12:24	59:14 73:11,14
PGW 4:25 49:11	195:19 201:21	116:15 119:15	20:4 57:19	73:17,21 74:21
49:13 57:24	208:22	119:21 145:13	160:18 161:6	75:2 76:13,23
78:3 79:10	Pittsburgh	151:3 153:24	169:8 170:22	76:25 81:7 82:2
80:13 95:8	173:23,25	161:2 164:24	209:7	82:7 83:13,25
phase 35:2 68:2,2	place 6:16 32:5,22	172:6,7,9,10	posted 31:10	84:6,15,19,25
68:2,4,6	32:23 39:14	173:13 190:19	post-AVI 117:25	85:4,10 86:25
phasing 60:19	69:17 103:22	191:9 193:22	post-issuance	88:3,13 89:3,10
phenomenal	128:19 129:21	194:3 201:18	80:9	89:17 90:6,9,10
136:21	131:21 137:7	213:9 215:25	potential 49:11	90:13,20 91:2
Philadelphia 1:2	places 123:4	points 83:6 91:17	80:12 95:5,7,8	93:13,25 95:2
1:6 2:21,23 13:6	125:19 129:4	94:21 241:4	95:20	96:2,9,13 97:9
28:17 32:3	211:7	poke 211:24	potentially 219:7	128:18 135:17
42:15 89:12	plan 2:22 5:21	policies 52:13	221:6	242:2,12,19
98:10,20 103:2	7:16 8:12,13,22	policy 47:3,14	PRA 216:13	pressure 184:25
127:8 139:11,24	9:15 10:4 24:6	48:22,25 49:20	practically	Presumably 84:3
173:14,22 174:4	24:11,11,23	51:17 53:7,12	156:11	presumptions
174:6	25:14 34:4	54:20 55:23	practice 129:18	177:21
Philadelphians	57:24 58:3	72:6 80:6,7,8,24	166:2	pretty 89:13
184:12	63:17 72:20,23	198:23	practices 50:21	115:8 119:20
phila.gov 39:4	75:5,20 76:6	Poor's 79:15	50:23 164:14	135:12 142:15
philosophy 69:24	80:13 112:22	pop 137:25	165:19	148:24 155:9
phone 229:11	113:5,7 120:7	populated 227:20	precision 142:22	192:3 225:16
phrased 214:2	157:23 177:25	population 187:9	prefer 135:6	242:13
physically 225:20	204:13 236:8	portion 19:5	preference 15:20	prevent 113:11
pick 231:5	planned 79:24	53:10 185:7	16:3	prevented 236:18
picking 226:17	planning 16:20	position 80:22	prep 74:12	236:18
231:10	33:12 34:25	88:14 124:2,20	prepare 175:13	previous 227:11
picture 168:5	80:20 81:24	129:15 200:4,5	175:22	price 66:17
170:17 228:5	111:22	positions 71:10	preparing 70:21	139:20 140:2,2
pictures 167:25	plans 73:6 94:15	99:21 100:20	152:22	223:3,7,16
169:5,7,16,18	94:19 99:4	101:3 115:14,21	present 1:9 77:7	priced 139:12
piece 129:25	Plan's 24:13	129:4 130:21	154:9 155:16	prices 139:9
139:3,5	please 2:7 3:13,23	132:4,6	President 1:10	192:2
piecemealing	96:20 125:25	positive 88:7	2:2 3:11,17,21	primarily 4:23,24
67:16	126:4 153:24	210:3 213:13	3:22 4:3 5:16	5:5 98:8 163:24
piggyback 161:14	161:3 162:2	possess 121:23	6:19 7:10,22 8:4	primary 52:6
231:24	179:19	possibilities	8:8,17,23 9:3,9	principal 86:22
pilot 73:2	pleased 4:9 85:13	127:23	9:19,25 10:6,11	87:16
pilots 72:20,24	plus 42:20 240:16	possibility 120:11	10:20,24 11:4	principally
pipeline 126:21	point 19:2,23 24:8	126:12 127:13	11:10,18 12:9	178:12
piper 12:13,17	46:8 47:20	163:20	12:12,15 13:4	prior 24:11 33:5
97:14 102:16,18	48:20 54:18	possible 81:23	13:13,19 20:15	48:22,25 62:15

93:8 182:9,14	151:8,14,16	17:12 18:20,21	138:25 161:5	129:18
190:2 199:18,24	153:11,13,22	42:13 43:10	168:2,2,3	proud 12:23
priority 150:24	154:19 156:6	69:4 73:2 80:4	169:24,25	206:13
private 93:5	163:12,17	98:17 127:12,13	172:11 195:15	prove 109:21
122:7	165:22 167:22	128:6,10,23	195:22,23 196:3	provide 4:9 14:16
privilege 141:14	169:9 170:6	134:5,12 177:6	196:12,24 197:2	37:24 39:18
probably 25:12	175:5 179:24	185:15 198:6,10	197:3,7,12	60:13 87:21
25:17 33:19,25	187:23 188:23	198:13 199:19	198:10 199:5	104:13,18
37:23 54:10	194:22 195:14	199:25 227:17	208:10 210:17	132:15,18 142:8
74:14 76:9	205:17 210:12	233:5 235:6	215:22 216:15	162:2 186:2
83:22 104:10	210:18,24 233:7	programs 69:5	218:5 219:8,11	provided 67:5
116:22 138:11	236:18	127:10 134:4	220:13,15	82:14 132:22,22
138:24 147:22	processes 31:7	program-based	property 9:16	202:10
165:20 171:25	33:18 62:12,17	68:25 69:25	21:8 26:5,22	provides 4:16
228:19 236:5	69:16 70:14	72:21	27:12 41:7,15	providing 2:20
237:17 238:13	74:2 155:13,14	progress 92:3	73:24 75:10	80:11 98:13
238:22	163:11 164:5,16	179:10	96:25 97:11,16	proximity 194:24
problem 106:25	204:14	prohibit 105:9	97:17,18,20	195:17 197:3
123:10 124:16	processing 233:9	project 6:20	98:6,9,12,14,15	prudent 83:23
203:4,11 235:20	235:17	21:21 22:18	98:16,19 99:2,4	88:21
problems 89:12	procured 78:15	23:8 29:18,24	100:7,10 102:22	public 2:3 27:11
127:7 232:9	79:6	30:7,8,9,14,19	104:23 113:16	244:15
proceed 3:23	procurement	31:4,18 32:18	113:20 114:2,8	publicly 43:25
90:11	28:15,22,24,25	33:3 34:15,19	125:5 137:4,12	purchase 28:21
proceeded 21:19	32:15 64:13,17	34:24 35:4,7	137:16 141:9	29:6 65:19
proceedings	64:18,20 65:14	63:22 73:25	142:7,14 143:18	purchases 28:16
244:4	66:10 68:9,10	116:24 177:4	148:4 153:5,7	62:22 65:13,16
proceeds 49:10	procuring 80:25	projected 12:22	159:8,9 164:4	66:8
81:12,14,25	prod 211:15	25:23 183:12	167:4,12,16	purchasing 70:14
83:20 84:9	produce 77:24	projecting 12:25	171:11,24 177:2	purpose 135:5
88:22	produced 78:5	projecting 12.23	181:5,10 183:8	purposes 42:5
process 6:24 7:6,9	79:18	8:18 239:3	188:7 194:23,24	103:20 173:21
15:16 16:13	producers 207:8	projections 8:5	195:3,11,16,17	208:17 216:23
25:20 29:15	products 66:12	24:10,14 58:7	196:5,7 197:4	222:6 224:7
39:3 40:12	profession 158:2	177:12 178:20	197:20,22	pursuant 3:5
41:23 44:18	222:25 223:17	178:22,24	203:17 208:7,9	92:17
52:5 60:13,19	professional 29:3	projects 19:3,22	208:9 211:5	purview 64:12
62:24 63:12	29:6,9,14 65:10	21:18 22:9	222:15 224:14	push 35:13
64:21 69:20	66:20 70:11	80:11 82:21	229:17	pushed 229:6,7
74:9 75:4,19,22	201:19 217:16	prone 213:6	property's 197:24	235:16
75:24,25 76:3,5	219:14	proper 122:8	proposed 2:24	put 32:4,21,22
76:10 83:23	professionals	properly 40:22	4:10,11,19 5:9	41:2 43:2 49:5
101:12 103:15	122:6 126:22	41:2	11:24 58:11	50:8 57:14,21
116:13,13	professions 224:3	properties 102:25	77:8 98:5	59:23 72:11,12
117:14,16	224:4	103:17 104:14	protections	107:19 111:14
118:10 133:23	profile 27:18	104:16 105:10	180:20,23	113:16 116:25
141:23 144:3,6	profile 27.18 program 2:11	110:18 111:13	protocols 122:9	139:12 142:11
111.23 177.3,0	program 2.11	110.10 111.13	protocols 122.7	157,12 172,11
		l	l	I

157:16 169:2	5:15,18 26:8,17	reach 129:5 160:9	206:6 227:6	recess 90:3,5
180:20 226:7,18	27:4,5 37:7,23	192:12 238:18	233:22 234:22	96:16,18 242:21
232:13	43:22,24 44:2	reachable 148:2	236:20	recessed 243:3
putting 41:12	81:5 84:22	reached 50:12	realm 215:6	recession 67:12
42:20 43:19	87:25 89:15	read 2:8 3:25 4:5	reason 12:2 69:18	71:16
57:9 60:9 70:22	93:11 96:7	226:6 227:16	91:15 134:18	reckoning 177:22
127:13 178:20	100:15 101:25	231:8	162:5 182:6	recognition
182:22 236:4	114:18 121:4,5	readily 213:22	186:6 216:15	146:22
p.m 43:3,3 243:3	134:24 136:4	reading 180:2	234:17	recognize 102:3
	143:5 156:4	227:12	reasonable 93:20	recognizes 13:16
Q	183:23 188:20	ready 74:12,13	reasoning 134:21	26:10 45:8
quadrants 215:12	196:19 242:8	112:16 152:23	reasons 224:5	58:17 59:16
quadrupled	queue 45:2 73:12	205:5 228:19	229:6	74:23
139:17	73:16 135:21	real 17:7 23:25	reassess 112:2	recollection 32:24
qualification	quick 5:17 75:3	25:9,10 33:9	113:8,19 118:13	recommendation
173:15 200:13	81:9 93:15	68:24 93:6	118:14 189:24	66:5
qualifications	173:6 194:21	97:15,17,18,20	reassessed 119:8	recommendatio
101:14 127:17	231:24	98:9,13,14,16	180:16 190:16	52:17,19 61:17
173:10	quicker 160:20	98:19 111:5,9	192:18	62:18 63:2,10
qualified 92:16	quickly 6:10	121:16 127:11	reassessing 191:3	63:16,25 64:3
135:18 184:5	23:25 58:10	127:22 128:11	207:25	64:17,20 67:25
qualifiers 200:7	86:7 88:5 89:13	128:22 129:6	reassessment	recommended
201:5	143:12 178:2	131:9 173:20	100:10 112:17	56:13
quality 10:25	179:19	181:4 200:14	114:12 118:24	recommends
11:16	quite 39:14 40:20	201:7 207:17	122:22 166:2,20	166:23
quantifying 61:2	119:4	231:17,23	166:21 167:6	reconvene 242:23
quarter 68:8 92:8		235:14 236:10	171:7 176:2	record 90:2
quarters 68:8	R	realistically	182:10,15	104:22 116:7
question 14:25	raised 173:15	100:25	189:17 192:21	180:14 194:21
16:11,23 21:16	raising 9:10	reality 177:22	193:2,3,7 196:2	records 36:6
27:3 30:10	171:23	realize 205:10	205:24 207:11	96:14 99:15
38:22 54:11	rampantly 191:23	realized 81:13	209:2 210:6,23	recovered 78:25
55:18 57:9 65:9	ran 141:8	140:13 233:9	212:25 213:17	recycling 72:23
73:13,18,20	range 237:9	really 6:18 14:25	reassessments	red 44:15
75:7 81:9,17	239:21	18:7 25:19 31:9	166:9,10 224:24	Redevelopment
93:15 104:20	rarely 212:9	35:6 40:18	reassessment-w	217:4
108:10 117:23	rate 48:10 72:14	41:20 44:3	191:6	reduce 71:23
125:25 133:11	91:17,24,25	50:24 52:12	Rebecca 61:7	152:25
134:14 136:19	93:17 94:7,14	74:13 75:12	recall 32:23 63:4	reduced 11:25
152:17 171:3	94:19 181:25	94:23 95:11	131:24	93:18,21 114:2
181:2,24 183:21	202:23 220:24	110:24 122:20	receive 40:21	138:7 148:3
183:25 193:22	221:12,13,13	122:25 136:16	104:23 108:8	199:4
194:21 201:12	223:10	137:15 147:23	158:24 165:14	reduces 79:13
209:9 225:9,10	rates 64:7 93:19	153:4 160:4	188:24	reducing 10:17,18
236:7,17 242:14	202:21 203:21	174:16 178:5	received 94:17	11:12 94:21
questioning 88:6	rating 79:15,21	188:13 192:12	133:7 161:17	reduction 91:16
questions 4:7,15	ratings 79:20	203:12 205:10	receiving 185:25	91:21 159:15
			9	
	I	1	1	<u> </u>

	1	ı	I	I
reductions 10:3	removes 175:24	126:17 173:11	180:25	reversed 71:24
14:9 148:25	rename 35:4	173:16 200:10	rest 92:25 173:16	review 26:21
redundant 118:3	Rendell 58:20	227:2	193:20 198:3	37:16 44:15
refinancing	render 107:13	requirement	restoration 83:21	61:19 71:2,6
139:16	rent 21:9 182:12	54:24,25 56:6,7	restore 84:10	99:6 111:15
reflected 8:18	rental 21:8 86:5	57:2,3 123:21	result 9:17 18:13	118:17 137:22
reflecting 5:25	87:19,23	124:17 174:5	19:7 61:16	141:24 143:14
Reform 10:15	reorganized 93:3	requirements	123:23 139:13	148:15,20 150:4
13:24	repaid 48:5	47:17 65:2	209:23	150:13 152:18
refresh 85:18	repayment 48:18	116:17 199:18	results 10:15 60:7	154:19 156:7,8
refreshed 33:18	86:17	rescue 139:9	178:17 181:3	156:11 158:19
refunding 78:4	repeat 30:10	reserved 44:16	182:21	159:3 163:12
refundings 77:17	106:15	residency 123:21	resume 128:21	164:6,19 165:21
77:22	replace 30:20	124:17 125:15	retail 98:22	165:23 166:3,8
refurbishment	31:5 32:12	136:12	203:19	175:5 181:3
83:21	35:11	resident 158:20	retain 121:13	184:17 209:11
refuse 41:8,17	replacements	residential 98:20	retire 31:8	225:24 226:2,15
refused 226:4	80:2	131:17 137:5	retirement 54:17	226:20 228:12
regarding 2:4	report 56:10,18	168:6,18 180:2	78:20 81:18,19	228:20 235:22
59:20	167:7 194:5	180:6,21 202:8	return 21:5,9,11	reviewed 63:25
regards 176:11	216:6,7	residentially	22:23 23:2	119:11,11
region 126:9,15	reported 135:2	220:12	82:23 83:8 84:4	reviews 70:24
139:8	reporter 244:23	residents 16:8	91:23 93:17	106:7 118:4
regular 112:23	reporting 56:6	44:17 161:17	94:4,5,10,25	181:13,14
regularly 82:13	57:2 133:12	181:15 187:11	returns 19:2,21	182:22 183:17
rejected 209:19	represent 26:19	222:16	19:25 22:17	209:24
209:25 210:2	135:6 148:11	resolution 1:17	42:7	revise 104:24
226:9 230:21	representatives	2:6,9,19	return-on-inves	219:5
232:14 234:5	4:13	resolved 237:3	84:13	revised 2:21
related 40:24	represents 87:7	resort 148:13	revamp 80:6	114:4
relates 36:3 95:7	179:21	resources 204:17	revenue 9:12	revising 101:13
relating 81:10	reproduction	respect 2:25	16:14 29:5	revision 24:2 99:6
relation 112:9	244:20	102:3	35:23 58:12	107:6,8,16
relationship	request 17:20,24	respond 52:4 99:5	60:24,25 62:18	112:10 120:5
173:8 174:20	23:12 85:16	107:7	63:5,18,20 64:2	148:14 149:3
176:4,13	86:14,19 91:5	response 75:7	79:4 87:21	156:19 174:21
relationships	99:20 100:3,8	84:24 89:16	149:18 177:4,12	175:8,9
122:6	100:11	96:8 98:13	177:13 178:13	revisions 118:19
relative 197:9	requested 14:7	162:9 207:18	183:6,8 185:13	revitalize 198:15
198:3	requesting 85:23	responses 109:11	208:22,24	revolve 111:9
relatively 5:20	86:9 87:12	responsibilities	209:15 236:10	rewarding 206:6
24:12 41:4	99:17	71:10	revenues 7:12 9:6	Reynolds 1:14
religious 98:25	requests 17:24	responsibility	18:14 19:8 24:3	120:22 126:25
remaining 186:9	require 5:23	54:16 174:22,24	50:9,19 61:16	172:25 199:11
remains 77:12	required 17:23	responsible 98:8	67:10 79:5	re-budget 70:18
remember 92:4	19:22 25:2	178:12 180:23	82:17,20 87:23	RFP 116:14
224:21 226:9	46:24 47:10	responsibly	180:5,7	117:14,15
		l		

	•	1	1	1
170:12,20 230:3	190:20,21	57:24 80:12	89:22 111:10	126:16,20
Rhynhart 61:7,8	192:10 193:9,15	95:8 192:2	112:12,20 113:4	128:10,15
61:12 62:7,13	193:21 198:17	223:16	120:6 157:3,14	142:17 145:22
63:14 64:15	201:11,24 212:8	sales 4:25 15:14	157:19,21 158:5	146:3,7,9 159:3
65:21 66:2,16	212:15 214:2,3	16:19,23 24:2	160:9,16 175:10	159:9 165:12
67:4,21 68:15	214:9 215:13,18	49:9,13 67:3	175:16,21	167:23,24
68:19 69:23	215:19 216:2	95:8 111:7	213:20 214:13	170:22 174:2,10
71:2,6 72:2,7	218:18 219:20	114:9 119:21	scheduled 44:12	176:3 191:20
73:6	219:23 221:15	127:24 133:21	82:13 112:11	192:19 198:9
richest 126:8	227:23 228:6,15	139:20 166:5,11	146:7 157:5	210:5 212:10
Richie 97:10	236:3 238:22	171:14,18,20,23	190:23	213:23 236:24
115:4	239:9,20 241:23	202:18,21	schedules 110:7	237:7 241:12,14
Richmond 123:4	risk 26:21 79:13	203:16,22	scheduling 146:6	241:16,18
123:5 198:12	Rob 4:8 70:19	220:17,19	157:2,8	seeing 18:25
right 10:23 11:2,9	robust 24:12 63:8	salesperson	school 5:6 13:24	40:20 70:2
11:17 13:8,14	role 52:5,7,15	200:24	14:7 18:15 19:5	182:6
14:23 23:11	rolls 182:12	sat 123:11 138:20	75:6 76:7 86:18	seek 101:17
25:9 28:6 29:4	room 1:6 6:9	207:24	218:17,17,18	seeking 78:12
33:15,22 40:19	71:16 146:18	satisfied 92:20	219:24	seen 42:7 148:23
41:19 43:7	190:14 242:24	save 65:19,24	schools 14:12,21	157:14,17 180:4
45:24 46:5,13	rough 206:4,7	78:17 138:16	15:14,17,18	sell 80:13 128:5
46:14,17,20	roughest 206:5	148:16	16:14,18,22,25	197:25 220:4,9
48:9 54:3,10,23	roughly 184:5	saving 62:11	20:20 22:13,14	220:23 222:3,10
57:5,12,17	round 146:23	savings 42:6	25:5 177:3	222:19
61:18 66:16	RPR-Notary	43:18 60:5,12	223:23	selling 191:18
68:13 71:11	244:15	60:14,17,24	scope 18:17	218:4 221:9
74:18 84:7,20	rule 114:25	61:2,3,14 67:20	102:14	send 129:14 202:4
89:14 95:16	140:12	77:18,20,25	screen 34:10,10	sending 131:8
101:23 105:15	rules 111:19	78:6,12 79:19	35:13	senior 97:13
106:21 107:21	ruling 162:18	80:16	screens 33:17	148:20,21 177:6
107:22 108:24	run 30:21 141:10	saw 127:6 137:3	season 70:21	184:23 185:5,11
111:16 114:17	rung 179:12	saying 57:5 71:21	107:6 108:5	186:3
115:25 116:25	running 32:6	113:23 144:14	seasonal 141:8	seniors 42:15
117:25 119:21	72:25	153:9,10 172:7	second 103:15	184:19 185:8,24
120:3,13 123:8	runs 29:24 131:3	213:16 219:17	145:23 230:12	186:8 227:7
132:23 137:21	146:16	222:7,10 231:18	Section 12:20	228:22 229:8,12
140:10 142:11	rushed 108:15	says 94:18 222:8	Security 233:21	sense 17:2 51:12
142:16 143:4		scale 205:11	see 19:6,25 20:8	51:13 60:15
144:22 148:8	S	scanned 225:19	40:3,7,23 41:25	72:12 84:18
149:24 150:2	safe 42:20	225:23 227:19	42:12 43:4,8,9	128:20 198:3
156:2,23 158:3	safer 43:19	scanner 226:6	43:10 50:16	sent 133:6 230:25
161:18 163:2	sake 205:2	scanning 226:16	58:9 63:9 65:14	231:16 234:16
164:17 171:15	salaries 101:13	231:4	72:19 75:14	separate 103:16
171:16 175:2	122:20,25 123:5	scenario 165:10	91:6 103:18	163:24 168:21
177:19 180:24	123:14 126:22	scenarios 95:14	108:4 110:25	169:18 209:18
181:6 184:15	salary 53:2	95:17	111:3 118:18	separated 28:9
188:22 190:5,18	sale 49:11,13	schedule 87:3	119:22 125:22	57:2
		-	-	·

	_	_	_	_
separately 29:7	208:19 209:6,19	151:14 225:16	139:5 142:9	135:10 155:12
209:25	209:23 210:15	227:15 229:3,24	164:22 181:19	sounded 12:17
series 62:17 131:3	Sheriff 176:5,6,14	simplify 64:21,25	185:24 215:18	127:17 154:4
seriously 191:14	176:17,23	single 36:6	215:20	sounding 154:5
191:24	shift 49:19 179:25	Sinking 85:6,12	smart 169:16	sounds 45:23 46:4
service 29:3,6,9	180:8,10 182:7	85:17,19 86:3	snails 32:5	46:14 207:4
29:14 42:14	shifted 180:6	sir 36:24 87:2	snapshot 168:19	sources 16:5
72:14 77:19	181:15	89:19 97:7	170:5,17,20	58:11
82:6,11,12,13	shoes 206:3,5	100:22 102:9	sneak 171:3	South 139:10
83:4 85:20,25	shopping 139:6,7	115:6 198:25	Snickers 130:16	Southwest 164:25
86:11,13 87:13	139:25	242:18	snow 40:22	so-called 143:2
101:8 123:17,22	short 84:5 90:5	site 131:10 203:18	Social 233:20	space 27:12,16,20
124:13 125:12	96:18 137:9	sitting 126:12	software 31:6	27:24 28:2
127:5,19 186:6	191:25	154:11 166:7	35:9,10	speak 37:6 121:14
200:5	shortest 109:17	206:14 242:5	sold 78:5 171:24	134:19 160:24
services 10:23	short-term 81:3	situation 110:24	196:3 203:20	162:21 174:19
11:16 15:22	99:3	119:5 120:4	217:20 221:18	176:4 211:25
60:20,23 62:12	shot 234:20	125:20 153:18	221:21 222:2	speaking 176:5
65:10 66:20	shoveling 40:21	190:3	solid 108:8	197:11 203:15
70:12 78:16	show 20:7,7	situations 160:2	Solomon 97:19	213:15
97:23 125:4	144:12 148:7	sit-down 154:15	solution 145:14	special 140:14
185:25	showed 92:15	six 2:12 31:20	somebody 70:7,10	146:24
set 29:21 43:16	showing 130:23	94:22 112:20	70:12,15,24	specialist 105:4
47:3,6,8,9,13	shown 56:21	157:14 160:12	107:19 138:15	specific 27:5
51:17,20 63:11	shows 143:19	200:19,21,23,24	138:16 141:9,18	173:10 195:11
63:18 93:8	shunted 85:14	Sixteen 181:13	142:20 145:9	201:7
110:7 143:17	side 10:5 28:24	six-month 31:19	149:2 154:7,8	specifically 18:10
144:6 151:7	50:18 58:13	157:19,21	154:12,22	202:9
153:11,11,14	62:18,20 64:2,4	size 209:21	218:22 220:21	specifics 200:16
168:15 175:2,3	64:8 66:20	220:16	226:7	specs 200:6
199:23 212:25	80:18 122:16,17	sketch 168:5,18	somebody's	speculation 223:6
215:14	141:4 165:8,9	170:19	137:24 138:14	spend 41:14 88:22
sets 54:24 126:16	165:11 180:21	sketched 170:4	somewhat 123:15	138:19 142:18
169:23	219:18,20,21	sketches 168:2	169:19,21	spending 71:7
setting 153:21	significant 62:14	skill 121:24	203:10	149:2
154:4	63:5 65:24	126:16 169:23	soon 81:13 142:15	spent 41:5 62:14
settled 108:16	77:15 193:12	199:23	sophisticated	70:2 152:21
109:19 213:19	significantly	skills 128:12,12	144:15	spike 12:2
settlement 7:4	24:17 164:3	slack 107:10,17	sorry 12:18 30:11	spill 223:9
settlements 12:5	191:19	slacked 107:25	59:19 62:3 87:2	spilling 223:13
set-out 41:13,18	silo 32:9,12	slam 147:14	105:5 138:20	spillover 209:5
42:3	silos 36:22 122:3	slight 99:23	149:23 229:21	split 14:6 15:12
Seven 61:23	similar 74:2	slightly 24:14,22	230:13	spoke 210:9
Shamika 90:18	108:13 121:6	55:17 91:13	sort 60:7 107:15	spoken 101:9
shape 55:25	149:19 194:5	slip 143:11	209:5 234:21	sports 87:22
share 66:22 137:7	210:5 220:15,16	slowed 25:20	236:9	spread 170:7
199:21 201:15	simple 145:14	small 65:2 89:25	sound 13:5 46:13	spreadsheet
				l

	1	1	1	1
227:20,24	staffer 176:6	227:6	18:2 20:7,11	supposed 232:12
spreadsheets	201:19,25	statement 162:6	23:12 53:3	sure 6:3,22 16:20
68:23	staffing 99:21	171:8	92:14 94:17	23:3 30:18 33:7
square 28:8	106:25 107:3	states 182:15	stuff 36:24 154:17	37:11 42:13,17
139:20 146:23	112:8 121:7	state's 25:6	187:15	42:23 43:12,14
218:20	131:20 143:5	stating 216:24	subdivides 201:20	47:16,16 50:25
Squilla 1:15 152:8	173:6 199:14	station 141:21	subdivision	62:13 66:25
152:11,15	staffs 234:25	statistical 166:16	193:13	70:23 89:13
155:22 156:3,13	stages 82:8	status 103:6	subdivisions	101:18 102:15
156:20 157:6,18	stand 96:16	statutorily 102:24	201:21,25 202:4	107:2,20 111:14
158:3,14 159:11	150:19 242:21	stay 150:10	subject 41:8,16	115:2 119:4
159:19 160:3,11	standard 79:15	241:18	42:18	121:19 122:13
160:19 161:8,15	165:22 167:2	stay-at-home	submit 43:22,25	124:19 126:24
163:25 187:20	standards 46:23	141:7	submitted 3:2	132:13 135:8
187:21 188:9,12	47:12 56:2	stenographic	154:16	136:5 149:8
188:22 189:6,11	163:13 164:6	244:6	substantially 59:6	154:14 159:25
189:22 190:5,9	166:18	step 166:4 234:23	79:11,12	162:3 163:17
190:13 191:2,8	stands 113:25	234:23	success 61:20	165:25 174:21
192:6,11 193:6	114:14 197:21	Steve 177:20	205:7,8	176:8 181:21
193:15,21 194:7	stand-alone 30:20	stop 88:25 144:8	successes 74:4	197:11 198:7,11
194:12 210:10	30:24,25 35:12	155:24 177:19	successful 69:7	198:24 199:22
214:16,17	start 38:5 45:15	storage 28:3,11	70:2 72:9	200:15 203:2
215:10,17,23	67:17,18 100:18	store 138:2	successfully 79:6	204:8 206:17
216:5,10 218:2	114:25 122:14	stores 139:12	such-and-such	207:20 213:14
218:15 219:16	130:20 156:22	181:18	220:23	226:21 229:2
219:25 221:15	167:21 168:4,8	strategic 198:23	suggesting 83:18	230:8 242:13
221:24 223:12	169:9 170:6,7	strategies 9:21	Sum 13:23	Surely 117:8
223:18 224:8,12	172:11 182:2	121:8,16	Sumit 90:16	surprised 179:2,8
224:19 225:4	219:4 220:25	street 137:14	summary 77:10	surprising 179:6
231:22,23	started 17:25	165:7,9,11	summer 40:23	swim 137:4
232:22 234:2,11	32:19 33:2,10	208:18 209:12	supervision	sympathy 146:21
235:7 236:3,14	35:8 60:12	Streets 35:23 41:4	244:22	system 29:13
237:10,23 238:2	63:23 96:21	41:9 72:21 73:5	supervisors 166:6	30:25 31:2,6,16
238:5,8,15,23	108:6 111:25	208:21,22,23	Supervisory	31:22 32:9
239:4,10,17,22	134:20 179:24	strong 15:20	131:5	33:16,20 35:11
240:4,9,18,22	starting 105:11	structure 50:11	supplies 28:21	35:15,20 36:6
241:2,9,19,22	123:5 202:18	137:23	support 13:23	68:22,24 79:8
Squilla's 155:21	203:16 237:20	struggling 132:2	14:17 16:16,17	80:19 100:7
162:6,15	state 5:20 14:8	132:3 147:4,6	16:17 30:22	116:12 138:11
stabilization	47:6 54:24	stuck 127:20	31:6 32:13 34:6	148:10 155:5
31:19,21	70:18 75:13	128:3	80:12 99:20	167:21,22
stack 177:21	93:16 98:24	student 127:14	100:4 206:19	170:21 180:15
stadiums 87:22	100:19 173:17	students 126:8,9	supportable 31:4	180:18 196:25
staff 91:7,10	173:19 180:14	studied 18:10,12	supporter 12:23	215:15 222:12
115:11 121:10	stated 103:20	62:16 149:25	supportive 17:5,6	222:12 224:10
132:7 146:13	121:12 125:8	studies 17:23	143:6	225:18,21
233:25 234:23	156:16 210:10	study 17:11,19	supports 4:12	226:12 229:19
	•	•	•	•

	I	I	I	I
systems 30:9,21	178:15	142:2 149:3	136:11	100:16 102:5
30:22,24 31:2,5	talking 32:10	156:19 161:20	term 12:16 77:25	105:24 106:2,3
31:24 32:7,13	38:19 56:5	174:21 175:8,9	78:6 84:4,5	114:21 115:3
33:17 34:24	67:18 83:14	177:2 220:7	107:25	120:18,23 130:6
35:12 69:17	88:11 111:4	222:7 224:9,13	terminology	130:7,9,12,19
74:3 229:18	128:22 130:21	taxing 200:22	226:10	132:19 136:7
	133:20,20 134:4	201:8	terms 16:4,18	143:23 149:11
T	138:22,23,25	taxpayer 210:16	20:21 50:20	152:5,6,7,11
table 3:16 30:3	184:3 207:8	taxpayers 14:18	62:19,20 64:23	170:24,25 171:2
37:13 61:6 75:9	230:2 238:24	110:8	68:3 69:6 71:9	173:2,4 179:13
76:21 85:8 97:3	tall 203:25	tax-abated	71:13 81:16	179:16 186:13
177:8 195:9	target 186:7	104:22 105:10	95:14 115:23,23	187:19,21
199:24 200:3	targeted 99:21	105:20 195:21	116:4 117:14,15	194:19 199:6,8
233:2	186:16 198:14	196:11,24 197:3	118:3,9 121:21	199:9 201:11,22
take 32:22 42:5	targets 178:14	team 31:14 77:6	140:20 150:24	206:2,18,22,23
50:6 65:12 67:2	Tasco 1:15 58:17	97:13 115:24	161:19 196:25	207:2 214:14,17
70:13,16 82:19	58:18,23 59:13	tear 193:11	236:25	225:4,6,9 230:7
84:9 89:24	tax 6:25 9:16,23	technical 104:20	terrible 218:20	230:9,16,17
104:8 108:25	10:3,4,15 14:15	technology 33:23	test 101:16 212:18	231:20 236:4,4
112:25 147:10	15:11,14 16:19	34:5 63:12	tested 79:7	241:23,23 242:3
152:2 153:2,3	16:19,21,23	69:12 116:3,6	testify 98:4	242:5,16,18,20
154:24 155:10	17:7,8,12 18:14	117:7 170:12	145:11	242:25
168:15,19 169:5	19:11,15 24:3	208:16	testifying 111:25	Thanks 136:6
169:7,16 172:9	26:5 44:14 49:9	teed 76:15 242:15	testimony 3:25	234:14
177:16 213:7	49:13 57:24	teens 46:6	4:10 5:14,19	theoretically
221:10 228:4,17	75:10 86:5	telecom 62:21	59:19 75:7	52:21
taken 19:17 66:24	87:19,23 95:8	Telford 125:18	76:17 77:7 81:4	theories 176:18
199:3 244:6	98:14,15,16	tell 90:23 96:14	88:20 89:18	theory 202:14
takes 19:22 70:10	100:7 105:12	102:13 120:13	91:3,5 93:16	203:9
71:4 110:9	162:11,16,17	133:19 136:22	96:10 100:14,19	thereof 204:20
135:3	173:12,21 177:6	138:18 143:20	102:11 121:12	they'd 142:10
Taliaferro 90:18	177:11 180:4	143:25 144:13	132:21 176:12	235:15
talk 25:17 29:25	184:23 185:12	144:21 148:8	242:17	thin 6:21
35:6 62:5	194:23,24	164:9 188:14	text 39:19	thing 10:16
102:16 115:10	195:16,18 198:6	210:21	thank 3:12 5:17	103:14 110:21
136:12 144:23	198:9 209:15	telling 155:8	13:15,18 23:21	140:21 148:8
149:5 154:7,14	216:23 222:6	222:16,17	23:24 26:7,12	149:20 154:11
163:11 164:5	224:6 235:14,22	Temple 129:6	26:13 36:17	169:20 170:10
165:3 195:5	taxable 103:6	ten 62:6 91:16	37:18 44:24	189:18 205:22
216:12	taxed 105:20	123:25 124:5,8	45:5,7,10 58:14	221:16 222:17
talked 6:11 20:22	taxes 9:10,14	124:22 199:2	59:13,15 74:19	228:22 234:15
56:6 81:12	10:18 11:12	235:8,8	74:22,25 76:11	things 6:23 7:6
116:2 125:10	20:20 21:13	tend 89:7 182:10	76:14,16 81:8	11:13 23:11
127:12 139:18	22:13,15 99:6	213:11	84:20 85:2,3,5	44:11 49:17,23
163:18,23	107:6,8,16	ten-day 235:25	88:4 89:14,18	52:23,25 55:13
164:16 165:20	120:5 137:11	ten-minute 90:3	91:3 93:14 96:4	65:16 66:18
166:14,20 171:5				67:23 68:5
1	1 39.13 1211.3		90 111 11 1111 1	
	139:15 141:5	ten-year 125:15	96:10,11 100:13	07.23 08.3

69:14 75:8 95:6	122:19,25	130:23 141:16	202:22	72:23
101:11,14	123:15 127:19	147:20 155:17	timing 75:12	Treasurer 76:19
109:25 110:25	129:11 131:23	156:13 200:6	title 51:4	77:4,5
112:16 116:14	132:2,25 136:20	201:5 204:5,23	titles 2:8 51:9	Treasurer's 77:8
120:7 122:19	138:9 139:3	205:6 233:8	today 37:20 85:23	77:11,18 80:8
123:18 127:25	146:14,15,16	threw 240:13	90:19 96:14	treasury 78:13
132:20 133:21	148:9,22 153:8	thrilled 148:6	97:12 172:8	80:19
134:3 137:25	155:16 158:16	Thursday 94:18	242:15	tremendous
139:10 143:19	162:14 166:18	tickets 40:21	toiletries 66:12	207:14 234:24
154:16 157:25	176:21 179:4,8	tiers 130:23,24	told 16:17 140:14	trend 181:12
159:10 166:4	179:9 180:10,15	time 10:5 12:8	140:16 145:14	trends 135:11
167:8,23 169:7	184:7,8,9,22,24	20:14 21:17	147:17,19	tried 190:8,12
170:3 175:19	185:17 186:9,23	22:11 32:4	189:23 225:13	triple 241:13
180:25 181:18	187:8,10,12	34:20 36:4	231:14	tripped 233:22
182:12 190:3,11	188:2,7 200:15	40:18,22 41:6	Tom 97:25	true 72:2,5
193:10,13	200:16,19,22	41:14 44:7,7	Tommy 73:2	152:17 154:19
197:18 205:6,17	202:21 205:6,9	45:5 46:8 47:20	ton 234:6	158:15 191:22
207:24 210:17	207:12,22	48:7,20 53:17	top 45:17 149:24	244:7
210:22 212:25	208:21 209:25	54:18 55:3,13	150:8 204:5	try 54:11 71:23
213:21 214:7,19	211:15,23 212:2	57:18 58:8,19	total 46:9,10,11	101:17 103:12
216:23,25	212:11 213:25	62:14 64:6	48:4 77:24	123:12 147:5
217:15,20,22	221:9,14,18,21	66:24 69:10	100:3,11 207:11	186:17 202:25
219:7 221:7	231:13,14 234:8	79:20,22 100:15	237:8 240:18	224:20
222:23 223:2	236:24 237:8,16	107:10 109:18	totally 154:11	trying 11:11 13:5
224:4,17 225:2	238:9,10,13	110:10 112:16	222:3 240:2	13:14 58:3
229:2 232:10,13	240:6,7,10,11	126:7 129:12,13	totals 4:20	113:14 115:21
233:14	240:14 241:6,11	129:20 132:14	town 164:23	120:5,8 122:17
think 8:20 10:2,9	241:14,21	141:6 147:13	track 80:21	135:11,17
12:7 17:4,8 19:4	thinking 121:11	152:2 154:13	tracking 94:4	148:11 162:10
20:5 21:20 22:7	122:2,11 207:25	155:5,21 157:11	tradeoff 240:15	168:10 185:4
25:16 33:5,13	third 48:3	158:5,6,11,12	training 143:7	216:13 221:25
34:3 38:2 44:2,3	third-year 50:3	160:14 161:6	234:21 235:2	222:5 223:7
46:15 48:3,17	Thirty-seven	174:3 183:20	trainings 234:25	235:13
49:6,20 50:16	115:16	189:9 190:24	traits 209:20	Tuesday 1:7
51:7,12 54:9	thoroughly	192:25 204:4,8	210:4	turn 113:13
55:19 56:4 57:8	174:19 229:3	204:10 209:2	TRAN 80:15	turned 111:15
65:23 67:9,12	thought 7:25	210:15 211:10	86:24	tweaking 180:24
67:17,22 69:10	51:11,12 60:14	228:14 230:17	transaction 81:13	two 10:15 33:2,11
69:11,16,20	106:19 108:22	236:6 241:8,24	transactions	35:8,22 48:4
70:18 74:2	113:21 121:17	242:23	77:23 78:4,4	67:23 75:10
75:11,14,21,24	121:21 125:17	timeframe 116:19	79:25	86:10 91:20
76:9 82:15,19	128:9 146:20	116:20,24	transcript 244:8	101:7 147:21
83:9,12 92:21	154:14 192:13	117:14	244:20	155:17 158:5,8
93:20,20,23	thousand 61:23	times 42:4 127:9	transfer 60:6,8	162:10 169:18
94:11,24 106:18	106:13 156:14	137:10 165:13	trash 40:25 41:12	174:6 183:23
115:11 117:15	three 39:14 44:7	240:21	42:3,16,21 43:2	201:18 214:19
117:24 121:15	79:21 106:12	time-adjusted	43:16,20 64:6	224:3,3,5,5
	-	-	-	-

226:12 233:20	154:20 157:15	88:22 89:8	224:6 225:3	wait 128:18
two-hour 43:15	169:22 174:22	107:25 134:7	valuing 98:9	142:19 156:21
two-noth 43.13	207:21 217:10	165:23 166:18	variance 203:11	waiting 147:15
two-year 31:18	217:14 222:5	177:4 178:20	variance 203.11 variety 44:11	162:8
127:15	224:16	187:25 209:21	62:22	waiver 125:15
type 74:2 126:21	understanding	216:16 217:7,18	various 30:20	walk 20:10
128:4 144:16	56:16 81:22	217:19 223:21	61:14 62:20	124:25 137:8
165:18 168:8	162:13	224:2 226:10	64:7 95:14	206:3 234:22
203:17,18	unexpected 6:10	uses 81:23 99:2	112:15	Walmart 142:16
types 39:21,22	unfairly 193:4	utilization 27:20	vary 40:18 41:21	want 20:17 22:20
40:8 66:7 71:10	unfilled 100:20	28:2 92:14	vehicle 87:23	33:13,14 34:3
169:24 170:2	Unfortunately	20.2 /2.14	vehicles 16:24	36:25 37:10
182:16 209:20	59:7	\mathbf{V}	vendor 33:12	42:12 43:4,8,9
215:22	unfounded 226:8	vacant 101:3	70:11	43:13,16 45:14
typical 166:2	unfunded 46:12	201:14,15 202:7	vendors 65:10	45:18 55:21
178:16,17	46:16 49:18,19	202:14,16 203:4	verbal 220:22	56:10,17 58:19
211:20	50:2 55:2,8,10	203:8,18 208:6	Veronica 97:22	75:14 109:2,18
typically 21:10	57:19	208:8 209:17	125:3	112:3 114:18
119:3 126:18	uniformity	218:18 219:24	version 8:6 25:5	118:3 124:25
134:5 158:23	212:14,18	220:2,3	versus 8:24 18:20	134:9 135:19
168:14 197:5,16	unintended	valid 166:17	88:9 157:4	146:10 147:9
214:5 222:24	143:11	181:21	166:11 193:5	149:15,21
	union 179:20	validation 166:5	196:4 205:18	153:18 155:11
U	unit 208:12	valuable 99:12	videos 235:2	155:12,15,23
ultimately 81:16	units 166:9	valuation 133:21	Viewed 209:18	157:19 159:17
107:14 112:3	universal 66:14	133:23 142:4	viewpoint 144:6	160:24 161:14
153:17	University's	229:17	Vincent 202:2,3	161:14 164:21
unanswered	129:6	value 65:15	violation 41:10	165:20 168:17
134:23	unknown 95:16	104:14,15	44:12,13,16	173:25 176:9
unauthorized	unprecedented	107:14 118:16	violations 39:2,3	180:14 183:22
41:13,18	204:2	119:19 141:16	39:24 40:24	203:8 204:25
unchanged 77:12	unusual 137:4	141:17 142:7	42:18	205:2 206:2
unclaimed 79:2	155:19	165:12 188:3,18	Virginia 198:12	211:14,24 214:4
underassessed	update 80:24	195:22 197:25	visibility 42:20	217:6 222:14
142:25	208:5,14	198:10 205:15	visitation 110:17	223:9 224:9,12
underlying 53:6	updated 53:3	209:10 215:5	visited 131:14	224:22 232:5
understaffed	upgrade 32:7	217:13 219:5,12	void 217:25	242:4,16
136:24 143:13	upgrades 79:15	220:19 224:13	volume 109:16	wanted 18:7
understand 16:10	upgrading 170:12	237:7	volunteer 137:16	33:19,24 115:9
18:7,17 53:10	upload 39:3,18	valued 153:6	volunteering	140:22 151:3
57:5 75:6 89:4,4	upticked 176:8	values 118:17,19	138:4	198:15 220:9
124:11,19	up-to-date 104:13	164:4 171:12	vote 146:12,19	224:19 230:19
134:21 136:11	urge 128:17,20	175:4 181:10	VPRC 216:13	233:10
139:22 147:19	use 33:24 50:4	196:12,15	TX 7	wanting 65:4,5
148:10 150:9	81:17,25 82:16	202:15 212:5	W	wants 142:12
151:10 153:8,10	82:20 83:2,3,15	216:14,14,17	W 1:11	222:19
153:22 154:12	83:19,19 84:9	220:14 223:20	wage 6:25	warehouse 98:23

warrant 197:13	189:4	43:17 54:19,21	101:6,9,12,13	113:5 117:12
wasn't 23:10	weeks 39:14	55:16 58:3 66:9	103:4,5,11	122:3,22 124:16
34:18 53:15	158:5,12 233:9	67:9,16 68:22	112:18 132:5	128:25 129:9,20
63:19 132:23	weird 135:9	68:24 72:3,17	144:3 159:25	130:3 141:6,7
137:2 140:12	Weiss 37:14,15,19	72:25 74:11,12	174:11 178:3	144:25 148:16
144:14 235:7	38:5,13,17,23	77:7 81:11	183:16 186:20	168:8 175:25
240:4	39:10,13,23	83:14 88:11	191:13 203:5	185:13 193:12
waste 22:6 23:16	40:5,14,17	89:20,21,22	206:8,13 228:7	199:15 204:23
wasting 147:13	41:20 42:9,23	90:2 92:8,19	228:9 229:6	205:4,5 206:3
watched 235:2	43:12 44:6,10	93:10 96:14	241:6	206:14 207:14
water 78:3 79:10	welcome 33:4	103:11,16	WILLIAM 1:11	213:17 214:8
86:4 87:5,5	36:19 90:21	105:21 106:23	willing 150:16,20	216:3 224:21
144:10,11	120:20 206:21	115:20 116:9,10	154:23 205:4	228:11
149:17 150:5	went 8:9 34:25	116:11,15 117:8	217:21	worked 33:12
Waxman 232:23	48:24 60:16	117:24 120:20	WILSON 1:11	35:2 63:16
233:3,4 234:9	108:20 141:25	122:23 128:7	window 235:25	126:6 198:5
234:14 235:10	149:23 154:15	135:20 156:10	winds 25:11	203:6 228:7
way 9:14 14:6	166:13 168:22	164:2,10 176:10	Winkler 76:22,24	worker 145:6
20:18 22:11,15	233:12	177:22 179:8	77:3 81:21 82:5	workforce 30:23
26:18 43:23	weren't 111:4	180:24 182:8,16	82:10 83:24	32:13 36:3
54:8 56:17	139:17 178:19	184:2 185:18,19	84:3,12,17 85:3	working 7:8 13:7
63:17 65:19	189:23 232:12	191:18 192:20	Winkler's 88:8,19	32:16 42:13
67:9 82:15	232:17	196:2 204:16	wished 155:3	43:11 63:15
106:23 110:14	we'll 3:18 9:15	207:18,25	withdraw 159:18	66:9 67:24
113:11 120:14	20:7 53:5 69:4	210:25 211:4	160:14 161:7	78:19 80:4,6
122:23 140:16	72:18 80:19	212:21 215:3	withdrawals	81:11 87:2
144:25 145:8	89:24 93:23	216:13,22,22	108:18	101:10 117:6,9
154:3,5 155:2	101:18,19	217:17,19 218:4	witness 3:15 26:9	122:5 176:13
180:13 186:20	114:24 118:17	219:19,21	30:2,2 37:12,12	177:13 204:23
189:9 192:20	118:20 119:2,4	220:22 221:20	61:5,5 76:20	207:16
209:10 210:19	146:3,7,8 151:2	222:6,16,17	84:23 85:7 96:7	works 31:14 40:7
213:13 231:15	151:25 152:25	223:24 224:6	97:2,2 150:19	133:22 148:12
ways 9:13 23:8	159:3,3,6,7,9,16	227:3 228:10,24	177:7,7 195:8,8	162:21 205:22
49:8 50:8 82:16	161:5 170:22	228:25 231:9	200:2,2 232:25	232:16
83:10 103:5	179:12 187:12	232:15 234:8	232:25	world 112:13
212:18	188:18 195:2	235:19 236:11	Witnesses 3:15	114:13
weaker 7:2	197:11 202:2,5	236:19 239:5,15	76:20 85:7	worrying 147:16
wealth 125:22	213:21 214:6	239:20,21	Woodhaven	worth 137:13
weather 40:25	215:14,20,21	241:11	141:2	147:22 218:7,8
web 39:3	222:14 224:2	we've 6:11 17:8	word 211:14	218:9,11 223:21
website 39:5 80:8	237:21 238:9,13	24:10 32:9	words 36:4 103:7	worthless 147:21
Wednesday	241:14	39:15 47:4 48:5	111:20	wouldn't 21:21
242:22	we're 6:16 12:13	48:9 58:10	work 28:3 33:15	40:9 55:20 60:2
weeding 103:2	16:14 18:22	62:23 64:23	35:18 52:2 54:7	60:5 151:20
weeds 151:17	32:16 33:16,21	67:24 69:10	64:19 65:5 69:3	154:23 195:25
week 42:6 112:23	33:22 35:6,8	71:13,14 79:3	74:12 75:17	196:9
112:24 158:5	40:23 42:14	79:13 94:4	95:24 110:14	wound 240:17
	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>

Wow 106:13	49:16 60:16	141:11 174:2,7	\$14 86:15	10:00 242:22
174:18	61:20 62:25	185:22 192:17	\$149 87:12	10:30 1:7
wrap 168:11	67:5 68:22	199:2 200:20,21	\$15,000 138:17	100 21:19 22:20
write 116:16	69:14,15 70:5	200:23,24	\$16 87:7	78:9 99:22
writing 38:6	70:20 71:7,22	203:21 221:13	\$20,000 138:17	131:24 205:15
43:23 117:15	71:23 72:20,23	224:20	142:18	11 11:22 12:20
128:12 154:10	75:17 76:3	year's 24:15,23	\$200 49:2	78:24 124:21
227:10	77:13 78:14,17	24:24 62:15	\$200,000 113:18	12 147:25
written 54:7	79:24 80:2,20	63:4 73:9 83:4	\$213 87:6	12.1 91:24 92:15
wrong 216:17	81:18,20 82:11	112:17 175:25	\$230 48:12	92:19
219:14 226:18	86:2 87:8,15	177:25 185:18	\$248 86:9	120 16:22 25:2
wrote 51:11	91:6,13 93:2	238:13	\$29 5:3	13 11:23 77:21,24
	95:7,21 98:5	yesterday's	\$3 86:23	78:5
X	99:16,19 100:2	235:14	\$30 88:12 240:11	13.18 92:6
X 137:14	101:3 105:12,19	yield 21:3,23 45:5	\$30,000 105:21	14 5:7,10 11:22
T 7	106:6,16,18	York 17:15	\$300,000 113:17	13:11 61:20
Y	111:22 112:2,16	young 126:17,21	\$400 240:21	77:21,24 78:5
yeah 8:20 9:11	113:9,18,25	127:22 128:24	\$400,000 78:17	78:14 237:20
12:4 20:25 22:3	114:3,4,14		147:23	14.4 77:20
24:13 26:24	115:10,11 116:2	Z	\$401,642 100:9	140144 1:17 2:5
29:2,23 34:22	117:18,20	zero-based 67:13	\$41 11:20	2:10 3:1 4:1 5:1
49:22 51:7	118:11,11,13	68:16 69:19,19	\$435,000 78:25	6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1
52:22 55:6	131:24 138:18	71:19,25 72:3	\$5,000 138:16	10:1 11:1 12:1
60:11,21 66:18	143:14 166:14	zip 132:23 133:4	\$50,000 150:5	13:1 14:1 15:1
67:4,7 75:11	166:21 178:6	133:10,14 134:7	\$500,000 147:23	16:1 17:1 18:1
88:14,14 94:24	181:8 185:17	134:14 135:2	\$529 4:21	19:1 20:1 21:1
111:23 113:7,24	188:25 189:3,8	zoned 137:5 203:9	\$55 180:5	22:1 23:1 24:1
117:21 124:24	189:12,22,24	220:12,15	\$6 87:20	25:1 26:1 27:1
131:11 133:5	190:6,17 191:4	zoning 203:7,11	\$616.4 85:24	28:1 29:1 30:1
135:22 149:7	191:7 192:7,8,9	203:12 218:25	\$7.8 86:21	31:1 32:1 33:1
156:15,21 163:3	200:14 201:6	219:22 221:6	\$71 180:6	34:1 35:1 36:1
172:3,23 184:8	210:10 224:17	ф	\$75 14:16	37:1 38:1 39:1
187:3 188:17	224:23,23 236:8	\$	\$794,600 100:3	40:1 41:1 42:1
189:7 196:14	236:10,12 237:3	\$1.3 183:7	\$8.6 85:21	43:1 44:1 45:1
204:21 205:12	237:5 238:6,12	\$1.955 4:20		46:1 47:1 48:1
206:5 210:8	238:14,24	\$10 79:18 240:5	0	49:1 50:1 51:1
212:20 218:15	240:24 241:4,14	\$10,000 138:17	0.54 91:18	52:1 53:1 54:1
222:8 229:25	yearly 163:19	142:18	1	55:1 56:1 57:1
230:5 237:17	164:13	\$10,158,928 99:23	$\frac{1}{11724226922}$	58:1 59:1 60:1
year 2:18,22,25	years 2:12,23 6:2	\$10.8 87:14	11:7 24:22 68:2,2	61:1 62:1 63:1
5:21 9:17 12:3,8	6:12 12:6 24:4,4	\$111 86:14	68:4 83:7 131:3	64:1 65:1 66:1
14:12 20:13	32:10 33:2,11	\$12 239:21	1st 90:19	67:1 68:1 69:1
24:21 25:15,24	35:8,23 48:4	\$120 15:13 92:23	1.3 236:22	70:1 71:1 72:1
25:25 38:8,8	55:18 67:11	\$13 239:21	1/4 226:8	73:1 74:1 75:1
40:5,19 41:3	71:15 77:17	\$13,000 142:2 \$13,737,018,00:18	1:30 96:17	76:1 77:1 78:1
42:2 43:5,6 44:9	94:22 123:25	\$13,727,918 99:18	10 46:2 211:21	79:1 80:1 81:1
44:11 46:19,25	124:4,5,8,21,22	100:12	240:13	82:1 83:1 84:1
48:15,18 49:3		\$136 86:20	10.94 91:24	

85:1 86:1 87:1	184:1 185:1	1968 208:10	270,000 239:14	61:1 62:1 63:1
88:1 89:1 90:1	186:1 187:1	1988 94:5,7	240:20	64:1 65:1 66:1
91:1 92:1 93:1	188:1 189:1	1992 3:8 173:18	28 242:8	67:1 68:1 69:1
94:1 95:1 96:1	190:1 191:1	3.0 173.10	20 2 12.0	70:1 71:1 72:1
97:1 98:1 99:1	192:1 193:1	2	3	73:1 74:1 75:1
100:1 101:1	194:1 195:1	2 8:24 68:2,6	3 8:24,24 61:13,15	76:1 77:1 78:1
102:1 103:1	196:1 197:1	100:18 131:4	131:4 181:9,9	79:1 80:1 81:1
104:1 105:1	198:1 199:1	148:3	236:9,20	82:1 83:1 84:1
106:1 107:1	200:1 201:1	2nd 175:10	3rd 3:8	85:1 86:1 87:1
108:1 109:1	202:1 203:1	242:22	3,000 106:10	88:1 89:1 90:1
110:1 111:1	204:1 205:1	2,046 185:11	156:12	91:1 92:1 93:1
112:1 113:1	206:1 207:1	2.7 237:8	3:00 43:17	94:1 95:1 96:1
114:1 115:1	208:1 209:1	20 43:24 83:6	3:55 243:3	97:1 98:1 99:1
116:1 117:1	210:1 211:1	175:10 237:25	30 238:6,14	100:1 101:1
118:1 119:1	212:1 213:1	238:2 239:19	30th 238:25 239:6	102:1 103:1
120:1 121:1	214:1 215:1	240:13,16	300 99:24 100:2	104:1 105:1
122:1 123:1	216:1 217:1	20's 6:7,8	31,000 44:12	106:1 107:1
124:1 125:1	218:1 219:1	20,000 168:16,18	33 7:19 8:2,19	108:1 109:1
126:1 127:1	220:1 221:1	200 49:15 59:20	12:22	110:1 111:1
128:1 129:1	222:1 223:1	86:10,14	34 92:9	112:1 113:1
130:1 131:1	224:1 225:1	2000 68:23 165:7	37 100:20 101:19	114:1 115:1
132:1 133:1	226:1 227:1	2000's 191:25	115:14	116:1 117:1
134:1 135:1	228:1 229:1	2001 94:8		118:1 119:1
136:1 137:1	230:1 231:1	2003 45:20	4	120:1 121:1
138:1 139:1	232:1 233:1	2004 46:25 47:4	4 5:19 55:19	122:1 123:1
140:1 141:1	234:1 235:1	2008 94:9	93:15	124:1 125:1
142:1 143:1	236:1 237:1	2010 47:20	4th 226:7	126:1 127:1
144:1 145:1	238:1 239:1	2011 47:20	4.5 46:11	128:1 129:1
146:1 147:1	240:1 241:1	2013 46:2,9 79:16	4.86 46:12 55:9	130:1 131:1
148:1 149:1	242:1 243:1	2014 1:7 2:25	4/1/14 3:1 4:1 5:1	132:1 133:1
150:1 151:1	140145 1:17 2:5	105:16	6:1 7:1 8:1 9:1	134:1 135:1
152:1 153:1	2:14	2015 2:12,15,18	10:1 11:1 12:1	136:1 137:1
154:1 155:1	140146 1:17 2:5	2:23 98:5 99:16	13:1 14:1 15:1	138:1 139:1
156:1 157:1	2:16	99:19 100:2,7	16:1 17:1 18:1	140:1 141:1
158:1 159:1	140159 1:17 2:6	100:11 105:12	19:1 20:1 21:1	142:1 143:1
160:1 161:1	2:19	105:17 119:25	22:1 23:1 24:1	144:1 145:1
162:1 163:1	15 25:23 77:9	120:9 164:10	25:1 26:1 27:1	146:1 147:1
164:1 165:1	86:2 236:13,15	191:10	28:1 29:1 30:1	148:1 149:1
166:1 167:1	238:22	2019 2:24	31:1 32:1 33:1	150:1 151:1
168:1 169:1	15th 189:4,12	2020 2:12	34:1 35:1 36:1	152:1 153:1
170:1 171:1	15,000 104:11	217 99:21 132:6	37:1 38:1 39:1	154:1 155:1
172:1 173:1	1563-A 3:9	22 104:8	40:1 41:1 42:1	156:1 157:1
174:1 175:1	16 73:7 237:21	22,000 104:3	43:1 44:1 45:1	158:1 159:1
176:1 177:1	160,000 138:23	179:6	46:1 47:1 48:1	160:1 161:1
178:1 179:1	17 46:2 77:21	230 239:15	49:1 50:1 51:1	162:1 163:1
180:1 181:1	17.65 92:9,21	232,000 185:10	52:1 53:1 54:1	164:1 165:1
182:1 183:1	175 8:21	25.5 78:6	55:1 56:1 57:1	166:1 167:1
			58:1 59:1 60:1	
	•	•	-	

160 1 160 1	40 1 01 14	05 000 140 0	
168:1 169:1	48.1 91:14	85,000 142:2	
170:1 171:1	5	87 78:23	
172:1 173:1	5 55:9,19 82:23	87.2 78:2 88 92:10	
174:1 175:1	91:8 142:6	00 92:10	
176:1 177:1 178:1 179:1	5:00 43:3	9	
180:1 181:1	50 64:5 181:17	9.33 92:4	
182:1 183:1	237:20	9.36 46:10	
184:1 185:1	500 5:4 145:15	90 94:21 184:10	
186:1 187:1	501(c)(3) 103:9	184:12	
188:1 189:1	53.57 5:4	90,000 184:12	
190:1 191:1	55 185:21,22	185:7	
192:1 193:1	57 91:10	90.3 78:23	
194:1 195:1	570,000 179:5	97 215:5	
196:1 197:1	579,000 98:18	99 126:15	
198:1 199:1	103:25	99.9 144:16	
200:1 201:1	59,995 155:9		
202:1 203:1			
204:1 205:1	6		
206:1 207:1	6th 179:21		
208:1 209:1	60 11:19 91:8		
210:1 211:1	235:23		
212:1 213:1	60,000 138:24		
214:1 215:1	144:18 154:21		
216:1 217:1	154:24		
218:1 219:1	65 12:19		
220:1 221:1	67,000 44:13		
222:1 223:1	7		
224:1 225:1			
226:1 227:1	7 21:5 42:21		
228:1 229:1	43:20 45:21		
230:1 231:1	7.34 11:25		
232:1 233:1	7.85 93:18,22		
234:1 235:1	7.9 94:20		
236:1 237:1	7.91 94:6,11		
238:1 239:1	7.95 93:18		
240:1 241:1	7:00 43:3,17 70 140:3		
242:1 243:1	70 140:3 70s 79:22		
40 39:15 40:2,3	70,000 184:5		
181:17	70,000 184.3 700 86:12,19		
400 1:6 99:25	87:13		
100:2 242:24	700,000 61:23		
400,000 165:8	71 91:10		
41 92:7	79 91:7		
47 7:4 50:12			
47's 8:19	8		
47.4 91:13	8 142:6 148:3		