

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA  
COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

Room 400, City Hall  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania  
Wednesday, April 6, 2016  
10:38 a.m.

PRESENT:

COUNCIL PRESIDENT DARRELL L. CLARKE  
COUNCILWOMAN CINDY BASS  
COUNCILWOMAN JANNIE L. BLACKWELL  
COUNCILMAN ALLAN DOMB  
COUNCILMAN DEREK S. GREEN  
COUNCILMAN WILLIAM K. GREENLEE  
COUNCILWOMAN HELEN GYM  
COUNCILMAN BOBBY HENON  
COUNCILMAN CURTIS JONES, JR.  
COUNCILMAN KENYATTA JOHNSON  
COUNCILMAN DAVID OH  
COUNCILWOMAN CHERELLE L. PARKER  
COUNCILWOMAN BLONDELL REYNOLDS BROWN  
COUNCILWOMAN MARIA D. QUINONES-SANCHEZ  
COUNCILMAN MARK SQUILLA  
COUNCILMAN AL TAUBENBERGER

BILLS: 160170, 160171, 160172  
RESOLUTIONS: 160180

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

STREHLOW & ASSOCIATES, INC.  
(215) 504-4622

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 2

1 - - -

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good morning.  
3 We are going to start.

4 This is the Public Hearing of the  
5 Committee of the Whole regarding Bills No.  
6 160170, 160171, 160172 and Resolution No.  
7 160180. Mr. Stitt, please read the titles  
8 of the bills and resolution.

9 THE CLERK: Bill No. 160170: An  
10 ordinance to adopt a Capital Program for the  
11 six Fiscal Years 2017-2022 inclusive.

12 Bill No. 160171: An ordinance to adopt  
13 a Fiscal 2017 Capital Budget.

14 Bill No. 160172: An ordinance adopting  
15 the Operating Budget for Fiscal Year 2017.

16 Resolution No. 160180: Resolution  
17 providing for the approval by the Council of  
18 the City of Philadelphia of a Revised Five  
19 Year Financial Plan for the City of  
20 Philadelphia covering Fiscal Years 2017  
21 through 2021, and incorporating proposed  
22 changes with respect to Fiscal Year 2016,  
23 which is to be submitted by the Mayor to the  
24 Pennsylvania Intergovernmental Cooperation  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

STREHLOW & ASSOCIATES, INC.  
(215) 504-4622

1 Authority (the "Authority") pursuant to the  
2 Intergovernmental Cooperation Agreement,  
3 authorized by an Ordinance of this Council  
4 approved by the Mayor on January 3, 1992  
5 (Bill No. 1563-A), by and between the City  
6 and the Authorized.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
8 Mr. Stitt.

9 Today we continue the Public Hearing of  
10 the Committee of the Whole to consider the  
11 bills read by the clerk that constitute  
12 proposed operating and capital spending  
13 measures for Fiscal 2017, a Capital Program,  
14 a forward looking Capital Plan for Fiscal  
15 2017 through Fiscal 2022.

16 Today we will hear testimony on the  
17 following departments: Finance, City  
18 Treasurer, Sinking Fund and OPA.

19 Mr. Stitt, the first person to testify  
20 from the Administration is?

21 THE CLERK: Rob Dubow, Director of  
22 Finance.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
24 sir.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1 (Witness approaches Table.)

2 Good morning.

3 MR. DUBOW: Good morning.

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Please.

5 MR. DUBOW: Good morning, Council  
6 President Clarke and Members of City  
7 Council. I'm Rob Dubow, the Director of  
8 Finance. And I'm pleased to provide  
9 testimony on the Office of Director of  
10 Finance's FY 17 Operating Budget. Joining  
11 me at the table today is Cathy Paster, First  
12 Deputy Director of Finance. There are also  
13 representatives from the various divisions  
14 of the Office of Director of Finance.

15 The Office of Director of Finance is  
16 charged with overseeing the City's financial  
17 accounting and budgetary functions including  
18 establishing fiscal policy guidelines,  
19 overseeing the City's budget and financial  
20 management programs and recording and  
21 accounting all of the City's activities.  
22 The proposed budget for the Office of  
23 City Director -- Office the Director of  
24 Finance supporting a number of departments  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 and divisions and representatives of those  
2 divisions are here.

3 In the next section you see we go  
4 through what our plans are for FY17. I  
5 won't read all of those, but you have them  
6 there. Our total budget which also includes  
7 funding for benefits citywide totals 1.4  
8 billion. That's an increase of 40.7 million  
9 over FY16 estimated obligations. The  
10 increase is caused by a \$49 million increase  
11 in fringe benefits.

12 In the core finance budget, there's a  
13 decrease of about 3.2 million. And that's  
14 mostly for moving functions over to the new  
15 Office of Chief Administrative Officer.

16 And with that --

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: The last  
18 part?

19 MR. DUBOW: Oh, there is a decrease of  
20 about 3.3 million in the budget. And most  
21 of that is moving functions over to the  
22 Chief Administrative Officer. So, we had  
23 units that were in our -- in Finance that  
24 have moved over.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.  
2 We thought you were hiding money for  
3 contracts, municipal contracts.

4 MR. DUBOW: We would never do that.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: That's what  
6 we would do in the old days.

7 MR. DUBOW: In the old days, but we  
8 don't do that anymore.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.

10 MR. DUBOW: And with that, I will  
11 conclude my testimony and are happy to  
12 answer any questions.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. Sorry.  
14 We good?

15 MR. DUBOW: Yeah.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.  
17 Thank you. Had a couple of quick ones and  
18 then do some follow ups.

19 One, I want to go back to earlier  
20 conversation on the sugar tax. And I'm  
21 asking you these questions because the tax  
22 bills are further -- further back in the  
23 budget process. Want to get some of this on  
24 the record now.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       One of the issues is that there was the  
2 consistent reference to Berkeley, California  
3 as the only municipality that currently has  
4 such a proposal. And I just wanted to  
5 outline -- I'm not asking you for a  
6 response -- but to outline the differences  
7 in Berkeley, California --

8       MR. DUBOW: Right.

9       COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: -- and the  
10 City of Philadelphia. It is clearly not  
11 apples to apples, may not even be apples and  
12 oranges.

13       As an example, as we all know, that  
14 Berkeley is much smaller than the City of  
15 Philadelphia. The City of Philly is  
16 1.5 million. Berkeley is 118,000. Not even  
17 the size of my council district. The  
18 demographics on the population in the City  
19 of Philadelphia is 41 percent White,  
20 43 percent African-American and 6.3 percent  
21 Asian and 12 percent Hispanic, not that that  
22 means anything, but that's just the  
23 demographics. In Berkeley it's 59 percent  
24 White, 10 percent African-American,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 19 percent Hispanic -- I'm sorry, 19 percent  
2 Asian and 10 percent Hispanic.

3 What does to some degree somewhat  
4 relevant to the issues with respects to  
5 taxes, the median home value in the City of  
6 Philadelphia is around 143,000; but in  
7 Berkeley it's 719,000. So, it's clearly a  
8 city that has a lot more wealth. And the  
9 median gross rent in Philadelphia is around  
10 \$915; and in Berkeley it's 2,851. The  
11 median household income in Philadelphia is  
12 37,400; and in Berkeley it's 65,000.

13 So, I say all that to say that when we  
14 use comparables on whatever the issue is, we  
15 tend to like to have a comparable  
16 environment to do an analysis on usage or  
17 taxes or anything that we do here. And I  
18 understand you can't use what you don't have  
19 because there's no other municipality that's  
20 comparable to the City of Philadelphia that  
21 has such a tax.

22 I just wanted to put that on the record.  
23 Not necessarily asking you for a response.

24 MR. DUBOW: Got it. We compared to  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1     there and to Mexico, too, because those are  
2     the two examples we knew of where it had  
3     been implemented. And looked at, you know,  
4     business behavior and looked at a wide range  
5     of how there are reactions to it.

6           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. There  
7     were a number of questions. And I don't  
8     think we got a response as yet. Who will  
9     the tax impact? We haven't gotten a  
10    specific answer yet. And a lot has to do  
11    with where the product is. And, I mean,  
12    without doing a real detailed analysis, I  
13    think most people understand that the  
14    options in certain neighbors are different  
15    than the options in other neighborhoods.

16           In the lower income neighborhoods, it  
17    tends to be less options in terms of  
18    product.

19           MR. DUBOW: Right. And we understand,  
20    too, that that's where the advertising is  
21    targeted which is part of what happens,  
22    also.

23           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Pardon me?

24           MR. DUBOW: We understand, too, that's  
          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 part of where the advertising is targeted  
2 for these products so that drives it, too.

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I'm just  
4 talking about the product. I don't know the  
5 advertisement. I mean, I guess you  
6 advertize a product you have in your store.  
7 But the reality is, is that they tend to be  
8 in lower income neighborhoods -- they don't  
9 tend to be, they are in lower income  
10 neighborhoods, the lack of choices as it  
11 relates to products. Okay.

12 This issue about, I guess, enforcement.  
13 Do we talk about a retail or a large scale,  
14 a Costco or a JB -- BJ's, I'm sorry. Tell  
15 you -- tell you where I shop. Is not  
16 purchase a product from a dealer that paid  
17 the tax, so they buy it from Virginia or  
18 something. Then the Costco-type stores,  
19 distributes -- distributor who must pay the  
20 tax to sell into a Philadelphia dealer.

21 What enforcement jurisdictions does the  
22 City currently have over a Costco outside  
23 the City boundaries? And what are the taxes  
24 in this Costco-type store subject to that?

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. DUBOW: I think I will ask Revenue  
2 to come up and answer that, the  
3 representatives from the Revenue Department,  
4 and they can give us the details on that.

5 (Witnesses approach Table.)

6 MS. WAXMAN: Good morning.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good morning.

8 MS. WAXMAN: My name is Marisa Waxman.  
9 I'm Deputy Revenue Commissioner. Your  
10 question was about how -- what happens when  
11 a store like a Costco or a BJ's is where a  
12 retailer gets the product they then sell in  
13 their ultimate store?

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Right.  
15 Specifically, when that -- that particular  
16 Costco or somebody didn't even buy from  
17 Philadelphia.

18 MS. WAXMAN: Right. So obviously, if  
19 it's in Philadelphia, the distributor who  
20 supplied the BJ's -- because there isn't a  
21 Costco in Philadelphia -- but a BJ's or jet  
22 row or one of those, if it's in Philadelphia  
23 the distributor --

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: No. If the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 distributor is not in Philadelphia?

2 MS. WAXMAN: Right -- yeah.

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, they got  
4 their product from a distributor in  
5 Maryland.

6 MS. WAXMAN: Right. So, product comes  
7 from Maryland, goes to Costco in New Jersey.  
8 Retailer from Philadelphia shows up and  
9 wants to purchase the product that he's  
10 going to sell in his store.

11 So what the law says, is that the notice  
12 that the retailer is to provide to that  
13 distributor, the Costco in New Jersey that  
14 got the product from Maryland, is showing  
15 their Pennsylvania sales tax exemption with  
16 a Philadelphia address on it. That is the  
17 notice that that now distributor, the Costco  
18 in this situation is a distributor, needs to  
19 know that they need to come and get licensed  
20 and file and pay in Philadelphia. And the  
21 law indicates that we have the ability to  
22 require them to do this.

23 Now --

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 purchase -- the person that purchased the  
2 product from Costco has what now?

3 Go a little slower for me. I'm a little  
4 slow this morning.

5 MS. WAXMAN: We're going to -- we are  
6 going to name him Bob, and he has a corner  
7 store in Southwest Philadelphia. Bob drives  
8 over to Costco in New Jersey.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.

10 MS. WAXMAN: Bob brings with him his  
11 sales tax exemption certificate which  
12 basically means, hi, I'm buying this for  
13 resale; so, please don't charge me the sales  
14 tax. So, that's why Bob brings that with  
15 him because he doesn't want to pay sales  
16 tax.

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: The Philly  
18 sales tax or what tax?

19 MS. WAXMAN: The whole state sales tax.  
20 If he's reselling it, that's why he has this  
21 form.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay.

23 MS. WAXMAN: Once he shows that form to  
24 the Costco, that's the notice that Costco  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 gets, hey, I have got to register and file  
2 and pay as a distributor. So Bob from  
3 Southwest Philly, he doesn't have to do  
4 anything. It's Costco that has to do it.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay.

6 MS. WAXMAN: Now if for some -- now Bob  
7 is in the clear as long as he shows that  
8 form to Costco. He did what he's supposed  
9 to do. But if Bob is buying from somewhere  
10 else, doesn't show that form or whatever,  
11 then Bob would be required to file and pay  
12 the tax himself.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: My question  
14 is, how do you enforce the distributor issue  
15 with Costco, if they did not?

16 MS. WAXMAN: If they didn't do it.  
17 So --

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I mean, how  
19 do they -- they say, well, you don't have  
20 the jurisdiction.

21 MS. WAXMAN: And I can probably defer  
22 that to the City Solicitor about, you know,  
23 our legal ability to enforce that. But my  
24 understanding is that we can do this. And  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1    their are a number of taxpayers who have  
2    obligations to the City who aren't  
3    physically located here. And so, our  
4    enforcement, we would be able to do a number  
5    of things.

6           When we're trying to figure out where --  
7    if there's product being sold in the City  
8    that the tax wasn't paid by the distributor,  
9    the legislation has on there that the  
10   invoice that Costco gives to Bob has to have  
11   a line showing that tax. And the reason for  
12   that is that so if we're going in, we're  
13   looking at Bob or we're looking at, you  
14   know, an entire supermarket or convenience  
15   store chain, we are going to want to be able  
16   to see on an invoice that it says, you know,  
17   who is supposed to be paying that tax.

18           And you know, if we see it and there's a  
19   line that says Costco and they paid, you  
20   know, a million dollars or whatever it is,  
21   then we're going to want to go back and  
22   check and did we actually get the funds from  
23   Costco and whatever. I'm just using that  
24   company as an example.

          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 But if we didn't get it, seeing their  
2 name on the invoice, we know there's a  
3 disconnect. We've got to go collect it. Or  
4 if there's nothing there, we then ask the  
5 question, where did you get this product?  
6 Did you show them the certificate? And we  
7 figure what we do next to try and figure out  
8 who the supplier of the product was.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Who currently  
10 enforces or checks invoices from retailers  
11 in the City of Philadelphia?

12 MS. WAXMAN: I don't know that we  
13 currently check invoices, but we do at the  
14 Department of Revenue, have a staff of  
15 auditors when audits are conducted, we are  
16 looking to make sure that all the taxes are  
17 being appropriately paid to the City.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, will we  
19 now have those people checking all the  
20 various retailers for their invoices that  
21 indicates where they got their product from?

22 MS. WAXMAN: We did include in the  
23 departmental budget for this year additional  
24 funding for staff so that we can increase  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 our audit capacity.

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, we're  
3 going to staff up to enforce the retailers  
4 in the City of Philadelphia and their  
5 invoices.

6 MS. WAXMAN: Well, it's so that when we  
7 are conducting audits, we will have more  
8 folks and we'll folks who are trained on how  
9 to look for this when they're looking for  
10 it.

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: How  
12 frequently do we do audits?

13 MS. WAXMAN: That would -- it would be  
14 something I would have to get back to you  
15 on.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: What do we  
17 normally do?

18 MS. WAXMAN: I'm sorry. I don't have  
19 the information on that. But we can  
20 certainly --

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Who would  
22 know that?

23 MR. BRESLIN: Good morning. Frank  
24 Breslin, Revenue Commissioner.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good morning.

2 MR. BRESLIN: As far as doing audits,  
3 you know, how frequently you do audits, it  
4 really varies on industry and.

5 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Pull the  
6 mic up.

7 MR. BRESLIN: Sure. It depends on the  
8 industry and the initiative. So, we select  
9 different audit projects essentially for any  
10 given year. So in this case, and when --  
11 it's important to note that when we do an  
12 audit, we are not doing a particular tax.  
13 We are doing a particular entity, a  
14 taxpayer.

15 Our auditors would go out and do -- in  
16 this case, if it was auditing Bob's as  
17 Deputy Waxman said, we would be looking at  
18 all of the invoices for purchases that --  
19 our auditors would look at all the invoices  
20 for purchases that that retail entity made  
21 and ensuring that the tax was paid. And  
22 that would just be a part of the entire  
23 audit.

24 Now with a new tax, it's not uncommon  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 that we would make that a focus of an audit  
2 initiative for the year because we want  
3 to -- we want to get some sense of  
4 compliance, so we would start doing audits.  
5 And we would track --

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Of all  
7 retailers, right?

8 MR. BRESLIN: Yes. It could be  
9 retailers. It could be the distributors.  
10 It could be whatever industry just to get  
11 some sense of the compliance. So when our  
12 auditors are out there and they're doing the  
13 audit, they would know to look for those  
14 invoices and be checking to see that that  
15 tax is being paid.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Do we know  
17 how many retailers there are in the City  
18 that sells sugary products?

19 MR. BRESLIN: I don't know that number  
20 off hand, but we can get back to you. We  
21 can do it by NAICS Code.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. I'm  
23 just asking. Because if we're now going to  
24 either staff up or have the responsibility,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 then that's -- we need to kind of know how  
2 many -- what the scope of the potential  
3 retailers are.

4 MR. BRESLIN: Right. And I don't think  
5 we would be going out and trying to audit  
6 all retailers, but retailers are obviously a  
7 normal part of our audit process. So when  
8 our auditors are out auditing a retailer,  
9 they would now be looking at the invoices to  
10 see from the taxes.

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: For that,  
12 also?

13 MR. BRESLIN: Yes, for that also. And  
14 the same thing with the distributors at  
15 whatever level. If that tax -- if there is  
16 exposure to that tax, our auditors would be  
17 trained to look for that to make sure that  
18 there's compliance.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. One  
20 quick follow up on one question I asked  
21 earlier, then I will relinquish the mic.

22 How frequently do we currently audit the  
23 average retailer?

24 MR. BRESLIN: I don't know that number.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 I don't know off the top of my head.

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Can somebody  
3 get back to us on that?

4 MR. BRESLIN: Sure.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I'm just  
6 trying to -- this is a big -- this is a  
7 pretty big project.

8 MR. BRESLIN: Yeah.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And I know on  
10 some blocks in the district I represent,  
11 there may be four or five stores on one  
12 block, maybe more than that, that sell  
13 sugary products. And I'm actually talking  
14 about Center City. Some people might think  
15 I'm talking about North Philly, but I  
16 represent Center City. They have four or  
17 five restaurants that actually sell -- sell  
18 sodas or fountain sodas or other things.

19 MR. BRESLIN: Right.

20 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. If you  
21 can get that information to us, please, that  
22 would be helpful. Thank you.

23 Turn it over to Councilman Greenlee.

24 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank you,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Mr. President. Good morning.

2 Mr. Dubow, I know we've -- I raised this  
3 before just last week in the Five Year Plan.  
4 I know Councilwoman Reynolds Brown brought  
5 it up yesterday to the Managing Director,  
6 too. This whole issue -- and I know you  
7 said that the issue of the disconnect, for  
8 lack of a better term, between BRT, OPA and  
9 Revenue will eventually get rectified by the  
10 CAMA system.

11 MR. DUBOW: Right.

12 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: But that's a  
13 couple years. And I was just wondering is  
14 there any progress being made in trying to  
15 improve this?

16 I mean, I checked with my office today.  
17 And they're still complaints about that,  
18 that people think they worked things out and  
19 then they get a bill that's different or  
20 some of them are getting, you know, sheriff  
21 sale notices and all. And you know,  
22 individually we're able to work it out. But  
23 it just seems -- and I'm trying to Monday  
24 morning quarterback here. I guess I don't  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 understand why people didn't see this  
2 coming.

3 MR. DUBOW: I understand. Yeah, I  
4 understand the issue. I think part of it  
5 was kind of the massive number of -- of  
6 changes and appeals. But I do think it's  
7 one of the things that, you know, we need to  
8 continue working on to make sure that those  
9 three agencies are meeting regularly and  
10 coordinating. But even when they do that,  
11 because of the way our systems work now,  
12 they are still going to be stuff that slips  
13 through.

14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Yeah. I mean,  
15 maybe I'm oversimplifying this. I'm far  
16 from a computer expert. So if you can't do  
17 it electronically, how about just sending  
18 paperwork over?

19 MR. DUBOW: I think that's kind of what  
20 happens. There are still things that kind  
21 of slip through.

22 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Yeah. Yeah. I  
23 mean, in --

24 MR. DUBOW: And obviously, those are the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 ones we hear about. The ones that --

2 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Pardon me?

3 MR. DUBOW: Obviously, those are the  
4 ones you hear about.

5 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Yeah, right. I  
6 hear you. But it still seems like a lot  
7 when you add it up. You know, I don't think  
8 we're the only office that hears it. I  
9 think a lot of -- lot of us do, and I don't  
10 think they are all the same people.

11 Again, I guess it's easy to criticize  
12 after the fact. It's just -- it's hard to  
13 explain to people. You know, they think  
14 they did everything right and --

15 MR. DUBOW: Definitely.

16 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: -- then you get a  
17 sheriff sale notice, you know.

18 MR. DUBOW: Right. I completely  
19 understand the frustration.

20 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay. I guess  
21 last question on that. Is it fair to say  
22 there's progress being made? I mean, is it  
23 getting better?

24 MR. DUBOW: I think so.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.

2 MR. DUBOW: What you're saying, from the  
3 complaints you're getting, clearly not  
4 enough. So, it's something we clearly have  
5 to keep working on.

6 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay. If you can  
7 keep us informed in some way about what that  
8 progress is.

9 MR. DUBOW: Yes. Will do.

10 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: We appreciate it.  
11 Okay. Thank you very much.

12 Thank you, Mr. President.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
14 Councilman.

15 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Reynolds  
16 Brown.

17 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Thank you.  
18 Good morning Administration.

19 MR. DUBOW: Good morning.

20 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: The follow  
21 up the Council President's question  
22 regarding enforcement. The budget materials  
23 stipulate that 1.8 million will be -- a  
24 request of the amount of increased  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 1.8 million to capture or to staff up staff  
2 for enforcement. How many staff does that  
3 buy?

4 MR. DUBOW: Sorry. I think they are  
5 going over answers to last question. Let me  
6 get their attention.

7 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay. So  
8 while we wait for staff to capture that  
9 answer, follow this scenario.

10 And it's much aligned with what  
11 President Clarke asked. So, corner shop --

12 MR. DUBOW: Councilwoman, should I ask  
13 the Revenue people to come up? Is this  
14 going to be a question for them?

15 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Of course.

16 (Witnesses approach Table.)

17 MR. DUBOW: They're up.

18 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: So if we  
19 have a 55 percent reduction in the  
20 consumption of sugary beverages, how much  
21 will sales tax revenue be reduced for the  
22 City?

23 MR. DUBOW: So, we looked at that. I  
24 mean, we think that other taxes will be  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 affected that could be kind of at the high  
2 end. I think it could be up to a couple  
3 million.

4 MS. WAXMAN: 3.8.

5 MR. DUBOW: Could be up to 3.8. I mean,  
6 we don't think it will be that full of a  
7 fall off in sales tax if people move to  
8 other products that might be taxable.

9 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay. Now  
10 I need you to talk into that mic.

11 MR. DUBOW: Sorry. So if all of that  
12 fall off and consumption went away from --  
13 went to other things that weren't taxable,  
14 the peak would be 3.8 million. We don't  
15 think it would be that much, but that's the  
16 largest amount of exposure.

17 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: And you  
18 don't think it would be that much because?

19 MR. DUBOW: People might move to other  
20 products that may be taxable.

21 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay. All  
22 right. And the record should reflect that a  
23 number of questions were raised in the  
24 individual briefings with staff about how we  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 really cannot compare Philadelphia to  
2 Berkeley for all the reasons that President  
3 Clarke shared with us in his opening  
4 question. It's just two different worlds.

5 Provide examples of where you are  
6 currently looking for efficiencies in the  
7 departments that you oversee.

8 MR. DUBOW: So, one example would be  
9 over in Pensions where we are looking at all  
10 of our investment managers to look at their  
11 returns and to look at their costs. And  
12 we've actually just eliminated some managers  
13 who we thought -- you know, where we thought  
14 that that tradeoff didn't work.

15 I mean, another example in Revenue --  
16 and Commissioner Breslin can talk about this  
17 more -- is what he's doing in the mailroom  
18 to make sure that that runs more  
19 efficiently.

20 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: How well  
21 are you doing --

22 MR. DUBOW: Those particular examples.  
23 What?

24 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: How well  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 are we doing with regards to making sure  
2 that those who are doing with the Pension's  
3 Office are -- how well are we doing with  
4 regards to MBE/WBES doing business with the  
5 Pension's Office?

6 MR. DUBOW: When the Pension Board comes  
7 in, they will give you those numbers. I  
8 think we are actually doing really well  
9 there. Those numbers, I think, are in and  
10 around the 20 percent range and have gone  
11 up. We focus on that. Actually, every  
12 month in the packet the board gets, there is  
13 report on the level of participation both  
14 kind of by M/W/DBE and by -- in Philadelphia  
15 and out. And we track that and talk about  
16 it in our, if not in the board meeting, the  
17 prep meeting. So, it's a big focus on  
18 Pensions.

19 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: And I ask  
20 that question simply to put it on the  
21 record. There was a briefing in President  
22 Clarke's office where that was covered.

23 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

24 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: And that's  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 one department that is doing exceptionally  
2 well. And when departments do well and show  
3 that they get it, that needs to be  
4 acknowledged on the public record.

5 MR. DUBOW: Thank you.

6 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: I don't  
7 remember, however, of that group how many  
8 are Philadelphians.

9 MR. DUBOW: The Philadelphia number -- I  
10 didn't -- I don't have that report with me,  
11 but we track that, too. So, we can get that  
12 to you or -- or Mr. Bielli -- can tell your  
13 during their hearing.

14 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay.

15 MR. DUBOW: But we have that reported  
16 separately.

17 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: So, yes.  
18 Please have them -- have them be prepared to  
19 share that with us during the -- during  
20 their specific hearing.

21 MR. DUBOW: Will do.

22 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: I think  
23 that might be it. I just want to be sure.  
24 That's it.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Thank you, Mr. President.

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
3 Councilwoman.

4 Chair recognizes Councilman Henon.

5 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,  
6 Mr. President. Going to start off with the  
7 same as the Council President has on the  
8 sugary beverage questions and kind of get  
9 them out of the way.

10 Just to -- well, let me start off by  
11 saying, what is the benefit of this tax,  
12 this tax being levied on the distributors?

13 MR. DUBOW: Give me in terms of --

14 COUNCILMAN HENON: Distributor levels as  
15 opposed to, you know, at the retailer at  
16 point of sale.

17 MR. DUBOW: One of the big advantages --  
18 and the Revenue folks can talk to this  
19 more -- it's much easier to administrate  
20 when it's done at the distributor level. I  
21 will turn that over to you guys if you want  
22 to add any detail to that.

23 MR. BRESLIN: Yeah. I think that is one  
24 of the big benefits. That it is much easier  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 to administrate.

2 COUNCILMAN HENON: Bring the mic in  
3 front.

4 MR. BRESLIN: You have a smaller  
5 population of, you know, taxable entities.  
6 So, it's easier to keep that in kind of a  
7 focus of compliance.

8 COUNCILMAN HENON: How many distributors  
9 are in the City?

10 MS. WAXMAN: Currently, there are 31  
11 business income and receipts taxpayers that  
12 are classified as either soft drink  
13 manufacturers or flavor and concentrate  
14 manufacturers. And of those -- I will have  
15 to get the exact split. But I believe only  
16 about a third of those are located in the  
17 City. Two thirds are outside the City.

18 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. And --

19 MS. WAXMAN: We can get back to you with  
20 the exact numbers.

21 COUNCILMAN HENON: Given that there's a  
22 major concern that -- how the tax is going  
23 to -- what kind of impact it's going to have  
24 on low income and poor individuals, how does  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 this proposal still maintain customer  
2 choice?

3 MR. DUBOW: Customer choice?

4 COUNCILMAN HENON: Customer choice.

5 MR. DUBOW: So I mean, I think customers  
6 can go to the store, look at whatever  
7 happens with the price of these drinks and  
8 decide whether they want to buy other drinks  
9 instead. So, I think, you know choice is  
10 still definitely there.

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: Can you -- can you  
12 talk about a little more on what you know  
13 about the local beverage distribution and --  
14 and how this is going to potentially impact  
15 the truck drivers and the products that they  
16 deliver?

17 MR. DUBOW: So, our understanding is  
18 that they deliver a range of products.

19 So for example, they may deliver bottled  
20 water or they may deliver diet soda. So to  
21 the extent that there's a shift from sugar  
22 sweetened beverages to other beverages, they  
23 will still have things to be --

24 COUNCILMAN HENON: So what other  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 products -- what other products are  
2 beverages that are not included in the  
3 sweetened sugar?

4 MR. DUBOW: So water, diet soda,  
5 naturally sweetened fruit juices without  
6 sugar added. If you have --

7 MS. WAXMAN: All dairy based.

8 MR. DUBOW: Dairy-based products or  
9 anything with milk in it is not taxed the  
10 way the legislation is written.

11 COUNCILMAN HENON: So, they are still  
12 going to be delivering?

13 MR. DUBOW: They are still many  
14 beverages.

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: Operations are not  
16 going to cease to the City of Philadelphia?

17 MR. DUBOW: We don't believe so, right.

18 COUNCILMAN HENON: Not going to be  
19 severed or cut off?

20 There are some concerns that the -- this  
21 tax targets one industry. Has the  
22 Administration considered any other possible  
23 impacts on the beverage industry?

24 And as it's written, will it withstand a  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 potential legal challenge.

2 MR. DUBOW: We believe it will withstand  
3 a legal challenge. The Law Department has  
4 assured us that they think it will survive a  
5 challenge?

6 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Why?

7 COUNCILMAN HENON: And the Mayor has  
8 said several times that the beverage  
9 industry is diversifying. How does that  
10 impact Philadelphia given the possible tax?

11 MR. DUBOW: So our understanding is that  
12 the industry has -- you know, because there  
13 was already a decline occurring in the  
14 consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages  
15 moved to other products which then goes back  
16 to your choice question, that there are  
17 other options for things to drink other than  
18 sugar-sweetened beverages.

19 COUNCILMAN HENON: And how does the  
20 Administration foresee what the landscape  
21 will be or what it looks like for  
22 distributors and the smaller neighborhood  
23 businesses three years from now if this tax  
24 goes into effect?

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 I mean, how do you foresee that  
2 especially when it comes to diversification  
3 of their products?

4 MR. DUBOW: So, we think --

5 COUNCILMAN HENON: I guess that would be  
6 more on your projections?

7 MR. DUBOW: Right. So, our projections  
8 are that there would be 55 percent reduction  
9 in consumption of sugar-sweetened beverages.  
10 We do think that some of that will result in  
11 people moving over to other beverages.

12 COUNCILMAN HENON: The Council  
13 President -- and I will end with the sugar.

14 The Council President is making some  
15 very good points when regards to the  
16 sugar -- sugary beverage retailers and the  
17 audits and auditors: How would you manage  
18 it? How would you enforce it?

19 Is that -- so generally, with retailers  
20 you have -- you have auditors as it is; is  
21 that correct? And would it be similar to  
22 the liquor by the drink, or how does it  
23 differ?

24 MR. BRESLIN: There is probably some  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 similarities with liquor by the drink in  
2 that with liquor by the drink --

3 COUNCILMAN HENON: I am sorry. You are  
4 going to have to move the microphone.

5 MR. BRESLIN: Sorry.

6 COUNCILMAN HENON: I've know it's  
7 uncomfortable, but I've been told that the  
8 Philadelphian citizens that actually watch  
9 this channel cannot hear us. So if I can't  
10 hear --

11 MR. BRESLIN: Okay.

12 COUNCILMAN HENON: -- I think it will be  
13 difficult.

14 MR. BRESLIN: It would be similar to  
15 liquor by the drink in the -- to the extent  
16 that it's a -- essentially a small  
17 population of taxable entities, so that  
18 makes Administration a little bit easier. I  
19 mean, we know -- the Department of Revenue  
20 knows from information we have of every  
21 licensed -- everyone who is licensed to sell  
22 alcoholic beverages, so that's a kind of a  
23 finite number.

24 We know every business in the City of  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Philadelphia that has a license to serve  
2 that. So we know that they should be filing  
3 the tax, so that's the first step. We can  
4 see that every licensed business is filing  
5 the tax. And then also, since we also know  
6 how much is being purchased, we can also do  
7 an analysis to see if the amount of tax  
8 being remitted is appropriate for the amount  
9 of purchases.

10 And so, there would be some similarity  
11 here in that we know who the wholesalers and  
12 distributors are. So, we know who is  
13 subject to the tax. We know who they are  
14 selling to. So, that makes tax  
15 administration, tax compliance much easier  
16 than something that's much broader.

17 COUNCILMAN HENON: Council President,  
18 with your permission, I just have one last  
19 question. It will be quick.

20 You know, reading in the paper,  
21 obviously, you know, this has been a very,  
22 you know, public, you know, opinionated  
23 conversation. The -- passing the burden on  
24 whether the distributors eat the cost or  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1    whatever that is, if there is indeed a cost  
2    at the end of the day because this is a  
3    process that we endure every year for a  
4    balanced budget and for some good programs.

5           The distributors, you know, eating the  
6    cost or a split from distributors to  
7    retailer to consumer, how would that work  
8    out in that -- with that scenario? How  
9    would -- would -- so could -- would there a  
10   memorandum of understanding? Or would there  
11   be -- I mean, is it just like U&O where it  
12   gets, you know, pushed onto the tenant?

13           How does that --

14           MR. DUBOW: Yeah. It would be like  
15   other taxes where decisions made probably at  
16   each level of distribution chain, how much  
17   are they going to pass on to the next level.

18           COUNCILMAN HENON: Somebody can say that  
19   we're not going to pass it on and then pass  
20   it on?

21           MR. DUBOW: There is no --

22           COUNCILMAN HENON: Or it's just nobody  
23   there -- it's too large of a scale, I would  
24   imagine, for that to actually happen. But  
          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 I'm just trying to --

2 MR. DUBOW: They're all making that  
3 decision. We're not -- we're not saying to  
4 them you have to eat it all or you have to  
5 pass it all on. That's -- that's their  
6 decision how they decide.

7 COUNCILMAN HENON: Of course, it's their  
8 decision, but it's our decision here to talk  
9 about options and talk about the consumer  
10 whether it's at the point of sale. I mean,  
11 it won't be at the point of sale. But it  
12 will be whether the additional costs for --

13 MR. DUBOW: Right. I guess I'm talking  
14 about --

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: -- consumers.

16 MR. DUBOW: -- how the legislation is  
17 drafted. Yeah. So it's not -- it's a  
18 choice -- it's their choice at each level.

19 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay.

20 Thank you, Council President.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
22 Councilman.

23 Chair recognizes Councilman Green.

24 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you, Council  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 President. Just having initial questions.

2 Commending Administration in reference  
3 to its work in trying to identify funding  
4 for preK in the way of putting our youngest  
5 citizens and future citizens and voters on  
6 the right path to educational attainment.  
7 However, as a City, we lag behind a number  
8 of other cities like DC and Chicago and New  
9 York and also even smaller cities like  
10 Hartford and Baltimore and Atlanta and  
11 Denver and Minneapolis in reference to  
12 educational attainment.

13 Looking at your budget testimony and  
14 also page 57 of the budget detail, you  
15 reduced by about 1.4 million the amount of  
16 dollars going to Community College of  
17 Philadelphia.

18 Can you give some perspective on that  
19 decision?

20 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. So last year made a  
21 one-time increase to their budget. And  
22 because it was a one-time increase, we took  
23 it out this year.

24 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Well, I know they  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 have had level funding for a number of  
2 years. I know one of the goals of the  
3 previous Administration, and I would also  
4 assume with this Administration, is to  
5 increase educational attainment. And one of  
6 the institutions that does a great job in  
7 doing that is Community College of  
8 Philadelphia. And by reducing those funds,  
9 that has the impact of increasing tuition  
10 costs for students who are often working and  
11 trying to find a way to either continue a  
12 degree or start on a path toward a degree.

13 So considering that we are looking at  
14 bond funding for some of the initiatives  
15 like community schools and preK, is that  
16 something that the Administration would  
17 consider?

18 MR. DUBOW: You know, I think kind of  
19 anything in the budget we are willing to  
20 talk about. So, I mean, just like any other  
21 topic, yes, we are willing to talk about  
22 that.

23 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. On page 15 of  
24 the budget detail in the Class 200, you have  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 a "to be announced" legislative initiative  
2 financial analysis.

3 Can you give some perspective on that?

4 MR. DUBOW: Right. So that is -- things  
5 come up every year where we need to do  
6 analysis. And that's money to make sure  
7 that we have funding if something comes up.

8 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Are there any  
9 specific initiatives that you anticipate  
10 that funding being used for?

11 MR. DUBOW: So, it's one of those things  
12 we don't know specifically it's going to  
13 come up.

14 When two years ago, for example, when  
15 there was a legislation about the impact of  
16 abatements and we were asked to do an  
17 analysis of that, if we don't have a line  
18 like this in our budget, we don't have the  
19 ability to fund it.

20 COUNCILMAN GREEN: I understand.

21 Page 16 of the budget detail in the  
22 Class 500, I see a number of allocations for  
23 various culture institutions around the City  
24 like the Mann Music Center. But then I  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 notice that for the African-American Museum  
2 in FY15, there was \$60,000 allocated but no  
3 dollars in FY16 or FY17.

4 Can you give some perspective on that?

5 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. I think that was a  
6 specific request from the Museum that year.  
7 And I think, if I remember correctly, they  
8 were having some particular financial  
9 difficulties that year. They asked for  
10 one-time help that we gave them.

11 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. But you have  
12 not received any specific requests from them  
13 recently?

14 MR. DUBOW: I don't believe so. I don't  
15 remember seeing any requests for them for  
16 '17.

17 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay.

18 Page 56 of the budget detail, you -- I  
19 believe that's for the Office of Property  
20 Assessment.

21 MR. DUBOW: And they are here later  
22 today.

23 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Right. I understand  
24 that. But there is something in reference  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 to street addressing analysis?

2 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

3 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And that's -- can you  
4 give me a little perspective on that?

5 MR. DUBOW: I'm actually going to ask  
6 Saskia Thompson from the Office of Property  
7 Data who manages that project, to come up  
8 and talk about that.

9 MS. THOMPSON: I'm sorry. What was the  
10 question?

11 COUNCILMAN GREEN: On page 56 of the  
12 budget detail for Finance, there a "to be  
13 announced" allotment of funds for street  
14 addressing analysis.

15 MS. THOMPSON: Excuse me. Saskia  
16 Thompson from the Finance Department.

17 So, last fall we completed the planning  
18 phase of what we're calling the Addressing  
19 Project. Essentially, it's a  
20 cross-departmental function. If you think  
21 about what the City does, most of what we do  
22 has some sort of locational component. And  
23 the address is how we identify that. But  
24 individual departments may categorize that  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 differently. So, we are trying to come up  
2 with a way to standardize that which would  
3 allow all of our back-end systems to talk to  
4 each other better.

5 We completed the planning last full.  
6 And we are going through an implementation  
7 plan and schedule now. So, there is no  
8 direct money attached to it until we have  
9 completed the budgeting process.

10 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay.

11 One other follow-up question, Mr. Dubow.  
12 You had said in reference to the possibility  
13 of a legal challenge which we have heard  
14 about in the past when Mayor Nutter had  
15 looked at the concept of a sugar, sweet and  
16 beverage tax. And you said you've been in  
17 conversations with City Solicitor Tulante  
18 regarding the possible outcome of that type  
19 of litigation. And you said you feel  
20 assured from the City Solicitor that we will  
21 be okay.

22 Has that been put forth in some type of  
23 opinion from Solicitor's Office to the  
24 Administration? And what's the background  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 of that assurance.

2 MR. DUBOW: Hold on one second.

3 Yes. The Solicitor has produced an  
4 opinion on that.

5 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Has issued an opinion  
6 to the Administration?

7 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

8 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. Is that  
9 something that can be provided to Council?

10 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

11 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. Thank you.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: You are  
13 waiving your rights of confidentiality is  
14 what you're saying here today?

15 MR. DUBOW: Well, it was -- it was  
16 provided to the Mayor's Office. I'm sure  
17 that they will okay releasing it and they'll  
18 waive their --

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: No. I just  
20 needed to know because --

21 MR. DUBOW: Yes. That's what that --

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Because if  
23 not, we will ask for an opinion. We had --  
24 it will be helpful.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. DUBOW: Okay.

2 MR. TULANTE: The back and forth -- Sozi  
3 Tulante, City Solicitor.

4 The back and forth I had with the  
5 Finance Director was simply advising him  
6 that if asked that question, I can't  
7 respond. But he, at the Administration,  
8 they have the -- it's their confidentiality  
9 waive. He should be aware if he answers  
10 that, he can waive it. And he has assured  
11 me that he's comfortable doing that. We are  
12 prepared to give that to Council.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: That's the  
14 way it's supposed to work. I like that.  
15 Just testing you. Thank you.

16 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Parker.

17 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,  
18 Mr. President.

19 And good morning --

20 MR. DUBOW: Good morning.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: -- to each of you.

22 One, I just want to reinforce  
23 Councilwoman Blondell's kudos on the record  
24 regarding the issue of diversity and  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 inclusion, particularly as it relates to  
2 asset managers. I will talk about that more  
3 when the board comes before us. But just  
4 wanted to say it to you on the record.

5 MR. DUBOW: Thank you.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: And when they come  
7 before us, we will ask very specific  
8 questions about the number of managers and  
9 so forth.

10 But I wanted to start with a question  
11 regarding the fund balance, and that is that  
12 the GFOA recommends that government  
13 maintains a fund balance that is equal to  
14 about two months of spending or 17 percent  
15 of its overall spending. And so for us, we  
16 know that would be about 699 million. And  
17 you mentioned in your testimony some of the  
18 challenges regarding our fund balance.

19 Well, actually in the overall Five Year  
20 Strategic Plan, we'll be at 42 million for  
21 FY17 and then down to 38 million in FY18.  
22 And obviously, in a Five Year Plan we talk  
23 about some of the reasons why.

24 But we see a spike back in '21. Tell us  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1    what the -- what the overall plan is there.  
2    What's the Administration's plan to sure up  
3    the general fund balance? And you know, the  
4    stresses and the strange, you don't have to  
5    go over. We are very clear about where the  
6    increase in our obligations are.

7           Just what's the overall plan?

8           MR. DUBOW: To start with, we completely  
9    agree with you that our fund balances are  
10   too low, and that provides substantial risk.  
11   And that it's something that needs to be  
12   built up over time. And it does, as you  
13   say, get up to 127 million by the end of the  
14   plan. Still much lower than it needs to be.

15          And really, I mean, the way to build it  
16   up over time is by constraining  
17   expenditures. Because revenues are not  
18   going to go really quickly over -- over  
19   time, particularly with kind of the mixed  
20   results from the economy that we've been  
21   seeing even in an expansion that's been  
22   relatively long. So, it's not likely that  
23   there will be a bigger pick up in the  
24   economy. So, it really is about

          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1     constraining expenditures.

2             So if you look at kind of what happens  
3     in expenditures in the out years of the  
4     plan, you'll see very little growth other  
5     than places like pensions. And so, that's  
6     kind of how it builds up over time. But  
7     then that requires making painful choices.

8             COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I started with  
9     that question with specific regards to the  
10    next one. And it's regarding the  
11    establishment of the Rainy Day Fund.

12            MR. DUBOW: Yes.

13            COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Right. So, we  
14    wanted to find out whether or not we are --  
15    when do we anticipate -- I mean, will we  
16    have to wait until '21, right, to be able to  
17    contribute anything to the Rainy Day Fund or  
18    when do we think we'll begin?

19            MR. DUBOW: Yeah. It would be great to  
20    be able to contribute before that because  
21    building a fund balance is a goal that I  
22    know we all share. Looking at how the  
23    numbers play out, we don't think we would  
24    get there before '21. You know, if somehow

              Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

              (215) 504-4622

1 the economy picked up, maybe we could get  
2 there. But I don't think we get there.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: But as of now, you  
4 see us potentially starting to contribute in  
5 '21?

6 MR. DUBOW: Twenty-one we are a little  
7 bit below the 3 percent threshold. I think  
8 that's about 2.7 percent. So, I mean,  
9 there's a chance that year. But, you know,  
10 we don't actually project that we'll get  
11 there. But if things got a little better,  
12 we'd at least get there in '21.

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay. And so, the  
14 next question -- and I'm not sure if you're  
15 aware of this. I was just informed this  
16 morning that apparently this past Friday a  
17 new federal rule can make it more expensive  
18 for governments to issue debt in the midst  
19 of a financial crisis. And in essence, it  
20 would make the selling of government bonds  
21 extremely difficult, you know, when we have  
22 the next credit crisis. And so, what it  
23 does is the rule limits the kinds of  
24 municipal bonds that would qualify in a  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 bank's portfolio as being highly liquid  
2 assets.

3 And so with that being said, I was  
4 wondering if we as a city -- now again, it  
5 just took place Friday. We would not sort  
6 of have a strategy in place right now. And  
7 although we are not in the midst of an  
8 economic crisis right now, none of us have  
9 the ball to be able to see in the future.  
10 But if after we reviewed this ruling we find  
11 out that it hampers or increases the cost  
12 of us to issue debt, we should work in a  
13 coordinated effort in our advocacy to lobby  
14 the Feds to adjust the ruling.

15 Now apparently, there have been some  
16 ongoing advocacy in '15, but the proposed  
17 ruling was sort of stalled. And Friday it  
18 was -- it was just issued. So, I would be  
19 interested in hearing your thoughts or if  
20 you were aware of the ruling at all.

21 MR. DUBOW: I've asked the City  
22 Treasurer to come up and discuss that issue.

23 MS. JOHNSON: Rasheia Johnson, City  
24 Treasurer. And you're right, it was just  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 passed on the House on Friday. The Senate  
2 is still out, so we need to -- we are  
3 waiting to see what the Senate comes back  
4 with and whether they will counter that bill  
5 with something similar to what the Fed has,  
6 which has a little bit more protection for  
7 municipalities. But we are monitoring it  
8 closely to see what the outcome is so we can  
9 protect the City moving forward with regards  
10 to bonds.

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: We are going to do  
12 our best to try to put together a resolution  
13 here in Council to sort of raise the red  
14 flag to note that this could potentially  
15 have a negative impact on -- on the City in  
16 the future. And that we should really sort  
17 of pull together from an intergovernmental  
18 perspective to make any adjustments  
19 possible, so we will be in contact with your  
20 office to work together to try to do that.

21 MS. JOHNSON: Okay.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,  
23 Mr. President.

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Councilwoman.

2 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Gym.

3 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Good morning.

4 MR. DUBOW: Good morning.

5 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: So, I wanted to go  
6 back a little bit to some of the questions  
7 we had had before about how the  
8 Administration projects school expenses in  
9 light of their Five Year Plan. And I know  
10 we've -- you've mentioned that the School  
11 District may see its fund balance continue  
12 and doesn't anticipate problems until FY19.  
13 But I think when you look at the district's  
14 own Five Year Plan and you look at that  
15 shifting of revenue and expenses  
16 particularly around charter schools, what we  
17 are seeing is that any additional revenue  
18 coming in over the next five years will be  
19 almost wholly offset by the expansion of the  
20 charter sector.

21 And one of the things that I think is  
22 commendable on the part of the  
23 Administration is that they have been  
24 articulate in stating that they want to see  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 investments in district-managed public  
2 schools, as well. There is an effort to  
3 build community schools. There's an effort  
4 to restore, make some level of restoration  
5 back to the district sector.

6 And I guess my question is, is that if  
7 the Dis -- if the City looks at the  
8 district's expense on the aggregate but not  
9 looks at them in terms of how district  
10 schools can actually see an investment over  
11 time, we may in fact be losing an  
12 opportunity. Already we are seeing some  
13 consequences happen, whether that's from the  
14 fact that we are going to see, you know, the  
15 district has announced the planned closure  
16 of three district public schools every  
17 single year. And you know, we are trying to  
18 understand that.

19 So, can you talk a little bit about  
20 whether the Administration actually expects  
21 to see any investment in district schools  
22 based on, you know, what the numbers are  
23 showing for the aggregate?

24 MR. DUBOW: Right. As I said last time,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 I think what we want to look at is what  
2 happens to the state, what happens over the  
3 next year or two while the district does  
4 have, you know, positive fund balances.  
5 And, you know, based on that, determine what  
6 we might do in the future.

7 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I guess I'm trying to  
8 be more specific about saying whether or not  
9 the district has a positive fund balance,  
10 there's not any indication that expenses are  
11 going -- you know, that charter school  
12 expense are arising. District investments  
13 is either flat or isn't seen as significant  
14 improvement.

15 MR. DUBOW: I mean, again, we would want  
16 to see what happens with the state before  
17 deciding what we do.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: So in that case,  
19 would -- would the Administration weigh in  
20 on certain policy decisions at the local and  
21 state level that would have significant  
22 fiscal impact on the School District?

23 So for example, like the achievement  
24 School District that's being proposed by the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 state level, what kind of financial impact  
2 that would have.

3 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. I think through our  
4 representation on the SRC and through our  
5 discussions with the District, we do weigh  
6 in on those things and discussions with  
7 legislators and with the Administration in  
8 Harrisburg.

9 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And do you discuss  
10 them publicly or issue a statement about it?

11 MR. DUBOW: I don't know that we have  
12 yet. That doesn't mean we wouldn't going  
13 forward.

14 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Is that something  
15 that we can talk about?

16 MR. DUBOW: Yes. Yes.

17 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Okay. My other  
18 question is around risk management. And I  
19 had some questions about whether they handle  
20 matters related to lawsuits that are  
21 judgments and settlements as they relate to  
22 claims on police abuse.

23 MR. DUBOW: I don't think they do -- no,  
24 they don't.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Do you know which  
2 department would handle?

3 MR. DUBOW: I think that's Law.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: That's just solely  
5 through legal?

6 MR. DUBOW: I think so. When Law  
7 Department comes -- we don't do that in  
8 Finance. I think it's just Law.

9 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And do you take a  
10 look at past claims or projections about  
11 future liability to measure end measures  
12 that might be taken to reduce exposure and  
13 financial impact on the City as a result of  
14 such claims?

15 MR. DUBOW: Yes. I mean, there are --  
16 yes. There are discussions about that all  
17 the time.

18 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And what kind of  
19 information related to that is made publicly  
20 available?

21 MR. DUBOW: I'd have to get back to you  
22 on that.

23 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And -- and do you  
24 have that -- like is -- can we also talk  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 about how often that becomes publicly  
2 available?

3 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. Yes. Yes.

4 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you. My last  
5 question is on how the Office on Budget and  
6 Program Evaluation might be able to work  
7 with the Office of Immigrant Affairs in  
8 order to assess how the language access  
9 mandate is being implemented compliance  
10 around it, what kind of budget line items  
11 maybe looked at with departments to --

12 MR. DUBOW: They can definitely talk to  
13 them.

14 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I'm sorry?

15 MR. DUBOW: Yes. If your question is  
16 can they talk to them, yes. That is --

17 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: No. I wanted to have  
18 an explanation of how the Office of Budget  
19 and Program Evaluation is currently working  
20 with OIA.

21 MR. DUBOW: Okay.

22 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: On some kind of a  
23 language access financial impact analysis  
24 for departments.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 MS. ADAMS: Hi. I'm Anna Adams, the  
2 Budget Director. So, we haven't  
3 specifically done any analysis of that, but  
4 we can. We can talk to MOIMA and ask them  
5 about -- we can kind of happily do that. We  
6 will work with them and do some analysis.

7 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I mean, some  
8 departments have been really spectacular in  
9 terms of their bilingual staffing positions  
10 and other types of thing. I'm not clear --  
11 you know, it's my understanding that each  
12 department contracts individually with like  
13 LanguageLine; is that right?

14 MS. ADAMS: I think they coordinate  
15 through MOIMA. Whatever they need. Some  
16 departments have the ability to do  
17 translation work themselves, and some  
18 departments need more help. And so, I think  
19 it varies dramatically by department.

20 I know that sometimes people need  
21 translation services for individuals that  
22 they serve on a day-to-day basis, whereas  
23 some just need more translation of  
24 materials. And it varies pretty widely

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 depending on the services that we offer as a  
2 City.

3 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: And is the Office of  
4 Program -- of Budget and Program Evaluation,  
5 like, is this solely in OIA's camp or  
6 MOIMA's camp? Or is this partly in  
7 conjunction with your department, like, in  
8 terms of the program evaluation and  
9 assessing about --

10 MS. ADAMS: So we will -- we work with  
11 all of the departments across the City. So  
12 in terms of kind of analyzing their needs  
13 from an expenditure, we can -- we work with  
14 them. And if departments request more  
15 funding for specific needs, we analyze that  
16 during the budget process based on what  
17 limited funds we have. And then analyze  
18 that as part of every other request that  
19 comes in.

20 When we get to -- as we do more and more  
21 analysis and we work with departments on  
22 sort of various degrees depending on their  
23 needs, we can -- we may find ways of  
24 reallocating existing resources to allow  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1    them to do that. But departments often do  
2    that on their own if they feel they have a  
3    need within a specific class. They have  
4    some flexibility to do that if they think  
5    that that's what their services need. It's  
6    often on the department head to make those  
7    decisions. We can work with them if there  
8    is an issue related to funding. But often,  
9    the analysis is done by the departments  
10   themselves.

11       COUNCILWOMAN GYM: I make circle back on  
12   this second round. But I just wanted to  
13   clarify that sometimes when there is a new  
14   compliance mandate in, and language access  
15   is a new compliance mandate, that most  
16   department heads and some department heads  
17   may not actually know what they need in  
18   order to be compliant with that. And I  
19   guess part of the question, and maybe we can  
20   figure that out later, is to clarify whether  
21   which departments are actually working with  
22   them to cost -- not only help them figure it  
23   out, but actually understand what the costs  
24   might be to the City in order to fully

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 comply with the language access mandate.

2 MS. ADAMS: And we in the Budget Office  
3 would help with any department that needs  
4 that analysis. That's absolutely something  
5 that we can do.

6 COUNCILWOMAN GYM: Thank you.

7 (Councilman Henon sitting in as Chair.)

8 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you,  
9 Councilwoman.

10 Chair recognizes Councilman Jones.

11 COUNCILMAN JONES: Thank you,  
12 Mr. Chairman. Still morning. Good morning.

13 MR. DUBOW: Morning.

14 COUNCILMAN JONES: You've been through a  
15 lot of transitions in our --

16 MR. DUBOW: I thought you were going to  
17 stop at "you've been through a lot."

18 (Laughter)

19 COUNCILMAN JONES: You've been through a  
20 lot. But also in the realm of our financial  
21 condition as a City, I remember the darker  
22 days of making tough decisions about whether  
23 or not we would layoff personnel. Whether  
24 or not we could meet our receivable  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 payments. Whether or not our bond rating  
2 was being impacted negatively.

3 So I guess what I want to start out with  
4 is, how are we doing by way of our credit  
5 rating? And juxtapose that with how we  
6 would be with our general obligation  
7 borrowing and how that might -- is it that  
8 inelastic? Elastic? What will happen?  
9 What are your predictors?

10 MR. DUBOW: So right now we are in the A  
11 category with all three rating agencies,  
12 which we've never been before, so that's  
13 really good. That's progress. We are,  
14 however, lower than one of the other top ten  
15 cities. Chicago is lower than we are. And  
16 that's because of some of the things that  
17 Councilwoman Parker was talking about  
18 before, our relatively low fund balances,  
19 our high fixed costs.

20 So, I think we're at a place where our  
21 ratings are high which helps with our  
22 borrowing costs. It lowers them. But there  
23 is risks going forward if we don't build up  
24 fund balances, that we could see that go

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 down.

2 COUNCILMAN JONES: So when we were  
3 considering the dreaded cigarette tax, how  
4 did that, in retrospect, impact our bottom  
5 line? And was the demand for cigarettes  
6 reduced or increase or stay stable?

7 MR. DUBOW: So, the cigarette tax  
8 definitely helped the School District's  
9 bottom line. Helped them kind of get to the  
10 place where they are now having positive  
11 fund balances. And it did have an impact on  
12 their -- on the level of consumption. There  
13 was discussion at the state about adding on.  
14 In their analysis, that adding onto the  
15 statewide tax would have had an impact on  
16 our local consumption.

17 COUNCILMAN JONES: So, the demand stayed  
18 relatively neutral.

19 MR. DUBOW: It went down a little, but  
20 the revenue was --

21 COUNCILMAN JONES: Okay.

22 MR. DUBOW: Revenue helped the district.

23 COUNCILMAN JONES: So with AVI and the  
24 new assessments, are we still revenue  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 neutral? Are we receiving extra money? How  
2 has that shook out thus far?

3 MR. DUBOW: So, we did a property tax  
4 increase last year for the district, so  
5 there is more revenue because of that. I  
6 think if there had been no change in the  
7 rate, we'd probably be at maybe slightly  
8 down from where we were before AVI was  
9 implemented because of appeal losses.

10 COUNCILMAN JONES: So, the appeals  
11 impacted some of that?

12 MR. DUBOW: Yes. Reduced the assessed  
13 values.

14 COUNCILMAN JONES: I think we set aside  
15 30 million, was it, for appeals? Did we --  
16 did we ever --

17 MR. DUBOW: I think we -- I think it  
18 was -- it got around that level.

19 COUNCILMAN JONES: So we did --

20 MR. DUBOW: We did lose a lot in  
21 appeals, yes.

22 COUNCILMAN JONES: Okay. And by way of  
23 our outstanding receivables as a  
24 municipality, particularly outside owners of  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 properties in Philadelphia that are tax  
2 delinquent. There was a sizable receivable,  
3 and the amount escapes me. But it was close  
4 to 300 million I think.

5 MR. DUBOW: For outside owners? I don't  
6 remember.

7 COUNCILMAN JONES: Someone who lives in  
8 another county that owns real estate in  
9 Philadelphia but doesn't pay their real  
10 estate taxes here, and we were going  
11 specifically after that receivable, what  
12 is -- how have we done going after that?

13 MR. DUBOW: Let me ask Revenue to come  
14 up.

15 COUNCILMAN JONES: And while they are  
16 coming up -- yeah. Go ahead. And we were  
17 modernizing the collection process. We  
18 invested about a million dollars in  
19 predictive dollars and good stuff like that.

20 MR. BRESLIN: So with the --

21 COUNCILMAN JONES: State your name for  
22 the record.

23 MR. BRESLIN: Frank Breslin, Revenue  
24 Commissioner. For the -- out of  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 Philadelphia property owners, there was --  
2 we received legal -- the legal authority to  
3 be able to transfer our liens in the form of  
4 judgments to those properties that they  
5 owned outside of Philadelphia. And that --  
6 the legal process to get that all  
7 straightened out took some time. And just  
8 recently, we were over those hurdles and we  
9 actually started the process.

10 And so, we are starting in each county  
11 to kind of learn the process within each  
12 county and start placing those judgments.  
13 And we just started with judgments within  
14 the last couple of months. We just started  
15 placing those judgments in Montgomery  
16 County. And we've placed low volume there  
17 just to learn the process and see, you know,  
18 what it yields.

19 And now we've moved to Delaware County.  
20 And we're in the process of placing  
21 judgments in Delaware County. They should  
22 be -- that process should be finalized this  
23 month. And that is kind of the process.

24 And then once we have learned the process  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 for placing these judgments, then we are  
2 going to go to larger volumes in all of the  
3 counties.

4 COUNCILMAN JONES: So, you are beta  
5 testing now to see how the process works?  
6 And when will you full throttle to go after  
7 this money? And was it \$300 million that we  
8 were --

9 MR. BRESLIN: I don't recall. It sounds  
10 about right. But I don't recall the exact  
11 number.

12 COUNCILMAN JONES: Can you provide to  
13 the President's Office what that figure is?

14 MR. BRESLIN: Absolutely.

15 COUNCILMAN JONES: And then when do you  
16 think we will be full fledged going after  
17 folk who own property in Philly, pay their  
18 taxes in Montgomery County and Delaware  
19 County, yet refuse to pay taxes here? When  
20 will we be full throttle with judgments and  
21 liens?

22 MR. BRESLIN: I think in the first half  
23 of Fiscal 17, there is money put into the  
24 budget that we need in order to be able to  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 place the liens and the cost of those  
2 judgments. So, I think that's -- that's the  
3 time frame.

4 COUNCILMAN JONES: So, okay. You'll  
5 provide that. Did you provided -- ramp up  
6 with the predictive dollars, all of those  
7 good things to go after collections?

8 MR. BRESLIN: We've done a lot of things  
9 around collections. We have not done a --  
10 an in-house call center. That we did not  
11 do. What we have done is we've, in turn,  
12 increased our collection agencies. We are  
13 getting things out to them quicker. They  
14 are actually serving essentially as a call  
15 center for us. They are making the outbound  
16 collection calls. And we have a lot of  
17 things around collections in this -- again,  
18 in this budget.

19 COUNCILMAN JONES: Are generally  
20 collections up or down?

21 MR. BRESLIN: I believe in general  
22 delinquent collections are up. I think the  
23 process has been effective.

24 COUNCILMAN JONES: So specifically, I  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 need that number provided to the President  
2 so that as we consider new taxes, we should  
3 be collecting on old taxes. One of the  
4 criticisms of us was that we put a new tax  
5 on the book, but we don't go after  
6 receivables hard. That's why I think that  
7 information provided to Members of Council  
8 through the President is essential.

9 MR. DUBOW: And one of the things you'll  
10 see in the budget in the Five Year Plan is  
11 that we do show an increase in delinquent  
12 property tax collections. So in FY15, the  
13 actual collection delinquent was 43.3 on the  
14 City side. And for '17, we are showing  
15 57 million. So, almost \$14 million  
16 increase. And we keep that throughout the  
17 plan.

18 COUNCILMAN JONES: Final question is on  
19 regional -- I think it was Councilman Green  
20 that mentioned the Mann on the  
21 African-American Museum. Is there a way  
22 that -- I happen to represent the Mann and  
23 the squirrels that go there and then also  
24 the Dell. But those are regional projects  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 that kind of draw a wider customer base.

2 Is there a consideration in our Capital  
3 Budget, our Operating Budget, to treat them  
4 as City-wide assets as opposed to just a  
5 District Councilperson paying for the  
6 capital of that?

7 MR. DUBOW: That's a good question.

8 COUNCILMAN JONES: I would think.

9 MR. DUBOW: I don't know that we have  
10 had those discussions. We can talk about  
11 those.

12 COUNCILMAN JONES: I really want to talk  
13 about that.

14 MR. DUBOW: But we should -- yeah, we  
15 should.

16 COUNCILMAN JONES: Okay. Thank you,  
17 Mr. President.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
19 sir.

20 Chair recognizes Councilman Domb.

21 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you, Council  
22 President.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Welcome.

24 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Still good morning.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. DUBOW: Good morning.

2 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Morning. First of  
3 all, I do appreciate all the cooperation  
4 your department has given me in its first 90  
5 days or so.

6 MR. DUBOW: And we appreciate your  
7 interest.

8 COUNCILMAN DOMB: So -- but I wanted to  
9 have a couple questions. You mentioned your  
10 budget's going up by, I think, about  
11 49 million for benefits?

12 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

13 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Are those health  
14 insurance or what type of benefits?

15 MR. DUBOW: They are a few things. The  
16 biggest are pensions and health insurance.

17 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Yeah. Okay. And then  
18 this may be a Revenue question. I had a few  
19 quick questions.

20 How many taxes do we have in the City of  
21 Philadelphia right now roughly? Twenty?  
22 Twenty-five?

23 MR. DUBOW: I think I will ask the  
24 Revenue Commissioner. There are some small  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 ones that I probably don't have off the top  
2 of my head.

3 MR. BRESLIN: Yeah. There is roughly 20  
4 taxes.

5 COUNCILMAN DOMB: And in general, the  
6 collection rate, which tax has the best  
7 collection rate?

8 MR. BRESLIN: You know, I don't know  
9 that number off top of my head. I probably  
10 should, but I don't.

11 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay.

12 MR. BRESLIN: I will get back to you  
13 with that.

14 COUNCILMAN DOMB: But I mean, I know  
15 that you mentioned earlier that real estate  
16 has 92 or 3 percent collection rate.

17 MR. BRESLIN: Yes.

18 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Would that be  
19 considered one of the best collection rates?

20 MR. DUBOW: Taxes. I think there are  
21 probably some that are higher than that,  
22 right?

23 MR. BRESLIN: Yeah. I would think some  
24 taxes come in at a higher -- at a higher  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 rate than that, so I would like to get back  
2 to you.

3 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay.

4 MR. BRESLIN: We definitely have those  
5 numbers.

6 COUNCILMAN DOMB: And to follow up with  
7 Councilman Jones questioning on the taxes,  
8 the collections, is there -- mentioned this  
9 earlier. Can we see a plan of the 20 or so  
10 delinquent taxes we have in place of how we  
11 are going to collect that money? The last  
12 statement I got was that we had cleansed our  
13 system down to somewhere around 700 to  
14 750 million dollars in total and real estate  
15 was like 350.

16 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. Our number is lower  
17 than that.

18 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay.

19 MR. DUBOW: But I think what we said  
20 last time was that --

21 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Get us a form?

22 MR. DUBOW: That the commissioner would  
23 bring that in his hearing, which I think is  
24 in a couple weeks in that plan.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Because I think what  
2 we would like to see is a plan of how we are  
3 going to collect each delinquency, what the  
4 goal is over the next twelve months to try  
5 and clean it up.

6 And the thing I want to keep in mind, it  
7 seems to me and I'm not an expert, the  
8 easiest tax to collect is real estate  
9 because it's the one tax that has the  
10 ability to lien. No other tax has  
11 collateral like real estate does. Real  
12 estate should be your best tax to collect.

13 I am just bringing it up in case we are  
14 thinking about that. I think that's, to me,  
15 where the focus should be.

16 Thank you.

17 MR. DUBOW: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
19 Councilman.

20 Chair recognizes Councilwoman  
21 Quinones-Sanchez.

22 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Thank  
23 you. Good morning, folks.

24 MR. DUBOW: Morning.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Little  
2 bit around the criteria. I was reading the  
3 New York Times article. There is so much  
4 comparison between Berkeley and  
5 Philadelphia.

6 Is there any GMA, whatever you guys call  
7 that term when you do your general market  
8 survey, in Berkeley that compares to any  
9 part of Philadelphia?

10 Do we have any of that?

11 MR. DUBOW: That compares to all of  
12 Philadelphia?

13 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: No, just  
14 some of Philadelphia. I want it apples to  
15 apples. I keep getting the calls around  
16 Berkeley. And North Philly ain't Berkeley.

17 So, is there anything that we can  
18 compare where we take in a GMA that has the  
19 same similar comparison around consumer,  
20 consumer income, stores per capita,  
21 supermarket per capita, anything so that I  
22 can say compare -- to really compare?

23 MR. DUBOW: I think we can do that and  
24 look at Mexico, too, where they implemented  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 it and kind of look at either.

2 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Maybe  
3 Mexico will give me comparison.

4 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. See where there are  
5 good comparisons.

6 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: I think  
7 that's important. Because irregardless of  
8 where people are in the tax, the issue of  
9 comparison is hugely important. I'm trying  
10 not to get into debate around the facts  
11 because I feel like they go nowhere  
12 sometimes because we don't have anything  
13 concrete to compare it with.

14 Around enforcement, I know one of the  
15 reasons we want to do the distributors is  
16 because there is fewer distributors.

17 How many distributors we have in the  
18 City?

19 MR. DUBOW: So I think there are 31, we  
20 will call it, distributors. But I think  
21 only about half of them are in the City.

22 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Oh, so  
23 the 31 distributors that compose kind of the  
24 market, some of them are located outside?

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

2 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: So, how  
3 many -- okay. I would like to see how many  
4 are in the City. So we've done an analysis.

5 MR. DUBOW: Excuse me, Councilman, she  
6 can answer that question.

7 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: How many  
8 distributors are within a 15-minute drive?

9 MS. WAXMAN: We can look into that.

10 MR. DUBOW: Can you answer City versus  
11 out of City?

12 MS. WAXMAN: There are 31 soft drink and  
13 flavor and concentrate manufacturers who are  
14 taxpayers. There are 31 total, I believe,  
15 two-thirds of those are outside the City.  
16 One-third is in. And we can get you the  
17 exact breakdown.

18 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Okay.  
19 So in terms of enforcement on collections,  
20 because again I can't find a comparison for  
21 liquor by the drink because Pennsylvania,  
22 you can't go across the bridge and buy  
23 liquor. You are not supposed to.

24 In terms of legal enforcement, there  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 is -- what can we do if someone goes outside  
2 the City and begins to purchase the  
3 products? We are so lucky -- the consumers  
4 would be so lucky because maybe they could  
5 keep their prices down.

6 MS. WAXMAN: So the consumers, if you  
7 are just an individual and you decide to pop  
8 in the car and get on Patco and do your  
9 thing, that's -- you know, there is no  
10 problem there. You are allowed to do that.  
11 If it's a retailer who is going outside, the  
12 law says that you must be selling licensed  
13 product in your store. And that if you're  
14 not, then you are liable for the tax and any  
15 penalties and things for late payment.

16 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: So, it  
17 has to be licensed.

18 MS. WAXMAN: It has to come from a  
19 licensed distributor that paid the tax.

20 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Okay.  
21 So like right now when bodegas go to BJ's at  
22 work, when they go to pick up their stuff at  
23 those --

24 MS. WAXMAN: So, if they are going to,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 say, BJ's or Jetro in Philadelphia, that  
2 BJ's or Jetro is both a dealer and a  
3 distributor.

4 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Okay.

5 MS. WAXMAN: The tax will already have  
6 been paid. So if they are going in there as  
7 a retailer, they are totally fine. If they  
8 are going to a location like that outside  
9 the City, they need to present their PA  
10 sales tax certificate to the distributor if  
11 it's a Costco or whatever outside the City.  
12 And then that distributor will need to file  
13 and pay the tax.

14 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: So, is  
15 there an expectation from us that we are  
16 going to get our distributors to somehow put  
17 something on their product that says it was  
18 a licensed good?

19 Like, how am I going to know -- how are  
20 we going to know what's on that shelf?

21 MS. WAXMAN: So, the way that we  
22 anticipate that being tracked is that the  
23 invoices that the distributors provide to  
24 those retailers must indicate on the invoice  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 that the tax was paid by the distributor.

2 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: So, we  
3 are going to be auditing that, those 31  
4 providers?

5 MS. WAXMAN: That's what we would be  
6 looking for as looking for them to collect  
7 and remit the tax. And then as we're out in  
8 the process of doing audits of anyone  
9 selling these, that is something our  
10 auditors could be looking for.

11 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: In terms  
12 of -- I think I had asked this before.

13 Have we begun to look at like consume --  
14 the average bodega product line? I  
15 mentioned this before, you know, I'm doing  
16 the informal take a picture of a bodega and  
17 the options. Don't -- it's a good thing  
18 we're not talking about health because diet  
19 is worse.

20 Have we looked at how we are going to  
21 monitor the activity among the store to see?

22 For instance -- I'm saying this. My  
23 brother-in-law is a distributor. Got some  
24 bodegas in my family. When we have this  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 debate, as we have had in the last few  
2 weeks, everybody tells me they are going to  
3 cheat. I shouldn't say that because now  
4 they are going to all get audited, right?

5 MS. WAXMAN: The Department of Revenue  
6 does accept tips for enforcement.

7 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: I am  
8 just being honest. They are like, we are  
9 going to spread it out, Maria. So in that  
10 regard, it is a grocery tax. We are going  
11 to spread it out. There is no -- you know,  
12 my brother-in-law who is a distributor just  
13 is, you know, the margin around some of the  
14 distributors is smaller, is so low. He says  
15 there is no way. I mean, he's actually  
16 going to just not carry these products  
17 anymore. So bodegas buy from him, now  
18 they're not going to buy that product.  
19 That's his answer to it.

20 I am just wondering when we discuss this  
21 elasticity terminology, is like -- so he is  
22 going to move away from. He's like I ain't  
23 carrying water, I ain't carrying nothing.

24 And I just look at those types of things  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 and -- and I'm wondering how we are going to  
2 monitor and really enforce this because I  
3 know on the cigarette sales, I mean,  
4 cigarette is different. I can't look at  
5 soda like cigarettes.

6 I was looking at those 200 jar Arizona  
7 things that my bodegas carry because if you  
8 are a mom, you buy it. And 200 ounces, so  
9 that's six -- that's nine bucks, right?  
10 Nine bucks. This is what they buy at the  
11 bodega. 200 ounces of Arizona Tea. I  
12 just -- it's just heart breaking for me.

13 What do I tell that mother? To buy 200  
14 ounces of water?

15 That was not a question, Rob.

16 MR. DUBOW: I am taking the advice of  
17 counsel.

18 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: All  
19 right, Mr. Chair. I am just trying -- I am  
20 having these honest discussions. I am just  
21 trying to figure it out.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: There are  
23 going to be a lot of honest discussions  
24 before it's over.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Chair recognizes Councilman Oh.

2 COUNCILMAN OH: Thank you very much,  
3 Council President.

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you.

5 COUNCILMAN OH: The budget is --  
6 proposed budget is 4.167 billion, which is  
7 significantly up from prior years. Is there  
8 no tax or fee you can reduce? Is there no  
9 tax or fee you can substitute for a -- for a  
10 tax increase? Can you take some other part  
11 of the budget where we give money or spend  
12 money? And instead of doing that, use that  
13 to fund some of these programs?

14 MR. DUBOW: So, we did as part of the  
15 budget process ask for cuts from  
16 departments. So we made cuts, but that was  
17 really just to keep the core budget in  
18 balance. So, we did not see any other  
19 option for raising the kind of resources we  
20 needed for these initiatives.

21 COUNCILMAN OH: There's no money that  
22 the City gives. You can't just instead of  
23 giving it, keeping it and fund this instead  
24 of raising taxes?

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. DUBOW: There is nothing that  
2 looking through we thought it made sense.  
3 And as part of this process, if Council  
4 looks through the budget and says we think  
5 that that should be eliminated to pay for  
6 it, and we are happy to have that  
7 discussion, but there wasn't anything we  
8 thought made sense.

9 COUNCILMAN OH: Yeah. Explain to me the  
10 allocation we give to SEPTA every year, 60  
11 to 65 million.

12 MR. DUBOW: Right. I think that's --  
13 most of that is local match that goes to pay  
14 debt service on SEPTA bonds. And that, you  
15 know, is part of a formula. We pay our  
16 portion of that.

17 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. Could you --  
18 could you give that to the Chair just for --

19 MR. DUBOW: Sure.

20 COUNCILMAN OH: -- us to take a look at  
21 for sure.

22 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

23 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. And then, this  
24 budget has a lot of borrowings and increase  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 for taxes. And --

2 MR. DUBOW: This budget has a new tax  
3 but it also has reductions in taxes.

4 COUNCILMAN OH: But the overall costs  
5 out of people's pockets, the average citizen  
6 they are paying more in taxes and fees,  
7 consumption, percent sales, cigarette,  
8 whatever it is.

9 MR. DUBOW: The way the tax goes down  
10 and before it goes down, so I don't know  
11 that the average citizen you actually see a  
12 reduction.

13 COUNCILMAN OH: I think if you are a  
14 wealthy employee, your reduction in wage tax  
15 may help somewhat. But -- but I think if  
16 you're the average person in the City, the  
17 miniscule drop in your wage tax does not  
18 outdo the increase in the cost of living.

19 MR. DUBOW: For anybody who doesn't buy  
20 sugar sweetened beverages, their taxes will  
21 go down.

22 COUNCILMAN OH: But they have a lot of  
23 other -- 2 percent sales tax, cigarette tax.

24 MR. DUBOW: That's not an increase.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 That tax has been in place for five years.

2 There's not an increase in the sales tax  
3 budget or increase in the cigarette tax.

4 COUNCILMAN OH: So, let me ask you this.  
5 The -- the -- the issue --

6 MR. DUBOW: If you're asking whether I  
7 think that the tax burden in Philadelphia is  
8 too high, that's a different question from  
9 whether taxes are going up in this budget.

10 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. However we say  
11 it, the tax burden, the fees, the penalties,  
12 the costs --

13 MR. DUBOW: And that's why through the  
14 plan we have significant reductions in the  
15 wage and business tax. Because we agree  
16 with you, the tax burden --

17 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay.

18 MR. DUBOW: -- is high in Philadelphia.

19 COUNCILMAN OH: So putting that within  
20 context of the PICA portion of the wage tax  
21 concluding in 2023.

22 MR. DUBOW: Right.

23 COUNCILMAN OH: And now there isn't a  
24 \$350 million amount of money on an annual  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 basis that -- that the Administration is  
2 anticipating along with the \$700 million  
3 that we got to pay every year till 2037 or  
4 whatever it is for the pension debt along  
5 with increased bond obligations in this  
6 plan.

7 What -- what -- what is, other than  
8 ignoring it, what is your plan when the PICA  
9 tax -- the PICA portion of wage tax ends?

10 MR. DUBOW: I don't think I've ever said  
11 ignoring it. The plan is to get that  
12 extended to make sure that it stays in  
13 place.

14 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. So, that's the  
15 plan. How is that being done? And -- and  
16 what is the process that assures us that  
17 other than coming into 2023 where there is  
18 no more money, that something is in place.

19 MR. DUBOW: Right. And I completely  
20 agree with you that we don't want to wait  
21 until 2023 or 2022 or 2021 to -- to make  
22 that happen. I think, you know, sometime  
23 within the next year we need to start  
24 working with our legislators to make sure  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 that that's extended.

2 COUNCILMAN OH: Me personally, I oppose  
3 extending that wage tax. I'd love to see  
4 that wage tax cut 1.5.

5 MR. DUBOW: I know. You've made that  
6 clear.

7 COUNCILMAN OH: Yeah. Yeah. But my  
8 point is that are you sure that despite all  
9 the workings of everyone who wants that wage  
10 tax to continue, that it's going to be  
11 passed in Harrisburg?

12 Shouldn't there be a Plan B to prepare  
13 for, you know, the fact that this money is  
14 not going to be available?

15 MR. DUBOW: So I think part of kind of  
16 the reason that we do Five Year Plans is to  
17 do that kind of look ahead. And I think if  
18 we get to the point where we are doing a  
19 Five Year Plan and we still haven't changed  
20 that, then we start -- you need to start  
21 looking at alternatives.

22 COUNCILMAN OH: So my concern is this.  
23 We are doing a Five Year Plan from 2016 to  
24 2021. The next Five Year Plan is to  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 '22/'23. And then there is suddenly, this  
2 money is going.

3 MR. DUBOW: That's why I'm saying it's  
4 something we need to take care of in the  
5 next year.

6 COUNCILMAN OH: Yeah. But is that part  
7 of your Five Year Plan here?

8 In other words, the borrowings and the  
9 soda tax and all that and all this other  
10 stuff, is that anticipating Plan A and Plan  
11 B around this large amount of money?

12 MR. DUBOW: It anticipates that that --  
13 that the PICA tax continues.

14 COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. So, I would love  
15 to see a Plan B in case the PICA tax doesn't  
16 continue. Because I think Plan B makes all  
17 this very, very different than Plan A.

18 MR. DUBOW: Well, the issue is that  
19 doesn't go away till 2023, so you are really  
20 asking for a seven-year plan. And I think  
21 the reason we don't do seven year plans is  
22 when you get out that far, your assumptions  
23 are really less meaningful.

24 COUNCILMAN OH: Yes. But I'm saying  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1     there's a definite law that sunsets that  
2     clearly puts 350 million a year that's  
3     calculated in paying the pension to 2037 and  
4     borrowing money and -- and putting new taxes  
5     on. And we're going to run out of things to  
6     tax in order to make up the difference in --  
7     in -- in -- in the PICA wage portion of the  
8     tax if you don't get that.

9           MR. DUBOW: Well, that would -- you're  
10    right. If we don't get that, the impact is  
11    so devastating, it's beyond, you know, just  
12    looking at what we would tax.

13           COUNCILMAN OH: So I'd finally say, that  
14    it's hard for me to take this budget process  
15    seriously because that is looming in --  
16    looming ahead so clearly 2023. That this  
17    process, which is a artificial legislative  
18    process around PICA, allows us to only plan  
19    for five years and ignore six and seven.  
20    But it's not like it's not there.

21           MR. DUBOW: Yeah, it is there. That's  
22    why we plan to try to get it extended.

23           COUNCILMAN OH: Okay. That's my time.

24           Thank you.  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
2 Councilman.

3 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Blackwell.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you.

5 And good morning.

6 MR. DUBOW: Morning.

7 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: I want to go  
8 back to a different subject. And that is to  
9 ask you about risk management, their  
10 relationship with finance and how the -- and  
11 how the money is determined. What their  
12 relationship is?

13 MR. DUBOW: Risk management is an office  
14 within Finance.

15 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yes, good.  
16 Because as you know, in fact, the Mayor sent  
17 one of his people to me -- Rich, thank you  
18 very much -- last week. And we still ended  
19 up with 34 people who were not straight from  
20 June 14 when a water main broke on North  
21 52nd Street between Westminster and  
22 Wyalusing in my district.

23 And I wondered, you know, half of those  
24 not completed have issues like we're calling  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 on mold. You know, people living and  
2 seniors living with those kind of health  
3 threatening issues. And other people, we're  
4 going to contact them about making a  
5 settlement. You know, and I have screamed  
6 about this so long. All of you know I have  
7 that issue.

8 I just wanted to know since they're  
9 within your department, how you all work it  
10 out? And we introduced legislation, but we  
11 are trying to straighten that out. It won't  
12 work as written, I'm told, and the state  
13 would have to be involved in some of that.  
14 We are still trying to work that out, as  
15 well. But I know that if all of us have  
16 problems or with regard to risk management,  
17 we should know -- we should be able to  
18 resolve them, certainly not in this time  
19 frame and certainly there should be some  
20 organized system that we can depend on.

21 MR. DUBOW: I understand. And so, I  
22 think we all kind of share the goal of  
23 getting all of these issues resolved as  
24 quickly as possible. I mean, that's one of  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 the things that, you know, we need --  
2 Mr. Scott every week. And this was an issue  
3 that we talked about a lot and how we can  
4 get each of those resolved as quickly as we  
5 can. So -- I mean, we share your goal of  
6 getting that done.

7 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yeah. I'm just  
8 wondering what -- I don't know what point it  
9 gets to you. I don't know what the other  
10 City departments, or is there some specific  
11 process? I mean, does it automatically go  
12 to L&I before you? Automatically Water? Is  
13 it that they don't get back to -- to -- that  
14 they don't -- I mean, they said they knew  
15 there were some issues. But in spite of  
16 that and they apologize, you know, I hate to  
17 call the Mayor again to say, please, help  
18 these people out.

19 I mean, is there some -- is there some  
20 way we can get input into the system or do  
21 we have to introduce legislation about that,  
22 too?

23 MR. DUBOW: No. I mean, clearly we  
24 don't want you to have to introduce  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 legislation. We want to be able to work  
2 with you. Mr. Scott can walk through the  
3 process.

4 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you.

5 MR. SCOTT: My name is Barry Scott. I'm  
6 Deputy Director of Finance for Risk  
7 Management. Good afternoon.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Good afternoon.

9 MR. SCOTT: The -- Councilwoman, we are  
10 continuing to work with the residents who  
11 were impacted by the water main break on  
12 June 14 last year. We are sort of close, I  
13 think, to resolving the vast majority of  
14 those claims. We have, you know, initially  
15 had more, as you know, more than 75 claims  
16 initially on properties which were impacted.

17 And we are -- you know, we have issues  
18 now remaining with just about 30, 34, 35.  
19 We are -- and we are actively working with  
20 those claimants each week. We -- I know  
21 that the claims adjuster who is handling  
22 these claims was out visiting sites on at  
23 least two days of this week as well as being  
24 there last week.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       We have -- we have four -- several of  
2   the properties, we are just awaiting them  
3   signing their release which they receive  
4   from us in order to process their claim  
5   settlement.

6       So, we took the step of going to each  
7   number of the properties which both  
8   structural or mold issues doing our own  
9   appraisal of the cost of that repair so that  
10   the homeowner did not have to do that. We  
11   are then including those values in the  
12   settlement offers we are making to those  
13   homeowners. You know, some of those  
14   homeowners also have some work to do in  
15   terms of getting us information.

16       So, we are really working with them in  
17   order to -- in order to move those to  
18   resolution as soon as we possibly can.

19       COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: That's really  
20   quite unbelievable. Half of the people. If  
21   there were 78 -- 75 to 78, and like, 34 to  
22   36 is still undone. That's half of the  
23   people who were affected. I mean, do you  
24   have staff? Is that you don't have staff?

      Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

      (215) 504-4622

1 Is it, you know -- I mean, I have no idea  
2 why we get these same answers. And why --  
3 and why you can't get it done. Pretty soon  
4 it's going to be a year. I just do not  
5 understand.

6 Is program-based budgeting involved in  
7 any of this?

8 MR. SCOTT: No. No. What we have --  
9 so, our process is this. We -- we work with  
10 the individual who is affected in order to  
11 identify the damages that they have  
12 suffered. We -- and in these circumstances,  
13 we have, as I said, gone further to sort of  
14 take the responsibility of trying to value  
15 those damages.

16 We had -- so we identified some -- some  
17 vendors in order to do that for us because  
18 we don't usually do that for claimants. And  
19 so, we've -- I think we have those numbers  
20 for most of the properties. I believe that  
21 barring some very unforeseen action, we  
22 should be able to resolve the open claims  
23 that we currently have down to, you know,  
24 less than a half a dozen within the next two  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 to three weeks where we are really relying  
2 on information that we need to get from  
3 others before we can finalize the  
4 agreements.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: You know how  
6 long we heard that two or three weeks?  
7 Okay. Now you all are here and Easter is  
8 passed and this is April the 6th. I am  
9 almost said August 6 because that's probably  
10 when it will really happen. I mean, we just  
11 don't believe you.

12 Let me say I also, while we're talking  
13 with the -- about the issue of water, I  
14 don't believe that the public should pay if  
15 there's lead in our water. I heard the  
16 Water Department say that we'll work with  
17 the customer. They didn't put lead in their  
18 water. I didn't fight it because it was  
19 another -- it was another issue and another  
20 bill about that.

21 But we're not supposed to -- where are  
22 people supposed to get all this money? We  
23 have lead in our water. You are going to  
24 tell people I'm going to do you a favor and  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 give you an agreement so you can dig up all  
2 these pipes and pay that, too. We can't  
3 even get this paid, Lord have mercy, where  
4 people have water in their kitchen and their  
5 houses destroyed.

6 I don't believe that we should further  
7 victimize our people. Living in  
8 Philadelphia shouldn't be a detriment where  
9 we make all our people victims because they  
10 have to -- it's bad enough if you have this,  
11 like, this bad storm we just had in all this  
12 wind where things happen where maybe people  
13 have problems with their roof and other  
14 things. But my God, obvious issues that are  
15 not their fault like these pipe breaking in  
16 the middle of the street and like lead in  
17 their water should not make them further  
18 victimized by our City.

19 Guess that's all I can do. I wish I  
20 could go out there and fix them my darn  
21 self, and maybe we would be further along.  
22 But thank you.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
24 Councilwoman. Thank you for your continued  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 passion for the people.

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you.

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Couple quick  
4 questions before I call the next member, I  
5 think, actually in the same rotation.

6 Can I get Revenue back up? I want to do  
7 some follow-up questions with respects to  
8 the number of retailers and -- thank you.

9 (Witness approaches Table.)

10 Just want to get some follow up.

11 It's -- your position is that you don't have  
12 or you just not aware at this table how many  
13 retailers do we have in the City of  
14 Philadelphia that sells, potentially sells  
15 sugary products.

16 MS. WAXMAN: Hi. Marisa Waxman, Deputy  
17 Commissioner. I do not have at this table  
18 the number of retailers in the City. And  
19 what we would do is we'd go and we look at  
20 the number of retailers by NAICS Code  
21 industry classification to try and estimate  
22 which ones of those would. So food and --  
23 food service and bars we would count all of  
24 them in. And then for retailers, we try and  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 break them down. So maybe depending upon  
2 how finely detailed the information is, we'd  
3 be able to identify supermarkets, grocery  
4 stores and put them in one pile as likely to  
5 sell sugar-sweetened beverages. Shoe stores  
6 and other things, we'd probably put in the  
7 pile of retailers unlikely to sell  
8 sugar-sweetened beverages. So, we would be  
9 able to make an estimate there of the  
10 number.

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.  
12 Your projections of revenue are based on  
13 what?

14 MS. WAXMAN: The projections of revenue  
15 are based on sales data for sugar-sweetened  
16 beverages.

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: That comes  
18 from?

19 MR. SCOTT: It comes from the source --  
20 is the Rudd Center at the University of  
21 Connecticut who gets information from the  
22 Beverage Marketing Corporation and looks at  
23 sales data. It's on -- they look at  
24 national and regional sales data for  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 sugar-sweetened beverages. Then they do --  
2 they do adjustments for local economic  
3 demographic characteristics and population.  
4 So, they present consumption estimates in  
5 gallons and ounces based on sales data for  
6 individual cities and states.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So it's a --  
8 okay. So, it's an analysis done that starts  
9 by someone in Connecticut that determines  
10 the --

11 MS. WAXMAN: The sales -- the sales data  
12 is collected from -- from a variety of  
13 sources and aggregated, and then it is  
14 analyzed by the Rudd Center.

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I'm just  
16 trying to find out where we getting this  
17 information?

18 MS. WAXMAN: We're getting -- we get it  
19 from -- we are getting it from the Rudd  
20 Center that has compiled the analysis.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: In  
22 Connecticut?

23 MS. WAXMAN: Yes.

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. So, we  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 don't have any ability to determine that  
2 locally?

3 MS. WAXMAN: No. Consumption data we  
4 are looking at the sales. The sales is  
5 what's most appropriate for making a  
6 projection of what's taxable. And so, that  
7 we have from there.

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. And we  
9 don't have a sense of how they get the  
10 information? So they basically look at the  
11 general sales, I'm guessing. I don't know  
12 where they are getting it from.

13 MS. WAXMAN: Yeah. We can provide  
14 you --

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: We estimate  
16 that a portion of these sales based on the  
17 population is probably coming from this  
18 City?

19 MS. WAXMAN: We can absolutely forward  
20 the methodology that they use.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.  
22 So, how difficult will it be for you to get  
23 information to us about how many retailers  
24 in the City of Philadelphia? Because that  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 is actually important. I know people like  
2 maybe wondering why I'm asking these  
3 question, but I really do need to know. We  
4 asked this question. I think Councilwoman  
5 Bass asked who is this going to impact?

6 MS. WAXMAN: We will be able to provide  
7 an estimate based on retailers in the  
8 categories based on the data we have. We  
9 can't guarantee that one necessarily sells  
10 it. But based on the type of retailer, we  
11 can make an estimate of whether or not  
12 they're likely to be a retailer of  
13 sugar-sweetened beverages.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: How long do  
15 you think that will take?

16 MS. WAXMAN: I would say that we can  
17 probably get that within a week.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: How much?  
19 How long?

20 MS. WAXMAN: Within a week.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. That's  
22 a reasonable time frame. Actually, better  
23 than I anticipated.

24 MS. WAXMAN: Well, let's make it two.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 (Laughter)

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Awesome.

3 MR. DUBOW: She'll learn for her next  
4 response.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: You've been  
6 here a while, right?

7 MS. WAXMAN: Little bit, yes.

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: That sounds  
9 like a veteran response.

10 With respects to the legislation and the  
11 issue with respects to the legal challenge,  
12 I think that was brought up earlier about  
13 potential legal challenge and we kind of  
14 pretty much figured it's going to be some  
15 sort of a challenge unless there's some sort  
16 of an agreement. The legislation says that  
17 if we get tied up in litigation, asked for  
18 confirmation, prolonged litigation in  
19 particular, that the shift of the  
20 responsibility of the tax then shifts to the  
21 retailer; am I correct?

22 MR. DUBOW: I think that's correct.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So  
24 potentially, the retailer could  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 ultimately -- we don't know how many there  
2 are, but every single retailer could be  
3 responsible for collecting and paying the  
4 tax.

5 MR. DUBOW: But we don't believe that's  
6 what will happen. We will show you -- get  
7 you the opinion why we think it will be  
8 upheld.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I mean -- I'm  
10 saying, court usually takes a long time best  
11 case scenario. We don't know how many  
12 retailers are. Then in the legislation it  
13 says that if the distributors' portion of  
14 the legislation gets tied up in litigation,  
15 we then focus to the retailer. But we don't  
16 know how many retailers we have to sell it.  
17 I'm still not -- going to need a little more  
18 clarity on the audit issue. I will ask the  
19 gentleman next to you right after this, but  
20 that's what the legislation says; am I  
21 correct?

22 MR. DUBOW: That's correct.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.  
24 So with respect to the audit, is it your  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 position that you do not at the table, I  
2 will say at the table, know how many audits  
3 you do on an annual basis with the retailers  
4 that potential do sugary products?

5 MR. BRESLIN: I don't at the table know  
6 our number of audits of retailers of sugary  
7 products.

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, how many  
9 audits do we do generally?

10 MR. BRESLIN: I can get you those  
11 numbers. I can get you the number of audits  
12 that we do, and then I can break those down.  
13 We have it in the database. I can break  
14 those down by the industry classifications,  
15 so I can break those down by retailer.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Retailer?

17 MR. BRESLIN: Yeah. I can get that for  
18 you.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: In the same  
20 time frame?

21 MR. BRESLIN: Three weeks.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.

23 MR. DUBOW: The Commissioner has been  
24 here a little longer.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Nah, come on.  
2 She's doing it in a week.

3 MR. DUBOW: Seriously --

4 MR. BRESLIN: I can get that to you very  
5 quickly. We have a database with that  
6 information.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. Thank  
8 you. The question about -- I think  
9 Councilman Green asked about community  
10 college. I think your response was is a one  
11 year?

12 MR. DUBOW: Correct.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Why are we  
14 doing that for one year?

15 MR. DUBOW: It was a request to add  
16 money last year. As I said to Councilman  
17 Green, we are happy to discuss that issue.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Discuss it  
19 where? Did they ask for the reduction?

20 MR. DUBOW: No. They asked -- last year  
21 they asked for money. We put it in one-time  
22 money. And since it was one-time money, we  
23 took it out this year.

24 COUNCILMAN JONES: Point of information.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yes.

2 COUNCILMAN JONES: I met with Community  
3 College. It's my understanding they were  
4 asking for \$3 million.

5 MR. DUBOW: This year.

6 COUNCILMAN JONES: This year.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: We are  
8 cutting 1.4. I am just trying to understand  
9 why it's one time. But I am sure they cut  
10 our budget one time, I'd be crying. Be on  
11 the other side of this table.

12 MR. DUBOW: I mean, that's the reason.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Because it  
14 was one time last year.

15 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So when you  
17 said it was one time, did they ask for it to  
18 be one time or did they ask for an increase  
19 in the budget? My memory is a little slow.

20 MR. DUBOW: No. They didn't -- I mean,  
21 this year they didn't say, oh, we wanted  
22 that to be one time.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yeah.

24 MR. DUBOW: We put it in. It was a  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 request. We put it in as one-time money.  
2 It wasn't there request for us to take it  
3 out, obviously.

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yeah. I  
5 mean, they wanted more than the 1.4. We  
6 gave them up 1.4, right? 3 million,  
7 Councilman.

8 COUNCILMAN JONES: Yes, sir.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, I'm just  
10 trying to -- that's the only reason?

11 MR. DUBOW: That's correct.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: But that was  
13 the last Administration. That wasn't this  
14 Administration. So, the last Administration  
15 decided it was one-time money. Why are we,  
16 the current Administration, reaching back to  
17 the -- I know some of you guys were around,  
18 but.

19 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. When you looked at  
20 the Five Year Plan from last year and you  
21 looked at FY17, the number that we're  
22 showing for Community College is what was in  
23 the plan for FY17 last year. We are being  
24 consistent with what's in the Five Year  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Plan.

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I'm sorry,  
3 Councilman Green.

4 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Point of information.

5 I know Councilman Jones had stated that they  
6 had made a request for \$3 million increase  
7 for this year. And actually, you're looking  
8 at a -- actually \$4 million swing now.

9 Because the reduction, they anticipated at  
10 least coming in level this year from what  
11 they had last year. Now they are actually  
12 getting a reduction of 1.4 when they wanted  
13 actually 3 million on top of what they got  
14 last year.

15 Part of that is based on the fact that  
16 historically Community College of  
17 Philadelphia has had level funding for a  
18 number of years. It was that year that  
19 Mr. Dubow talked about that actually got  
20 increase. Finally after years of asking for  
21 increase, they finally got an increase of  
22 1.4. Thought that 1.4 would continue and  
23 that would be their new level funding. And  
24 were asking for 3 million on top of that.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Historically, they've been at a level  
2 funding for number of years. Did get that  
3 1.4 increase. Asking for 3 million on top  
4 of that. So in addition to not getting  
5 3 million additional, now they got a 1.4  
6 reduction taking them back to what has been  
7 historically underfunding for number of  
8 years.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Wow. That's  
10 obviously problematic for them. We need to  
11 get a better understanding of the decision  
12 to reduce that 1.4. So needless to say,  
13 there will be further discussion on that  
14 during our budget process.

15 One last sugar question. During the  
16 debate, we don't know. This is all  
17 speculative in terms of how -- who will at  
18 the end of the day ultimately pay the tax if  
19 this program is implemented. Some people, I  
20 know testimony here I guess last week there  
21 was testimony that likely that the retailer  
22 will eat some or the distributor or the soda  
23 industry will eat some of the increase.

24 But in a briefing, when we talked about  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 the estimation of the revenues and the  
2 briefing from the Administration, the  
3 statement says projected to assume the  
4 entire tax will be passed onto the end  
5 consumer.

6 MR. DUBOW: I'm sorry. Say that again?

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: In a  
8 briefing, an earlier briefing, it's thought  
9 the Department of Revenue estimated the  
10 revenue tax rates to identify the rate,  
11 blah, blah, blah. Then it says the  
12 projections assume the entire tax will be  
13 passed onto the end consumer.

14 Is that the position? Because earlier  
15 it was --

16 MR. DUBOW: There are two different  
17 things. One is how we put together the  
18 projections. And the projections we want it  
19 to be conservative. And the projections  
20 assume that everything is passed on. That's  
21 how you get the 55 percent reduction.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay.

23 MR. DUBOW: If not, everything is passed  
24 on, you probably would see a smaller fall  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 off in -- in consumption.

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. So,  
3 that's based on the reduction in  
4 consumption?

5 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: One last -- I  
7 know I am over my time. With respect to the  
8 reduction and consumption or the change in  
9 product, because some people might actually  
10 have more choices and maybe, eventually like  
11 me, start liking diet soda.

12 MR. DUBOW: Or water.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Nah. When I  
14 eat my food, I got to have some kind of  
15 sweet stuff. Water is for Council budget  
16 session. I'm sorry.

17 Is there analysis done on the potential  
18 loss of revenue, and then subsequently taxes  
19 by the retailer if the retailers reduce  
20 their sales?

21 Do we --

22 MR. DUBOW: For sales tax you mean?

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yeah. People  
24 stop buying products, then won't the --  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 MR. DUBOW: Right. So --

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Wouldn't that  
3 be an impact on the City?

4 MR. DUBOW: Yes. If the consumption  
5 reduction was 55 percent, and all of that  
6 reduction -- none of that reduction and  
7 consumption had people moving onto something  
8 else that was taxable, there would be a  
9 sales tax reduction of up to 3.8 million.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, we do  
11 have potential projections on that. Okay.  
12 All right. Thank you.

13 MR. DUBOW: Sure.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Chair  
15 recognizes Councilman Taubenberger.

16 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Thank you,  
17 Council President.

18 Just reiterating what Councilman Green  
19 said regarding Community College. I fully  
20 agree with him. That the \$3 million ask and  
21 now you're reducing them to 1.4 million is  
22 really an equation of really more than  
23 \$4 million. And they're doing important job  
24 training. And I would like to just say for  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 the record, I'm not asking any questions  
2 because you explained why the cut has been  
3 made which was my original question. But  
4 they do important job training. We really  
5 need. And that's really kicking them pretty  
6 low. And I would like to see that changed.

7 The questions I have are -- and I have  
8 one more comment. Let me put it on with a  
9 sugar tax, soda tax, whatever you want to  
10 call it. My 23 years in the Chamber of  
11 Commerce, I know for a fact at some point  
12 that full tax is being imposed down the  
13 line. They may not do it the first year for  
14 strategies or marketing and that sort of  
15 thing. But you know what, that -- that  
16 money is going to come down the line. And a  
17 lot of small people are going to be paying  
18 that extra tax. I don't think it's good.  
19 But that's my comment.

20 We're borrowing \$4 million -- \$400  
21 billion this year. Is this going to tie our  
22 hands financially over the next eight years?  
23 I understand the policy for rebuilding the  
24 parks will grow the economy. So, will -- we  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 get more funds in time. But what is your  
2 timeline for this overall projects?

3 MR. DUBOW: So, the borrowing related to  
4 the projects of 400 million is actually over  
5 five years, to clarify, it's not one year.  
6 And at the end of the five years, because  
7 there's other debt service that is expiring  
8 over time, our debt as a percent of revenue  
9 is actually lower -- will be lower than it  
10 is now with the borrowings.

11 So, does that answer your question?

12 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Yeah, it does  
13 answer it.

14 Back on the soda tax. We have gotten  
15 some projects and more things are coming  
16 because Council President asked. And I know  
17 he will be disseminating that information to  
18 us.

19 What I want to ask you, do you have  
20 faith that the soda tax will bring in the  
21 money projected off the formulas you are  
22 using? I mean, I have had it explained to  
23 me, but I don't think I've seen the formula  
24 itself, what actually you're using.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. DUBOW: We actually provide it to  
2 Council, a one pager that explained how --  
3 what our assumptions are and how we got to  
4 the numbers. You should have that. If not,  
5 we can send it.

6 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: I will look at  
7 that again. Then I apologize to you that  
8 being the case. But still, like I said  
9 earlier, I believe that will be really  
10 funded by the people in the long run. And  
11 in the long run -- I really do. In fact, I  
12 know it for a fact.

13 And I -- there is a mention of 32  
14 distributors?

15 MR. DUBOW: Thirty-one.

16 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Okay. Can we  
17 have a list of those 31?

18 MS. WAXMAN: Hi. Marisa Waxman. So, we  
19 have the list of current business income and  
20 receipts taxpayers that are manufacturers of  
21 soft drinks and flavoring and concentrates,  
22 so that's the base of the list. There maybe  
23 more that we discover over the course that  
24 we have identified those.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Sure. But can  
2 we as a legislative body have that list?

3 MS. WAXMAN: I will need to make sure  
4 that wouldn't breach any taxpayer  
5 confidentiality. I can check on whether or  
6 not we're allowed to release that.

7 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: I didn't ask  
8 what they're paying in taxes, but I'm asking  
9 for a list of manufacturers or distributors  
10 that you are going to base this tax on. I  
11 don't think it has any breach. I think it's  
12 within my right. I might have to talk to  
13 legal counsel. Solicitor leave?

14 But no. My point is, I think it's  
15 important information that we know.  
16 Information that we ought to know how our  
17 industries are. That's education. If I  
18 were to ask the amount of tax, you know  
19 that, that's none of my business. But I'm  
20 asking for who is eligible for this tax.

21 MS. WAXMAN: Councilman, I understand  
22 your request. Yeah.

23 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Thank you.  
24 The other question I have, Mr. Dubow,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 you had said earlier that our SEPTA payout  
2 is based on a formula. Is it possible to  
3 look at that formula?

4 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. I told Councilman Oh  
5 that we would provide an explanation.

6 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: I just want to  
7 hear it again. I appreciate that.

8 Also, there are -- through your  
9 discussion, there are reductions in this  
10 year's taxes. Is it possible -- what is  
11 that reduction? How much are we reducing  
12 our taxes?

13 MR. DUBOW: The rates?

14 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Well, the  
15 rates and what's the total amount of  
16 dollars?

17 MR. DUBOW: Sure. The total amount over  
18 the Five Year Plan in the wage tax is about  
19 214 million. And for business tax, I think  
20 it's about 207.

21 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: That's over  
22 five years?

23 MR. DUBOW: Yeah.

24 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: What is it for  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 this year?

2 MR. DUBOW: I will get that for you  
3 during the hearing. I just have to find it  
4 in my folder.

5 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Okay. I knew  
6 you had a lot of things of importance in  
7 that folder.

8 Well, Council President, in the lieu of  
9 time, I am done with my questioning. And  
10 whenever he can get that answer to me, that  
11 would be great. I would like to see that  
12 formula. I don't think it's like a secret  
13 Coca-Cola formula that no one ever gets to  
14 see. I actually want to see this formula.

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay.

16 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Thank you.

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
18 Councilman.

19 Chair recognizes Councilman Henon.

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: Thank you, Council  
21 President.

22 Let me see here. Pensions.

23 Rob, what are the --

24 MR. DUBOW: Just the answer to your  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 question. It's between wage and business  
2 taxes, about 6 million in the first year.  
3 Obviously, as it grows each other.

4 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Thank you  
5 very, very much.

6 MR. DUBOW: Sorry, Councilman.

7 COUNCILMAN HENON: No problem. We will  
8 really get into details when Pension, when  
9 they're called up here.

10 But just generally, what is the impact  
11 of the Board's recent actions to reduce the  
12 assumed rate of return?

13 MR. DUBOW: So we assumed -- reduced the  
14 assumed rate of return from 7.8 million  
15 to -- 7.8 percent to 7.5 percent. That  
16 increases the amount the general fund has to  
17 contribute each year by about 5 million a  
18 year. It also reduces the risk that we will  
19 miss our earnings assumption. And since we  
20 have reduced the rate from 8.75 to 7.75 over  
21 the last eight years, it also helps us make  
22 more conservative investments which then  
23 reduces the risk of loss.

24 COUNCILMAN HENON: All right. So, are  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 any of the debts being serviced that could  
2 be refinanced in order to make additional  
3 payments for funded liability, only  
4 dedicated instead of going back to the  
5 general fund?

6 MR. DUBOW: Right. And we have done  
7 that with some refundings in the past. We  
8 do have some refunding opportunities that we  
9 are looking at. And we could definitely  
10 think about dedicating some of those savings  
11 to pensions.

12 COUNCILMAN HENON: Well, if you have any  
13 that you are thinking about or have  
14 recently, you know, had dedicated that or  
15 refinanced and --

16 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

17 COUNCILMAN HENON: Can you just provide  
18 that to the Chair?

19 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

20 COUNCILMAN HENON: And have you -- have  
21 you analyzed the controllers report or the  
22 proposal to buy benefits?

23 MR. DUBOW: So the controller's -- yeah.  
24 Proposal is actually to couple of different  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 portions of that proposal. One would be  
2 just straight buying out future benefits for  
3 people in the Planned 67. I think another  
4 version was making payments so that they  
5 would switch from 67 to 87, the newer plan.  
6 The pension funds actuary is looking at that  
7 now and doing an analysis of. We don't have  
8 that back. But when we do, we will  
9 definitely take a close look at that.

10 COUNCILMAN HENON: Are you going to --  
11 throughout this process, would there be some  
12 sort of summary or feedback, you know,  
13 unofficially just to -- you know, just to  
14 get a snapshot of --

15 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

16 COUNCILMAN HENON: -- pros and cons?  
17 Especially when you're -- when you're  
18 reducing the, you know, the obligation rate  
19 or the --

20 MR. DUBOW: Earnings assumption.

21 COUNCILMAN HENON: Earning assumption,  
22 right.

23 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

24 COUNCILMAN HENON: I will -- so I have  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 in the previous Administration, at the end  
2 of the previous Administration, you know  
3 money -- additional money was dumped into  
4 revenue for increased collections. And I  
5 will -- when Revenue comes in, we will get  
6 into that. We just touched on the call  
7 center. And so, we will get into the weeds  
8 on that. We are going to be asking some of  
9 those questions.

10 But one of the things for Finance is  
11 there was supposed to be a data warehouse.  
12 Couple things.

13 One, is there a data warehouse? And can  
14 other departments access it and use it?

15 MR. DUBOW: The data warehouse for  
16 Revenue?

17 COUNCILMAN HENON: For Office of  
18 Property Data.

19 MR. DUBOW: That's different. Office of  
20 Property Data is actually -- there is an  
21 Office of Property Data. System that they  
22 are working closely with is the CAMA system  
23 for OPA. The data warehouse is for Revenue.

24 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. Is there an  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 office -- is there a data warehouse then?

2 MR. DUBOW: The data warehouse for  
3 Revenue is in the process of being put in  
4 place. It's not fully in place yet. I  
5 think it's in the early stages of  
6 implementation. Yes, that's right.

7 COUNCILMAN HENON: The other -- I think  
8 the intent is that other departments will be  
9 able to access it, on confidential basis or  
10 selectively.

11 MS. WAXMAN: So -- Marisa Waxman, Deputy  
12 Revenue Commissioner. The data warehouse is  
13 in the process of being stood up.

14 MR. DUBOW: Implemented.

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: Good catch.

16 MS. WAXMAN: We will be able to provide  
17 reports of non-confidential data to  
18 departments as needed. Currently, the  
19 department already sort of does analyses of  
20 assisting other departments, making sure  
21 that we can provide the information without  
22 disclosing anything confidential. The data  
23 warehouse will make it easier for us to  
24 produce those for other departments.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILMAN HENON: What's the timeline  
2 on that?

3 MS. WAXMAN: So, I believe it's going to  
4 be put up in three different phases. The  
5 end of phase three is February or  
6 March 2017. And so, there will be  
7 incrementally starting the summer basically  
8 parts that they are in.

9 COUNCILMAN HENON: So phase one this  
10 summer?

11 MS. WAXMAN: Let me get back to you on  
12 the exact month.

13 COUNCILMAN HENON: Hopefully, by fall.

14 MS. WAXMAN: Yes. I feel comfortable --

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: And that will  
16 actually produce some sort of reports that  
17 the departments can use confidentially?

18 MS. WAXMAN: Yeah. Phase one focuses  
19 primarily on internal data to the Department  
20 of Revenue. So, our tax system, our water  
21 billing system as well as the information  
22 from our collection agencies and co-counsel.  
23 And subsequent phases will include marrying  
24 that with data from other departments.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILMAN HENON: Okay. My last  
2 question here is, the Office of Property  
3 Data. They kind of ran right into each  
4 other generally. What is the mission of  
5 that office? And are they supposed to be  
6 responsible for assembling the property  
7 related data on taxes, liens, assessments,  
8 zoning history, license and billing permits?

9 In the history, I think just from what I  
10 can recall from several years ago, just  
11 having a one-stop shop for what a profile of  
12 that property; is that correct?

13 MR. DUBOW: Right. So, their mission is  
14 to make sure that all the various  
15 information systems related to property  
16 around the City are consistent. And they  
17 weren't going in.

18 COUNCILMAN HENON: Is it up and running?  
19 I mean, is it together? Is it still in the  
20 phasing-in program?

21 MR. DUBOW: So one of -- part of the  
22 money in the budget for this year is for an  
23 addressing consultant to help with the  
24 addressing process. And that will get at  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 what you're -- that is part of implementing  
2 that.

3 COUNCILMAN HENON: There is on  
4 addressing analysis where it asks for  
5 \$160,000, I guess, for the professional  
6 services.

7 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

8 COUNCILMAN HENON: Particular for this.

9 MR. DUBOW: Correct. So that is --

10 COUNCILMAN HENON: Is there a timeline  
11 on?

12 MR. DUBOW: Timeline? I think Saskia  
13 Thompson who is head of the office is going  
14 to come up and address the timeline issue.

15 COUNCILMAN HENON: Because the data  
16 warehouse, separate; Office of Property  
17 Data, separate, all right I think they are  
18 both very, very useful. And I think  
19 critical to either sharing information and  
20 providing information for interdepartmental  
21 use. But also, it's better for us to call  
22 and use as a resource when we're trying to  
23 really assess, you know, who -- what a  
24 property looks like and what's all involved,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 whether there is pending suits or liens and  
2 litigation or violations, et cetera.

3 MS. THOMPSON: Saskia Thompson, Finance  
4 Department of the Office of Property Data.  
5 So, that is exactly what we're trying to do.  
6 The addressing project in particular, once  
7 we have standardized addresses or come up  
8 with a way to link addresses, we will be  
9 better able to do exactly what you're  
10 talking about, which is to give you a  
11 picture of a property. And what all of the  
12 services that the City delivers to that  
13 particular property.

14 So it's L&I, for example, right now they  
15 feed information to a number of other  
16 departments. But there is an error rate.  
17 So, they feed information on a specific  
18 property and another system might not be  
19 able to accept that record because it's not  
20 matching up. That's what we're trying to  
21 fix.

22 COUNCILMAN HENON: Right. Hence the  
23 silo system that we have -- you hear, year  
24 in and year out. And really excited about  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 the innovation and creativity that has been  
2 taking place over the last several years. I  
3 want it to continue with just -- would hope  
4 that they would go online soon and we can  
5 further have these conversations offline,  
6 but we need it.

7 I think the City needs it. I think the  
8 citizens need it. And I think they are  
9 invaluable tools, in my opinion, because it  
10 will help us do our job. And we don't have  
11 to insert any kind of policy decisions when,  
12 you know, administratively I think these  
13 will eliminate or alleviate some of the  
14 unanswered questions or concerns that we  
15 have here in this body. So excited there.

16 MR. DUBOW: We agree. Thank you.

17 MS. THOMPSON: Thank you.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
19 Councilman.

20 Chair recognizes Councilman Squilla.

21 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,  
22 Mr. President.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: You're  
24 welcome, sir.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I -- just a quick  
2 question. It might have been answered  
3 earlier on the sugar tax as far as  
4 elasticity. Understanding the use and then,  
5 I guess, the reduction of use depending on  
6 the rate.

7 Is that percentage used, obviously, is  
8 that looked at from an origin that already  
9 used that type of tax or any type of tax?

10 How do we come up with that number?

11 MR. DUBOW: How did they come up with  
12 the 1 percent elasticity?

13 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Yes.

14 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. So, they looked at, I  
15 guess, maybe a dozen different studies that  
16 looked at the impact of increases in cost  
17 consumption. So, they were looking at cost  
18 changes and how that impacts consumption.

19 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And was that the  
20 higher, I guess, the cost change the more  
21 reduction in consumption?

22 MR. DUBOW: Right.

23 For example, with a 1 percent  
24 elasticity, if cost goes up 20 percent, then  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 consumption goes down 20 percent. And in  
2 this case, goes up 55 percent, consumption  
3 goes down 55 percent.

4 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And then does that  
5 percentage stay the same throughout after  
6 the initial drop?

7 MR. DUBOW: You have -- right. You have  
8 the big drop off from the first -- the  
9 55 percent. Then we actually project that  
10 the trend of reduction in consumption that  
11 had been going on will continue. So, there  
12 will be additional reductions after that,  
13 but not as large as the initial reduction  
14 when people adjust their habits based on  
15 that change.

16 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right. Also, I  
17 mean, I guess I have some questions for --  
18 on OPA. I guess I will wait till they come  
19 up since you've been bombarded with a bunch  
20 of other questions already.

21 MR. DUBOW: They come today.

22 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: They come up today.

23 MR. DUBOW: OPA comes up today.

24 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Hopefully, if we  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 get to it. I know it's a lot of questions.

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yes.

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right. Thank  
4 you.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yeah. Was  
6 hoping we can get a break in, but have like  
7 six more. Never want to attempt to suppress  
8 members' questions because they will put  
9 somebody else at the front table if I try to  
10 do that. But, you know, we are -- be good  
11 if we can get to OPA.

12 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Reynolds  
13 Brown and then Councilwoman Parker will be  
14 immediately after that.

15 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Good  
16 afternoon. Couple follow ups.

17 I view this as a teachable moment, at  
18 least for me. I very much appreciated  
19 Councilmember Allan Domb's question  
20 regarding a list of all the taxes. So if  
21 you -- maybe this exists some place. I just  
22 don't know. But I would love for you to  
23 submit to the Chair or as a part of the  
24 testimony for the Revenue Department when  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 they come back before us, a list of all the  
2 taxes, what department, I guess, benefits  
3 from the collection of that particular tax.  
4 And then to his question, which may have  
5 been answered offline, which one of those  
6 taxes, which do we experience the greatest  
7 success.

8 MR. DUBOW: In terms of collection  
9 rates?

10 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Yes. And  
11 which do we experience -- which one has the  
12 worst collection rate.

13 MR. DUBOW: Okay. We will put that --

14 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: That will  
15 be very, very informative.

16 And then to Councilwoman Helen Gym's  
17 questions regarding language access, so what  
18 I thought I heard is that there does not  
19 exist a fundamental protocol across  
20 departments when it comes to language  
21 access. Is that fair to say?

22 MR. DUBOW: I think we are in the  
23 process of putting together a language  
24 access plan. At the end of that plan, there  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 would be a system protocol. I don't think  
2 it's in place now.

3 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay. Is  
4 that something because it's so new, that  
5 that mandate is so new?

6 MR. DUBOW: I think that's correct.

7 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: My  
8 personal opinion and experience is that as  
9 was mentioned by Councilwoman Gym, when it's  
10 a mandate, sometimes it takes a minute for  
11 leadership across departments to get it and  
12 then implement it, to establish a  
13 fundamental protocol is a beginning place of  
14 ensuring it's going to get done.

15 MR. DUBOW: That's right. We are in  
16 that process.

17 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: And so, if  
18 you had to look at a long term deadline,  
19 drop deadline completion of that, what are  
20 we looking at? The end of the fiscal year?  
21 End of the calendar year?

22 MR. DUBOW: I think the deadline was end  
23 of the fiscal year.

24 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. DUBOW: Let me -- if that's not  
2 right, I will correct the record.

3 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay. The  
4 City Solicitor left, correct?

5 MR. DUBOW: I think so.

6 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay.  
7 Because someone said that there's a belief  
8 that the City will survive the challenge.  
9 And so, I'm curious to know why? How?  
10 Based on what?

11 MR. DUBOW: So we -- we will provide his  
12 opinion to show why -- why we will survive  
13 it. The other thing I should say is I think  
14 if there is a challenge, I think we would  
15 not -- and there was a court order, that  
16 would probably tell us not to impose. We  
17 would have to wait to impose the tax until  
18 that challenge was resolved.

19 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay. All  
20 right then.

21 Thank you, Mr. President. Thank you,  
22 Rob.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
24 Councilwoman.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Parker.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,  
3 Mr. President. If I'm standing between us  
4 and a break, I am going to move pretty  
5 quickly here.

6 I will ask you -- I wanted to ask you  
7 this, Rob. I will get the detail when  
8 Revenue comes. Because you were here, I  
9 wanted to just quickly stroll back to 2013.  
10 The City is, you know, in the midst of  
11 making a AVI transition. We -- we, the  
12 Pennsylvania General Assembly, the  
13 Philadelphia Delegation worked very closely  
14 with the Administration along with the  
15 Council President's office. Even it was  
16 actually my first time in working with  
17 Councilman Allan Domb who is not elected  
18 during that time, but actually put some skin  
19 in the game and helping us lobby for a bill  
20 that I was very proud to have authored which  
21 ended up being Act 93 of 2013, which gave  
22 the City an additional tool, not just  
23 Philadelphia, but every municipality in the  
24 Commonwealth as it related to the collection  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 of delinquent property taxes. And I still  
2 remember looking at the pictures Herb Wetzel  
3 showed us, Council President, the link --  
4 tax delinquent properties in the City of  
5 Philadelphia and the Main Line mansions and  
6 swimming pools.

7 Since those properties weren't being  
8 liened, that, hey, they were incentivized  
9 that they had several properties here. It  
10 ran into court challenges and broke my  
11 heart. But I understand that some of those  
12 issues have been addressed.

13 What are we doing and how are we taking  
14 advantage?

15 MR. DUBOW: Finally, it has survived.  
16 Challenge, we are beginning to implement it.  
17 We are doing it in Montgomery County on a  
18 small scale just to kind of make sure we are  
19 doing it correctly, and then we will expand  
20 it. But it is a real important tool. We  
21 are glad we have it. Thank you.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay. Thank you  
23 very much. I will definitely when Revenue  
24 comes back, I want to just delve into how  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 effective were we at using the tool when it  
2 was sort of first provided to the City. Any  
3 sort of challenges that we're having moving  
4 forward now? Because if we need any  
5 additional assistance, we can work in an  
6 intergovernmental manner to get that done.

7 MR. DUBOW: Thank you. Appreciate that.  
8 It's think it's very early. Maybe a little  
9 while before we can answer that, but thank  
10 you. We appreciate that.

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,  
12 Mr. President.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
14 Councilwoman.

15 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Quinones  
16 Sanchez.

17 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Thank  
18 you, Mr. President.

19 I just wanted for the record to read  
20 from the website of the Rudd Center for food  
21 policy and obesity. The Rudd Center is a  
22 non-profit organization devoted to promoting  
23 solutions to childhood obesity, poor diet  
24 and weight bias through research and policy.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 And in their own literature, they really  
2 speak to the fact that they understand the  
3 regressive nature of the taxes that they  
4 promote, but that their goal is a health  
5 one. So, I just wanted to put that on the  
6 record because I think it's important when  
7 we ask for the data sets, and the reason we  
8 have asked for these analysis, particularly  
9 in its comparison to Berkeley is that the  
10 Rudd Center's goal is different than ours.  
11 We have made a decision this is not a health  
12 decision. This is a financial one.

13 So, if I'm hearing you right, 31  
14 distributors are the ones that we expect to  
15 pay the \$90 million a year that we are  
16 projecting?

17 MR. DUBOW: Yes. It's 31. That's  
18 right.

19 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Okay.  
20 So people get it, you know, it's 90 million  
21 for 31 businesses. And I don't know what  
22 their business model is, but that is our  
23 expectation.

24 Because you've written in the provision  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 about going after the retail folks, if  
2 I'm -- my brother-in-law who pays all his  
3 taxes, poor guy, as a distributor, if he  
4 pays his taxes to the distributor on the  
5 retail basis and we discover that because of  
6 litigation we can't collect but I'm paying  
7 the tax to the distributor and I'm a retail  
8 person and you come after me, that  
9 expectation is that we're going to expect  
10 retail folks to pay twice?

11 MR. DUBOW: Our expectation is if there  
12 is a challenge, that we would -- we would  
13 probably wait to implement until the  
14 challenge is resolved. So, that would mean  
15 that that situation wouldn't arise.

16 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Okay.  
17 So -- so but if we feel so secure that based  
18 on your -- the legal opinion and what you  
19 have said here that the -- the -- we are  
20 secure in our legal challenge to the  
21 distributor, why add the additional  
22 provision?

23 MR. DUBOW: I think we can --

24 COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: We tried  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       it before. This Council did not approve it.  
2       You are selling it to us now and saying we  
3       are only going after the distributor. It's  
4       easier to manage. We said no several times  
5       to the other.

6             Why do you need that provision there?

7             MR. DUBOW: I think as part of this  
8       process, we can discuss that provision.

9             COUNCILWOMAN QUINONES-SANCHEZ: Okay.

10       Thank you, Madam Chair.

11       (Councilwoman Reynolds Brown sitting in as Chair.)

12             COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: For the  
13       record, I wanted to hear repeat to the  
14       question, how many distributors and the  
15       number we're going after.

16             MR. DUBOW: 31 distributors.

17             COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: To pay  
18       90 million. Okay.

19             So as a follow up to that, what is  
20       the -- what is the remedy for those  
21       businesses who go to Chester County and  
22       Montgomery County on my side of the world  
23       and do not show their retail beverage  
24       license?

              Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

              (215) 504-4622

1           You gave us the best case scenario. Now  
2           let's go to the other end of that continuum  
3           and look at the worst case scenario of those  
4           who go across county lines and do not honor  
5           up with their license.

6           MR. DUBOW: So, we think that there will  
7           probably be some people who don't comply.  
8           We built in a 10 percent non-compliance  
9           rate.

10          COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay.

11          MR. DUBOW: So, we assume that there  
12          will be some of that.

13          COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Very well.  
14          Okay. Councilman Green.

15          COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you, Madam  
16          Chair.

17                I notice in the budget testimony that,  
18                Mr. Dubow, that you provided that there was  
19                some information that every year for the  
20                past number of years has not been included  
21                in this year's budget testimony. That being  
22                a request from the School District for  
23                additional funding. And my understanding of  
24                that is correct?

              Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

              (215) 504-4622

1 MR. DUBOW: That is correct. There was  
2 not a request for additional funding from  
3 the district.

4 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And the anticipated  
5 obligation for FY17 is 104?

6 MR. DUBOW: That's right.

7 COUNCILMAN GREEN: On page 69 of the  
8 budget detail?

9 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

10 COUNCILMAN GREEN: So based on that  
11 information not being a request from the  
12 School District this year, is it your  
13 understanding or belief that they are in  
14 better financial position for at least this  
15 fiscal year and next fiscal year?

16 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

17 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And that's based on  
18 information that we have received, I think,  
19 by media reports that they have a, as they  
20 described it, excess revenue over expenses  
21 of approximately \$80 million for the current  
22 fiscal year and a projected 120 for next  
23 fiscal year?

24 MR. DUBOW: I think it was 80 -- in the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 80s for the fiscal year that ended June 30,  
2 2015. And that the number for this year is  
3 about 134-ish.

4 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. When did you  
5 first get information from the School  
6 District that they would not be making a  
7 request for additional funding?

8 MR. DUBOW: We got that information  
9 probably within the last few weeks.

10 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. So, within the  
11 last few weeks. And was that prior to media  
12 reports regarding that issue?

13 MR. DUBOW: To media reports that they  
14 were not going to request?

15 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Media reports that  
16 they were going to have -- I will use their  
17 language -- excess revenue over expenses for  
18 this fiscal year, next fiscal year.

19 MR. DUBOW: So, I think that was  
20 probably right around the same time when  
21 their projections came out. And it was  
22 after -- it was after the 88 or so million  
23 number for FY15 came out, but before the  
24 FY16 and 17 numbers came out.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 COUNCILMAN GREEN: And I would have the  
2 perspective that based on your position with  
3 the City, you have regular conversation with  
4 the School District regarding their  
5 financial issues?

6 MR. DUBOW: That's correct.

7 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. And so, I know  
8 that Council had entered into either an  
9 intergovernmental agreement or memorandum of  
10 understanding regarding getting better  
11 information from the School District. But  
12 from my perspective, and I could be wrong  
13 being somewhat new to this body but not new  
14 to this room, we didn't receive information,  
15 we as City Council the body, receive  
16 information regarding their financial status  
17 around the same time that you did.

18 MR. DUBOW: I'm not sure. I know that  
19 there were briefings from the School  
20 District to Council. I don't know the exact  
21 timing and when it relates to when we got  
22 information.

23 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Based on your  
24 experience both in this Administration and  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 the last two Administrations, you would  
2 regularly get information regarding the  
3 status of the School District and finances  
4 because they're such an impactful issue not  
5 only for education of children throughout  
6 the City but also the impact on the City's  
7 budget as well, correct?

8 MR. DUBOW: That's correct.

9 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. And are you  
10 having regular meetings with the School  
11 District regarding their finances?

12 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

13 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. And when was  
14 your last meeting with the School District  
15 prior to the release of that information.

16 MR. DUBOW: Prior to when they released  
17 it?

18 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Uh-huh.

19 MR. DUBOW: It was probably during the  
20 week when they released.

21 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. But prior to  
22 that, when was your last conversation with  
23 the School District regarding their  
24 finances?

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1 MR. DUBOW: We talk to them regularly so  
2 may have been the week before that.

3 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. So considering  
4 your ongoing and regular communication with  
5 the School District, it would, I guess from  
6 my perspective, seem somewhat odd that they  
7 would not have an ongoing perspective of  
8 where they were from a financial perspective  
9 until that meeting that you had with them.  
10 And it seemed odd that we didn't get any  
11 earlier information how they were doing in  
12 reference to the fiscal year and the next  
13 fiscal year.

14 MR. DUBOW: I think they didn't -- they  
15 didn't know exact numbers. I mean, they  
16 knew that they were going to have positive  
17 fund balances. I don't think that they  
18 knew, kind of, where exactly that would fall  
19 out for '16 and '17.

20 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Okay. When you said  
21 they knew they were going to have positive  
22 numbers, when did you get information in  
23 reference to when they knew they were at  
24 positive numbers without being specific?

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Just a general perspective.

2 MR. DUBOW: I think, you know, probably  
3 several months ago.

4 COUNCILMAN GREEN: Several months ago.  
5 Okay. Thank you.

6 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: As a  
7 follow up to Councilman Green's questions  
8 regarding the School District, is there --  
9 did the Administration suggest to the School  
10 District that they should not ask for  
11 anything additional this year given where  
12 they are and what we're trying to accomplish  
13 in this fiscal budget?

14 MR. DUBOW: I don't think the  
15 Administration told them what they should or  
16 shouldn't do. I think that was a decision  
17 that they made.

18 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: "They"  
19 meaning the School District of Philadelphia?

20 MR. DUBOW: Yeah.

21 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Very well.  
22 Councilwoman Blackwell.

23 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you very  
24 much. I was walking down the hall, and one  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 of the companies stopped me and reminded me  
2 that when it comes to Pedialyte, I believe  
3 that's the correct name for --

4 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: It is.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: -- what  
6 children take, you know. When I got  
7 married, my youngest was 13. So -- and my  
8 oldest is still five years my junior, so I  
9 didn't get a chance for that. And even  
10 Ensure, which my father took towards the end  
11 of his life and all those protein drinks,  
12 they're all effected by what we do here.  
13 So, I think my colleagues should keep that  
14 in mind, as well.

15 It's terrifying to think that children  
16 and the elderly will be hurt by additional  
17 tax on sugar. Thank you.

18 That's my comment.

19 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Can or  
20 will the Administration comment on that? Is  
21 that factual?

22 MR. DUBOW: I think it depends on the  
23 ingredient. So for example, anything with  
24 milk in it, is not subject to the tax. So  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 if the children's products have milk in  
2 them, they are not going to be subject to  
3 the tax.

4 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Okay.

5 MR. DUBOW: I'm sorry. Revenue will  
6 give a more detailed response to that.

7 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Sure.  
8 Restate your name and pull the mic close to  
9 you.

10 MS. WAXMAN: Hi. Marisa Waxman, Deputy  
11 Revenue Commissioner.

12 So, there are already exclusions built  
13 in for things like baby formula. Also, the  
14 legislation includes language that says by  
15 regulation certain things can be excluded  
16 for health-related reasons for, like, the  
17 products you were talking about.

18 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Such as  
19 for clarity purposes?

20 MS. WAXMAN: I'm not an expert yet in  
21 those particular products. But there  
22 basically there is the flexibility to  
23 exclude health-related products. So if  
24 there is something that might be included,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 for example, something like a Pedialyte or  
2 an Ensure but there's a health-related  
3 reason to exclude it, there is flexibility  
4 to do so via regulation.

5 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Well, we would  
6 like that clarified so that we are  
7 specifically sure, because one of the  
8 companies told me that about an hour ago.  
9 So, we would like to know for sure. Because  
10 many people and many seniors who need it and  
11 the young as well need that. And we want  
12 that clarified.

13 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Is that  
14 understood by the Administration?

15 MR. DUBOW: Yes. Yes, it is.

16 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you.

17 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Thank you,  
18 Council Lady.

19 Councilman Domb.

20 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you, Madam  
21 Chairwoman.

22 Just one question on -- has to do with  
23 the reduction in the wage taxes. I think we  
24 talked about this earlier. I was wondering  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 if we knew the figure for the non-resident  
2 reduction over the five-year period?

3 MR. DUBOW: The dollars or the rate?

4 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Dollars.

5 MR. DUBOW: Dollars. We will get back  
6 to you on that.

7 COUNCILMAN DOMB: All right. Thanks. I  
8 will tell you the reason for the question,  
9 just to be blunt. It sounds like the causes  
10 of the programs, I'm going to say this  
11 publicly, that that the Mayor and the  
12 Administration wants to do, I think  
13 everybody likes the idea preK and parks. I  
14 think the only question is how do we fund  
15 it. I am trying to look for areas like this  
16 possibly that might be solutions to that.

17 You don't have to answer that one.

18 MR. DUBOW: I wasn't planning to.

19 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay. Thanks.

20 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Is that  
21 all? So for clarity purposes let's just  
22 revisit Councilwoman Blackwell's statement  
23 regarding sugary drinks. Confusion still  
24 exists. And as Councilwoman has stated,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 right now anything with sugar in it,  
2 anything from your power drink to your  
3 16-ounce soda will be taxable?

4 MR. DUBOW: No. So, there are  
5 exclusions in the legislation.

6 So for example, anything with milk in it  
7 and as Marisa said, things for medical  
8 purposes can be excluded by regulation.  
9 There are exclusions.

10 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: By  
11 regulation. But in the actual bill --

12 MR. DUBOW: Some by the Act and some by  
13 the Bill. We can lay that out for you to  
14 make sure you --

15 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: That would  
16 be imperative so that there is no confusion  
17 by the consumer.

18 MR. DUBOW: Great.

19 COUNCILWOMAN REYNOLDS BROWN: Thank you,  
20 Mr. President.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
22 Councilwoman. Okay. I see -- one last  
23 question. Excuse me, Rob. I don't know.  
24 It's kind of like a Finance/OPA question  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 with respects to the reduction in the  
2 commercial base in our estimates show as  
3 relates to value, our estimates show that  
4 this is low.

5 MR. DUBOW: I'm sorry?

6 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: The value.

7 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Commercial  
9 base that we now look at possibly as much as  
10 1.9 billion in the reduction of the  
11 commercial.

12 MR. DUBOW: In losses to appeals.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yeah. So,  
14 should I ask you that question or should I  
15 wait till OPA, because some of it was  
16 appeals?

17 MR. DUBOW: It was all -- that reduction  
18 was all from either appeals.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Based on  
20 OPA's assessments. And should I wait for  
21 OPA to come up?

22 MR. DUBOW: Sorry, what's the question?  
23 What caused that?

24 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yeah. Why?  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. DUBOW: It's appeals. Losses and in  
2 settlements of appeals. It's all related to  
3 that.

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So first  
5 because we have -- it's all appeals?

6 MR. DUBOW: Yeah. You can -- I mean,  
7 OPA is going to be here. We can talk about  
8 it more later.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I thought a  
10 portion of it was based on reassessments.

11 MR. DUBOW: There hasn't -- since the  
12 big reassessment, there really hasn't been a  
13 commercial assessment. We are doing that  
14 next year. I think all of that --

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Have to go  
16 back. I'm just saying that's a lot of  
17 money.

18 MR. DUBOW: I understand, yes.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: A lot of  
20 money. And then there's been some  
21 questions. I know my colleague, in  
22 particular Councilman Domb, has talked about  
23 some inconsistencies in assessments and  
24 appraisals based on the actual sales of  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 properties within the --

2 MR. DUBOW: Right. That's why the next  
3 stage of what we're doing is a full  
4 commercial reassessment.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Right.

6 MR. DUBOW: They are doing over the  
7 course of the next year. That's one of the  
8 reasons to make sure that it's all  
9 consistent.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.  
11 In the -- okay. Because I want to get --  
12 assuming a lot of members want to get in  
13 depth for that.

14 You going to be around when OPA is here?

15 MR. DUBOW: Yes.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. I can  
17 wait. Thank you.

18 Next up we will have Treasurer and  
19 Sinking Fund, and then we will go on break.

20 (Witnesses approach Table.)

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good  
22 afternoon.

23 MS. JOHNSON: Good afternoon.

24 MR. MAZZA: Afternoon.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Please just  
2 state your name for the record.

3 MS. JOHNSON: Sure.

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And start  
5 your testimony.

6 MS. JOHNSON: Rasheia Johnson. Good  
7 afternoon, Council President Clarke, Members  
8 of City Council. I am Rasheia Johnson, City  
9 Treasurer.

10 In the interest of time I know we have  
11 submitted the testimony, so I'm just going  
12 to be very truncated. Joining me today is  
13 Matthew Mazza who is the Executive Director  
14 of the Sinking Fund Commission. And I am  
15 pleased to provide the testimony for the  
16 City Treasurer's Office for Fiscal Year 2017  
17 Operating Budget.

18 The proposed Fiscal Year 2017 General  
19 Fund Budget totals 1.18 million, increase of  
20 \$54,000 over FY2016 estimated obligations.  
21 This increase is primarily due to a request  
22 for an additional accountant and increase in  
23 wages from DC 47 raises beginning in  
24 July 2016. One additional thing I'd like to  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 highlight that was mentioned earlier. The  
2 CTO manages the City's relationships with  
3 the rating agency, leveraging the City's  
4 improving and economic fiscal outlook and  
5 working to optimize investor relations. And  
6 currently, the City is rated in the A  
7 category across all three rating agencies.

8 This concludes my testimony. I'll be  
9 happy to answer any questions.

10 MR. MAZZA: Good afternoon, Council.  
11 Matthew Mazza, Executive Director of the  
12 Sinking Fund Commission.

13 The mission of the Sinking Fund is  
14 appropriately pay debt service for the City  
15 and to help in the management of the PGW  
16 Pension Plan. My total budget for the  
17 Sinking Fund Commission for Fiscal Year 2017  
18 is \$630.58 million, which is an increase of  
19 27.99 million or about 4.64 percent over the  
20 estimated obligation of Fiscal Year 16.

21 The Fiscal Year 17 budget for each of  
22 the funds changed in the last year as  
23 follows. You know, it's \$31.6 million  
24 increase in general fund. Approximately, a  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 12.85 percent increase. A decrease in  
2 19.7 million for the Water Department. It's  
3 approximately a decrease in 8.7 percent.  
4 Aviation, we have an increase in  
5 14.1 million; approximately an increase in  
6 11.4 percent. Car rental taxes stayed flat  
7 at \$6 million.

8 I'd be happy to answer any questions  
9 from anyone now.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you.  
11 Councilman Domb.

12 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you, Council  
13 President. I think you guys sent me a chart  
14 of some debt issues that you -- I requested,  
15 but it doesn't have what my questions are.

16 That is, with the new potential  
17 borrowings, what will our debt be for the  
18 City in all categories? I have in this  
19 chart, if anybody wants it. It says in 2000  
20 I think we were at, what, 7 billion,  
21 7.1 billion?

22 MS. JOHNSON: That's correct.

23 COUNCILMAN DOMB: And in 2007, it was  
24 7.5 billion. In 2015, it's 8.1 billion.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1           And my question is, with the new  
2       borrowings we may have to do, what will our  
3       debt be in 2017? That's one question. May  
4       not have the answers today.

5           And the second question is, I would just  
6       like to know compiled, not broken down but  
7       compiled in total, if we were like -- if you  
8       had a mortgage payment, you would want to  
9       know how much is principal and how much is  
10      interest. For all of this debt we have,  
11      what are we paying off per year in  
12      principal? What are we paying in interest?  
13      Is there an average interest rate of all  
14      that debt that you can show us?

15          MS. JOHNSON: The first question, 2017  
16      is estimated an additional -- in the budget  
17      as additional 150 million in debt in  
18      addition to what's there. And I think we  
19      provided that to you. But we can send  
20      that -- then also we can send your our debt  
21      service schedule of how debt is rolling off  
22      every year. Because I think another one of  
23      the questions you had is how long the debt,  
24      and it rolls out to -- for 30 years to 2046.

          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

          (215) 504-4622



1 Your other -- that's across all credits  
2 including water, gas and aviation in the  
3 general fund.

4 In addition to that, I know you asked  
5 about a weighted average. We do not do a  
6 weighted average because each credit has its  
7 own rating. So to combine all the -- the  
8 TICs, we just don't do that.

9 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Okay. Let me just ask  
10 this question. If we are at 8 billion in  
11 2015, what will that -- will that number  
12 be -- do we borrow -- I don't know the  
13 number for 2016. I am trying to find out  
14 what is our debt in 2017 going to look like?  
15 Are we paying off \$500 million a year in  
16 principal in total?

17 MR. MAZZA: So, the debt service number  
18 for Fiscal Year 2017 is \$795 million. The  
19 maturity of that is principal with -- I  
20 think it's 60/40 the split in terms of  
21 principal and interest. As you know with  
22 all debt, you know, we would hope that the  
23 debt is going to continue to pay off over  
24 time as we continue to pay off our debt.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1           In Fiscal Year 16, it was 971 million.

2           But we are also including a tran for fiscal  
3           year 16 in that number. If you subtract  
4           tran, it would be in the high sevens.

5           COUNCILMAN DOMB: Is it possible just to  
6           show -- because you have 8 billion in the  
7           chart you gave me.

8           MR. MAZZA: That was as of 6/30/2015.  
9           Right now it's probably about 7.7 billion as  
10          my numbers of March 24.

11          COUNCILMAN DOMB: This could be in the  
12          positive way, not a negative way. That's  
13          what I'm trying to get to.

14          MR. MAZZA: Correct.

15          COUNCILMAN DOMB: If our debt as a City  
16          is going down because we are paying  
17          principal, right, that's positive. That I  
18          am sure Moody's would enjoy that view of  
19          that. I just want to show everybody where  
20          we are financially, if we can have that kind  
21          of chart that shows it's now down to 7.6 and  
22          what's going to be down -- what's going to  
23          happen as we borrow and as we pay down.

24          Sounds like we're paying down almost faster  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       than we're borrowing; is that accurate?

2           MS. JOHNSON: That's accurate. And over  
3       the ten-year period, over 50 percent is paid  
4       down.

5           COUNCILMAN DOMB: I don't think people  
6       really know that. I think that information  
7       should be shared. Thank you.

8           MS. JOHNSON: Thank you.

9           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
10      Councilman.

11          Chair recognizes Councilman  
12      Taubenberger.

13          COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Thank you,  
14      Council President. I do have a question,  
15      Ms. Johnson, on your exhibit that you have  
16      given us, the Treasury Management System,  
17      TMS.

18          MS. JOHNSON: Yes.

19          COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: The question I  
20      have, the Treasury Management System  
21      mentioned on page 4 of your testimony, how  
22      much does that cost?

23          And second part, would it pay for itself  
24      in savings?

          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
          (215) 504-4622

1 MR. SCHWARTZ: Christopher Schwartz,  
2 Deputy City Treasurer.

3 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Thank you, Mr.  
4 Schwartz.

5 MR. SCHWARTZ: To answer your question,  
6 TMS approximately in the first year would  
7 cost about 135/140,000 dollars. That  
8 includes the implementation cost of getting  
9 that system up and running. The system  
10 itself could provide some benefit in terms  
11 of cost savings, I will say, in terms of  
12 analyzing bank fees and ensuring that across  
13 the board we are paying less fees and giving  
14 us the ability to negotiate fees down.

15 It's more of a control and value added  
16 type system then it is a cost saving system,  
17 though.

18 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Okay. But  
19 there is potential savings in small amount  
20 of money.

21 MR. SCHWARTZ: Very small amount.

22 MS. JOHNSON: Incremental.

23 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: I don't know.

24 Ben Franklin said save your pennies, and  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 dollars will take care of themselves or  
2 something like that. But, I mean, the point  
3 is -- my point to you is you are saving some  
4 dollars in some ways in small amounts.

5 MR. SCHWARTZ: Small amounts.

6 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Still  
7 something. Thanks.

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
9 Councilman. I have one quick question.

10 In your budget detail Section 17, page  
11 4, you show an increase of 3 million in  
12 interest payments on the tran, i.e., Tax  
13 Revenue Anticipate Note.

14 Can you tell me the reason for that?

15 MR. MAZZA: That is just the actual  
16 interest on the TRAN. The TRAN with \$175  
17 million, the interest is.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Is that  
19 normal?

20 MR. MAZZA: Yes.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: It's no  
22 aberration. Okay. All right. Thank you  
23 very much.

24 Wait a minute, hold on. Councilman Domb  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 has some more follow up.

2 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you, Councilman.  
3 Just a follow-up question.

4 We now have over 270 different bank  
5 accounts between Wells Fargo, PNC, United  
6 Bank Republic and TD. We pay about one and  
7 a half million in bank fees. Is there any  
8 way to negotiate those fees down or  
9 eliminate them or try to condense some of  
10 those accounts?

11 MS. JOHNSON: What we actually do is we  
12 don't actually pay hard dollars for bank  
13 fees. They are paid through earnings  
14 credits. And the CTO, we continually  
15 monitor fees to ensure that they are being  
16 delivered at negotiated prices. So, we are  
17 currently doing that and for the services  
18 that they provide to us.

19 COUNCILMAN DOMB: My understanding of  
20 how that works is that that's the interest  
21 they are paying on our money, and they  
22 are taking the interest from us as the fee.  
23 That's how that works.

24 MS. JOHNSON: Well, in -- right. It's  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       earned income credits exactly. But we  
2       wouldn't -- in natural sense, we wouldn't  
3       earn that -- for example, there is an  
4       overage. It doesn't -- we don't earn that  
5       interest. So what we do is we continually  
6       monitor to make sure that we have enough to  
7       cover any expenses. And any other dollars  
8       are actually moved to our investment  
9       managers where we actually earn interest  
10      that could actually flow into our general  
11      fund.

12           COUNCILMAN DOMB: In the private world,  
13      I will say, that we have conversations with  
14      banks all the time and request that they  
15      waive fees on certain accounts, which they  
16      do, because we have other businesses with  
17      them. So I guess one of the question is,  
18      besides these bank accounts, do we do other  
19      business with Wells Fargo, PNC, the United  
20      Republic and TD where that conversation  
21      could occur.

22           MS. JOHNSON: Yes. We do other business  
23      with them. And we can have conversations  
24      with them.

          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
          (215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILMAN DOMB: I would push them.

2 The other question I have, the second  
3 question has to do with the City recently  
4 required all non-representative exempt  
5 employee to enroll in direct deposit and  
6 receive a Citibank debit type card.

7 MS. JOHNSON: Uh-huh.

8 COUNCILMAN DOMB: And the question is,  
9 why are we still printing out paystubs for  
10 those employees and mailing some? And can  
11 we require all employees to enroll in direct  
12 deposit or debit card to replace this  
13 administrative costs?

14 MS. JOHNSON: Well, the question with  
15 regards to the paystubs, I think that's a  
16 question that payroll can answer. But we  
17 work in conjunction with them in human  
18 resources.

19 MS. KATHY: Hi. Kathy, First Deputy  
20 Director of Finance.

21 I'm sorry. Is the question why don't we  
22 require all employees to do direct deposit?

23 COUNCILMAN DOMB: That's one of them.  
24 And the other is, if we are doing direct  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 deposit, why do we still print out paystubs?

2 MS. KATHY: In answer to the first  
3 question of why don't we require all  
4 employees to do direct deposit, we have --  
5 so far we have required exempts and non-reps  
6 to do that because we have the ability to  
7 impose that requirement. We don't have the  
8 ability to impose the requirement on the  
9 labor represented people unless we negotiate  
10 that with the union.

11 We are going to move -- we plan to move  
12 towards encouraging them at this point. And  
13 we have discussed whether or not we want to,  
14 you know, go further with the unions to see  
15 if we can work out more of a requirement.  
16 But we are not quite there yet.

17 COUNCILMAN DOMB: So that's part of the  
18 union negotiations that will occur?

19 MS. KATHY: We have to negotiate with  
20 them. We can't just impose that.

21 COUNCILMAN DOMB: What about the --

22 MS. KATHY: And the paystubs, we also  
23 are working towards a part of -- the system  
24 that we're building, the One Philly System,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 will -- there will be a piece of that that  
2 has employee self-service where people can  
3 actually go online and look up their  
4 paystubs. Right now we don't have the  
5 ability to provide that information to  
6 people electronically. Unfortunately, we do  
7 still provide the paper paystub. We are  
8 working to move away from that.

9 COUNCILMAN DOMB: All right. Thank you  
10 very much. Thank you.

11 MS. KATHY: Welcome.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
13 Councilman. That appears to conclude the  
14 questions for these witnesses.

15 We will reconvene at two o'clock. Thank  
16 you -- with Office of Property and  
17 Assessment.

18 (Break taken at 1:21 p.m)

19 - - -

20 (Hearings recommenced at 2:22 p.m.)

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Committee of  
22 the Whole is now reconvening. We will now  
23 have the Office of Property Assessment.

24 (Witnesses approach Table.)  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Good  
2 afternoon.

3 MR. PIPER: Good afternoon, Council  
4 President Clarke, Members of City Council.  
5 My name is Michael Piper. I'm here as the  
6 Chief Assessment Officer of the Office of  
7 Property Assessment. Here with me today are  
8 eight members of my senior management team.  
9 They are Deputy Chief Assessment Officer  
10 James Aros, Jr., who is seated to my right;  
11 Deputy Administrators J. Divine, Herman  
12 Seawert, Sharon Swann; Administrative  
13 Services Director Delicia Wallace seated to  
14 my left. Administrator of mass appraisal  
15 analysis Kevin Keene, IT Director Tom  
16 Dougherty and Senior Legal Counsel for OPA  
17 Drew Aldinger.

18 We are here to testify on the Proposed  
19 2017 Fiscal Year Operating Budget. The OPA  
20 is primarily responsible for discovering,  
21 listing and valuing all real property in the  
22 City of Philadelphia in a fair and equitable  
23 manner. Additionally, the OPA is charged  
24 with establishing legal addresses for all  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 parcels, providing a response to real  
2 property tax appeal cases, applying real  
3 property tax exemptions and administering  
4 the real property tax abatement program.

5 There are currently approximately  
6 579,000 parcels of real property in the City  
7 of Philadelphia. These include residential,  
8 condominium, multi-family, large apartment  
9 complexes, retail hospitality, office,  
10 industrial, warehouse, hospital, government  
11 which includes city, state and federal,  
12 religious exempt and nonexempt property uses  
13 and vacant land.

14 As a short term goal, OPA will continue  
15 to respond to any first level review and  
16 Board of Revision of Taxes appeal for tax  
17 year 2015 and 2016 that has been filed. As  
18 a long term goal, OPA will continue to  
19 collect valuable data on the characteristics  
20 of parcels located throughout the City as  
21 well as arms-length sales related data and  
22 focus efforts on improving all assessment of  
23 performance measures of assessment  
24 uniformity and accuracy through regular  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 ongoing reassessments.

2 For Fiscal Year 2017, we are requesting  
3 from Council a general fund budget of  
4 \$12,794,865 which represents a decrease of  
5 \$490,281 under the Fiscal Year 2016  
6 estimated obligation.

7 The Department performance operations  
8 Fiscal Year 2016 included the second phase  
9 of the actual value initiative or AVI during  
10 which the OPA completed the first complete  
11 City-wide reassessment. The initiative  
12 which began in 2010 and continued through  
13 2015 resulted in the first major  
14 reassessment of all 579,000 parcels in the  
15 City of Philadelphia in several decades and  
16 will play a substantial role in removing the  
17 inequities and property assessment in the  
18 City.

19 The initial year of AVI saw a  
20 substantial improvement in the price related  
21 differential or PRD, which is used to  
22 measure uniformity between lower and higher  
23 valued properties. A mass appraisal of the  
24 PRD is a statistic for measuring the extent  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 to which high valued properties are assessed  
2 relative to low value properties. So,  
3 closer result to or slightly above one is  
4 considered desirable. That measurement for  
5 which the goal is between 0.90 and 1.037  
6 improved from a pre-AVI level of 0.970 to  
7 1.037 in 2014. Last year, tax year 2016,  
8 saw a relatively inconsequential change to  
9 1.42 for single family residential.

10 Additionally, the City-wide coefficient  
11 of dispersion, or COD, which measures  
12 uniformity between different property groups  
13 and for which the goal is less than 0.150  
14 also were improved from the pre-AVI level of  
15 0.275 to 0.139 to 2014, which is an  
16 improvement of 49.5 percent. The COD is the  
17 most commonly used measure of overall  
18 uniformity and assessment ratio studies.  
19 Technically, it measures the extent to which  
20 the relationship between the assessment and  
21 sale price, known as the assessment ratio,  
22 deviate from the median. In general, a  
23 decrease in deviation is considered an  
24 improvement in the COD. That measure

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 improves slightly in tax year 2015 to 0.137.

2 The departmental challenges that we  
3 have, like to speak about a little. After  
4 completing the initial phase of AVI, the OPA  
5 is still dealing with the after effects of  
6 the record number of market value appeals  
7 filed for tax year 2014. The first year of  
8 AVI resulted in over 50,000 informal appeals  
9 or first level review appeals, a process  
10 that allows taxpayers to contest an  
11 assessment due to valuation based assertions  
12 related to an incorrect amount or level of  
13 assessment or missing exemption.

14 While the new informal appeal process  
15 was a success in that it facilitated greater  
16 access to taxpayer remedy, a record number  
17 of formal market value appeals were still  
18 filed with the Board of Revision of Taxes.  
19 OPA evaluators have been responsible for  
20 answering over 25,000 BRT appeals filed for  
21 tax year 2014 alone, and are still for some  
22 commercial properties addressing these  
23 appeals.

24 OPA's -- among OPA's daunting challenge  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 continues to be its lack of a modern, robust  
2 industry-accepted computer assisted mass  
3 appraisal system or CAMA. Ongoing  
4 comprehensive City-wide reassessments will  
5 require a CAMA System that will allow and  
6 support sophisticated mass appraisal  
7 methodology and statistical analysis as well  
8 as detailed property characteristic  
9 maintenance and facilitate a much more  
10 efficient assessment recertification process  
11 resulting in the timely reissuing of  
12 property tax bills.

13 An ongoing -- an additional ongoing  
14 challenge that the OPA faces is the ability  
15 to increase its staffing levels that mirror  
16 industry standards among our accomplishments  
17 and initiatives. So in conjunction with the  
18 actual value initiative implementation that  
19 began in 2014, the City of Philadelphia  
20 continues to offer relief programs that  
21 mitigate the effects of long overdue  
22 assessment revisions that in many instances  
23 result in the potential for increased tax  
24 liabilities for Philadelphia homeowners.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1           The Homestead Exemption was created to  
2           help mitigate taxpayer concerns over  
3           potential increases in annual property taxes  
4           by offering owner-occupiers an exemption of  
5           up to \$30,000. During the past year, the  
6           OPA has transitioned the responsibilities  
7           related to the application process of the  
8           Homestead Exemption to the Department of  
9           Revenue.

10           Additionally, the OPA continues to work  
11           with the Department of Revenue to implement  
12           the long time owner-occupant program or LOOP  
13           which provides ten years of tax discounts to  
14           certain long time homeowners whose taxable  
15           property assessments more than tripled in  
16           2014. However, the OPA's role is fairly  
17           limited in the LOOP process. OPA provides  
18           Revenue with the initial assessment data for  
19           any property that experience the tripling  
20           between tax years, and then verifies a  
21           property's abatement history if any. The  
22           Department of Revenue manages the overall  
23           program including outreach, application  
24           processing, approval or denial, et cetera.

          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

          (215) 504-4622

1           The OPA's website [www.phila.gov/OPA](http://www.phila.gov/OPA)  
2 continues to offer property owners  
3 information regarding their property  
4 valuation data in addition to the Homestead  
5 Exemption. The available information  
6 includes application, assistance regarding  
7 denials and reapplications and answer to  
8 frequently asked questions. For those  
9 without internet access or more specific  
10 questions, the Homestead hotline which is  
11 (215)686-9200 continues to operate Monday  
12 through Friday, 8:30 a.m. to 6:00,  
13 non-English speaking property owners can  
14 conduct their call in any language.

15           Under current initiatives, in order to  
16 continue to have assessments closely reflect  
17 actual market values, OPA is committed to  
18 regular ongoing reassessments. For tax year  
19 2016, OPA looked to further improve its goal  
20 of lower coefficients of dispersion  
21 City-wide for residential parcels but with a  
22 focus on those neighborhoods where our  
23 measurements of dispersion were higher than  
24 the City-wide average.

          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
          (215) 504-4622

1           This year OPA is seeking to improve the  
2           level of accuracy and uniformity of the  
3           assessment of the land component of the City  
4           of Philadelphia's over 470,000 residential  
5           parcels and on the 40,000 non-commercial or  
6           industrial vacant land parcels. OPA's  
7           modeling unit with the assistance of experts  
8           from the City's Land Bank as well as  
9           nationally respected modeling consultant  
10          have at the neighborhood level closely  
11          examined the relationship of the land  
12          component of each parcel to existing market  
13          values with regard to the land's  
14          contributory value. More appropriate, OPA  
15          has adjusted the land-to-improvement ratio  
16          in a manner that is more reflective of what  
17          the market indicates it should be. And in  
18          some cases, revised the overall market value  
19          of the parcel itself.

20          Approximately 475,000 change of  
21          assessment notices will be mailed within the  
22          next week. And some have already gone out  
23          to taxpayers who may see a change in the  
24          overall assess value for partially abated  
                Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 properties or a change in the taxable assess  
2 value or, in most instances, simply a change  
3 in the land-to-improvement allocation that  
4 results in no change to the taxable  
5 assessment. OPA will continue to allow  
6 property owners seeking to challenge a  
7 reassessment to file an informal appeal or  
8 first level review directly with the Office  
9 of Property Assessment within 30 days of the  
10 change of assessment notice.

11 New initiative. OPA will continue to  
12 pursue its goal of regular assessments  
13 focusing on area on property types where  
14 performance measures for accuracy and/or  
15 uniformity are in need of some improvement.  
16 As the local market for commercial real  
17 estate is improved substantially over the  
18 past four years, the OPA has recognized a  
19 need for an overall reassessment focused on  
20 commercial and industrial properties so that  
21 assessments reflect what hotels, office  
22 buildings, apartment buildings, retail  
23 shopping centers, warehouses and other  
24 commercial parcels are selling for in the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 open market.

2 During the coming fiscal year, OPA will  
3 pursue an intense data gathering effort with  
4 regard to all commercial property within the  
5 City of Philadelphia. This effort will  
6 focus on updating OPA's records to include  
7 current data relating to local commercial  
8 sales, income and expense data, vacancy  
9 rates and appropriate income capitalization  
10 rates. Additionally, the OPA will at the  
11 recommendation of City Council and the AVI  
12 monitoring group who we have spoken to  
13 representatives of, seek to contract with  
14 MAI professionals experienced in the local  
15 commercial real estate market to assist in  
16 this data gathering effort. Our goal is to  
17 carefully examine the accuracy of each  
18 assessment for tax year 2018, recertifying  
19 the existing values where appropriate but  
20 implementing revisions where necessary.

21 Additionally, OPA has gone forward with  
22 the process of acquiring a CAMA System.  
23 Together with the Office of Property Data  
24 and the Office of Innovation and Technology,  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 OPA has made substantial progress towards an  
2 anticipated goal securing a contract for a  
3 CAMA vendor by mid 2016. The budget that  
4 the Office of Property Assessment is  
5 requesting will allow the department to  
6 ensure that it reaches its goal of fair and  
7 equitable assessments for all taxpayers  
8 using methodologies that employ industry  
9 standard.

10 So, I thank you for the opportunity to  
11 testify before Council this afternoon. My  
12 staff and I will now be happy to answer any  
13 questions that you have.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you  
15 very much. Got a couple of questions.

16 The first of which I started with  
17 Mr. Dubow under Finance. So, we have  
18 information that reflects the reduction in  
19 the value of commercial property to the tune  
20 of \$1.9 billion. Can you kind of talk to us  
21 about that?

22 And it looks like a significant amount  
23 of that was actually reduced by OPA, and  
24 then a significant amount by the water  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 revision and tax as it relates to appeals.

2 So I guess my question is, one, how did that  
3 happen, i.e., how were we so far off in our  
4 assessments?

5 And two, what are we going to do about  
6 losing that much value in commercial  
7 properties?

8 MR. PIPER: Sure. The assessment  
9 reductions and commercial appeals that  
10 you've seen the report on do reflect that  
11 there were a portion that were reduced by  
12 the BRT as a result of appeals filed.  
13 However, there's also a substantial amount  
14 that were reduced by, I would say, a  
15 negotiation or an agreement with the  
16 appellant and the OPA. They were also as a  
17 result of appeals filed. And --

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Right. I  
19 know the BRT is sitting over there. We  
20 going to make sure we get the numbers out.  
21 OPA was 3.3.

22 MR. PIPER: Correct.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And BRT was  
24 1.2.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1 MR. PIPER: Right.

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: It's a lot  
3 more by OPA. Wanted to ask you, the OPA was  
4 responsible for the original assessment.

5 How could you be that far off?

6 MR. PIPER: I don't know if I would say  
7 we were far off in terms of our assessment.  
8 I think what that reflects is the idea that  
9 when an appeal is filed, particularly by a  
10 commercial property owner, there is a  
11 certain amount of risk that we understand is  
12 inherent with letting the appeal go forward  
13 to the Board, whether or not the value is  
14 correct or not. And the ones that we  
15 actually allow to go to the Board are the  
16 ones in which we feel as though we are going  
17 to have to take the risk because we are so  
18 far apart from what the property owner is  
19 asserting the value should be and what we  
20 believe it should be.

21 In the instance where you see  
22 OPA-implemented reductions, those are ones  
23 in which we either felt as though we didn't  
24 see the gap between what we believe the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 property value is worth and what the  
2 taxpayer believes it's worth as being so  
3 great as we couldn't come to some type of  
4 agreement that didn't involve us taking an  
5 additional risk in that we were going to  
6 lose altogether.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, that  
8 still doesn't explain the question which is  
9 how were you that far off. But you're  
10 basically saying that you are cutting in the  
11 like -- I hate to use the term, but in the  
12 prosecutor's deal on criminal cases, you  
13 say, well, let's cut a deal. And you run  
14 the risk of going to the jury where you can  
15 get 50 years and, you know, we will be  
16 prepared to let you only get 25 years, but  
17 the original charge was for life.

18 I mean, what -- I'm just trying to get a  
19 sense of -- that's a lot of money. That's a  
20 significant amount we were off.

21 MR. PIPER: Yes.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: You are  
23 suggesting that the BRT's appeal process  
24 would be more lenient with the appellant --  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 the entity that would appeal?

2 MR. PIPER: Not nec -- I'm suggesting  
3 that in some instances either we didn't want  
4 to take that chance because it put the City  
5 at too much risk because of the amount  
6 involved, but also because in some instances  
7 the difference between what the OPA asserted  
8 the value is and the taxpayer asserts the  
9 value should be was close enough that we  
10 didn't need to go and further risk the loss  
11 to the City.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: You are  
13 basically not standing by your -- your  
14 assessments basically?

15 MR. PIPER: We're standing --

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: If you  
17 believe your assessments are accurate, then  
18 you should stand by that.

19 MR. PIPER: We believe they are  
20 accurate. And we believe that --

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Why would you  
22 automatically fold, fold your tent in terms  
23 of the appeal process?

24 MR. PIPER: I guess another way I could  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 put it, Council President Clarke, as part of  
2 the assessment process which is not an exact  
3 science where the number that we put on  
4 there, everyone is going to agree on. We --  
5 we will always make sure that we are looking  
6 at what we're risking on behalf of the City.  
7 And we need to make sure that we are doing  
8 the prudent thing.

9 And in some instances -- by the way, I  
10 will have to say, yeah, you're right. Our  
11 assessments were wrong, but it was only  
12 because the appeal got as far as it did that  
13 we got the information from the taxpayer to  
14 let us know, well, you know what, here is  
15 where maybe we have a little room to change  
16 it. You know, maybe our data indicated we  
17 had three times as much gross building area  
18 as what's actually there. That information,  
19 as you might imagine, doesn't come to us  
20 willingly especially on commercial  
21 properties until the commercial appellant  
22 has actually come in on the appeal.

23 When that information is given to us,  
24 sometimes we feel we do need to make the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 adjustment. We can say we were wrong. We  
2 were wrong. We're inaccurate. And thank  
3 you, to the taxpayer, for bringing the  
4 information to us. Because a lot of what we  
5 do with residential and commercial  
6 properties is based on assumptions.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.  
8 So when we did AVI, we had little flyers  
9 out. And we said, well, you know, this is a  
10 fair and accurate assessment.

11 MR. PIPER: Right.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: These are the  
13 values and we stood behind that. We did,  
14 too, because we voted for it. You know,  
15 also some of us had some concerns about our  
16 vote.

17 That wasn't accurate at that point? We  
18 knew that --

19 MR. PIPER: Fair.

20 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I'm saying  
21 when we did AVI, the whole point -- in the  
22 old days when it was just the BRT, things  
23 were kind of like all over the place. Now  
24 we said these are the values. And I'm  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1        assuming it was based on comps. But now  
2        you're telling me today that we weren't  
3        really sure in a lot of instances to the  
4        tune of 3 billion on behalf of the OPA. We  
5        were ready to adjust based on the people  
6        appealing.

7           MR. PIPER: No. What I'm saying is that  
8        the difference between the value that we  
9        have on the property --

10          COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I know what  
11        you said.

12          MR. PIPER: Right. And what the  
13        taxpayer asserts it is, is there is a middle  
14        ground that in some instances we do have to  
15        stand by it. In some instances we have  
16        stood by it and we've lost completely.

17          Does that mean that it was incorrect?  
18        No. Does that mean that BRT has made a bad  
19        decision? In some cases, maybe. But at the  
20        end of the day, the City would lose  
21        especially if this was something we were  
22        adamant we were right about.

23          So as part of regular reassessment  
24        practice that takes place during appeals, we  
             Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 have to look at what losses we think we can  
2 reasonably say, you know, we can't help that  
3 because we are adamant. We have the right  
4 information. We have the right -- we have  
5 rent rules. We are using a good  
6 capitalization rate.

7 In some instances, we have to say we  
8 have done all that and we are going to let  
9 someone else make the decision. In some  
10 instances, we have to say we have done --  
11 everything we need to do to make this an  
12 accurate assessment and we stand by our  
13 number. However, if we're going to the BRT  
14 hearing because the appellant has done a  
15 good case, a good job of making a case, we  
16 need to be able to figure out how that is  
17 going -- by the way, the appellants do  
18 exactly the same thing.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.  
20 So, some of your predecessors in the budget  
21 process, you're going to have your answer.  
22 We are going to have our questions. We can  
23 go on and on. But I'm just -- the reality  
24 is, is that we gave people our pledge that  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       these were going to be accurate assessments,  
2       fair and accurate. And we did a big  
3       promotion. But that doesn't seem to be the  
4       case. I don't want to keep going back and  
5       forth on that. You are going to give me the  
6       same answer, and I will give you the same  
7       question. So, we can move on to this.

8               So, I'm going to give you a couple of  
9       examples. This is not, you know, the norm.  
10      So give you four properties as an example.  
11      Two Franklin Town Boulevard; 1336 Chestnut;  
12      1513 Walnut, 22-34 South 17th.

13             So in these cases, and I will go down  
14      the line, so the market value was listed at  
15      26 million on the first one, 10 million on  
16      the second one, 2 million and the last one  
17      90 million. But then they sold for 65  
18      million, 26 million, 29 million for the  
19      10 million, 14 for the 2 million and  
20      101 million for the 90 million.

21             So, this is a snapshot of a case where  
22      there were large expensive commercial  
23      properties where our assessments weren't  
24      even close to the market value. So as we  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 move ahead, is it likely in your  
2 reassessment that we will cut a deal with  
3 these people, too?

4 MR. PIPER: That's a good question,  
5 Council President. I would like to -- you  
6 know, when we started going down this road a  
7 few years ago with AVI, yes, we held out  
8 some ideas that we want to make sure that  
9 the assessments are fair and accurate. And  
10 I think a lot of folks were sort of new to  
11 what we do. I mean, what we do is basically  
12 appraisal. But I think a lot of folks,  
13 including Council and taxpayers, have  
14 learned a lot about the process.

15 But there are some other things about  
16 the process that, if you don't mind, I would  
17 like to in trying to answer your question  
18 sort of point out.

19 What we do is basically appraisal, okay?  
20 Almost the same as just appraising one  
21 property. If a person takes a week to  
22 appraise a property, 40 hours he puts into  
23 his appraisal work. The information he got  
24 at the beginning of the week and the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 information he gets a week later when he  
2 writes his report is still concerned to be  
3 current. It's now, okay?

4 The information that the OPA or any  
5 assessment office uses is what we call  
6 current data. But by nature because of the  
7 assessment process, it's sometimes a year or  
8 two or three years old because we are  
9 looking at sales over a recent period. And  
10 the recent period is not last year  
11 necessarily. It's sometimes two or three  
12 years.

13 So for instance, the ones you just  
14 mentioned, our assessment of commercial  
15 properties, they were based on when we did  
16 AVI in which we had to certify an assessment  
17 role by March 31 of 2013, our numbers were  
18 based on sales data from no more recently  
19 than fourth quarter 2011 maybe, in some  
20 instances, first quarter 2012 which seems  
21 like kind of a big gap. It certainly is a  
22 big gap between then and now. And we can  
23 understand that prices, real estate prices  
24 on commercial properties, have been going up

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 dramatically since then.

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Your  
3 testimony says over the past four years.

4 MR. PIPER: Yes.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, you knew  
6 that this was -- how did you know that?

7 MR. PIPER: We --

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Why wasn't  
9 that reflected in your assessment if you  
10 knew property values were going up?

11 MR. PIPER: The same information you  
12 have, we get that information from the  
13 Recorder of Deeds and from professional  
14 publications that let us know what's going  
15 on in the region and in Philadelphia --

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.

17 MR. PIPER: -- in commercial properties.  
18 So we're aware.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.

20 MR. PIPER: Which is why we are looking  
21 forward to doing the commercial  
22 reassessment.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: All right.

24 I'm actually over my time. In spite of what  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 people believe, I am on the clock, also. I  
2 know you guys don't believe it.

3 But -- so the reality is, is that as we  
4 move forward and I know there are going to  
5 be some other questions about this, how do  
6 we fix this issue?

7 Because somebody as an example, take the  
8 extreme, the 26 million-dollar property  
9 market value property sold for 65. Somebody  
10 did an assessment when they agreed to pay  
11 65 million. Maybe we need to have that  
12 person do the assessment to determine that  
13 it was worth 65 million and not 26.

14 MR. PIPER: When you get information  
15 about a sale price on a commercial property,  
16 and our commercial assessors know this and a  
17 appraiser knows this also, you get honest  
18 and accurate information on the deed. It  
19 says \$65 million. But for us to be able to  
20 use that type of information as a gauge to  
21 what we should be assessing, we need to  
22 validate the terms of that sale. With  
23 commercial property, that means we need to  
24 be able to figure out how much of that was  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       attributable to the value agreed upon  
2       between the seller and the buyer on the real  
3       estate, and how much was on -- which is  
4       typically the case with commercial  
5       properties on the business. And which is  
6       almost always the case on the personal  
7       property, furniture, whatever, that's not  
8       real estate and, therefore, we cannot  
9       assess.

10       We can make assumptions that it's maybe  
11       30, 40 percent depending on the type of  
12       building, office building, hotel. But in  
13       order to get actual information about it,  
14       which is what we need, we either have to  
15       send out questionnaires and hope we get  
16       honest information back. Which you might  
17       expect, we typically don't get anything  
18       back. It's not in the buyer or seller's  
19       interest to let us know this. But we don't  
20       usually get it until, again, the appellant  
21       walks in.

22       COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: My assumption  
23       is that was a functioning property at the  
24       time of this sale, wasn't like it was a  
          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 vacant property?

2 MR. PIPER: Right.

3 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, there  
4 were indicators that there was a functioning  
5 business in that property prior to?

6 MR. PIPER: Right.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: That's what I  
8 am going to do. I'm going to come back  
9 because I'm taking a lot of time. But I  
10 just -- I'm -- this is a big gap. It's a  
11 lot of money.

12 MR. PIPER: Sure.

13 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: It's  
14 1.9 billion. If we were able to tax that,  
15 we would be getting \$26 million a year in  
16 additional revenue. And guess what we can  
17 pay for with that, right? The magic number  
18 that we've been talking about the preK. So,  
19 okay.

20 Chair recognizes Councilman Greenlee.

21 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank you,  
22 Mr. President. Good afternoon.

23 MR. PIPER: Good afternoon, Councilman.

24 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: First of all, I  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 just want to say I always appreciate when I  
2 contact you, you always get back and try to  
3 give me as much information as you can. I  
4 appreciate that.

5 I was going to ask about the CAMA  
6 system. I still want to. Just to follow up  
7 just slightly on what the Council President  
8 was talking about. When it comes to first  
9 level reviews or, you know, the  
10 consideration that OPA gives to appeals, do  
11 you have any information on either  
12 percentage or real numbers on what is worked  
13 out for residential properties versus  
14 commercial properties?

15 MR. PIPER: In terms of the level of  
16 success or in terms of --

17 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: No. How many -- I  
18 was thinking more how many agreements do you  
19 work out percentage-wise of the appeals that  
20 residents put in as opposed to commercial  
21 property owners? Am I making sense?

22 MR. PIPER: I can say, and Mr. Al can  
23 confirm if I'm wrong or not. I can say with  
24 the first level reviews, a substantial  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 number particularly what was filed for tax  
2 year 2014 and 2015, a substantial number of  
3 those were just denied because they were  
4 found to be non-credible.

5 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Is that on  
6 residential?

7 MR. PIPER: That's particularly on --

8 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Particularly on  
9 residential.

10 MR. PIPER: Most of the FLRs, any of the  
11 appeals were filed on the residential. But  
12 a larger percentage were filed on the  
13 residential.

14 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.

15 MR. PIPER: So what you would expect to  
16 see is, in other words, the commercial  
17 property owners usually don't bother with  
18 the first level review. They go right to  
19 the BRT.

20 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: All right. But  
21 you still got involved, as Council President  
22 pointed out, when there were appeals to the  
23 BRT on the commercial property.

24 MR. PIPER: Sure.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: In other words,  
2 you tried to work things out, right?

3 MR. PIPER: Right.

4 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: That's what I'm  
5 getting at. I guess, how many  
6 percentage-wise or approximate, you might  
7 not have the figure, did you do that with  
8 commercial as opposed to residential?

9 MR. PIPER: We probably did it more with  
10 commercials than residential. Because  
11 again, with residential what you are going  
12 to see is an appeal either an FLR or BRT  
13 appeal that sort of straightforward that  
14 says this is what I think my house is worth.  
15 I think you've overassessed me. I think  
16 it's worth what you put on there, but the  
17 guy across the street, you are assessing it  
18 a lot less, so it's not uniform.

19 With the commercial property owner,  
20 again, we get a lot more information that  
21 comes in that's likely to sway us to say,  
22 you know what, we -- our assumptions were  
23 right and our value is right based on the  
24 assumptions that we think were right. But  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1       some of our assumptions were wrong. You  
2       just kind of filled in the blanks commercial  
3       property owner. Thank you. Now  
4       unfortunately for us, we have to lower the  
5       value. But this -- it's sort of a  
6       self-correcting part of the process.

7           COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay. I have to  
8       say, the reason I raised that, I heard  
9       before that fair or not, I'll just throw it  
10      out there, that you're more likely to make  
11      agreements with commercial property owners  
12      because they have the wherewithal,  
13      particularly larger commercial buildings, to  
14      appeal that kind of thing. Where Joe and  
15      Mary Jones can only probably do so much.

16           I don't know if you have a reaction to  
17      that or not?

18           MR. PIPER: I can say that's probably  
19      not true based on our experience because a  
20      commercial property owner has a lot -- is  
21      going to wind up spending a lot more money  
22      to continue to pursue a appeal.

23           COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: They got a lot  
24      more money to give, I guess.

          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

          (215) 504-4622

1 MR. PIPER: They do. But it cost  
2 them -- a residential property owner never  
3 has to pay any money to file an appeal  
4 either with us or the BRT. A commercial  
5 property owner is required to produce and  
6 pay for an appraisal to continue to pursue  
7 the appeal.

8 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: As far as the CAMA  
9 System, I know you said you hope to have  
10 this in place by mid 2016. So, the  
11 proposals have been put in?

12 MR. PIPER: Yes.

13 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: We're pretty --  
14 sounds like that's pretty close then, right?

15 MR. PIPER: Yes.

16 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Who all makes the  
17 decision on that as far as picking the  
18 system, picking the vendor? I'm sorry.

19 MR. PIPER: The decision on the vendor?

20 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Yes. Yes.

21 MR. PIPER: It's combination of upper  
22 level staff that is part of OPA, OPD and  
23 OIT.

24 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Combination. It's what I figured.

2 And just so I'm clear, because Mr. Dubow  
3 and I were going back and forth a couple  
4 times on the whole issue of the problems  
5 between BRT, OPA and Revenue people getting  
6 the wrong bills, you know, all that kind of  
7 thing. I guess one of the things the CAMA  
8 System is supposed to do is improve that  
9 or --

10 MR. PIPER: Yes.

11 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Solve it maybe.

12 MR. PIPER: Well, it's what a  
13 jurisdiction the size of Philadelphia will  
14 typically have in place. And it's part of  
15 the regular process. You have a computer  
16 system mass appraisal system that helps  
17 generate assessments in a timely fashion so  
18 that, you know, the tax bills that result  
19 from appeals or just from regular  
20 reassessments are -- the information gets  
21 over a lot quicker, a lot more efficiently,  
22 sure.

23 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: If I could --  
24 again, I use the term to Mr. Dubow this  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 morning, Monday morning quarterback. I  
2 guess that's what I'm doing.

3 But AVI came in a couple, you know,  
4 couple years ago, right? Why is CAMA System  
5 now, you still haven't got it yet? I know  
6 it's not totally your decision. I'm just  
7 trying to think out loud. It seems like if  
8 it's such a great thing to have, seems like  
9 it's taking a long time to get it.

10 MR. PIPER: I would agree. We wish we  
11 had it now. And I think, however, what we  
12 have done this time around in trying to  
13 acquire a CAMA System has been probably the  
14 most professional process that I've been  
15 involved with in my 25 years with the City  
16 because of the way the City's gone about  
17 trying to acquire it. We didn't go out and  
18 say we need someone who can do it at the  
19 cheapest price, you know, who can show us  
20 the most bells and whistles. We went  
21 through a process.

22 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: You feel you did  
23 your due diligence.

24 MR. PIPER: We did more than our due  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 diligence. I can give you details on what  
2 we have done including visiting current  
3 customers of the vendors, having the vendors  
4 come in and give demonstrations to our, at  
5 least, a substantial portion of our staff as  
6 well as OPD and OIT. I think we vetted  
7 everyone who has submitted proposals.

8 In fact, I think just going back prior  
9 to, you know, even submitting -- before we  
10 got the proposals from the vendors, I think  
11 what we have put into trying to have a needs  
12 assessment document put together, I think we  
13 did our due diligence. And I think we were  
14 responsible stewards of taxpayer money.

15 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Okay. Thank you  
16 for your answers.

17 Thank you, Mr. President.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
19 Councilman.

20 Chair recognizes Councilman Domb.

21 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you, Council  
22 President. Good afternoon.

23 MR. PIPER: Hi, Councilman.

24 COUNCILMAN DOMB: My comments are more  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       constructive purposes. I want to work with  
2       everybody to make this better. You guys  
3       have been very cooperative and I appreciate  
4       that. I want to make sure I said some  
5       information accurate.

6             Right now in the City we bill about --  
7       we have values of 134 billion roughly of  
8       real estate. We bill about 103 billion  
9       roughly.

10       MR. PIPER: Right. Roughly about.

11       COUNCILMAN DOMB: We have revenues of  
12       about 1.2 billion in real estate taxes? 1.2  
13       to 1.3?

14       MR. PIPER: I'm not sure about that.

15       COUNCILMAN DOMB: Pretty close.

16       MR. PIPER: Yes.

17       COUNCILMAN DOMB: We have 3.1 billion of  
18       real estate we don't bill which is  
19       nonprofits.

20       MR. PIPER: Okay.

21       COUNCILMAN DOMB: And in the private  
22       sector, just so you -- in the private  
23       sector, most companies would spend 2 percent  
24       of that on professional management. We are  
              Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       barely spending 1 percent. I just want to  
2       put that spotlight down because we should  
3       understand what we are dealing with. This  
4       is the most important area of real estate of  
5       assets that the City has, 134 billion. And  
6       some comparison, one of our largest firms in  
7       the City, is probably Brandywine. And they  
8       have, what, 5 to 10 billion dollars? We  
9       have 134 billion.

10       In the last three years, we really  
11       haven't changed our values of 134. They  
12       stayed pretty constant.

13       MR. PIPER: Right.

14       COUNCILMAN DOMB: And I'm not blaming  
15       anybody. Because in my opinion, the crux of  
16       this problem is that when we did AVI way  
17       back, we should have had a CAMA System on a  
18       dual track while we were doing AVI. When  
19       AVI was finished, the CAMA System would have  
20       picked it up.

21       To the Council President's comments  
22       about 1.9 billion, it's about 27, 28 million  
23       dollars of taxes we're not getting. But in  
24       the big picture of 134 billion, not  
25       Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       terrible. I mean, it's not even 2 percent,  
2       okay. What does happen, I was on the other  
3       side of the coin so I can speak to this  
4       issue.

5               What does happen is what Councilman  
6       Greenlee said is that real estate people  
7       hire the best lawyers in the City and the  
8       best appraisers in the City. They go into  
9       the hearing. And our appraisers are good,  
10      but they're not of that caliber. And they  
11      don't have the information that the outside  
12      people have. They don't have the comps.  
13      It's a tough process. I understand why you  
14      made some deals. I understand all that  
15      stuff.

16             My goal is to equip you guys with the  
17      firepower you need in order to manage this  
18      asset in a really good way. By not changing  
19      the values for the last three years, if it  
20      was just 3 percent a year, it would have  
21      been \$36 million each year. Which is like  
22      \$108 million. So, we lost a lot of revenue.  
23      This is a big area that we got to keep focus  
24      on. I understand also in your statement  
        Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1       today, you have open slots for appraisers.

2               MR. PIPER: We do.

3               COUNCILMAN DOMB: You can't fill them.

4       My guess is because of salaries we offer,  
5       that's why they can't be filled. I am just  
6       guessing that. I understand the salary is  
7       okay but not great.

8               The other piece we should focus on is  
9       with the number of appraisers you have, it's  
10      123. We have 579,000 properties, so each  
11      appraiser is, I guess, responsible for 4,707  
12      properties per year. That's impossible to  
13      handle. I mean, that's a tough job.

14              That's why I don't think we as the City  
15      of Philadelphia are giving you the resources  
16      that you need to really effectively manage  
17      this whole process. So, it would be tough  
18      for me -- I'm not criticizing anything  
19      because I don't think you have the dollars  
20      or the investment in order to make this more  
21      effective. Something we need to look at and  
22      work together to figure out. There is a lot  
23      of issues why values were off, by the way,  
24      in the last three years.

            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

            (215) 504-4622

1           The cap rates dramatically went down  
2       which caused values to go up dramatically.  
3       Number one. And number two, many buildings  
4       were sold because the uses were change. You  
5       have an office building that gets changed to  
6       residential. Investor sees that but you  
7       guys can't say that. You have to value it  
8       as an office building. So the price could  
9       have doubled because it was a residential.  
10      Look at all the apartment buildings that  
11      were office buildings before in this City  
12      that were converted. That's a reason why a  
13      lot of these value have changed.

14           Now we don't have the firepower to go  
15      back in and fix it. So what I'd like -- you  
16      don't have to give me an answer today. What  
17      I would like you guys to think about is how  
18      do we fix this really well. If you need  
19      more assets, you got to tell us. Because I  
20      look at this as an investment. I don't look  
21      at this as a cost. I think we need to  
22      really focus in this area and get all these  
23      land values that are off. I know a  
24      penthouse recently sold for huge numbers,  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       like, 10 million and the land value is  
2       68,000. This property on Walnut Street sold  
3       for 40 billion and it's assessed at 4 and a  
4       half. I can go on with those examples, but  
5       that's not productive.

6       I want to try to give you guys the tools  
7       to fix all this stuff. So having said that,  
8       I would like you to think about. Maybe we  
9       can meet again and figure this out and we'll  
10      work together.

11      MR. PIPER: Councilman Domb, I  
12      appreciate what you're saying and the  
13      support. I got to share something with  
14      folks in this room that I've already shared  
15      with my senior staff and I think with you.

16      Your expertise is something we certainly  
17      appreciate. When I got into trying to sell  
18      real estate part time in the early '90s, my  
19      managing broker requested that I try to find  
20      a way to have a conversation with Allan Domb  
21      because Allan Domb knows what he's talking  
22      about. And I asked him to facilitate the  
23      meeting, but then he told me Allan Domb  
24      charges to watch him work. And I couldn't  
       Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       afford to meet Allen Domb. Now that you're  
2       here to give me free advice, I certainly do  
3       appreciate it and the staff does, too.

4           They've always -- particularly, our  
5       condo unit -- always said you have been good  
6       at sharing what you do know. I appreciate  
7       the support. There's a couple quick  
8       comments.

9           You made a comment about salaries the  
10      staff is paid. I think to some degree,  
11      that's a concern because I know we have  
12      gotten folks in over the past few years with  
13      college degrees and business-related  
14      subjects. And a few of them actually have  
15      left when the economy got a little better.  
16      I think that's a concern. I think between  
17      Council and the Civil Service Commission, we  
18      have gotten some support in trying to kind  
19      of go outside the City a little bit. We  
20      haven't gotten a lot of folks from outside  
21      the City. We're doing everything we can.

22           Actually, I think we are getting close  
23      to our goals. And our goal, by the way, for  
24      substantial -- a big jurisdiction like  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 Philadelphia, you are looking at  
2 approximately one person to every 2,500 to  
3 3,000 parcels. That, you know, that could  
4 change depending on the inventory. But I  
5 think we're getting pretty close to that.  
6 Having said that, looking at what we're  
7 doing going forward with not only the CAMA  
8 System, which is going to require some of  
9 our folks to be involved in implementation  
10 efforts, the commercial reappraisal is  
11 something that we really do want to have  
12 some consultants help on.

13 I appreciate your support on that.

14 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you. Thank you  
15 very much.

16 Thank you, Council President.

17 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
18 Councilman. Also known as our City Council  
19 secret weapon on real estate. Thank you,  
20 sir.

21 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Parker.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,  
23 Mr. President. Let me say good afternoon to  
24 each of you. Thank you for being here.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. PIPER: Good afternoon.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Let me start by  
3 asking you to just give us a summary, if you  
4 will, on how much revenue you think is not  
5 being collected for properties that have  
6 multiple exemptions?

7 You can give us an example of, you know,  
8 something that automatically comes to mind  
9 where you can think of a few properties  
10 where they have multiple exemptions.

11 MR. PIPER: Sure. Let me say, first of  
12 all, before someone jumps up and stops me  
13 from talking about revenue, I don't -- I  
14 can't really speak to revenue. I understand  
15 the question as it relates to what we do.  
16 So in terms of what -- maybe what percentage  
17 of properties are exempt that maybe should  
18 be taxable, that's kind of my question.

19 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes. For example,  
20 you are going out and trying to conduct your  
21 assessments. But there is a property that  
22 may have multiple exemptions because they  
23 file in categories. They find themselves in  
24 different categories where they are

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 eligible --

2 MR. PIPER: Sure.

3 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: -- to receive  
4 exemptions. I'm asking you of all of the  
5 properties that we do assess, how many of  
6 them have multiple exemptions?

7 And then would you be able to tell me if  
8 there are any commercial properties that  
9 have multiple exemptions?

10 MR. PIPER: That's a very good question.  
11 The answer to the first part of that, let me  
12 say, is there may be some properties that  
13 have multiple exemptions or an exemption and  
14 an abatement. But because we don't have a  
15 modern CAMA System, the current V-SAM based  
16 system that we use now does not allow us to  
17 track those exemptions in a way that's  
18 apparent to the assessor. It's sort of a  
19 manual process. And I will give you an  
20 example of one.

21 There's a property owned by one of the  
22 major university in which they have partial  
23 exemption because they are statutorily  
24 exempt as a nonprofit. But some of the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 upper space is used for apartment buildings.  
2 And the developer that developed that has an  
3 abatement on it, which is a temporary  
4 exemption. So in order to track those  
5 multiple exemptions, meaning the one that  
6 matures after a certain amount of time and  
7 the ones that would stay on forever, it's  
8 very difficult to do without the modern CAMA  
9 System.

10 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Because we don't  
11 have CAMA, are you telling me that even --  
12 we don't have an approximate even though it  
13 would have to be this data sort of collected  
14 manually? You don't have sort of a  
15 snapshot. Without CAMA, I get it, we can't  
16 give you a number and say this is the  
17 accurate, official number.

18 Can you give us a snapshot of properties  
19 with multiple exemptions, or you don't have  
20 a number?

21 MR. PIPER: I can find out. I can tell  
22 you that. But I think the first part what  
23 you just asked, in other words, without  
24 CAMA, does that mean we don't do anything?  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 The answer is no. We do track them, but  
2 it's more of a manual process that either  
3 allows the taxpayer to go ahead receiving an  
4 exemption that they shouldn't have till we  
5 catch it or us terminating an exemption.  
6 And that usually creates some anxiety with a  
7 taxpayer who says, how did you do this? I  
8 still have a few more years.

9 We catch it, but that's the only way we  
10 can do it right now.

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: And I guess -- let  
12 me just let you know where my concern is.  
13 And I know the CAMA will help to alleviate  
14 some of this. I think about the legislation  
15 that we helped to provide the enable of this  
16 authority for this Council to act. And  
17 Councilman Kenyatta Johnson and Councilman  
18 Squilla just worked extremely hard so that  
19 we could make some adjustments to benefit  
20 the community for that. We provided the  
21 enabled legislation for the Homestead  
22 advocated by all members here and then we  
23 had the abatement. Despite what people can  
24 personally think about it, it's been used as  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 an effective tool in some areas despite what  
2 you think.

3 And so, the issue becomes when you think  
4 about people who are eligible and how hard  
5 you fight to extend the eligibility  
6 guidelines, and then you say as a call I  
7 received, someone receiving Homestead and  
8 LOOP and abatement. They say, Cherelle, is  
9 that possible? And I couldn't answer the  
10 question.

11 MR. PIPER: Oh, right. For those I  
12 think we do have a pretty good auditing  
13 process in place. Those are fairly new  
14 programs, so there were some rules. And I  
15 think some of the rules have been modified a  
16 little bit to say you can pretty much have  
17 one or the other. So, I think we audit  
18 those on a regular basis.

19 What triggers an audit usually is a  
20 new -- a new deed, a new title owner. If  
21 you have -- if there is a property with  
22 Homestead and they apply for abatement, of  
23 course, we can always check that out. If  
24 they have an abatement on it currently and  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       they are looking to get a Homestead  
2       exemption, we can -- we can find that out.

3           COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Can you forward  
4       that information to the Chair for  
5       distribution so that we can just get a  
6       snapshot of those properties.

7           MR. PIPER: Sure.

8           COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: In addition to  
9       that, I want to go back to the staffing  
10      question that you talked about earlier,  
11      particularly as it related to the commercial  
12      assessments and training because this is  
13      extremely important for me, to have a  
14      challenge. I know there are some things I  
15      will agree the private sector does much more  
16      efficiently than the government does. But  
17      when we have the opportunity for  
18      professional growth and development and/or  
19      training, we can learn.

20           So with that being said, tell me how  
21      often do you remember have you -- do you  
22      work with the Civil Service Commission as it  
23      relates to any of the incoming courses or  
24      testing that's being offered? And in your  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       role as the chief assessment officer, are  
2       you what is something that is called a  
3       subject matter expert?

4           MR. PIPER: Depends on what the subject  
5       is. But sometimes, yes.

6           COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So if the Civil  
7       Services offering a test and it's for real  
8       property evaluator and/or management or  
9       supervisor in those tests, would Civil  
10      Service look to you as being a subject  
11      matter expert as the chief officer?

12          MR. PIPER: I think what Civil Service  
13      would do is say who would be a subject  
14      matter expert.

15          COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The question for  
16      me is, have you ever served in that  
17      capacity?

18          MR. PIPER: Yes.

19          COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: How recent would  
20      you say that have been like recently in  
21      terms? I am thinking about the number of  
22      people we are trying to bring in, in terms  
23      of testing.

24          MR. PIPER: I would say as recently as  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 couple years ago.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: A couple years  
3 ago, so '14? '15? '13? I just want to  
4 finish this line of questioning, Mr.  
5 President, and then I'll come back on the  
6 second round.

7 MR. PIPER: Some time, I think, during  
8 '15.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Sometime during  
10 '15, that's the last time, '15?

11 MR. PIPER: I think so.

12 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The last time you  
13 will remember. Okay. We are going to come  
14 back around. And I will see you during the  
15 next go around. I really want to get into  
16 the staffing of professional development and  
17 training component, and then quickly come  
18 back to multiple exemptions.

19 MR. PIPER: Okay.

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you very  
21 much for your patience.

22 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
23 Councilwoman.

24 Chair recognizes Councilman Johnson.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Thank you, Council  
2 President. I want to thank all of you for  
3 being here and providing your testimony.

4 Just a couple questions going back to  
5 your testimony regarding the second phase of  
6 the actual value initiative. Can you give  
7 me an overview on -- I know you talk about  
8 the coefficient of dispersion as a part of  
9 your testimony and how you are going about  
10 doing reassessments of various parcels of  
11 property throughout the area. My primary  
12 concern right now is residential properties  
13 specifically in gentrifying neighborhoods  
14 such as Point Breeze, Grays Ferry, Southwest  
15 Inner City, three key areas in which I  
16 represent. But also, I get calls from  
17 individuals who live in Girard Estate,  
18 Packer Park regarding the impacts of AVI.

19 And so when we talk about the second  
20 phase of AVI, I want to get an idea, one,  
21 first and foremost, how often we will be  
22 doing these assessments?

23 Two, can your office provide my office  
24 as well as the Chair a City-wide map of the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 assessments that have been taking place,  
2 one, for 2014 for us to take a look at and  
3 then most recently 2016? If you can map  
4 that data and provide it to us.

5 And then three, I want to get an idea of  
6 rapidly changing gentrifying neighborhoods,  
7 how often can my residents count on their  
8 properties to be reassessed moving forward?

9 MR. PIPER: I will try to answer the  
10 last part of that first, which is how often  
11 can folks expect reassessment, residential  
12 reassessment particularly in the 2nd  
13 Councilmanic District but also in other  
14 areas.

15 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Let me say that for  
16 the record. Not just the 2nd Councilmanic  
17 District, I am going to talk about the City  
18 of Philadelphia as a whole. Because also I  
19 know I have other colleagues specifically in  
20 the 1st Councilmanic District that borders  
21 the 2nd Councilmanic District and also the  
22 5th Councilmanic District are seeing rapid  
23 growth and development, probably more than  
24 any of the other districts.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. PIPER: You mentioned you said  
2 gentrifying, yeah. I'm sorry. The area  
3 that seems to be growing -- I know the term  
4 is gentrification sometimes.

5 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Rapid growth.

6 MR. PIPER: Rapid growth, right. The  
7 idea with AVI in the first place was to make  
8 sure that regular reassessments occur, so  
9 that we never get in the position we were  
10 for decades in which we didn't do much of  
11 anything other than put on values that  
12 reflect new construction. Every now and  
13 then we raised everyone 4 percent or 5  
14 percent or 7 percent and, you know, kind of  
15 did a fundraiser. All that did was  
16 exacerbate the inequities. We still weren't  
17 addressing the inaccuracies and uniformity  
18 issues.

19 Okay. So again, we are still committed  
20 to doing regular ongoing reassessments.

21 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Can you clarify for  
22 the record, what -- be more specific.  
23 What's regular? Every year? Every two  
24 years? Every three years.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 MR. PIPER: What do I mean -- let me  
2 clarify. But -- and I apologize if I'm not  
3 actually answering the question as to when  
4 like these particular areas might see  
5 reassessment notices.

6 What we do is we look at the entire City  
7 every year, okay?

8 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Every year you are  
9 doing a review of the whole City.

10 MR. PIPER: No. Well, we are looking at  
11 the entire City. And then we are looking at  
12 where we find that there are some -- some --  
13 some things that we think we should be doing  
14 a lot better and we prioritize that stuff.

15 So for instance, what we did last  
16 year -- I don't know if you remember -- but  
17 I did actually bring maps and some reports  
18 to District Council people to show what we  
19 were doing in the individual Council  
20 Districts and City-wide. We are actually  
21 prepared to that this year, also.

22 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Thank you.

23 MR. PIPER: So what we do is when we  
24 look at the City, however, we have to in  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 addition to trying to figure out where it is  
2 that we need to lower our coefficient of  
3 dispersion or address our mean ratio, we  
4 also look at what is the priority, what do  
5 we need to do right now because it's  
6 starting to lag behind. We look at the  
7 resources that we have.

8 And our reassessment project for each  
9 year is based on those things. So, I can't  
10 say that we're going to do a reassessment  
11 that's going to necessarily affect certain  
12 areas or even our residential properties  
13 every year. The idea is to do something  
14 every year so that we never have that  
15 disparity between, you know, the properties  
16 we reassessed recently and the ones that we  
17 haven't reassessed in five or ten years.

18 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Okay. And you're  
19 going to provide the map?

20 MR. PIPER: We will provide the maps  
21 that we provided when we did AVI. And then  
22 I can have the ones redone that we did last  
23 year. Like I said, we do have reports for  
24 everyone that shows what we did for this  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 year.

2 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: For 2016 for this  
3 year, do you have information either now or  
4 you can provide those particular areas that  
5 are rapidly developing and give me an idea  
6 of what the assessment is for those  
7 particular areas.

8 MR. PIPER: It -- so if I look at areas  
9 where the values have jumped substantially  
10 since we did AVI, we can look at that? And  
11 we can kind of, you know, maybe come to an  
12 understanding of what we mean by drastic  
13 increases in values versus this normal real  
14 estate goes up in value anyway type of  
15 valuing. We can do that.

16 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Thank you very  
17 much.

18 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
19 Councilman.

20 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Parker.

21 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,  
22 Mr. President. Let me sort of just  
23 quickly -- I want to go roundabout here to  
24 the beginning of my questioning. I want to  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 go to the number of appeals. Tell me if the  
2 number is accurate, Mr. Piper.

3 How many appeals do you --

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Councilwoman,  
5 can you hold.

6 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I know you got  
7 back around to me much quicker. You didn't  
8 get to Squilla. Listen, if you were trying  
9 to show some love today, Mr. President, I  
10 wasn't going to tell you, you were wrong.

11 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Councilwoman,  
12 I show love every day.

13 But we have what is called a technical  
14 difficulty. All right.

15 So now we going to call on Councilman  
16 Taubenberger.

17 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Mr. Council  
18 President, thank you. And I will note for  
19 the record that you do show love every day.

20 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you.

21 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: You're  
22 welcome. I do have a question in this  
23 regard.

24 We got from Mr. Brian Abernathy that  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 approximately \$300 million increase in  
2 revenue for this year is the fact that we  
3 are looking at approximately \$16 million for  
4 reassessing vacant land and \$15 million for  
5 commercial. Instead of saying it seems low,  
6 ask this.

7 How many vacants lots -- this is my real  
8 question. How many vacant lots are being  
9 reassessed and how many commercial lots?  
10 And are they being reassessed on the  
11 priority of ZIP code?

12 MR. PIPER: They are not being  
13 reassessed on the priority of ZIP codes. I  
14 can answer that. The vacant lots, there are  
15 about 30,000/35,000 that we're looking at  
16 the assessments on those. Those are  
17 included in this year's project, but that  
18 will not be included in what we send out to  
19 maps because we haven't actually finished  
20 those yet. That's a little bit more of an  
21 involved process. And to be honest with  
22 you, it's the first time we have done it in  
23 house, so we want to make sure we are doing  
24 it correctly.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1           The other question in terms of the  
2       commercial properties, again, because we are  
3       looking to do commercial reassessment next  
4       year, vacant lots that we consider having  
5       had commercial use or in commercial  
6       corridors, are not included in the projects.

7           COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: That would be  
8       potential commercial use, as well?

9           MR. PIPER: It would be potential  
10      commercial use or something that had a  
11      commercial -- it could even be a parking  
12      garage or parking lot that we coded vacant  
13      land but has that type of commercial use to  
14      it.

15          COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Do they have  
16      to be zoned commercial or in your criteria?

17          MR. PIPER: They have to be more than  
18      just zoned commercial, but yeah.

19          COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Okay.

20          MR. PIPER: So to answer your question,  
21      we kind of limited to scope to the vacant  
22      ground that the vacant land was related to a  
23      former residential use or is in a  
24      residential area. And the residual  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 residential properties where we look at the  
2 current allocation of land improvement and  
3 looked to see if that was something we  
4 needed to make an adjustment for.

5 COUNCILMAN TAUBENBERGER: Thank you very  
6 much. Mr. President, thank you.

7 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
8 Councilman.

9 Chair recognizes Councilman Squilla.

10 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,  
11 Mr. President.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: You're  
13 welcome.

14 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: And I want to  
15 reiterate some of my colleagues who said  
16 about the responsiveness from OPA when we  
17 call, and my office calls we have a lot of  
18 complaints -- not complaints, but concerns  
19 and issues. Always, somebody gets back to  
20 us. So that's very important and may not  
21 always be the answers we want, but at least  
22 there is a return, and that's what we want  
23 the most.

24 MR. PIPER: Thanks, Councilman. I think  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 we speak to someone in your office on a  
2 weekly basis.

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I think daily.

4 MR. PIPER: And it's a good  
5 relationship.

6 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: But just to  
7 reiterate the issues we had with the  
8 reassessments and understanding that the  
9 goal of reassessing every year or looking at  
10 the City every year, and I know I brought  
11 this up last year and the year before. Just  
12 with the resources we have, it's very  
13 difficult to do City-wide analysis every  
14 year now without the CAMA System, even when  
15 the CAMA System is in there. We know you  
16 have to drill down some of these properties  
17 to really get what the assessment is. We  
18 believe once we have it right the first  
19 time, then it will be easier to maintain.

20 Be we talked about a quarter of the City  
21 being done at a time to make sure that we  
22 can really get that, at least initially, to  
23 drill down in those areas to make sure we  
24 have all this right.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1           My question before, and it's still the  
2           same question, is this a policy decision to  
3           do the City every year? Or is it a  
4           legislative decision that you must do it  
5           every year.

6           MR. PIPER: Well, it's a commitment that  
7           we made when we initially rolled out AVI  
8           that we would do regular reassessments.  
9           Every year I kind of, you know, shy away  
10          from making the statement every year because  
11          that gives the impression that we're looking  
12          at all 579,000 parcels. And everyone is  
13          going to get some type of change or even  
14          most. And I don't think that's ever going  
15          to happen even once we have a CAMA.

16          But I think what we're going to do,  
17          however, is continue to look at the whole  
18          City every year. As I said, put our  
19          resources into what we think are inequities  
20          or poor measurements of performance.

21          COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: When a sale happens  
22          and we have a sale price and it's an ongoing  
23          sale, is that something that triggers a  
24          relook at an assessment, or do we just not  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 look at it at that time? Because it seems  
2 like we have properties that have currently  
3 sold for certain values, but yet the  
4 assessment stills remains either the same or  
5 changes a little but not reflecting the sale  
6 of the property.

7 MR. PIPER: In Pennsylvania, that's  
8 illegal. And so, the answer is no. We  
9 never look at one sale and make a change to  
10 either the subject property or other  
11 properties based on that one sale. In some  
12 states, it's the only time they reassess  
13 upon a sale. But most states do it the way  
14 Pennsylvania does it.

15 You can't look at the one sale, in other  
16 words, and form an opinion of value because  
17 that sale could have included even for  
18 residential properties, it could have  
19 included some conditions that you're not  
20 aware of at that time. So it wouldn't be --  
21 it might be accurate. And if you pay  
22 \$300,000 for your property and we have you  
23 assessed at \$300,000 and I paid 300,000 for  
24 mine and I'm next door to you and it's same  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 type of property and we're assessed at  
2 300,000, we're both accurate. Our  
3 assessments are accurate. But if the guy  
4 across the street paid 300,000 but he's been  
5 assessed at 100,000, it's not uniform. And  
6 us being accurate also means we are being  
7 aggrieved because we are not being treated  
8 fairly.

9 So, one sale doesn't trigger anything,  
10 no.

11 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right. So it  
12 doesn't even trigger the assessment on that  
13 property that's sold, correct?

14 MR. PIPER: Absolutely not.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right. Do you  
16 think that we as the City -- and I know you  
17 stated this. But to be able to look at the  
18 whole City with the number of resources that  
19 we have, we can actually be accurate on  
20 City-wide assessments every year?

21 MR. PIPER: I think the number of staff  
22 members we have, and I think in Philadelphia  
23 I believe the assessors, the residential  
24 assessors, the commercial assessors are some  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 of the best qualified and trained in the  
2 state. And I say that because even though  
3 we're not required by state law to  
4 necessarily be certified about -- I'm going  
5 to say, about 90 percent of us are. And  
6 some before they even step into the job.

7 Having said that, I think what's going  
8 to help those resources be able to do what  
9 we look to do every year, that is look at  
10 the entire City, I think the CAMA System is  
11 going to help that. It's going to involve  
12 some process modification that we change  
13 some of the way we do things. But I think  
14 with the resources, once we get staffed up  
15 to where we feel we need to be and a new  
16 CAMA System, I think we will be in a good  
17 position to be able to say we are looking at  
18 the entire City, but not necessarily have to  
19 plug holes and say we are going to do  
20 commercial one year and some residential  
21 another.

22 I think what we have been doing since  
23 AVI is tightening up all assessments  
24 City-wide. And I think once we have a CAMA  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 System and once we get staffed up, I think  
2 that's going to be a reachable goal.

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: But we're going to  
4 need people trained in that. It's going to  
5 take time to get that information into CAMA,  
6 right?

7 So all -- as we're doing all this, we're  
8 still have to supposedly look at the  
9 City-wide every year at the same time. So,  
10 you know, I just feel like if we can  
11 concentrate on a quarter of the City each  
12 time, we can really work on it. And then  
13 people would know every time they are going  
14 to be assessed every four years. You sort  
15 of get a feel, some assessments will go up,  
16 some will go down depending on the  
17 neighborhoods.

18 But some areas feel like they change  
19 every year, and other areas don't. And  
20 maybe it is because of the hot areas and  
21 neighborhoods that have higher value. It  
22 seems we will never be able to go through in  
23 a large City that we have to be able to come  
24 up with a plan to say everybody's

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 assessments are accurate. And AVI was  
2 supposed to get us close to that. And I  
3 think the intent is there, and it's still  
4 there.

5 But I just think as a City, we want to  
6 be as fair as possible to all the residents.  
7 And I think the only way to do that is to  
8 say we took our time in each specific area,  
9 and then we actually did the proper  
10 assessments in that area.

11 That was just a statement, but I will  
12 come back after the next round.

13 MR. PIPER: Thanks.

14 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you.

15 Chair recognizes Councilman Greenlee.

16 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Thank you,  
17 Mr. President again. Just one other thing I  
18 wanted to ask in my first go round here.

19 I know staffing and man power you -- we  
20 talked a lot about. I know -- I don't know  
21 if you still do it this way. Like one  
22 assessor had a ward, you know, handled a  
23 particular ward.

24 MR. PIPER: Right.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: But I know there's  
2 some areas, as we've been talking about  
3 there, have much more activity than others.

4 Do you readjust according to that  
5 activity or?

6 MR. PIPER: We do. You mean, do we  
7 reassign assessors based on the number of  
8 parcels or the amount of activity?

9 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Amount of  
10 activity, yeah.

11 MR. PIPER: Sure. Sure.

12 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: One person doesn't  
13 get sort of, like, overburdened in one where  
14 another might not have a lot of activity.

15 MR. PIPER: We are constantly adapting  
16 and reallocating resources, yeah.

17 COUNCILMAN GREENLEE: Great. That was  
18 my question. Thank you, sir.

19 MR. PIPER: Sure.

20 (Council President momentarily stepped away from  
21 Chair.)

22 THE CLERK: Thank you, Councilman  
23 Greenlee. And next is Councilman Johnson.

24 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: I'm going to defer  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 to the Madam Chair, they say, of great  
2 northwest.

3 THE CLERK: Okay. They say it's now  
4 Council lady Parker.

5 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you, very  
6 graciously. And thanks to my former state  
7 house colleague who I feel a special bond  
8 with in Councilman Johnson. Thank you so  
9 very much.

10 Let me quickly go back to the sort of  
11 properties with multiple exemptions. And I  
12 want to ask, are there any commercial  
13 properties that are receiving LOOP and/or  
14 Homestead Exemption, commercial properties?

15 MR. PIPER: Just a second. Let me see  
16 if I can find someone who can answer that  
17 question who is here now.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you.

19 MR. PIPER: Councilwoman Parker, I think  
20 we can find that information. In fact, I'm  
21 sure we can. But I don't think anyone can  
22 answer right this minute.

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: If you could, that  
24 would be extremely important. Because again  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1       when we're going out -- and just for the  
2       record, for the past ten years I have been  
3       having these annual town hall meetings and  
4       particularly during the time when we were  
5       working on these sort of instituting AVI,  
6       OPA was always -- BRT, OPA. You were there,  
7       we were doing, like, six or seven meetings  
8       back to back.

9           MR. PIPER: I think I just responded to  
10       one last night, yeah.

11          COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: For the 2016  
12       series, and they were always there. Even  
13       then, we will acknowledge that this is a  
14       question that comes up quite often. We  
15       really need to get an answer. Because  
16       people when they think of LOOP and when they  
17       think of Homestead, they're not thinking  
18       about commercial property.

19          MR. PIPER: Sure.

20          COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: They're thinking  
21       about residential homeowners. And I need to  
22       know who is benefitting.

23          MR. PIPER: I can say this. There are  
24       some properties that we categorize. It's a  
          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 relatively new category. We call mixed-use  
2 properties which do include some commercial  
3 use but may also include a partial or a  
4 Homestead Exemption because our  
5 understanding, our interpretation of the  
6 legislation allows if you are using the  
7 property for your primary residence, even  
8 though there is a portion that has  
9 commercial use, you are entitled to the  
10 exemption on that part of the property.

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So let me tell  
12 you, I want more. It will usually be  
13 residential on the top and a store front on  
14 the bottom. And they are fine. And those  
15 individuals, you know, should be  
16 receiving -- they should be able to access  
17 Homestead and LOOP and whatever else they're  
18 eligible for.

19 But I'm really interested in not mixed  
20 use but strict commercial properties  
21 receiving a LOOP and/or Homestead Exemption.

22 MR. PIPER: We'll find that out.

23 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Really like to  
24 get. Next, let me just follow up on the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 number of appeals. Just clarify the record  
2 for me. I have a note here as of February  
3 10, 2016, 772 appeals were pending for '14  
4 and 536 for FY15.

5 What is the status of these appeals?  
6 Not exactly sure where the data count or  
7 number comes from.

8 For the record, tell me how many appeals  
9 you have in the cue right now?

10 MR. PIPER: And many are still pending?

11 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Yes.

12 MR. PIPER: Right. That is probably one  
13 of the easiest pieces of information for me  
14 to find out. But I would kind of need to be  
15 able to query the database to do it.

16 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay. So, the  
17 appeals pending for '14 and for '15 and sort  
18 of what is the status.

19 MR. PIPER: Sure.

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Again, if you can  
21 forward that information to the Chair, I'll  
22 appreciate that.

23 MR. PIPER: No problem.

24 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Greatly appreciate  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       that.

2               Next. When we start talking about the  
3       City and how frequently it plans to reassess  
4       properties after you have instituted CAMA,  
5       will it then sort of move like clockwork and  
6       you expect it to be able to be done on an  
7       annual basis versus a biannual basis?  
8       And/or is some sort of legislative  
9       prescription required from Harrisburg?

10              Because, you know, the uniform -- some  
11       sort of uniformity -- obviously, we looked  
12       at it for some time when I was there. No  
13       longer there. But some uniformity  
14       associated with municipal appeals. Where  
15       are we with that?

16              MR. PIPER: You brought up the  
17       uniformity issue. The City of Philadelphia  
18       kind of gotten itself in a little bit of  
19       trouble a few years ago, I guess it was  
20       about four or five years ago when we had the  
21       CLR issue. It -- it -- you know, just  
22       abbreviate what the trouble was, from years  
23       of not doing assessments, decades really, we  
24       had gotten to the point where our uniformity  
              Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 was so bad, we were in danger. There was a  
2 class action lawsuit. We were in danger of  
3 perhaps having a court order us to do one.  
4 And the way it comes about like that is sort  
5 of a very organic process. In other words,  
6 if you are under-assessing, no one  
7 complains. Okay.

8 So no one is going to come say anything.  
9 You might on a good year have 2 or 3,000  
10 appeals. And that low number of appeals,  
11 however, did not indicate we were doing the  
12 right thing. It indicated that most people  
13 were happy. So, what we have committed to  
14 doing since AVI is regular ongoing  
15 assessments. I think a CAMA System is going  
16 to make the reassessment something -- I know  
17 Councilwoman Sanchez who said something last  
18 week. She used the term sticker shock  
19 which, you know, not to get out of my lane,  
20 that really is bad tax policy where you do  
21 something that causes a dramatic shift in  
22 the changes. And that's what we're trying  
23 to avoid.

24 What we look to do is regular  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 reoccurring reassessments. And it would  
2 look closer to something that you might want  
3 to call annual for the whole City.

4 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Okay.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
6 Councilwoman.

7 Chair recognizes Councilwoman Blackwell.

8 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you. I  
9 only have one little question.

10 Thank you, Mr. Piper, for what you do.

11 MR. PIPER: You're welcome,  
12 Councilwoman.

13 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: My staff says  
14 that people complain from your department  
15 and Revenue that they can't get receipts.  
16 Veterans, disabled folks, seniors come in  
17 for one reason or another, and they need  
18 receipts showing they have been in there.  
19 They have applied and they need proof they  
20 filled out the proper paperwork and when  
21 they apply for exemptions or whatever. But  
22 they say they having problems getting  
23 receipts.

24 MR. PIPER: Receipt like a photocopy of  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 something? You did?

2 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Yeah. Proof  
3 that they have been there, that they  
4 applied.

5 MR. PIPER: Well, is someone comes in  
6 and submits exemption application or an  
7 abatement application, first of all, the  
8 abatement application actually comes with  
9 its own copy. So when you submit it, you  
10 submit a copy to us. But I think if someone  
11 sends something or brings it in, delivers it  
12 in person, they are usually -- 90 percent of  
13 the time, they are coming to our customer  
14 service unit. If they ask for a copy, we  
15 give them a copy.

16 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: All right.  
17 Then I will get to you in detail because  
18 they complain to me all the time. But I  
19 will get more info to you then.

20 MR. PIPER: Sure.

21 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you.  
22 Thank you, Mr. President.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Clarify that  
24 a little more please for the Councilperson  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 and me. You say you don't give them a  
2 receipt?

3 MR. PIPER: Well, we don't charge for  
4 anything, so there is no receipt if that's  
5 what you mean like. For instance, when you  
6 go to Revenue, you pay for something and get  
7 a receipt. We don't have anything that we  
8 charge for.

9 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Revenue is not  
10 doing it either. Their people are  
11 complaining they can't get proof of their  
12 paperwork. They want to sell or want to do  
13 anything, they are stuck.

14 MR. PIPER: We don't have anything that  
15 we charge.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So, there is  
17 no proof of contact.

18 MR. PIPER: That's why I was referring  
19 to maybe a photocopy of something someone  
20 submitted.

21 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Something  
22 stamped.

23 MR. PIPER: Sure. We have a time stamp  
24 right in the front lobby. It's an easy  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 thing.

2 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: You can do  
3 that?

4 MR. PIPER: Sure. Sure.

5 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: There's  
6 people, you know, particularly older people  
7 like to have records and transactions.

8 MR. PIPER: I understand that.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: I know that  
10 now because I'm kind of getting there.

11 MR. PIPER: Sure.

12 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you.  
13 Thanks, Councilwoman.

14 COUNCILWOMAN BLACKWELL: Thank you.

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: So who's  
16 next. Councilman Johnson.

17 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Thank you,  
18 Mr. President.

19 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Welcome, sir.

20 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: I want to go back  
21 to the regular reassessments that are going  
22 to be taking place moving forward. I know  
23 you don't want to be tied down to say  
24 specifically year, every year we will be  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       doing assessments in particular areas, but  
2       you will be regularly looking at different  
3       parts of the City. And I'm looking at your  
4       testimony.

5           I want you to go back and clarify for me  
6       what would be the criteria?

7           MR. PIPER: For us to --

8           COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Why you do your  
9       regular reassessments. What are some of the  
10      red flags that go up and say, hey, you know  
11      what --

12          MR. PIPER: Okay.

13          COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: -- in this  
14      particular area we are going to go down  
15      there.

16          MR. PIPER: Good question.

17          COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: And do a  
18      reassessment.

19          MR. PIPER: I think I can answer that.

20          COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: And one more. And  
21      the other follow up is begin laying out the  
22      process of the land assessments that are  
23      going to be taking place moving forward.

24      When does that kick into place, or have we  
        Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 started already?

2 MR. PIPER: We have started.

3 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Okay.

4 MR. PIPER: As a matter of fact, we have  
5 completed probably more than half of the  
6 process. It's just that as we are going  
7 through it, we are looking at some of the  
8 values that were being produced by the  
9 mile -- I am actually going to ask our  
10 modeling director to come up and speak to it  
11 a little bit in terms of the process.

12 We were looking at some of the values.  
13 We weren't comfortable that they were  
14 defensible, and that's the bottom line. We  
15 might -- what we do at the end of the day,  
16 someone may appeal and say we have done it  
17 wrong. And the Board may agree or the  
18 courts may agree, but we need to be able to  
19 start off from a place where we think we can  
20 defend the value. So on some of the vacant  
21 land parcels, we were comfortable with the  
22 values. But again, we are not comfortable  
23 saying we think these were done right and  
24 these weren't done right.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1           So, you're going to -- you will see  
2           those notices probably, I'm going to say, by  
3           the end of June, beginning of July,  
4           something like that.

5           COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: So notices --  
6           notices haven't been going out yet?

7           MR. PIPER: Not on the vacant land  
8           parcels. But notices start going out this  
9           week and will continue throughout the rest  
10          of this week on the other reallocation.

11          COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Second phase of the  
12          real -- the second reassessment phase is  
13          what you're saying?

14          MR. PIPER: Yeah. Yeah.

15          COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Okay.

16          MR. PIPER: Did you need some further  
17          explanation in terms of --

18          COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Yeah. You can  
19          bring the modeling up person.

20          MR. PIPER: Sure.

21          MS. JOHNSON: Good afternoon.

22          COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Good afternoon.

23          MR. KEENE: I'm Kevin Keene. I'm the  
24          Master Appraisal Director. I've been pretty  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 much in charge of writing, doing the  
2 modeling for vacant land project.

3 So, in terms of the way that we are  
4 doing it for vacant land parcels, we are  
5 pretty much limiting ourselves to what we  
6 consider to be buildable parcels of  
7 residential land. For those, we are using a  
8 sales model, sales-based model.

9 And the reason why we are limiting  
10 ourselves to those parcels is when we look  
11 at vacant land, it tends to fall into one of  
12 four different classes. Each one those  
13 would have to be done using a different  
14 method because it's all different markets  
15 and what drives those values are different.

16 If you look at exempt land, there is not  
17 a whole lot of sales for Fairmount Park and  
18 other exempt pieces or pieces owned by  
19 exempt entities.

20 If you look at the small private side  
21 yards, and the unbuildable parcels that are  
22 in the middle of the block where something  
23 has been torn down, it's too small to build  
24 anything on. There's not really a market

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       for those. So we wouldn't -- it's very  
2       difficult to come up with a sales-based  
3       model to value those pieces.

4           Then again, the one we think we can do  
5       is these residential parcels where the  
6       players are local developers for the most  
7       part. And there are sales. We had almost  
8       4,000 sales we could use throughout the City  
9       to develop these models.

10          The fourth one is the -- well, you get  
11       these large parcels that are -- where if you  
12       can put a high rise on a piece if it's big  
13       enough to put a high rise on for a  
14       department building or apartment building,  
15       the value of the piece of land skyrockets.  
16       And we don't really have a lot of data to  
17       tell us about those. We would have to look  
18       at more regional-based data because those  
19       players tend to be multi-regional players.  
20       The person who is going to come in and take  
21       on a project like that is not somebody  
22       typically in the local market.

23          So given that those four different  
24       classes of land would each require a  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 completely different approach, we focus on  
2 the ones that we felt we could do a  
3 reasonable job on, which was the residential  
4 land.

5 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Are the same  
6 property assessors who did -- are the same  
7 property assessors who did the assessments  
8 for the residential properties under AVI and  
9 the second phase of AVI, are they going to  
10 be the same workers who are going to be out  
11 doing the land value assessments under those  
12 four particular categories you just gave us?

13 MR. KEENE: Well, those accounts --  
14 those accounts are typically assigned the  
15 same evaluator who have other residential  
16 and multi-family properties in the --  
17 essentially, our residential evaluation  
18 staff. They also have some of these -- a  
19 lot of these vacant lots. And we assign  
20 them to go and to look at all the sales for  
21 those properties. Back prior to starting  
22 the modeling process, we also ask them to  
23 look at the properties themselves, all the  
24 vacant land to determine is it in fact still  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 vacant land. A lot of it's been built out  
2 so that we can put the values on them.

3 So yes, it is the same evaluators that  
4 will be reviewing. But they are not  
5 actually determining the value. We are  
6 using multiplicative sales models to project  
7 values, which the staff is then going to go  
8 out and review one at a time to see if those  
9 values make sense.

10 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Okay. I will move  
11 onto the next round. But I did have the  
12 initial part of my question also, the first  
13 part, was just the regular reassessments of  
14 properties throughout the City of  
15 Philadelphia and then the criteria that OPA  
16 is going to use to say this year, we have  
17 done an overview of the City of  
18 Philadelphia. And in this particular  
19 neighborhood, we are going to do a  
20 reassessment.

21 MR. PIPER: Right. So in looking at  
22 what we need to address, for instance, this  
23 year we are going to address commercial, we  
24 are looking at everything. But we know that  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1       between 2014 when we did AVI, because we  
2       used data that was at that time recent to us  
3       but as old as maybe three years old, we know  
4       that the market has changed to the degree  
5       that we need to address the lag between --  
6       let me say this. And I know this is just  
7       not exactly in answer to your question.

8           But with commercial reassessments,  
9       residential reassessments, City-wide  
10      reassessments, the nature of reassessment is  
11      that it's based on a cyclical process, an  
12      annual cyclical process. So right off the  
13      bat, you know, no matter what kind of  
14      resources we have, we're going to be looking  
15      at data that's a little older than what you  
16      would call today data, but that's okay.  
17      Because it takes us a year to do everything  
18      we need to do.

19           We need to do what we're doing. We need  
20      to develop models. We need to verify sales  
21      before we can say these are good sales. I  
22      read them in the paper. Those numbers are  
23      important. We pay attention to them. We  
24      see the same information everyone else does.

          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

          (215) 504-4622

1 We have to make sure they are arms-length  
2 transactions. And then when we -- that's  
3 the first part of what we do. And then when  
4 we go through the annual cycle, we have to  
5 make sure that what we're doing is time to  
6 be able to issue notices by right around  
7 now. Right after the March 31 certification  
8 date.

9 So, it takes us kind of a year to do  
10 everything. The idea is once we have a  
11 CAMA, there will be less things that we'll  
12 have to do just every two or three years.  
13 But by nature, an assessment cycle is  
14 something that lags a little behind. One or  
15 two years behind the sales is considered  
16 tight assessments.

17 COUNCILMAN JOHNSON: Thank you very  
18 much.

19 THE CLERK: Thank you, Councilman  
20 Johnson. Chair recognizes Councilman Domb.

21 COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you. Couple  
22 other follow-up questions.

23 In the CAMA System, does that handle  
24 commercial properties?

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. PIPER: Does it handle commercial  
2 properties? Sure.

3 COUNCILMAN DOMB: It does. Okay. And I  
4 think one of the bigger issues I wanted to  
5 put a magnifying glass on is the sense of  
6 timing and time. Because when you look at  
7 this portfolio of \$134 billion, and we just  
8 had as I mention earlier, a 3 percent  
9 adjustment. That's 35 to 40 million per  
10 year. The land values which you're affixing  
11 now would be 15 or 20, whatever that number  
12 is going to be, a million per year. And  
13 commercial could be 50 to 100 million  
14 dollars per year.

15 Waiting, we are losing that revenue  
16 every year, which is a hundred million  
17 dollars a year. And so, whatever we can do  
18 to speed up the timing, we should try to  
19 help you do because it's extremely  
20 important. The waiting costs us over a  
21 hundred million dollars every year just in  
22 these categories.

23 Land will get done this year, which is  
24 great. But the residential and the  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 commercial, if there is something we can do  
2 to speed this up, we should try to do it.

3 MR. PIPER: I agree. Any  
4 recommendations we are certainly open to  
5 them. We have spoken about this. We  
6 absolutely would like to see it happen  
7 faster.

8 I think in all fairness to the vendor  
9 we're talking to and the project management  
10 consultant company we have worked with over  
11 the past couple of years, I think the aspect  
12 of time and having to get this done because  
13 it's something that we're sorely in need of  
14 is then one of the priorities. But you got  
15 to remember with Philadelphia as opposed to  
16 another big jurisdiction where they are  
17 getting a new CAMA System, we are getting a  
18 CAMA System. We have never had one before.  
19 This is the first time we are getting one.  
20 We are not just going from, you know,  
21 updating something.

22 And we realize that's going to be part  
23 of what we have to factor in, in terms of  
24 when it is that we think we can actually get  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       some use out of it. Because there's a lot  
2       of -- a lot that happens between signing a  
3       contract and actually being able to drive  
4       the car out of the showroom.

5           COUNCILMAN DOMB: Let me just say this.  
6       If there is something I can do to help,  
7       offer, sit in on meetings, whatever I can  
8       do, I am available and use me as a resource.

9           MR. PIPER: I appreciate it.

10          COUNCILMAN DOMB: Thank you.

11          MR. PIPER: Thank you.

12          COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Chair  
13       recognizes Councilman Squilla.

14          COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Thank you,  
15       Mr. President.

16          COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: You're  
17       welcome.

18          COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: On the number of  
19       employees, a lot of them are new and coming  
20       in. And I know the workload. I'm curious  
21       to see, we have certain areas obviously that  
22       are hot. Who decides on the workloads of  
23       certain, I guess, GMAs and how that work is  
24       being assimilated? Is there areas that  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 never change value? Is it done by Property?

2 Do you have a certain number of property?

3 Or do you put more people in the resources

4 that are heavy areas that are changing?

5 How does that work?

6 MR. PIPER: We certainly would assign  
7 more evaluators per parcel to more complex  
8 properties.

9 For instance, commercial properties, you  
10 wouldn't expect an evaluator to be  
11 responsible for as many commercial  
12 properties as you would residential. Even  
13 some of the institutionally-owned properties  
14 which don't get talked about as much, but  
15 they are also a big part of what we have in  
16 Philadelphia.

17 We have a lot of colleges and  
18 universities. That even though the majority  
19 of the assessment is exempt, there is quite  
20 a bit of taxable assessment on those  
21 parcels, and they're a little complex. They  
22 involve institutionally-owned properties  
23 that frankly have residential facility in  
24 there or commercial facility.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Or parking.

2 MR. PIPER: Right. There is -- or movie  
3 theater. I actually used to do some of that  
4 more complex stuff myself years ago. So, I  
5 know it's the type of thing that we have to  
6 assign the work based on the complexity of  
7 the problem but also we do look at the  
8 amount of inventory in a particular ward.

9 We have evaluators that have been with  
10 the department for as little as two or three  
11 years. Once we believe they have the level  
12 of expertise to be able to go into either a  
13 more complex area or a more complex type of  
14 property is something they can be assigned  
15 to, we make that adjustment. We try to make  
16 sure that the evaluators that have  
17 demonstrated the expertise and that they  
18 have a knack for this kind of stuff gets  
19 transferred to those areas.

20 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Yeah. Well, the  
21 reason why I'm asking that is because the  
22 number of people who are doing the  
23 assessments, some of them can't do 2,500  
24 assessments a year --

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1 MR. PIPER: Sure.

2 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: -- depending on the  
3 complicated issues that are associated with  
4 it. So the -- that makes me think that  
5 areas, certain areas, say an area like Queen  
6 Village and Point Breeze or some places  
7 really changing rapidly, seems like they  
8 would need a little more help in those areas  
9 compared to maybe say go northeast where the  
10 assessments aren't changing as much. Maybe  
11 that person can handle more parcels there  
12 and the workload could be different.

13 Because I -- just seems like if we have  
14 the same -- trying to put the same workload  
15 on people that actually work in areas that  
16 are a lot harder, those areas will not get  
17 the attention that is needed compared to the  
18 other areas. I didn't know if there was any  
19 formula you use to try to --

20 MR. PIPER: No. You are absolutely  
21 right. I think when I said that we strive  
22 for sort of a ratio of one employee per  
23 2,500 to 3,000 accounts, you know, there's a  
24 little bit more explanation for that. And  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1       again, that's just a sort of a basic  
2       estimate, an IAAO estimate, industry  
3       standard estimate for a large jurisdiction  
4       like Philadelphia.

5             But between the assessors and the  
6       clerical staff and the aides and the  
7       supervisors, and we include all of those in  
8       terms of who addresses residential and  
9       commercial, there is a lot of what we do  
10      that wouldn't be categorized as assessing  
11      residential properties or commercial.

12            For instance, I mentioned the  
13      institutionally owned ones and the  
14      governmental owned ones which, to a degree,  
15      to some degree they are not as in the  
16      spotlight because a lot of that is exempt or  
17      they're immune from taxation. But we still  
18      have to have the values right. But in  
19      addition to that, a lot of the folks that  
20      are also assessors and clerks or aides are  
21      responsible for other support positions such  
22      as consolidations and subdivisions and  
23      addressing. That's a specialty unit that is  
24      used to interacting with other City agencies  
       Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 and external entities, so we assign that to  
2 one division.

3 We have a division that's assigned the  
4 responsibility of quality control. So when  
5 transfers take place from, say, exempt  
6 entities to taxable entities, for instance,  
7 we catch that. Put them back on the taxable  
8 roles. They address catastrophic loss  
9 applications when folks need to have their  
10 assessment temporarily reduced because of  
11 that.

12 We have another unit, again staffed with  
13 supervisors, evaluators and clerks, that  
14 address the appeal functions on the OPA side  
15 and the abatements. Our qual -- our  
16 customer service unit is actually staffed  
17 with assessors.

18 So, I guess what I'm saying is a lot of  
19 the folks that work for us work in very  
20 specialty units that don't necessarily  
21 reflect sort of, you know, how many  
22 residential or how many commercial  
23 properties we have. And -- but you're  
24 right, though. What we do is we try to make  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       sure that the areas that have the largest  
2       amount of properties or the most activities  
3       or the most growth like Council --  
4       Councilman Johnson referred to, we have  
5       people who we believe have the best  
6       expertise assigned to those.

7           COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right. And  
8       lastly, I know we spoke about this before.  
9       But it seems like when we have residential  
10      and then we have apartments or mixed-use  
11      development on the same block, it seems like  
12      the mixed use duplex or triplexes are, for  
13      some reason, assessed less. I think it was  
14      because income-based assessment compared to  
15      there. But when they sell, they sell for  
16      more.

17           So my -- I'm trying to understand the  
18      reasoning behind that. And what -- why  
19      would the duplexes assess for less than a  
20      single family home in the same area?

21           MR. PIPER: In some multi-family areas,  
22      you see apartments in which there's some  
23      type of an agreement in which the owner of  
24      the property agrees -- there's a rent  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 restriction in which there is some subsidies  
2 involved. And there is --

3 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Say there is no  
4 subsidies where it's just regular rent,  
5 regular market rate.

6 MR. PIPER: But the problem is, the ones  
7 you are referring to, lots of time we have  
8 to -- we get that information because what  
9 the taxpayer, the owner who comes in and  
10 says is, is these need to be assessed  
11 differently then the way you assess anything  
12 else. And they show us the rent  
13 restrictions and everything else.

14 So, we have to adhere to that.

15 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: I agree with that.  
16 I mean, but say it's just a corner property  
17 or a property in the middle block that's  
18 converted from single family to a duplex.  
19 And now it's assessed less because it's a  
20 duplex. What is the reasoning behind it? I  
21 just -- when that property actually sells  
22 for more money when they put it on the  
23 market.

24 MR. PIPER: I agree it seems  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1 counterintuitive. But I think we have to  
2 look at that on an individual basis and  
3 figure does it have something to do -- in  
4 some neighborhoods, believe it or not, a  
5 duplex may not sell for as high as what a  
6 single family property sells for. But we  
7 would have to look at that.

8 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: It's an income  
9 producing property. So I mean, it just --  
10 it seems counterproductive and --

11 MR. PIPER: It does.

12 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Also showed when  
13 you look at the sales throughout, that the  
14 sales are actually more than a single family  
15 home. You know, I know you don't go by  
16 sales numbers. But I think -- we need to  
17 look at that as a general. If you look at  
18 all the duplexes throughout the City  
19 compared to the single family homes, they  
20 are assessed a lot less than the single  
21 family.

22 MR. PIPER: We look at sales. We just  
23 don't look at one, like I was saying.

24 COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: Right.  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1           MR. PIPER: We look at sales. If sales  
2           in an area kind of indicate maybe -- I think  
3           what you're saying is you see it where the  
4           sales indicate something counter to what we  
5           have assessed to that. In that instance, I  
6           think we need to look at it.

7           COUNCILMAN SQUILLA: All right. Thank  
8           you.

9           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Chair  
10          recognizes Councilwoman Parker.

11          COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you,  
12          Mr. President.

13          And quickly just wanted to say that  
14          Councilman Domb, he just stepped out. But  
15          he had brought a document up online for me.  
16          And we'll go back and check it.

17          Remember my question earlier was just  
18          about commercial properties, right, that  
19          were receiving sort of Homestead and/or  
20          LOOP. And now we just saw a list that  
21          industrial properties were receiving a  
22          Homestead Exemption. Industrial properties.  
23          So when you send back your response to the  
24          Chair, I think it was printed in  
                Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       October 2015 where you document the  
2       categorize properties and then the number.  
3       But you'll have to tell me what -- what  
4       constitute an industrial property being  
5       eligible to receive a Homestead Exemption.

6           MR. PIPER: Again, we'll find out, you  
7       know, which ones do. But I think some of it  
8       may have to do with how we've coded the  
9       property. We may have --

10          COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Right. When you  
11       go back and forward that information to us.

12          You just brought up your -- the person  
13       responsible for modeling. And so, they gave  
14       us summary regarding land and then you use  
15       some modeling for residential areas.

16          MR. PIPER: Right.

17          COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Do we use modeling  
18       for commercial properties, also?

19          MR. PIPER: To some degree but not as  
20       much. We are more looking at other  
21       information that we're relying on. For  
22       instance, from property owners. We're  
23       relying on trying to figure out what's the  
24       best cap rate to use.

          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

          (215) 504-4622

1 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So just help me  
2 because you see, when you do it, this is  
3 what you do. Walk me through it and tell me  
4 how modeling work and is assist you from a  
5 land perspective and also a residential, but  
6 really don't use it as often with  
7 commercial.

8 MR. PIPER: With commercial, right.

9 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Just help me.  
10 Tell me why? Justify that for me?

11 MR. PIPER: Well with commercial, you  
12 have a lot of variation and property types.  
13 It really just comes down to that. Where  
14 with residential and vacant land, you have a  
15 lot of similarity in property types. So,  
16 you can model using certain coefficients  
17 based on the attributes that they share.  
18 With commercial property, you have a lot of  
19 variation. It really comes down to that.

20 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: So when -- in a  
21 highly dense row home area, you know, like  
22 my block, the modeling system works. But  
23 when you go to just, let's say, the  
24 commercial corridor along Vernon or either  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 along Wadsworth Avenue, you are saying  
2 because of the variations in the styles or  
3 types of businesses along the corridor?

4 MR. PIPER: For commercial properties,  
5 yeah. Commercial properties along the  
6 corridor, right.

7 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Now see, that's  
8 really interesting. Because I would dare  
9 say that variation amongst commercial  
10 buildings on commercial corridors varies  
11 according to your neighborhood.

12 MR. PIPER: That's true.

13 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: The swankier the  
14 commercial corridor is in your district  
15 where it has original architect, very good  
16 brick, it may be difficult to use modeling  
17 in that area. But when you come in  
18 neighbors where we have commercial corridors  
19 that are struggling and many of the  
20 businesses, the commercial businesses look  
21 exactly the same, the modeling would, in  
22 essence, be effective there.

23 MR. PIPER: That's true. I guess the  
24 other thing I should say is with residential  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 property, you tend to have a lot more sales  
2 on an annual basis than you do with  
3 commercial properties. So even looking  
4 at -- forgot the modeling for a minute.

5 Even looking at the difference between  
6 the properties where the commercial  
7 property, you're not likely to rely as  
8 strictly on sales information because you  
9 don't have as many sales on an annual basis.  
10 You are not relying on strictly on one  
11 approach to valuation, I should say. You  
12 are relying on commercial property, an  
13 estimate of a future income stream being  
14 capitalized into some opinion of value.

15 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: And finally, I  
16 know I don't have that much time left, but I  
17 really want you to on the record for me tell  
18 me about professional development available  
19 internally for OPA assessors, particularly  
20 when they look in the eye these commercial  
21 assessors from the private sector. These  
22 mean and lean assessors come and do it  
23 extremely well, and some of them may have  
24 special training.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1           When we have had in the past access to  
2           opportunity to contract out with commercial  
3           assessors within the department, have we  
4           ensured that that knowledge coming from the  
5           private sector has been transferred to our  
6           employees internally through some sort of  
7           professional development?

8           For me, I wouldn't think we were  
9           maximizing efficient use of the resource of  
10          contracting with the private sector employee  
11          if when the contract was over and they left,  
12          all of the intellectual property left with  
13          them, right, when it ran out. I want to  
14          figure out what are we doing to make sure  
15          that they're leaving some of that  
16          intellectual property behind for our  
17          workforce.

18          MR. PIPER: Two things. In terms of the  
19          professional development that our staff gets  
20          on a regular basis, about ten years ago  
21          we --

22          COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I'm sorry,  
23          Mr. Piper. I apologize for interrupting.  
24          I'm really talking about since we have  
                Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 worked on AVI. To me, there is revolution  
2 in what you have had to do with moving  
3 forward with AVI.

4 I'm really talking about as, you know,  
5 all of the coverage regarding our challenges  
6 with the -- you know, assessments on the  
7 commercial side. So, I guess I'm really  
8 talking about within the past four to five  
9 years. All the other Councilmembers, most  
10 of them have been here. This is new for me.

11 MR. PIPER: I would say this. The folks  
12 that work for us now, the assessors are --  
13 I'd say 90 percent, maybe more, have the  
14 same certification that is required the rest  
15 of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, which  
16 is you have to have an assessor's license  
17 just like an appraiser's license to appraise  
18 general real estate for bank. You have to  
19 have -- it's not the exact same license.  
20 Ours is called the Certified Pennsylvania  
21 Evaluators License.

22 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I guess, Mr.  
23 Piper, my time is gone. I see the President  
24 blinking my time is coming up. I want to  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 leave you with this. This is the spirit and  
2 the tone of my line of questioning with  
3 regards to this.

4 We have heard it consistently stated  
5 that the level of professionalism,  
6 educational attainment and the experience  
7 within the private sector for the commercial  
8 assessors have been a challenge for the City  
9 of Philadelphia during the appeals process.  
10 And we have over the years contracted out to  
11 bring in private sector knowledge to help us  
12 with our commercial assessment process.

13 MR. PIPER: Sure.

14 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I am only saying  
15 to you as our chief officer that when we  
16 contract out and there are opportunities to  
17 do so, I just didn't go through the numbers  
18 like here, okay. When we contract out to  
19 bring that outside talent from the private  
20 sector within our department, we should  
21 never allow the contract to run out without  
22 having formalized a way that that individual  
23 can leave that intellectual property with  
24 our employees here.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 MR. PIPER: I agree.

2 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: I am hoping --  
3 maybe we will do a recall. And when we come  
4 back, hopefully, you will have given some  
5 thought. Maybe we will have found a way to  
6 institutionalize it. It's like running an  
7 office and one person, you know, only knows  
8 how to sharpen the pencils. That kind of  
9 thinking just, you know, just bothers me.  
10 If that person is absent, someone else needs  
11 to know how to sharpen the pencils.

12 MR. PIPER: And this is a good time for  
13 us to be talking about that. As I said, we  
14 are looking to bring in outside consultants.  
15 And your point, to be able to make, I guess,  
16 get the most out of our money going forward  
17 even with the contract is about -- we agree.

18 COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Usually, you know,  
19 there are silos. The outside contractors,  
20 they are over here. The internal sort of  
21 our workers, they are there. If we are  
22 managing using the collaborative style, we  
23 will assure that one is not at odds with the  
24 other. And we are finding a way to make  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1       sure that knowledge is being exchanged.

2           MR. PIPER: We agree.

3           COUNCILWOMAN PARKER: Thank you.

4           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you,  
5       Councilwoman. Just one, two quick  
6       questions.

7           Supposed to ask this question 12th and  
8       Lehigh. I think that's in the GMA or G341,  
9       and somehow it must be a relatively large  
10      one that they are using comps at 12th and  
11      Girard. And the taxes, the residential  
12      taxes at 12th and Lehigh have gone up  
13      significantly for the last couple of years.  
14      There is literally no new construction  
15      activity whatsoever up in that area, but  
16      their taxes keep going. And when we  
17      inquired, they said they are doing comps at  
18      12th and Girard.

19           As you know, 12th and Girard is, you  
20      know, an area York Town, you know.

21           MR. PIPER: Sure.

22           COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Popular area  
23      where there is stuff. Can you please check  
24      that because there is no way in the world  
            Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

1 the taxes should be going up at 12th and  
2 Lehigh.

3 MR. PIPER: We can check that.

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Please. And  
5 the last question is U&O. I am asking a  
6 question that I assume hasn't been.

7 Has there been given any thought to --  
8 U&O is essentially self reporting.

9 MR. PIPER: Right.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Has there  
11 been any thought given to us essentially  
12 doing the assessment and, thereby, the tax  
13 bill based on the square footage of the  
14 space. And then the responsibility to  
15 the -- to notify or to approve that the  
16 property is not being utilized would be on  
17 the property owner versus the other way  
18 around where the property owner basically  
19 tells us, I am only using half of the space  
20 and we accept that and we implement that tax  
21 based on that?

22 MR. PIPER: It sounds like what you are  
23 asking is sort of a policy question. I have  
24 to admit, I don't know because we don't  
Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622



1 really deal with U&O. I know we deal with  
2 what kind of in directly affects the U&O.  
3 But as a policy, I don't know.

4 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: That would be  
5 the Mayor's Office or the Finance Director.

6 MR. PIPER: I'm sorry. I am going to  
7 bring Mr. Dubow up for a second.

8 Could you repeat that, please.

9 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Just question  
10 about U&O, we talked about probably before.  
11 The issue with respects to U&O and its  
12 implication and its collection is  
13 self-reporting.

14 MR. DUBOW: Correct.

15 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: And the  
16 question is, has there been thought about  
17 taxing or assessing and thereby taxing the  
18 property owner based on the space, the  
19 square footage; and then there would be the  
20 responsibility of that property owner to  
21 indicate what space is being used as opposed  
22 to the other way around?

23 MR. DUBOW: In other words, assuming a  
24 hundred percent usage.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
(215) 504-4622

1 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Right.

2 MR. DUBOW: We did talk about that a  
3 couple years ago. I need to go back to  
4 Revenue, because we talked about it. And we  
5 came out not changing it. I have to  
6 remember why. Let me talk to them about it  
7 and get back to you before they come back.

8 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yeah.

9 MR. DUBOW: I understand the question.

10 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: People you  
11 asked me to -- I wish somebody at the IRS  
12 asked me to self-report my revenue. I would  
13 make out pretty good.

14 MR. DUBOW: I'm not going to comment on  
15 that.

16 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Okay. Thank  
17 you. Thank you very much. Thank you,  
18 gentleman. You don't want to leave?

19 MR. PIPER: I'm sorry. We done?

20 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Yes.

21 MR. PIPER: Thank you, Council  
22 President.

23 COUNCIL PRESIDENT CLARKE: Thank you so  
24 much for your testimony.

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 287

1           Thank you very much. There being none,  
2           the Committee will stand in recess until  
3           Tuesday, April 12, 2016, 10:00 a.m. At  
4           which time we will reconvene in Room 400  
5           City Hall. Thank you all very much.

6           (Public Hearing adjourned at 4:13 p.m.)

7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
          Strehlow & Associates, Inc.  
          (215) 504-4622

STREHLOW & ASSOCIATES, INC.  
(215) 504-4622

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, hereby certify that the  
proceedings and evidence noted are  
contained fully and accurately in the  
stenographic notes taken by me in the  
foregoing matter, and that this is a  
correct transcript of the same.

-----  
ANGELA M. KING, RPR  
Court Reporter - Notary Public

(The foregoing certification of  
this transcript does not apply to any  
reproduction of the same by any means,  
unless under the direct control and/or  
supervision of the certifying reporter.)

Strehlow & Associates, Inc.

(215) 504-4622

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 1

<b>A</b>	267:12	238:21	<b>added</b> 34:6	272:14	<b>Administra...</b>	104:13	<b>aligned</b> 26:10
<b>a.m</b> 1:6	282:15	239:2,3,6	168:15	<b>adjourned</b>	175:11	<b>aggrieved</b>	<b>Allan</b> 1:10
182:12	<b>absent</b>	239:19	<b>adding</b> 66:13	287:6	<b>admit</b> 284:24	239:7	136:19
287:3	282:10	242:1	66:14	<b>adjust</b> 53:14	<b>adopt</b> 2:10,12	<b>ago</b> 43:14	140:17
<b>abated</b>	<b>absolutely</b>	<b>accurately</b>	<b>addition</b>	135:14	<b>adopting</b> 2:14	130:10	215:20,21
183:24	64:4 70:14	288:5	114:4	193:5	<b>advantage</b>	152:3,4	215:23
<b>abatement</b>	105:19	<b>achievement</b>	164:18	<b>adjusted</b>	141:14	155:8 196:7	<b>Allen</b> 216:1
176:4	239:14	57:23	165:4 182:4	183:15	<b>advantages</b>	208:4 225:1	<b>alleviate</b>
181:21	264:6	<b>acknowledge</b>	223:8 230:1	<b>adjuster</b>	31:17	225:3	133:13
219:14	268:20	245:13	269:19	97:21	<b>advertisem...</b>	248:19,20	221:13
220:3	<b>abuse</b> 58:22	<b>acknowledg...</b>	<b>additional</b>	<b>adjustment</b>	10:5	267:4	<b>allocated</b>
221:23	<b>accept</b> 84:6	30:4	16:23 40:12	192:1 235:4	<b>advertising</b>	279:20	44:2
222:8,22,24	132:19	<b>acquire</b>	55:17 114:5	263:9	9:20 10:1	286:3	<b>allocation</b>
251:7,8	284:20	208:13,17	125:2 127:3	267:15	<b>advertize</b>	<b>agree</b> 50:9	87:10 184:3
<b>abatements</b>	<b>access</b> 60:8	<b>acquiring</b>	135:12	<b>adjustments</b>	10:6	89:15 90:20	235:2
43:16	60:23 63:14	185:22	140:22	54:18 104:2	<b>advice</b> 85:16	117:20	<b>allocations</b>
270:15	64:1 127:14	<b>act</b> 140:21	142:5	221:19	216:2	133:16	43:22
<b>abbreviate</b>	128:9	157:12	144:21	<b>administeri...</b>	<b>advising</b> 48:5	191:4	<b>allotment</b>
248:22	137:17,21	221:16	146:23	176:3	<b>advocacy</b>	208:10	45:13
<b>Abernathy</b>	137:24	<b>action</b> 99:21	147:2 148:7	<b>administrate</b>	53:13,16	223:15	<b>allow</b> 46:3
232:24	179:16	249:2	152:11	31:19 32:1	<b>advocated</b>	255:17,18	62:24 180:5
<b>aberration</b>	182:9	<b>actions</b>	153:16	<b>administrat...</b>	221:22	264:3	184:5 186:5
169:22	246:16	124:11	161:22,24	3:20 25:18	<b>Affairs</b> 60:7	272:15,24	188:15
<b>ability</b> 12:21	279:1	<b>actively</b> 97:19	164:16,17	34:22 35:20	<b>affect</b> 230:11	282:1,17	219:16
14:23 43:19	<b>accomplish</b>	<b>activities</b> 4:21	180:13	37:18 38:15	<b>affixing</b>	283:2	281:21
61:16 77:10	152:12	271:2	189:5	41:2 42:3,4	263:10	<b>agreed</b>	<b>allowed</b> 81:10
105:1	<b>accomplish...</b>	<b>activity</b> 83:21	201:16	42:16 46:24	<b>afford</b> 216:1	199:10	121:6
168:14	180:16	243:3,5,8	<b>Additionally</b>	47:6 48:7	<b>African-A...</b>	200:1	<b>allows</b> 93:18
173:6,8	<b>accountant</b>	243:10,14	175:23	55:8,23	7:20,24	<b>agreement</b>	179:10
174:5	161:22	283:15	178:10	56:20 57:19	44:1 72:21	3:2 101:1	221:3 246:6
180:14	<b>accounting</b>	<b>actual</b> 72:13	181:10	58:7 90:1	<b>afternoon</b>	107:16	<b>alternatives</b>
<b>able</b> 15:4,15	4:17,21	157:11	185:10,21	112:13,14	97:7,8	149:9	91:21
22:22 51:16	<b>accounts</b>	159:24	<b>address</b> 12:16	112:14,16	136:16	187:15	<b>altogether</b>
51:20 53:9	170:5,10	169:15	45:23	115:2 127:1	160:22,23	189:4	189:6
60:6 69:3	171:15,18	177:9	131:14	127:2	160:24	271:23	<b>amount</b> 25:24
70:24 95:17	259:13,14	180:18	230:3	140:14	161:7	<b>agreements</b>	27:16 38:7
97:1 99:22	268:23	182:17	260:22,23	149:24	162:10	100:4	38:8 41:15
103:3,9	<b>accuracy</b>	200:13	261:5 270:8	152:9,15	175:2,3	202:18	68:3 89:24
106:6 128:9	176:24	226:6	270:14	153:20	186:11	205:11	92:11
128:16	183:2	<b>actuary</b>	<b>addressed</b>	155:14	201:22,23	<b>agrees</b> 271:24	121:18
132:9,19	184:14	126:6	141:12	156:12	209:22	<b>ahead</b> 68:16	122:15,17
194:16	185:17	<b>adamant</b>	<b>addresses</b>	<b>Administra...</b>	217:23	91:17 93:16	124:16
199:19,24	<b>accurate</b>	193:22	132:7,8	50:2	218:1	196:1 221:3	168:19,21
201:14	167:1,2	194:3	175:24	<b>Administra...</b>	256:21,22	<b>aides</b> 269:6	179:12
219:7	190:17,20	<b>Adams</b> 61:1,1	269:8	150:1	<b>agencies</b> 23:9	269:20	186:22,24
239:17	192:10,17	61:14 62:10	<b>addressing</b>	<b>administrat...</b>	65:11 71:12	<b>ain't</b> 78:16	187:13
240:8,17	194:12	64:2	45:1,14,18	5:15,22	129:22	84:22,23	188:11
241:22,23	195:1,2	<b>adapting</b>	130:23,24	172:13	162:7	<b>Al</b> 1:16	189:20
246:16	196:9	243:15	131:4 132:6	175:12	269:24	202:22	190:5 220:6
247:15	199:18	<b>add</b> 24:7	179:22	<b>administrat...</b>	<b>agency</b> 162:3	<b>alcoholic</b>	243:8,9
248:6	210:5	31:22	228:17	133:12	<b>aggregate</b>	37:22	267:8 271:2
255:18	220:17	110:15	269:23	<b>Administra...</b>	56:8,23	<b>Aldinger</b>	<b>amounts</b>
262:6 265:3	232:2	144:21	<b>adhere</b>	175:14	<b>aggregated</b>	175:17	169:4,5

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 2

<b>analyses</b> 128:19	142:9 156:17	<b>apartment</b> 176:8	<b>appellant</b> 187:16	202:1,4 210:3	228:2 234:24	119:16 143:8 165:4	269:10 285:17
<b>analysis</b> 8:16 9:12 38:7 43:2,6,17 45:1,14 60:23 61:3 61:6 62:21 63:9 64:4 66:14 80:4 104:8,20 116:17 126:7 131:4 143:8 175:15 180:7 236:13	162:9 163:8 168:5 172:16 173:2 182:7 186:12 194:21 195:6 196:17 214:16 219:11 221:1 222:9 227:9 233:14 234:20 238:8 244:16,22 245:15 254:19 261:7	184:22 214:10 220:1 258:14 <b>apartments</b> 271:10,22 <b>apologize</b> 96:16 120:7 229:2 279:23 <b>apparent</b> 219:18 <b>apparently</b> 52:16 53:15 <b>appeal</b> 67:9 176:2,16 179:14 184:7 188:9 188:12 189:23 190:1,23 191:12,22 204:12,13 205:14,22 206:3,7 255:16 270:14 <b>appealing</b> 193:6 <b>appeals</b> 23:6 67:10,15,21 158:12,16 158:18 159:1,2,5 179:6,8,9 179:17,20 179:23 187:1,9,12 187:17 193:24 202:10,19 203:11,22 207:19 232:1,3 247:1,3,5,8 247:17 248:14 249:10,10 281:9 <b>appears</b> 174:13	189:24 191:21 194:14 200:20 <b>appellants</b> 194:17 <b>apples</b> 7:11 7:11,11 78:14,15 <b>application</b> 181:7,23 182:6 251:6 251:7,8 <b>applications</b> 270:9 <b>applied</b> 250:19 251:4 <b>apply</b> 222:22 250:21 288:16 <b>applying</b> 176:2 <b>appraisal</b> 98:9 175:14 177:23 180:3,6 196:12,19 196:23 206:6 207:16 256:24 <b>appraisals</b> 159:24 <b>appraise</b> 196:22 280:17 <b>appraisers</b> 212:8,9 213:1,9 <b>appraising</b> 196:20 <b>appraisor</b> 199:17 213:11 <b>appraisor's</b> 280:17 <b>appreciate</b> 25:10 74:3 74:6 122:7 142:7,10	215:12,17 216:3,6 217:13 247:22,24 265:9 <b>appreciated</b> 136:18 <b>approach</b> 11:5 26:16 160:20 174:24 259:1 278:11 <b>approaches</b> 4:1 102:9 <b>appropriate</b> 38:8 105:5 183:14 185:9,19 <b>appropriat...</b> 16:17 162:14 <b>approval</b> 2:17 181:24 <b>approve</b> 145:1 284:15 <b>approved</b> 3:4 <b>approving</b> 176:22 <b>approximate</b> 204:6 220:12 <b>approximat...</b> 147:21 162:24 163:3,5 168:6 176:5 183:20 217:2 233:1 233:3 <b>April</b> 1:6 100:8 287:3 <b>architect</b> 277:15 <b>area</b> 184:13 191:17 211:4 212:23 214:22 226:11	242:8,10 254:14 267:13 268:5 271:20 274:2 276:21 277:17 283:15,20 283:22 <b>areas</b> 156:15 222:1 226:15 227:14 229:4 230:12 231:4,7,8 236:23 241:18,19 241:20 243:2 254:1 265:21,24 266:4 267:19 268:5,5,8 268:15,16 268:18 271:1,21 275:15 <b>arising</b> 57:12 <b>Arizona</b> 85:6 85:11 <b>arms-length</b> 176:21 262:1 <b>Aros</b> 175:10 <b>article</b> 78:3 <b>articulate</b> 55:24 <b>artificial</b> 93:17 <b>Asian</b> 7:21 8:2 <b>aside</b> 67:14 <b>asked</b> 20:20 26:11 43:16 44:9 48:6 53:21 83:12 106:4,5 107:17 110:9,20,21	215:22 220:23 286:11,12 <b>asking</b> 6:21 7:5 8:23 19:23 89:6 92:20 106:2 111:4 113:20,24 114:3 118:1 121:8,20 127:8 218:3 219:4 267:21 284:5,23 <b>asks</b> 131:4 <b>aspect</b> 264:11 <b>assembling</b> 130:6 <b>Assembly</b> 140:12 <b>asserted</b> 190:7 <b>asserting</b> 188:19 <b>assertions</b> 179:11 <b>asserts</b> 190:8 193:13 <b>assess</b> 60:8 131:23 183:24 184:1 200:9 219:5 271:19 272:11 <b>assessed</b> 67:12 215:3 238:23 239:1,5 241:14 271:13 272:10,19 273:20 274:5 <b>assesses</b> 178:1 <b>assessing</b> 62:9 199:21 204:17	44:20 159:13 174:17,23 175:6,7,9 176:22,23 177:17 178:18,20 178:21 179:11,13 180:10,22 181:18 183:3,21 184:5,9,10 185:18 186:4 187:8 188:4,7 191:2 192:10 194:12 197:5,7,14 197:16 198:9 199:10,12 209:12 224:1 231:6 236:17 237:24 238:4 239:12 262:13 266:19,20 270:10 271:14 281:12 284:12 <b>assessments</b> 66:24 130:7 158:20 159:23 181:15 182:16 184:12,21 186:7 187:4 190:14,17 191:11 195:1,23 196:9 207:17 218:21 223:12

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 3

226:22	<b>assisting</b>	95:24 96:24	150:24	203:24	256:24	205:1	190:22
227:1	128:20	97:24 98:24	151:24	204:24	257:24	<b>assurance</b>	218:8
233:16	<b>associated</b>	99:24	152:24	205:24	258:24	47:1	<b>available</b>
239:3,20	248:14	100:24	153:24	206:24	259:24	<b>assure</b> 282:23	59:20 60:2
240:23	268:3	101:24	154:24	207:24	260:24	<b>assured</b> 35:4	91:14 182:5
241:15	<b>Associates</b>	102:24	155:24	208:24	261:24	46:20 48:10	265:8
242:1,10	1:23 2:24	103:24	156:24	209:24	262:24	<b>assures</b> 90:16	278:18
248:23	3:24 4:24	104:24	157:24	210:24	263:24	<b>Atlanta</b> 41:10	<b>Avenue</b> 277:1
249:15	5:24 6:24	105:24	158:24	211:24	264:24	<b>attached</b> 46:8	<b>average</b>
254:1,22	7:24 8:24	106:24	159:24	212:24	265:24	<b>attainment</b>	20:23 83:14
259:7,11	9:24 10:24	107:24	160:24	213:24	266:24	41:6,12	88:5,11,16
262:16	11:24 12:24	108:24	161:24	214:24	267:24	42:5 281:6	164:13
267:23,24	13:24 14:24	109:24	162:24	215:24	268:24	<b>attempt</b>	165:5,6
268:10	15:24 16:24	110:24	163:24	216:24	269:24	136:7	182:24
280:6	17:24 18:24	111:24	164:24	217:24	270:24	<b>attention</b>	<b>AVI</b> 66:23
<b>assessor</b>	19:24 20:24	112:24	165:24	218:24	271:24	26:6 261:23	67:8 140:11
219:18	21:24 22:24	113:24	166:24	219:24	272:24	268:17	177:9,19
242:22	23:24 24:24	114:24	167:24	220:24	273:24	<b>attributable</b>	179:4,8
<b>assessor's</b>	25:24 26:24	115:24	168:24	221:24	274:24	200:1	185:11
280:16	27:24 28:24	116:24	169:24	222:24	275:24	<b>attributes</b>	192:8,21
<b>assessors</b>	29:24 30:24	117:24	170:24	223:24	276:24	276:17	196:7
199:16	31:24 32:24	118:24	171:24	224:24	277:24	<b>audit</b> 17:1	197:16
239:23,24	33:24 34:24	119:24	172:24	225:24	278:24	18:9,12,23	208:3
239:24	35:24 36:24	120:24	173:24	226:24	279:24	19:1,13	211:16,18
243:7 259:6	37:24 38:24	121:24	174:24	227:24	280:24	20:5,7,22	211:19
259:7 269:5	39:24 40:24	122:24	175:24	228:24	281:24	108:18,24	226:18,20
269:20	41:24 42:24	123:24	176:24	229:24	282:24	222:17,19	228:7
270:17	43:24 44:24	124:24	177:24	230:24	283:24	<b>audited</b> 84:4	230:21
278:19,21	45:24 46:24	125:24	178:24	231:24	284:24	<b>auditing</b>	231:10
278:22	47:24 48:24	126:24	179:24	232:24	285:24	18:16 20:8	237:7
279:3	49:24 50:24	127:24	180:24	233:24	286:24	83:3 222:12	240:23
280:12	51:24 52:24	128:24	181:24	234:24	287:24	<b>auditors</b>	242:1 245:5
281:8	53:24 54:24	129:24	182:24	235:24	288:23	16:15 18:15	249:14
<b>asset</b> 49:2	55:24 56:24	130:24	183:24	236:24	<b>assume</b> 42:4	18:19 19:12	259:8,9
212:18	57:24 58:24	131:24	184:24	237:24	115:3,12,20	20:8,16	261:1 280:1
<b>assets</b> 53:2	59:24 60:24	132:24	185:24	238:24	146:11	36:17,20	280:3
73:4 211:5	61:24 62:24	133:24	186:24	239:24	284:6	83:10	<b>aviation</b>
214:19	63:24 64:24	134:24	187:24	240:24	<b>assumed</b>	<b>audits</b> 16:15	163:4 165:2
<b>assign</b> 259:19	65:24 66:24	135:24	188:24	241:24	124:12,13	17:7,12	<b>avoid</b> 249:23
266:6 267:6	67:24 68:24	136:24	189:24	242:24	124:14	18:2,3 19:4	<b>awaiting</b> 98:2
270:1	69:24 70:24	137:24	190:24	243:24	<b>assuming</b>	36:17 83:8	<b>aware</b> 48:9
<b>assigned</b>	71:24 72:24	138:24	191:24	244:24	160:12	109:2,6,9	52:15 53:20
259:14	73:24 74:24	139:24	192:24	245:24	193:1	109:11	102:12
267:14	75:24 76:24	140:24	193:24	246:24	285:23	<b>August</b> 100:9	198:18
270:3 271:6	77:24 78:24	141:24	194:24	247:24	<b>assumption</b>	<b>authored</b>	238:20
<b>assimilated</b>	79:24 80:24	142:24	195:24	248:24	124:19	140:20	<b>Awesome</b>
265:24	81:24 82:24	143:24	196:24	249:24	126:20,21	<b>authority</b> 3:1	107:2
<b>assist</b> 185:15	83:24 84:24	144:24	197:24	250:24	200:22	3:1 69:2	
276:4	85:24 86:24	145:24	198:24	251:24	<b>assumptions</b>	221:16	<b>B</b>
<b>assistance</b>	87:24 88:24	146:24	199:24	252:24	92:22 120:3	<b>authorized</b>	<b>B</b> 91:12 92:11
142:5 182:6	89:24 90:24	147:24	200:24	253:24	192:6	3:3,6	92:15,16
183:7	91:24 92:24	148:24	201:24	254:24	200:10	<b>automatical...</b>	<b>baby</b> 154:13
<b>assisted</b> 180:2	93:24 94:24	149:24	202:24	255:24	204:22,24	96:11,12	<b>back</b> 6:19,22
							15:21 17:14

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 4

19:20 21:3	39:4	284:13,21	239:23	34:14 35:14	215:3 263:7	<b>board</b> 29:6	<b>Boulevard</b>
32:19 35:15	<b>balances</b> 50:9	285:18	267:11	35:18 36:9	<b>bills</b> 1:19 2:5	29:12,16	195:11
48:2,4	57:4 65:18	<b>basic</b> 269:1	271:5 273:4	36:11 37:22	2:8 3:11	49:3 168:13	<b>boundaries</b>
49:24 54:3	65:24 66:11	<b>basically</b>	<b>believes</b>	88:20 103:5	6:22 180:12	176:16	10:23
55:6 56:5	151:17	13:12	189:2	103:8,16	207:6,18	179:18	<b>Brandywine</b>
59:21 63:11	<b>ball</b> 53:9	105:10	<b>bells</b> 208:20	104:1	<b>bit</b> 37:18 52:7	188:13,15	211:7
75:12 76:1	<b>Baltimore</b>	129:7	<b>Ben</b> 168:24	106:13	54:6 55:6	255:17	<b>breach</b> 121:4
94:8 96:13	41:10	154:22	<b>benefit</b> 31:11	<b>beyond</b> 93:11	56:19 78:2	<b>Board's</b>	121:11
102:6	<b>bank</b> 168:12	189:10	168:10	<b>biannual</b>	107:7	124:11	<b>break</b> 97:11
112:16	170:4,6,7	190:13,14	221:19	248:7	216:19	<b>Bob</b> 13:6,7,10	103:1
114:6	170:12	196:11,19	<b>benefits</b> 5:7	<b>bias</b> 142:24	222:16	13:14 14:2	109:12,13
119:14	171:18	284:18	5:11 31:24	<b>Bielli</b> 30:12	233:20	14:6,9,11	109:15
125:4 126:8	183:8	<b>basis</b> 61:22	74:11,14	<b>big</b> 21:6,7	248:18	15:10,13	136:6 140:4
129:11	280:18	90:1 109:3	125:22	29:17 31:17	255:11	<b>Bob's</b> 18:16	160:19
137:1 140:9	<b>bank's</b> 53:1	128:9 144:5	126:2 137:2	31:24 135:8	266:20	<b>BOBBY</b> 1:12	174:18
141:24	<b>banks</b> 171:14	222:18	<b>benefitting</b>	159:12	268:24	<b>bodega</b> 83:14	<b>breakdown</b>
156:5	<b>barely</b> 211:1	236:2 248:7	245:22	195:2	<b>BJ's</b> 10:14	83:16 85:11	80:17
159:16	<b>barring</b> 99:21	248:7 273:2	<b>Berkeley</b> 7:2	197:21,22	11:11,20,21	<b>bodegas</b>	<b>breaking</b>
195:4	<b>Barry</b> 97:5	278:2,9	7:7,14,16	201:10	81:21 82:1	81:21 83:24	85:12
200:16,18	<b>bars</b> 102:23	279:20	7:23 8:7,10	211:24	82:2	84:17 85:7	101:15
201:8 202:2	<b>base</b> 73:1	<b>Bass</b> 1:9	8:12 28:2	212:23	<b>Blackwell</b>	<b>body</b> 121:2	<b>Breeze</b>
207:3 209:8	120:22	106:5	78:4,8,16	216:24	1:10 94:3,4	133:15	226:14
211:17	121:10	<b>bat</b> 261:13	78:16 143:9	258:12	94:7,15	149:13,15	268:6
214:15	158:2,9	<b>began</b> 177:12	<b>best</b> 54:12	264:16	96:7 97:4,8	<b>bombarded</b>	<b>Breslin</b> 17:23
223:9 225:5	<b>based</b> 34:7	180:19	75:6,19	266:15	98:19 100:5	135:19	17:24 18:2
225:14,18	56:22 57:5	<b>beginning</b>	77:12	<b>bigger</b> 50:23	102:2	<b>bond</b> 42:14	18:7 19:8
226:4 232:7	62:16	138:13	108:10	263:4	152:22,23	65:1 90:5	19:19 20:4
235:19	103:12,15	141:16	146:1 212:7	<b>biggest</b> 74:16	153:5 155:5	244:7	20:13,24
242:12	104:5	161:23	212:8 240:1	<b>bilingual</b> 61:9	155:16	<b>bonds</b> 52:20	21:4,8,19
244:10	105:16	196:24	271:5	<b>bill</b> 2:9,12,14	250:7,8,13	52:24 54:10	28:16 31:23
245:8,8	106:7,8,10	231:24	275:24	3:5 22:19	251:2,16,21	87:14	32:4 36:24
253:20	113:15	256:3	<b>beta</b> 70:4	54:4 100:20	252:9	<b>book</b> 72:5	37:5,11,14
254:5	116:3 122:2	<b>begins</b> 81:2	<b>better</b> 22:8	140:19	253:14	<b>borders</b>	68:20,23,23
259:21	135:14	<b>begun</b> 83:13	24:23 46:4	157:11,13	<b>Blackwell's</b>	227:20	70:9,14,22
270:7	139:10	<b>behalf</b> 191:6	52:11	210:6,8,18	156:22	<b>borrow</b>	71:8,21
274:16,23	144:17	193:4	106:22	284:13	<b>blah</b> 115:11	165:12	75:3,8,12
275:11	147:10,17	<b>behavior</b> 9:4	114:11	<b>billing</b> 129:21	115:11,11	166:23	75:17,23
282:4 286:3	149:2,23	<b>belief</b> 139:7	131:21	130:8	<b>blaming</b>	<b>borrowing</b>	76:4 109:5
286:7,7	158:19	147:13	132:9	200:12	211:14	65:7,22	109:10,17
<b>back-end</b>	159:10,24	<b>believe</b> 32:15	147:14	<b>billion</b> 5:8	<b>blanks</b> 205:2	93:4 118:20	109:21
46:3	179:11	34:17 35:2	149:10	86:6 118:21	<b>blinking</b>	119:3 167:1	110:4
<b>background</b>	192:6 193:1	44:14,19	210:2	158:10	280:24	<b>borrowings</b>	<b>Brian</b> 232:24
46:24	193:5	71:21 80:14	216:15	163:20,21	<b>block</b> 21:12	87:24 92:8	<b>brick</b> 277:16
<b>bad</b> 101:10	197:15,18	99:20	229:14	163:24,24	257:22	119:10	<b>bridge</b> 80:22
101:11	204:23	100:11,14	<b>beverage</b>	165:10	271:11	163:17	<b>briefing</b>
193:18	205:19	101:6 108:5	31:8 33:13	166:6,9	272:17	164:2	29:21
249:1,20	219:15	120:9 129:3	34:23 35:8	186:20	276:22	<b>bother</b>	114:24
<b>balance</b> 49:11	230:9	153:2	36:16 46:16	193:4	<b>blocks</b> 21:10	203:17	115:2,8,8
49:13,18	238:11	188:20,24	103:22	201:14	<b>BLONDELL</b>	<b>bothers</b> 282:9	<b>briefings</b>
50:3 51:21	243:7	190:17,19	145:23	210:7,8,12	1:15	<b>bottled</b> 33:19	27:24
55:11 57:9	261:11	190:20	<b>beverages</b>	210:17	<b>Blondell's</b>	<b>bottom</b> 66:4,9	149:19
86:18	267:6	199:1,2	26:20 33:22	211:5,8,9	48:23	246:14	<b>bring</b> 32:2
<b>balanced</b>	276:17	236:18	33:22 34:2	211:22,24	<b>blunt</b> 156:9	255:14	76:23



Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 5

119:20	179:20	56:3 65:23	<b>buying</b> 13:12	249:15	218:23,24	262:7	46:13
224:22	187:12,19	257:23	14:9 116:24	262:11,23	259:12	280:14	107:11,13
229:17	187:23	<b>buildable</b>	126:2	264:17,18	263:22	288:15	107:15
256:19	192:22	257:6		<b>camp</b> 62:5,6	<b>categorize</b>	<b>certified</b>	139:8,14,18
281:11,19	193:18	<b>building</b>	<b>C</b>	<b>cap</b> 214:1	45:24	240:4	141:16
282:14	194:13	51:21	<b>C</b> 288:1,1	275:24	245:24	280:20	144:12,14
285:7	203:19,23	173:24	<b>calculated</b>	<b>capacity</b> 17:1	275:2	<b>certify</b> 197:16	144:20
<b>bringing</b>	204:12	191:17	93:3	224:17	<b>categorized</b>	288:3	179:24
77:13 192:3	206:4 207:5	200:12	<b>calendar</b>	<b>capita</b> 78:20	269:10	<b>certifying</b>	180:14
<b>brings</b> 13:10	245:6	214:5,8	138:21	78:21	<b>category</b>	288:19	184:6
13:14	<b>BRT's</b> 189:23	258:14,14	<b>caliber</b>	<b>capital</b> 2:10	65:11 162:7	<b>cetera</b> 132:2	223:14
251:11	<b>bucks</b> 85:9,10	<b>buildings</b>	212:10	2:13 3:12	246:1	181:24	281:8
<b>broad</b>	<b>budget</b> 2:13	184:22,22	<b>California</b>	3:13,14	<b>Cathy</b> 4:11	<b>chain</b> 15:15	<b>challenges</b>
38:16	2:15 4:10	205:13	7:2,7	73:2,6	<b>caused</b> 5:10	39:16	49:18
<b>broke</b> 94:20	4:19,22 5:6	214:3,10,11	<b>call</b> 71:10,14	<b>capitalization</b>	158:23	<b>Chair</b> 25:15	141:10
141:10	5:12,20	220:1	78:6 79:20	185:9 194:6	214:2	31:4 40:23	142:3 179:2
<b>broken</b> 164:6	6:23 16:23	277:10	96:17 102:4	<b>capitalized</b>	<b>causes</b> 156:9	48:16 55:2	280:5
<b>broker</b>	25:22 39:4	<b>builds</b> 51:6	118:10	278:14	249:21	64:7,10	<b>Chamber</b>
215:19	41:13,14,21	<b>built</b> 50:12	127:6	<b>capture</b> 26:1	<b>cease</b> 34:16	73:20 77:20	118:10
<b>brother-in-l...</b>	42:19,24	146:8	131:21	26:8	<b>center</b> 21:14	85:19 86:1	<b>chance</b> 52:9
83:23 84:12	43:18,21	154:12	182:14	<b>car</b> 81:8	21:16 43:24	87:18 94:3	153:9 190:4
144:2	44:18 45:12	260:1	197:5 222:6	163:6 265:4	71:10,15	117:14	<b>change</b> 67:6
<b>brought</b> 22:4	60:5,10,18	<b>bunch</b> 135:19	232:15	<b>card</b> 172:6,12	103:20	123:19	116:8
107:12	61:2 62:4	<b>burden</b> 38:23	235:17	<b>care</b> 92:4	104:14,20	125:18	134:20
236:10	62:16 64:2	89:7,11,16	246:1 250:3	169:1	127:7	133:20	135:15
248:16	70:24 71:18	<b>business</b> 9:4	261:16	<b>carefully</b>	142:20,21	136:12,23	178:8
274:15	72:10 73:3	29:4 32:11	<b>called</b> 124:9	185:17	<b>Center's</b>	140:1	183:20,23
275:12	73:3 86:5,6	37:24 38:4	224:2	<b>carry</b> 84:16	143:10	142:15	184:1,2,4
<b>Brown</b> 1:15	86:11,15,17	89:15	232:13	85:7	<b>centers</b>	145:10,11	184:10
18:5 22:4	87:4,24	120:19	280:20	<b>carrying</b>	184:23	146:16	191:15
25:16,17,20	88:2 89:3,9	121:19	<b>calling</b> 45:18	84:23,23	<b>certain</b> 9:14	167:11	214:4 217:4
26:7,15,18	93:14	122:19	94:24	<b>case</b> 18:10,16	57:20	201:20	237:13
27:9,17,21	111:10,19	124:1	<b>calls</b> 71:16	57:18 77:13	154:15	209:20	238:9
28:20,24	114:14	143:22	78:15	92:15	171:15	217:21	240:12
29:19,24	116:15	171:19,22	226:16	108:11	181:14	223:4	241:18
30:6,14,17	130:22	200:5 201:5	235:17	120:8 135:2	188:11	225:24	266:1
30:22 35:6	146:17,21	<b>business-rel...</b>	<b>CAMA</b> 22:10	146:1,3	220:6	226:24	<b>changed</b>
136:13,15	147:8 150:7	216:13	127:22	194:15,15	230:11	231:20	91:19 118:6
137:10,14	152:13	<b>businesses</b>	180:3,5	195:4,21	238:3	235:9	162:22
138:3,7,17	161:17,19	35:23	185:22	200:4,6	265:21,23	242:15	211:11
138:24	162:16,21	143:21	186:3 202:5	<b>cases</b> 176:2	266:2 268:5	243:21	214:5,13
139:3,6,19	164:16	145:21	206:8 207:7	183:18	276:16	244:1	261:4
145:11,12	169:10	171:16	208:4,13	189:12	<b>certainly</b>	247:21	<b>changes</b> 2:22
145:17	175:19	277:3,20,20	211:17,19	193:19	17:20 95:18	250:7	23:6 134:18
146:10,13	177:3 186:3	<b>buy</b> 10:17	217:7	195:13	95:19	262:20	238:5
152:6,18,21	194:20	11:16 26:3	219:15	<b>catastrophic</b>	197:21	265:12	249:22
153:4,19	<b>budget's</b>	33:8 80:22	220:8,11,15	270:8	215:16	274:9,24	<b>changing</b>
154:4,7,18	74:10	84:17,18	220:24	<b>catch</b> 128:15	216:2 264:4	<b>Chairman</b>	212:18
155:13,17	<b>budgetary</b>	85:8,10,13	221:13	221:5,9	266:6	64:12	227:6 266:4
156:20	4:17	88:19	236:14,15	270:7	<b>certificate</b>	<b>Chairwoman</b>	268:7,10
157:10,15	<b>budgeting</b>	125:22	237:15	<b>categories</b>	13:11 16:6	155:21	286:5
157:19	46:9 99:6	<b>buyer</b> 200:2	240:10,16	106:8	82:10	<b>challenge</b>	<b>channel</b> 37:9
<b>BRT</b> 22:8	<b>build</b> 50:15	200:18	240:24	163:18	<b>certification</b>	35:1,3,5	<b>characteristic</b>
			241:5 248:4				

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 6

180:8	40:18	101:18	162:2,3	28:3 31:2	190:21	93:2,16	159:21
<b>characteris...</b>	<b>choices</b> 10:10	102:13,18	183:8	40:21 47:12	191:1 192:7	96:23	244:7
104:3	51:7 116:10	105:18,24	208:16	47:19,22	192:12,20	<b>clerical</b> 269:6	<b>colleagues</b>
176:19	<b>Christopher</b>	117:3	<b>City-wide</b>	48:13 54:24	193:10	<b>clerk</b> 2:9 3:11	153:13
<b>charge</b> 13:13	168:1	130:16	73:4 177:11	73:18,23	194:19	3:21 243:22	227:19
189:17	<b>cigarette</b> 66:3	132:12	178:10	77:18 85:22	198:2,5,8	244:3	235:15
252:3,8,15	66:7 85:3,4	133:7 139:4	180:4	86:4 94:1	198:16,19	262:19	<b>collect</b> 16:3
257:1	88:7,23	139:8	182:21,24	101:23	198:23	<b>clerks</b> 269:20	76:11 77:3
<b>charged</b> 4:16	89:3	140:10,22	226:24	102:3	200:22	270:13	77:8,12
175:23	<b>cigarettes</b>	141:4 142:2	229:20	103:11,17	201:3,7,13	<b>clock</b> 199:1	83:6 144:6
<b>charges</b>	66:5 85:5	149:3,15	236:13	104:7,15,21	209:18	<b>clockwork</b>	176:19
215:24	<b>CINDY</b> 1:9	150:6 161:8	239:20	104:24	217:17	248:5	<b>collected</b>
<b>chart</b> 163:13	<b>circle</b> 63:11	161:8,16	240:24	105:8,15,21	225:22	<b>close</b> 68:3	104:12
163:19	<b>circumstan...</b>	162:6,14	241:9 261:9	106:14,18	231:18	97:12 126:9	218:5
166:7,21	99:12	163:18	<b>citywide</b> 5:7	106:21	232:4,11,20	154:8 190:9	220:13
<b>charter</b> 55:16	<b>Citibank</b>	166:15	<b>Civil</b> 216:17	107:2,5,8	235:7,12	195:24	<b>collecting</b>
55:20 57:11	172:6	168:2 172:3	223:22	107:23	242:14	206:14	72:3 108:3
<b>cheapest</b>	<b>cities</b> 41:8,9	175:4,22	224:6,9,12	108:9,23	250:5	210:15	<b>collection</b>
208:19	65:15 104:6	176:6,11,20	<b>claim</b> 98:4	109:8,16,19	251:23	216:22	68:17 71:12
<b>cheat</b> 84:3	<b>citizen</b> 88:5	177:15,18	<b>claimants</b>	109:22	252:16,21	217:5 242:2	71:16 72:13
<b>check</b> 15:22	88:11	180:19	97:20 99:18	110:1,7,13	253:2,5,9	<b>closely</b> 54:8	75:6,7,16
16:13 121:5	<b>citizens</b> 37:8	183:3 185:5	<b>claims</b> 58:22	110:18	253:12,15	127:22	75:19
222:23	41:5,5	185:11	59:10,14	111:1,7,13	253:19	140:13	129:22
274:16	133:8	190:4,11	97:14,15,21	111:16,23	265:12,16	182:16	137:3,8,12
283:23	<b>city</b> 1:1,5	191:6	97:22 99:22	112:4,9,12	274:9 283:4	183:10	140:24
284:3	2:18,19 3:5	193:20	<b>clarified</b>	113:2 114:9	283:22	<b>closer</b> 178:3	285:12
<b>checked</b>	3:17 4:6,23	208:15	155:6,12	115:7,22	284:4,10	250:2	<b>collections</b>
22:16	7:10,14,15	210:6 211:5	<b>clarify</b> 63:13	116:2,6,13	285:4,9,15	<b>closure</b> 56:15	71:7,9,17
<b>checking</b>	7:18 8:5,8	211:7 212:7	63:20 119:5	116:23	286:1,8,10	<b>CLR</b> 248:21	71:20,22
16:19 19:14	8:20 10:22	212:8	228:21	117:2,10,14	286:16,20	<b>co-counsel</b>	72:12 76:8
<b>checks</b> 16:10	10:23 14:22	213:14	229:2 247:1	123:15,17	286:23	129:22	80:19 127:4
<b>Cherelle</b> 1:14	15:2,7	214:11	251:23	133:18,23	<b>Clarke's</b>	<b>Coca-Cola</b>	<b>college</b> 41:16
222:8	16:11,17	216:19,21	254:5	136:2,5	29:22	123:13	42:7 110:10
<b>Chester</b>	17:4 19:17	217:18	<b>clarity</b> 108:18	139:23	<b>class</b> 42:24	<b>COD</b> 178:11	111:3
145:21	21:14,16	226:15	154:19	142:13	43:22 63:3	178:16,24	112:22
<b>Chestnut</b>	26:22 32:9	227:17	156:21	157:21	249:2	<b>code</b> 19:21	113:16
195:11	32:17,17	229:6,9,11	<b>Clarke</b> 1:9	158:6,8,13	<b>classes</b>	102:20	117:19
<b>Chicago</b> 41:8	34:16 37:24	229:24	2:2 3:7,23	158:19,24	257:12	233:11	216:13
65:15	41:7 43:23	236:10,20	4:4,6 5:17	159:4,9,15	258:24	<b>coded</b> 234:12	<b>colleges</b>
<b>chief</b> 5:15,22	45:21 46:17	237:3,18	6:1,5,9,13	159:19	<b>classification</b>	275:8	266:17
175:6,9	46:20 48:3	239:16,18	6:16 7:9 9:6	160:5,10,16	102:21	<b>codes</b> 233:13	<b>combination</b>
224:1,11	53:4,21,23	240:10,18	9:23 10:3	160:21	<b>classificatio...</b>	<b>coefficient</b>	206:21
281:15	54:9,15	241:11,23	11:7,14,24	161:1,4,7	109:14	178:10	207:1
<b>childhood</b>	56:7 59:13	242:5 248:3	12:3,24	163:10	<b>classified</b>	226:8 230:2	<b>combine</b>
142:23	62:2,11	248:17	13:9,17,22	167:9 169:8	32:12	<b>coefficients</b>	165:7
<b>children</b>	63:24 64:21	250:3 254:3	14:5,13,18	169:18,21	<b>clean</b> 77:5	182:20	<b>come</b> 11:2
150:5 153:6	72:14 74:20	258:8	16:9,18	174:12,21	<b>cleansed</b>	276:16	12:19 26:13
153:15	79:18,21	260:14,17	17:2,11,16	175:1,4	76:12	<b>coin</b> 212:3	43:5,13
<b>children's</b>	80:4,10,11	269:24	17:21 18:1	186:14	<b>clear</b> 14:7	<b>collaborative</b>	45:7 46:1
154:1	80:15 81:2	273:18	19:6,16,22	187:18,23	50:5 61:10	282:22	49:6 53:22
<b>choice</b> 33:2,3	82:9,11	281:8 287:5	20:11,19	188:2 189:7	91:6 207:2	<b>collateral</b>	68:13 75:24
33:4,9	86:22 88:16	<b>City's</b> 4:16,19	21:2,5,9,20	189:22	<b>clearly</b> 7:10	77:11	81:18 110:1
35:16 40:18	96:10	4:21 150:6	25:13 26:11	190:12,16	8:7 25:3,4	<b>colleague</b>	118:16

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 7

132:7	279:4	245:18	<b>community</b>	177:10	226:12	<b>cons 126:16</b>	<b>consumers</b>
134:10,11	280:24	246:2,9,20	41:16 42:7	255:5	<b>concerned</b>	<b>consequences</b>	40:15 81:3
135:18,21	<b>commenda...</b>	260:23	42:15 56:3	<b>completely</b>	197:2	56:13	81:6
135:22	55:22	261:8	110:9 111:2	24:18 50:8	<b>concerns</b>	<b>conservative</b>	<b>consumption</b>
137:1 144:8	<b>Commending</b>	262:24	112:22	90:19	34:20	115:19	26:20 27:12
158:21	41:2	263:1,13	113:16	193:16	133:14	124:22	35:14 36:9
189:3	<b>comment</b>	264:1 266:9	117:19	259:1	181:2	<b>consider 3:10</b>	66:12,16
191:19,22	118:8,19	266:11,24	221:20	<b>completing</b>	192:15	42:17 72:2	88:7 104:4
201:8 209:4	153:18,20	269:9,11	<b>companies</b>	179:4	235:18	234:4 257:6	105:3 116:1
225:5,13,17	216:9	270:22	153:1 155:8	<b>completion</b>	<b>conclude 6:11</b>	<b>consideration</b>	116:4,8
231:11	286:14	274:18	210:23	138:19	174:13	73:2 202:10	117:4,7
241:23	<b>comments</b>	275:18	<b>company</b>	<b>complex</b>	<b>concludes</b>	<b>considered</b>	134:17,18
242:12	209:24	276:7,8,11	15:24	266:7,21	162:8	34:22 75:19	134:21
249:8	211:21	276:18,24	264:10	267:4,13,13	<b>concluding</b>	178:4,23	135:1,2,10
250:16	216:8	277:4,5,9	<b>comparable</b>	<b>complexes</b>	89:21	262:15	<b>contact 54:19</b>
255:10	<b>Commerce</b>	277:10,14	8:15,20	176:9	<b>concrete</b>	<b>considering</b>	95:4 202:2
258:2,20	118:11	277:18,20	<b>comparables</b>	<b>complexity</b>	79:13	42:13 66:3	252:17
277:17	<b>commercial</b>	278:3,6,12	8:14	267:6	<b>condense</b>	151:3	<b>contained</b>
278:22	158:2,8,11	278:20	<b>compare 28:1</b>	<b>compliance</b>	170:9	<b>consistent 7:2</b>	288:5
282:3 286:7	159:13	279:2 280:7	78:18,22,22	19:4,11	<b>condition</b>	112:24	<b>contest</b>
<b>comes 12:6</b>	160:4	281:7,12	79:13	20:18 32:7	64:21	130:16	179:10
29:6 36:2	179:22	<b>commercials</b>	<b>compared</b>	38:15 60:9	<b>conditions</b>	160:9	<b>context 89:20</b>
43:7 49:3	184:16,20	204:10	8:24 268:9	63:14,15	238:19	<b>consistently</b>	<b>continually</b>
54:3 59:7	184:24	<b>Commission</b>	268:17	<b>compliant</b>	<b>condo 216:5</b>	281:4	170:14
62:19	185:4,7,15	161:14	271:14	63:18	<b>condominiu...</b>	<b>consolidatio...</b>	171:5
103:17,19	186:19	162:12,17	273:19	<b>complicated</b>	176:8	269:22	<b>continue 3:9</b>
127:5	187:6,9	216:17	<b>compares</b>	268:3	<b>conduct</b>	<b>constant</b>	23:8 42:11
135:23	188:10	223:22	78:8,11	<b>comply 64:1</b>	182:14	211:12	55:11 91:10
137:20	191:20,21	<b>commissioner</b>	<b>comparison</b>	146:7	218:20	<b>constantly</b>	92:16
140:8	192:5	11:9 17:24	78:4,19	<b>component</b>	<b>conducted</b>	243:15	113:22
141:24	195:22	28:16 68:24	79:3,9	45:22 183:3	16:15	<b>constitute</b>	133:3
153:2 202:8	197:14,24	74:24 76:22	80:20 143:9	183:12	<b>conducting</b>	3:11 275:4	135:11
204:21	198:17,21	102:17	211:6	225:17	17:7	<b>constraining</b>	165:23,24
218:8	199:15,16	109:23	<b>comparisons</b>	<b>compose</b>	<b>confidential</b>	50:16 51:1	176:14,18
245:14	199:23	128:12	79:5	79:23	128:9,22	<b>construction</b>	182:16
247:7 249:4	200:4	154:11	<b>compiled</b>	<b>comprehen...</b>	<b>confidential...</b>	228:12	184:5,11
251:5,8	202:14,20	<b>commitment</b>	104:20	180:4	47:13 48:8	283:14	205:22
272:9	203:16,23	237:6	164:6,7	<b>comps 193:1</b>	121:5	<b>constructive</b>	206:6
276:13,19	204:8,19	<b>committed</b>	<b>complain</b>	212:12	<b>confidentially</b>	210:1	237:17
<b>comfortable</b>	205:2,11,13	182:17	250:14	283:10,17	<b>confirm</b>	<b>consultant</b>	256:9
48:11	205:20	228:19	251:18	<b>computer</b>	202:23	130:23	<b>continued</b>
129:14	206:4	249:13	<b>complaining</b>	23:16 180:2	<b>confirmation</b>	183:9	101:24
255:13,21	217:10	<b>Committee</b>	252:11	207:15	107:18	264:10	177:12
255:22	219:8	1:2 2:5 3:10	<b>complains</b>	<b>concentrate</b>	<b>confusion</b>	<b>consultants</b>	<b>continues</b>
<b>coming 23:2</b>	223:11	174:21	249:7	32:13 80:13	282:14	217:12	92:13 180:1
55:18 68:16	233:5,9	287:2	<b>complaints</b>	241:11	156:23	282:14	180:20
90:17	234:2,3,5,5	<b>commonly</b>	22:17 25:3	<b>concentrates</b>	157:16	<b>consume</b>	181:10
105:17	234:8,10,11	178:17	235:18,18	120:21	<b>conjunction</b>	83:13	182:2,11
113:10	234:13,16	<b>Commonwe...</b>	<b>complete</b>	<b>concept 46:15</b>	62:7 172:17	<b>consumer</b>	<b>continuing</b>
119:15	234:18	140:24	177:10	<b>concern</b>	180:17	39:7 40:9	97:10
185:2	239:24	280:15	<b>completed</b>	32:22 91:22	<b>Connecticut</b>	78:19,20	<b>continuum</b>
251:13	240:20	<b>communica...</b>	45:17 46:5	216:11,16	103:21	115:5,13	146:2
265:19	244:12,14	151:4	46:9 94:24	221:12	104:9,22	157:17	<b>contract</b>

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 8

185:13	251:14,15	13:24 14:4	109:8,16,19	198:2,5,8	37:3,6,12	124:4,6,7	206:8,13,16
186:2 265:3	<b>core</b> 5:12	14:8,15	109:22	198:16,19	38:17 39:18	124:24	206:20,24
279:2,11	86:17	15:10,19,23	110:1,7,13	198:23	39:22 40:7	125:12,17	207:11,23
281:16,18	<b>corner</b> 13:6	82:11	110:18	200:22	40:15,19,22	125:20	208:22
281:21	26:11	<b>Costco-type</b>	111:1,7,13	201:3,7,13	40:23,24	126:10,16	209:15,19
282:17	272:16	10:18,24	111:16,23	202:7	41:24 42:23	126:21,24	209:20,21
<b>contracted</b>	<b>Corporation</b>	<b>costs</b> 28:11	112:4,9,12	203:21	43:8,20	127:17,24	209:23,24
281:10	103:22	40:12 42:10	113:2 114:9	209:18,21	44:11,17,23	128:7,15	210:11,15
<b>contracting</b>	<b>correct</b> 36:21	63:23 65:19	115:7,22	211:21	45:3,11	129:1,9,13	210:17,21
279:10	107:21,22	65:22 88:4	116:2,6,13	216:17	46:10 47:5	129:15	211:14
<b>contractors</b>	108:21,22	89:12	116:15,23	217:16,17	47:8,11	130:1,18	212:5 213:3
282:19	110:12	172:13	117:2,10,14	217:18	64:7,8,10	131:3,8,10	215:11
<b>contracts</b> 6:3	112:11	263:20	117:17	221:16	64:11,14,19	131:15	217:14,18
6:3 61:12	130:12	<b>council</b> 1:1,9	119:16	225:22	66:2,17,21	132:22	221:17,17
<b>contribute</b>	131:9 138:6	2:2,17 3:3,7	120:2 123:8	226:1	66:23 67:10	133:19,20	225:24
51:17,20	139:2,4	3:23 4:4,5,7	123:15,17	229:18,19	67:14,19,22	133:21	226:1
52:4 124:17	146:24	5:17 6:1,5,9	123:20	231:18	68:7,15,21	134:1,13,19	227:15
<b>contributory</b>	147:1 149:6	6:13,16 7:9	133:18,23	232:4,11,17	70:4,12,15	135:4,16,22	228:5,21
183:14	150:7,8	7:17 9:6,23	136:2,5	232:20	71:4,19,24	135:24	229:8,22
<b>control</b>	153:3	10:3 11:7	139:23	235:7,12	72:18,19	136:3	230:18
168:15	163:22	11:14,24	140:15	242:14	73:8,12,16	140:17	231:2,16,19
270:4	166:14	12:3,24	141:3	243:20	73:20,21,24	146:14,15	232:15,17
288:18	187:22	13:9,17,22	142:13	244:4 250:5	74:2,8,13	147:4,7,10	232:21
<b>controller's</b>	188:14	14:5,13,18	145:1 149:8	251:23	74:17 75:5	147:17	234:7,15,19
125:23	239:13	16:9,18	149:15,20	252:16,21	75:11,14,18	148:4,10,15	235:5,8,9
<b>controllers</b>	285:14	17:2,11,16	155:18	253:2,5,9	76:3,6,7,18	149:1,7,23	235:10,14
125:21	288:8	17:21 18:1	157:21	253:12,15	76:21 77:1	150:9,13,18	235:24
<b>convenience</b>	<b>correctly</b> 44:7	19:6,16,22	158:6,8,13	253:19	77:19 80:5	150:21	236:3,6
15:14	141:19	20:11,19	158:19,24	265:12,16	86:1,2,5,21	151:3,20	237:21
<b>conversation</b>	233:24	21:2,5,9,20	159:4,9,15	271:3 274:9	87:9,17,20	152:4,7	239:11,15
6:20 38:23	<b>corridor</b>	25:13,21	159:19	283:4,22	87:23 88:4	155:19,20	241:3
149:3	276:24	31:2,7	160:5,10,16	284:4,10	88:13,22	156:4,7,19	242:15,16
150:22	277:3,6,14	36:12,14	160:21	285:4,9,15	89:4,10,17	159:22	243:1,9,12
171:20	<b>corridors</b>	38:17 40:20	161:1,4,7,8	286:1,8,10	89:19,23	163:11,12	243:17,22
215:20	234:6	40:21,24	162:10	286:16,20	90:14 91:2	163:23	243:23,24
<b>conversations</b>	277:10,18	47:9,12,19	163:10,12	286:21,23	91:7,22	165:9 166:5	244:8
46:17 133:5	<b>cost</b> 38:24	47:22 48:12	167:9,14	<b>Councilman</b>	92:6,14,24	166:11,15	253:16,17
171:13,23	39:1,6	48:13 54:13	169:8,18,21	1:10,11,11	93:13,23	167:5,10,11	253:20
<b>converted</b>	53:11 63:22	54:24 72:7	174:12,21	1:12,13,13	94:2 110:9	167:13,19	254:8,13,17
214:12	71:1 88:18	73:18,21,23	175:1,3,4	1:14,16,16	110:16,24	168:3,18,23	254:20
272:18	98:9 134:16	77:18 85:22	177:3	21:23,24	111:2,6	169:6,9,24	255:3 256:5
<b>cooperation</b>	134:17,20	86:3,4 87:3	185:11	22:12 23:14	112:7,8	170:2,2,19	256:11,15
2:24 3:2	134:24	94:1 101:23	186:11,14	23:22 24:2	113:3,4,5	171:12	256:18,22
74:3	167:22	102:3	187:18,23	24:5,16,20	117:15,16	172:1,8,23	259:5
<b>cooperative</b>	168:7,8,11	103:11,17	188:2 189:7	25:1,6,10	117:18	173:17,21	260:10
210:3	168:16	104:7,15,21	189:22	25:14 31:4	119:12	174:9,13	262:17,19
<b>coordinate</b>	206:1	104:24	190:12,16	31:5,14	120:6,16	201:20,21	262:20,21
61:14	214:21	105:8,15,21	190:21	32:2,8,18	121:1,7,21	201:23,24	263:3 265:5
<b>coordinated</b>	<b>Costco</b> 10:14	106:14,18	191:1 192:7	32:21 33:4	121:23	202:17	265:10,13
53:13	10:22 11:11	106:21	192:12,20	33:11,24	122:4,6,14	203:5,8,14	265:14,18
<b>coordinating</b>	11:16,21	107:2,5,8	193:10	34:11,15,18	122:21,24	203:20	267:1,20
23:10	12:7,13,17	107:23	194:19	35:7,19	123:5,16,18	204:1,4	268:2 271:4
<b>copy</b> 251:9,10	13:2,8,24	108:9,23	196:5,13	36:5,12	123:19,20	205:7,23	271:7 272:3

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 9

273:8,12,24	136:12,13	277:7,13	<b>courts</b> 255:18	16:13 20:22	128:1,2,12	<b>debit</b> 172:6	222:20
274:7,14	136:15	278:15	<b>cover</b> 171:7	28:6 32:10	128:17,22	172:12	<b>Deeds</b> 198:13
<b>Councilma...</b>	137:10,14	279:22	<b>coverage</b>	60:19 99:23	129:19,24	<b>debt</b> 52:18	<b>defend</b>
227:13,16	137:16	280:22	280:5	128:18	130:3,7	53:12 87:14	255:20
227:20,21	138:3,7,9	281:14	<b>covered</b>	162:6	131:15,17	90:4 119:7	<b>defendable</b>
227:22	138:17,24	282:2,18	29:22	170:17	132:4 143:7	119:8	255:14
<b>Councilme...</b>	139:3,6,19	283:3,5	<b>covering</b> 2:20	176:5	176:19,21	162:14	<b>defer</b> 14:21
136:19	139:24	<b>counsel</b> 85:17	<b>created</b> 181:1	222:24	181:18	163:14,17	243:24
<b>Councilme...</b>	140:1,2	121:13	<b>creates</b> 221:6	238:2	182:4 185:3	164:3,10,14	<b>definite</b> 93:1
280:9	141:22	175:16	<b>creativity</b>	<b>CURTIS</b> 1:13	185:7,8,16	164:17,20	<b>definitely</b>
<b>Councilper...</b>	142:11,14	<b>count</b> 102:23	133:1	<b>customer</b>	185:23	164:21,23	24:15 33:10
73:5 251:24	142:15,17	227:7 247:6	<b>credit</b> 52:22	33:1,3,4	191:16	165:14,17	60:12 66:8
<b>Councilwo...</b>	143:19	<b>counter</b> 54:4	65:4 165:6	73:1 100:17	197:6,18	165:22,23	76:4 125:9
1:9,10,12	144:16,24	274:4	<b>credits</b> 165:1	251:13	220:13	165:24	126:9
1:14,15,15	145:9,11,12	<b>counterintu...</b>	170:14	270:16	227:4 247:6	166:15	141:23
18:5 22:4	145:17	273:1	171:1	<b>customers</b>	258:16,18	<b>debts</b> 125:1	<b>degree</b> 8:3
25:15,17,20	146:10,13	<b>counterpro...</b>	<b>criminal</b>	33:5 209:3	261:2,15,16	<b>decades</b>	42:12,12
26:7,12,15	152:6,18,21	273:10	189:12	<b>cut</b> 34:19	<b>database</b>	177:15	216:10
26:18 27:9	152:22,23	<b>counties</b> 70:3	<b>crisis</b> 52:19	91:4 111:9	109:13	228:10	261:4
27:17,21	153:4,5,19	<b>county</b> 68:8	52:22 53:8	118:2	110:5	248:23	269:14,15
28:20,24	154:4,7,18	69:10,12,16	<b>criteria</b> 78:2	189:13	247:15	<b>decide</b> 33:8	275:19
29:19,24	155:5,13,16	69:19,21	234:16	196:2	<b>date</b> 262:8	40:6 81:7	<b>degrees</b> 62:22
30:6,14,17	155:17	70:18,19	254:6	<b>cuts</b> 86:15,16	<b>daunting</b>	<b>decided</b>	216:13
30:22 31:3	156:20,22	141:17	260:15	<b>cutting</b> 111:8	179:24	112:15	<b>Delaware</b>
35:6 48:16	156:24	145:21,22	<b>critical</b>	189:10	<b>DAVID</b> 1:14	<b>decides</b>	69:19,21
48:17,21,23	157:10,15	146:4	131:19	<b>cycle</b> 262:4	<b>day</b> 39:2	265:22	70:18
49:6 51:8	157:19,22	<b>couple</b> 6:17	<b>criticisms</b>	262:13	51:11,17	<b>deciding</b>	<b>Delegation</b>
51:13 52:3	217:21,22	22:13 27:2	72:4	<b>cyclical</b>	114:18	57:17	140:13
52:13 54:11	218:2,19	69:14 74:9	<b>criticize</b>	261:11,12	193:20	<b>decision</b> 40:3	<b>Delicia</b>
54:22 55:1	219:3	76:24 102:3	24:11	<b>D</b>	232:12,19	40:6,8,8	175:13
55:2,3,5	220:10	125:24	<b>criticizing</b>	<b>D</b> 1:15	255:15	41:19	<b>delinquency</b>
57:7,18	221:11	127:12	213:18	<b>daily</b> 236:3	<b>day-to-day</b>	114:11	77:3
58:9,14,17	223:3,8	136:16	<b>cross-depar...</b>	<b>dairy</b> 34:7	61:22	143:11,12	<b>delinquent</b>
59:1,4,9,18	224:6,15,19	186:15	45:20	<b>Dairy-based</b>	<b>days</b> 6:6,7	152:16	68:2 71:22
59:23 60:4	225:2,9,12	195:8 207:3	<b>crux</b> 211:15	34:8	64:22 74:5	193:19	72:11,13
60:14,17,22	225:20,23	208:3,4	<b>crying</b> 111:10	<b>damages</b>	97:23 184:9	194:9	76:10 141:1
61:7 62:3	231:20,21	216:7 225:1	<b>CTO</b> 162:2	99:11,15	192:22	206:17,19	141:4
63:11 64:6	232:4,6,11	225:2 226:4	170:14	<b>danger</b> 249:1	<b>DC</b> 41:8	208:6 237:2	<b>deliver</b> 33:16
64:9 65:17	244:5,18,19	262:21	<b>cue</b> 247:9	249:2	161:23	237:4	33:18,19,20
77:20,22	244:23	264:11	<b>culture</b> 43:23	<b>dare</b> 277:8	<b>deadline</b>	<b>decisions</b>	<b>delivered</b>
78:1,13	245:11,20	283:13	<b>curious</b> 139:9	<b>darker</b> 64:21	138:18,19	39:15 57:20	170:16
79:2,6,22	246:11,23	286:3	265:20	<b>darn</b> 101:20	138:22	63:7 64:22	<b>delivering</b>
80:2,7,18	247:11,16	<b>course</b> 26:15	<b>current</b>	<b>DARRELL</b>	<b>deal</b> 189:12	133:11	34:12
81:16,20	247:20,24	40:7 120:23	112:16	1:9	189:13	<b>decline</b> 35:13	<b>delivers</b>
82:4,14	249:17	160:7	120:19	<b>data</b> 45:7	196:2 285:1	5:19 163:1	132:12
83:2,11	250:4,6,7,8	222:23	147:21	103:15,23	285:1	163:3 177:4	251:11
84:7 85:18	250:12,13	<b>courses</b>	182:15	103:24	<b>dealer</b> 10:16	178:23	<b>Dell</b> 72:24
94:3,4,7,15	251:2,16,21	223:23	185:7 197:3	104:5,11	10:20 82:2	<b>dedicated</b>	<b>delve</b> 141:24
96:7 97:4,8	252:9	<b>court</b> 108:10	197:6 209:2	105:3 106:8	<b>dealing</b> 179:5	125:4,14	<b>demand</b> 66:5
97:9 98:19	253:13,14	139:15	219:15	127:11,13	211:3	<b>dedicating</b>	66:17
100:5	274:10,11	141:10	235:2	127:15,18	<b>deals</b> 212:14	125:10	<b>demographic</b>
101:24	275:10,17	249:3	<b>currently</b> 7:3	127:20,21	<b>debate</b> 79:10	<b>deed</b> 199:18	104:3
102:2 106:4	276:1,9,20	288:12	10:22 16:9	127:23	84:1 114:16		<b>demograph...</b>

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 10

7:18,23 <b>demonstrat...</b> 267:17 <b>demonstrat...</b> 209:4 <b>denial</b> 181:24 <b>denials</b> 182:7 <b>denied</b> 203:3 <b>dense</b> 276:21 <b>Denver</b> 41:11 <b>department</b> 11:3 16:14 30:1 35:3 37:19 45:16 59:2,7 61:12,19 62:7 63:6 63:16,16 64:3 74:4 84:5 95:9 100:16 115:9 128:19 129:19 132:4 136:24 137:2 163:2 177:7 181:8 181:11,22 186:5 250:14 258:14 267:10 279:3 281:20 <b>departmental</b> 16:23 179:2 <b>departments</b> 3:17 4:24 28:7 30:2 45:24 60:11 60:24 61:8 61:16,18 62:11,14,21 63:1,9,21 86:16 96:10 127:14 128:8,18,20 128:24 129:17,24 132:16 137:20 138:11	<b>depend</b> 95:20 <b>depending</b> 62:1,22 103:1 134:5 200:11 217:4 241:16 268:2 <b>depends</b> 18:7 153:22 224:4 <b>deposit</b> 172:5 172:12,22 173:1,4 <b>depth</b> 160:13 <b>Deputy</b> 4:12 11:9 18:17 97:6 102:16 128:11 154:10 168:2 172:19 175:9,11 <b>DEREK</b> 1:11 <b>described</b> 147:20 <b>desirable</b> 178:4 <b>despite</b> 91:8 221:23 222:1 <b>destroyed</b> 101:5 <b>detail</b> 31:22 41:14 42:24 43:21 44:18 45:12 140:7 147:8 169:10 251:17 <b>detailed</b> 9:12 103:2 154:6 180:8 <b>details</b> 11:4 124:8 209:1 <b>determine</b> 57:5 105:1 199:12 259:24 <b>determined</b> 94:11 <b>determines</b> 104:9	<b>determining</b> 260:5 <b>detriment</b> 101:8 <b>devastating</b> 93:11 <b>develop</b> 258:9 261:20 <b>developed</b> 220:2 <b>developer</b> 220:2 <b>developers</b> 258:6 <b>developing</b> 231:5 <b>development</b> 223:18 225:16 227:23 271:11 278:18 279:7,19 <b>deviate</b> 178:22 <b>deviation</b> 178:23 <b>devoted</b> 142:22 <b>diet</b> 33:20 34:4 83:18 116:11 142:23 <b>differ</b> 36:23 <b>difference</b> 93:6 190:7 193:8 278:5 <b>differences</b> 7:6 <b>different</b> 9:14 18:9 22:19 28:4 85:4 89:8 92:17 94:8 115:16 125:24 127:19 129:4 134:15 143:10 170:4 178:12 218:24 254:2	257:12,13 257:14,15 258:23 259:1 268:12 <b>differential</b> 177:21 <b>differently</b> 46:1 272:11 <b>difficult</b> 37:13 52:21 105:22 220:8 236:13 258:2 277:16 <b>difficulties</b> 44:9 <b>difficulty</b> 232:14 <b>dig</b> 101:1 <b>diligence</b> 208:23 209:1,13 <b>direct</b> 46:8 172:5,11,22 172:24 173:4 288:18 <b>directly</b> 184:8 285:2 <b>director</b> 3:21 4:7,9,12,14 4:15,23,23 22:5 48:5 61:2 97:6 161:13 162:11 172:20 175:13,15 255:10 256:24 285:5 <b>Dis</b> 56:7 <b>disabled</b> 250:16 <b>disclosing</b> 128:22 <b>disconnect</b> 16:3 22:7 <b>discounts</b> 181:13 <b>discover</b>	120:23 144:5 <b>discovering</b> 175:20 <b>discuss</b> 53:22 58:9 84:20 110:17,18 145:8 <b>discussed</b> 173:13 <b>discussion</b> 66:13 87:7 114:13 122:9 <b>discussions</b> 58:5,6 59:16 73:10 85:20,23 <b>disparity</b> 230:15 <b>dispersion</b> 178:11 182:20,23 226:8 230:3 <b>disseminati...</b> 119:17 <b>distributes</b> 10:19 <b>distribution</b> 33:13 39:16 223:5 <b>distributor</b> 10:19 11:19 11:23 12:1 12:4,13,17 12:18 14:2 14:14 15:8 31:14,20 81:19 82:3 82:10,12 83:1,23 84:12 114:22 144:3,4,7 144:21 145:3 <b>distributors</b> 19:9 20:14 31:12 32:8 35:22 38:12 38:24 39:5 39:6 79:15 79:16,17,20	79:23 80:8 82:16,23 84:14 120:14 121:9 143:14 145:14,16 <b>distributors'</b> 108:13 <b>district</b> 7:17 21:10 55:11 56:5,9,15 56:16,21 57:3,9,12 57:22,24 58:5 66:22 67:4 73:5 94:22 146:22 147:3,12 148:6 149:4 149:11,20 150:3,11,14 150:23 151:5 152:8 152:10,19 227:13,17 227:20,21 227:22 229:18 277:14 <b>district's</b> 55:13 56:8 66:8 <b>district-ma...</b> 56:1 <b>districts</b> 227:24 229:20 <b>diversificati...</b> 36:2 <b>diversifying</b> 35:9 <b>diversity</b> 48:24 <b>Divine</b> 175:11 <b>division</b> 270:2,3 <b>divisions</b> 4:13 5:1,2 <b>document</b> 209:12 274:15	275:1 <b>doing</b> 9:12 18:2,12,13 19:4,12 28:17,21 29:1,2,3,4,8 30:1 42:7 48:11 65:4 83:8,15 86:12 91:18 91:23 98:8 110:2,14 117:23 126:7 141:13,17 141:19 151:11 159:13 160:3,6 170:17 172:24 191:7 198:21 208:2 211:18 216:21 217:7 226:10,22 228:20 229:9,13,19 233:23 240:22 241:7 245:7 248:23 249:11,14 252:10 254:1 257:1 257:4 259:11 261:19 262:5 267:22 279:14 283:17 284:12 <b>dollars</b> 15:20 41:16 44:3 68:18,19 71:6 76:14 122:16 156:3,4,5 168:7 169:1 169:4	170:12 171:7 211:8 211:23 213:19 263:14,17 263:21 <b>Domb</b> 1:10 73:20,21,24 74:2,8,13 74:17 75:5 75:11,14,18 76:3,6,18 76:21 77:1 140:17 155:19,20 156:4,7,19 159:22 163:11,12 163:23 165:9 166:5 166:11,15 167:5 169:24 170:2,19 171:12 172:1,8,23 173:17,21 174:9 209:20,21 209:24 210:11,15 210:17,21 211:14 213:3 215:11,20 215:21,23 216:1 217:14 262:20,21 263:3 265:5 265:10 274:14 <b>Domb's</b> 136:19 <b>door</b> 238:24 <b>doubled</b> 214:9 <b>Dougherty</b> 175:16 <b>dozen</b> 99:24 134:15 <b>drafted</b> 40:17 <b>dramatic</b>
--	--	--	---	--	---	--	---

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 11

<b>dramatically</b> 61:19 198:1 214:1,2	40:13,16 41:20 42:18 43:4,11	115:6,16,23 116:5,12,22 117:1,4,13	<b>due</b> 161:21 179:11 208:23,24	116:14 <b>eating</b> 39:5 <b>economic</b> 53:8 104:2	202:11 204:12 206:4 221:2	<b>enforce</b> 14:14 14:23 17:3 36:18 85:2	<b>essence</b> 52:19 277:22 <b>essential</b> 72:8
<b>drastic</b> 231:12	44:5,14,21 45:2,5	119:3 120:1 120:15	<b>dumped</b> 127:3	162:4 <b>economy</b> 50:20,24	231:3 238:4 238:10 252:10	<b>enforcement</b> 10:12,21 15:4 25:22	<b>essentially</b> 18:9 37:16 45:19 71:14
<b>draw</b> 73:1	46:11 47:2 47:7,10,15	121:24 122:4,13,17	<b>duplex</b> 271:12	52:1 118:24 216:15	267:12 276:24	26:2 79:14 80:19,24	259:17 284:8,11
<b>dreaded</b> 66:3	47:21 48:1 48:20 49:5	122:23 123:2,24	272:18,20 273:5	<b>education</b> 121:17	<b>Elastic</b> 65:8 <b>elasticity</b> 84:21 134:4	84:6 16:10	<b>establish</b> 138:12
<b>Drew</b> 175:17	50:8 51:12 51:19 52:6	124:6,13 125:6,16,19	<b>duplexes</b> 271:19	150:5 <b>educational</b> 41:6,12	134:12,24 <b>elderly</b> 153:16	<b>enforces</b> 166:18 <b>enroll</b> 172:5	<b>establishing</b> 4:18 175:24 <b>establishme...</b> 51:11
<b>drill</b> 236:16	53:21 55:4 56:24 57:15	125:23 126:15,20	273:18	42:5 281:6 <b>effect</b> 35:24	<b>elected</b> 140:17 <b>electronically</b> 23:17 174:6	172:11 153:10 155:2	<b>estate</b> 68:8,10 75:15 76:14
<b>drink</b> 32:12	58:3,11,16 58:23 59:3	126:23 127:15,19	<b>earlier</b> 6:19 20:21 75:15	<b>effected</b> 153:12 <b>effective</b> 71:23 142:1	<b>eligibility</b> 222:5 <b>eligible</b> 121:20	170:15 186:6 279:4	77:8,11,12 184:17 185:15
35:17 36:22	59:6,15,21 60:3,12,15	128:2,14 130:13,21	<b>E</b> <b>E</b> 288:1	277:22 <b>effectively</b> 213:16	219:1 222:4 246:18 275:5	<b>ensured</b> 18:21 <b>ensuring</b> 138:14	197:23 200:3,8 210:8,12,18
37:1,2,15	60:21 64:13 64:16 65:10	131:7,9,12 133:16	76:9 107:12 115:8,14	213:16 <b>effects</b> 179:5 180:21	<b>eliminate</b> 133:13 170:9	215:18 217:19 226:17	211:4 212:6 215:18 217:19
80:12,21	66:7,19,22 67:3,12,17	134:11,14 134:22	120:9 122:1 134:3	279:9 <b>efficiencies</b> 28:6	<b>eliminated</b> 28:12 87:5 <b>employ</b> 186:8	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
157:2	67:20 68:5 68:13 72:9	135:7,21,23 137:8,13,22	151:11 155:24	279:9 <b>efficiently</b> 28:19	<b>employee</b> 88:14 172:5 174:2	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
<b>drinks</b> 33:7,8	73:7,9,14 74:1,6,12	138:6,15,22 139:1,5,11	162:1 223:10	207:21 223:16	<b>employees</b> 172:10,11 172:22	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
120:21	74:15,23 75:20 76:16	141:15 142:7	263:8 274:17	<b>effort</b> 53:13 56:2,3	<b>entitled</b> 246:9 <b>entity</b> 18:13	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
153:11	76:19,22 77:17,24	143:17 144:11,23	274:17 <b>early</b> 128:5	185:3,5,16 <b>efforts</b> 176:22	<b>entire</b> 15:14 18:22 115:4	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
156:23	78:11,23 79:4,19	145:7,16 146:6,11,18	142:8 215:18	217:10 <b>eight</b> 118:22	279:6 281:24	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
<b>drive</b> 80:8	80:1,5,10 85:16 86:14	147:1,6,9 147:16,24	171:9 <b>earn</b> 171:3,4	124:21 175:8	<b>enable</b> 221:15 <b>enabled</b> 221:21	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
265:3	87:1,12,19 87:22 88:2	148:8,13,19 149:6,18	171:9 <b>earned</b> 171:1	<b>either</b> 19:24 32:12 42:11	<b>encouraging</b> 173:12 <b>ended</b> 94:18	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
<b>drivers</b> 33:15	88:9,19,24 89:6,13,18	150:8,12,16 150:19	126:21 <b>Earning</b> 126:20	57:13 79:1 131:19	<b>enroll</b> 172:5 174:2	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
<b>drives</b> 10:2	89:6,13,18 89:22 90:10	151:1,14 152:2,14,20	124:19 126:20	149:8 158:18	<b>entire</b> 15:14 18:22 115:4	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
13:7 257:15	90:19 91:5 91:15 92:3	153:22 154:5	170:13 <b>easier</b> 31:19	188:23 190:3	<b>entity</b> 18:13 18:20 190:1	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
<b>drop</b> 88:17	92:12,18 93:9,21	154:5 155:15	31:24 32:6 37:18 38:15	200:14 <b>eat</b> 38:24	<b>environment</b> 8:16 <b>equal</b> 49:13	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
135:6,8	94:6,13 95:21 96:23	156:3,5,18 157:4,12,18	128:23 145:4	40:4 114:22 114:23	<b>equation</b> 117:22 <b>equip</b> 212:16	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
138:19	107:3,22 108:5,22	158:5,7,12 158:17,22	145:4 236:19	<b>easy</b> 24:11 252:24	<b>equitable</b> 175:22 186:7	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
<b>dual</b> 211:18	109:23 110:3,12,15	159:1,6,11 159:18	247:13 <b>Easter</b> 100:7	252:24 <b>eat</b> 38:24	<b>error</b> 132:16 <b>escapes</b> 68:3	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
<b>Dubow</b> 3:21	111:5,12,15 111:20,24	160:2,6,15 186:17	247:13 <b>easy</b> 24:11	252:24 <b>eat</b> 38:24	<b>especially</b> 36:2 126:17 191:20	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
4:3,5,7 5:19	112:11,19 113:19	207:2,24 285:7,14,23	252:24 <b>eat</b> 38:24	200:14 <b>endure</b> 39:3	193:21 <b>evaluator</b>	226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
6:4,7,10,15		286:2,9,14				226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
7:8 8:24						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
9:19,24						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
11:1 22:2						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
22:11 23:3						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
23:19,24						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
24:3,15,18						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
24:24 25:2						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
25:9,19						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
26:4,12,17						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
26:23 27:5						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
27:11,19						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
28:8,22						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
29:6,23						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
30:5,9,15						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
30:21 31:13						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
31:17 33:3						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
33:5,17						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
34:4,8,13						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
34:17 35:2						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
35:11 36:4						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
36:7 39:14						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18
39:21 40:2						226:17 231:14 280:18	226:17 231:14 280:18

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 12

224:8	<b>examples</b> 9:2	220:5,19	185:14	215:22	191:12	199:24	43:2 44:8
259:15	28:5,22	225:18	<b>expert</b> 23:16	<b>facilitated</b>	206:8,17	204:7	52:19 58:1
266:10	195:9 215:4	244:11	77:7 154:20	179:15	<b>Fargo</b> 170:5	213:22	59:13 60:23
<b>evaluators</b>	<b>exceptionally</b>	250:21	224:3,11,14	<b>facility</b>	171:19	215:9 230:1	64:20
179:19	30:1	<b>exempts</b>	<b>expertise</b>	266:23,24	<b>fashion</b>	273:3	143:12
260:3 266:7	<b>excess</b> 147:20	173:5	215:16	<b>fact</b> 24:12	207:17	275:23	147:14
267:9,16	148:17	<b>exhibit</b>	267:12,17	56:11,14	<b>faster</b> 166:24	279:14	149:5,16
270:13	<b>exchanged</b>	167:15	271:6	91:13 94:16	264:7	<b>figured</b>	151:8
280:21	283:1	<b>exist</b> 137:19	<b>experts</b> 183:7	113:15	<b>father</b> 153:10	107:14	<b>financially</b>
<b>eventually</b>	<b>excited</b>	<b>existing</b> 62:24	<b>expiring</b>	118:11	<b>fault</b> 101:15	207:1	118:22
22:9 116:10	132:24	183:12	119:7	120:11,12	<b>favor</b> 100:24	<b>file</b> 12:20	166:20
<b>everybody</b>	133:15	185:19	<b>explain</b> 24:13	143:2 209:8	<b>February</b>	14:1,11	<b>find</b> 42:11
84:2 156:13	<b>exclude</b>	<b>exists</b> 136:21	87:9 189:8	233:2	129:5 247:2	82:12 184:7	51:14 53:10
166:19	154:23	156:24	<b>explained</b>	244:20	<b>Fed</b> 54:5	206:3	62:23 80:20
210:2	155:3	<b>expand</b>	118:2	255:4	<b>federal</b> 52:17	218:23	104:16
<b>everybody's</b>	<b>excluded</b>	141:19	119:22	259:24	176:11	<b>filed</b> 176:17	123:3
241:24	154:15	<b>expansion</b>	120:2	<b>factor</b> 264:23	<b>Feds</b> 53:14	179:7,18,20	165:13
<b>evidence</b>	157:8	50:21 55:19	<b>explanation</b>	<b>facts</b> 79:10	<b>fee</b> 86:8,9	187:12,17	215:19
288:4	<b>exclusions</b>	<b>expect</b> 143:14	60:18 122:5	<b>factual</b>	170:22	188:9 203:1	218:23
<b>exacerbate</b>	154:12	144:9	256:17	153:21	<b>feed</b> 132:15	203:11,12	220:21
228:16	157:5,9	200:17	268:24	<b>fair</b> 24:21	132:17	<b>filing</b> 38:2,4	223:2
<b>exact</b> 32:15	<b>Excuse</b> 45:15	203:15	<b>exposure</b>	137:21	<b>feedback</b>	<b>fill</b> 213:3	229:12
32:20 70:10	80:5 157:23	227:11	20:16 27:16	175:22	126:12	<b>filled</b> 205:2	244:16,20
80:17	<b>Executive</b>	248:6	59:12	186:6	<b>feel</b> 46:19	213:5	246:22
129:12	161:13	266:10	<b>extend</b> 222:5	192:10,19	63:2 79:11	250:20	247:14
149:20	162:11	<b>expectation</b>	<b>extended</b>	195:2 196:9	129:14	<b>Final</b> 72:18	275:6
151:15	<b>exempt</b> 172:4	82:15	90:12 91:1	205:9 242:6	144:17	<b>finalize</b> 100:3	<b>finding</b>
191:2	176:12	143:23	93:22	<b>fairly</b> 181:16	188:16	<b>finalized</b>	282:24
280:19	218:17	144:9,11	<b>extending</b>	222:13	191:24	69:22	<b>fine</b> 82:7
<b>exactly</b> 132:5	219:24	<b>expects</b> 56:20	91:3	239:8	208:22	<b>finally</b> 93:13	246:14
132:9	257:16,18	<b>expenditure</b>	<b>extent</b> 33:21	<b>Fairmount</b>	240:15	113:20,21	<b>finely</b> 103:2
151:18	257:19	62:13	37:15	257:17	241:10,15	141:15	<b>finish</b> 225:4
171:1	266:19	<b>expenditures</b>	177:24	<b>fairness</b>	241:18	278:15	<b>finished</b>
194:18	269:16	50:17 51:1	178:19	264:8	244:7	<b>finance</b> 3:17	211:19
247:6 261:7	270:5	51:3	<b>external</b>	<b>faith</b> 119:20	<b>fees</b> 88:6	3:22 4:8,12	233:19
277:21	<b>exemption</b>	<b>expense</b> 56:8	270:1	<b>fall</b> 27:7,12	89:11	4:14,15,24	<b>finite</b> 37:23
<b>examine</b>	12:15 13:11	57:12 185:8	<b>extra</b> 67:1	45:17	168:12,13	5:12,23	<b>firepower</b>
185:17	179:13	<b>expenses</b> 55:8	118:18	115:24	168:14	45:12,16	212:17
<b>examined</b>	181:1,4,8	55:15 57:10	<b>extreme</b>	129:13	170:7,8,13	48:5 59:8	214:14
183:11	182:5	147:20	199:8	151:18	170:15	94:10,14	<b>firms</b> 211:6
<b>example</b> 7:13	219:13,23	148:17	<b>extremely</b>	257:11	171:15	97:6 127:10	<b>first</b> 3:19 4:11
15:24 28:8	220:4 221:4	171:7	52:21	<b>family</b> 83:24	<b>felt</b> 188:23	132:3	38:3 70:22
28:15 33:19	221:5 223:2	<b>expensive</b>	221:18	178:9	259:2	172:20	74:2,4
43:14 57:23	244:14	52:17	223:13	271:20	<b>Ferry</b> 226:14	186:17	118:13
132:14	246:4,10,21	195:22	244:24	272:18	<b>fewer</b> 79:16	285:5	124:2 135:8
134:23	251:6	<b>experience</b>	263:19	273:6,14,19	<b>fight</b> 100:18	<b>Finance's</b>	140:16
153:23	274:22	137:6,11	278:23	273:21	222:5	4:10	142:2 148:5
155:1 157:6	275:5	138:8	<b>eye</b> 278:20	<b>far</b> 18:2	<b>figure</b> 15:6	<b>Finance/OPA</b>	159:4
171:3	<b>exemptions</b>	149:24		23:15 67:2	16:7,7	157:24	164:15
195:10	176:3 218:6	181:19	<b>F</b>	92:22 134:3	63:20,22	<b>finances</b>	168:6
199:7 218:7	218:10,22	205:19	<b>F</b> 288:1	173:5 187:3	70:13 85:21	150:3,11,24	172:19
218:19	219:4,6,9	281:6	<b>faces</b> 180:14	188:5,7,18	156:1	<b>financial</b> 2:19	173:2
219:20	219:13,17	<b>experienced</b>	<b>facilitate</b>	189:9	194:16	4:16,19	176:15
			180:9				



Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 13

179:7,9	230:17	216:12,20	87:15	<b>frankly</b>	<b>fundamental</b>	<b>G</b>	114:4
184:8	248:20	217:9	119:23	266:23	137:19	<b>G341</b> 283:8	149:10
186:16	280:8	227:11	122:2,3	<b>free</b> 216:2	138:13	<b>gallons</b> 104:5	168:8
195:15	<b>five-year</b>	250:16	123:12,13	<b>frequently</b>	<b>funded</b>	<b>game</b> 140:19	201:15
197:20	156:2	269:19	123:14	17:12 18:3	120:10	<b>gap</b> 188:24	204:5 207:5
201:24	<b>fix</b> 101:20	270:9,19	154:13	20:22 182:8	125:3	197:21,22	211:23
202:8,24	132:21	280:11	268:19	248:3	<b>funding</b> 5:7	201:10	216:22
203:18	199:6	<b>follow</b> 6:18	<b>formulas</b>	<b>Friday</b> 52:16	16:24 41:3	<b>garage</b>	217:5
218:11	214:15,18	20:20 25:20	119:21	53:5,17	42:1,14	234:12	250:22
219:11	215:7	26:9 76:6	<b>forth</b> 46:22	54:1 182:12	43:7,10	<b>gas</b> 165:2	253:10
220:22	<b>fixed</b> 65:19	102:10	48:2,4 49:9	<b>fringe</b> 5:11	62:15 63:8	<b>gathering</b>	264:17,17
226:21	<b>flag</b> 54:14	136:16	195:5 207:3	<b>front</b> 32:3	113:17,23	185:3,16	264:19
227:10	<b>flags</b> 254:10	145:19	<b>forward</b> 3:14	136:9	114:2	<b>gauge</b> 199:20	<b>GFOA</b> 49:12
228:7	<b>flat</b> 57:13	152:7 170:1	54:9 58:13	246:13	146:23	<b>general</b> 50:3	<b>Girard</b>
233:22	163:6	202:6	65:23	252:24	147:2 148:7	65:6 71:21	226:17
236:18	<b>flavor</b> 32:13	246:24	105:19	<b>fruit</b> 34:5	<b>fundraiser</b>	75:5 78:7	283:11,18
242:18	80:13	254:21	142:4	<b>frustration</b>	228:15	105:11	283:19
251:7	<b>flavoring</b>	<b>follow-up</b>	185:21	24:19	<b>funds</b> 15:22	124:16	<b>give</b> 11:4 29:7
260:12	120:21	46:11 102:7	188:12	<b>full</b> 27:6 46:5	42:8 45:13	125:5	31:13 41:18
262:3	<b>fledged</b> 70:16	170:3	198:21	70:6,16,20	62:17 119:1	140:12	43:3 44:4
264:19	<b>flexibility</b>	262:22	199:4 217:7	118:12	126:6	152:1	45:4 48:12
<b>fiscal</b> 2:11,13	63:4 154:22	<b>following</b>	223:3 227:8	160:3	162:22	161:18	79:3 86:11
2:15,20,22	155:3	3:17	247:21	<b>fully</b> 63:24	<b>furniture</b>	162:24	87:10,18
3:13,14,15	<b>flow</b> 171:10	<b>follows</b>	253:22	117:19	200:7	165:3	101:1
4:18 57:22	<b>FLR</b> 204:12	162:23	254:23	128:4 288:5	<b>further</b> 6:22	171:10	132:10
70:23	<b>FLRs</b> 203:10	<b>food</b> 102:22	275:11	<b>function</b>	6:22 99:13	177:3	154:6 195:5
138:20,23	<b>flyers</b> 192:8	102:23	280:3	45:20	101:6,17,21	178:22	195:6,8,10
147:15,15	<b>focus</b> 19:1	116:14	282:16	<b>functioning</b>	114:13	273:17	202:3
147:22,23	29:11,17	142:20	<b>found</b> 203:4	200:23	133:5	280:18	205:24
148:1,18,18	32:7 77:15	<b>footage</b>	282:5	201:4	173:14	<b>generally</b>	209:1,4
151:12,13	108:15	284:13	<b>fountain</b>	<b>functions</b>	182:19	36:19 71:19	214:16
152:13	176:22	285:19	21:18	4:17 5:14	190:10	109:9	215:6 216:2
161:16,18	182:22	<b>foregoing</b>	<b>four</b> 21:11,16	5:21 270:14	256:16	124:10	218:3,7
162:4,17,20	185:6	288:7,15	98:1 184:18	<b>fund</b> 3:18	<b>future</b> 41:5	130:4	219:19
162:21	212:23	<b>foremost</b>	195:10	43:19 49:11	53:9 54:16	<b>generate</b>	220:16,18
165:18	213:8	226:21	198:3	49:13,18	57:6 59:11	207:17	226:6 231:5
166:1,2	214:22	<b>foresee</b> 35:20	241:14	50:3,9	126:2	<b>gentleman</b>	251:15
175:19	259:1	36:1	248:20	51:11,17,21	278:13	108:19	252:1
177:2,5,8	<b>focused</b>	<b>forever</b> 220:7	257:12	55:11 57:4	<b>FY</b> 4:10	286:18	<b>given</b> 18:10
185:2	184:19	<b>forgot</b> 278:4	258:23	57:9 65:18	<b>FY15</b> 44:2	<b>gentrification</b>	32:21 35:10
<b>five</b> 2:18	<b>focuses</b>	<b>form</b> 13:21	259:12	65:24 66:11	72:12	228:4	74:4 152:11
21:11,17	129:18	13:23 14:8	280:8	86:13,23	148:23	<b>gentrifying</b>	167:16
22:3 49:19	<b>focusing</b>	14:10 69:3	<b>fourth</b> 197:19	124:16	247:4	226:13	191:23
49:22 55:9	184:13	76:21	258:10	125:5	<b>FY16</b> 5:9	227:6 228:2	258:23
55:14,18	<b>fold</b> 190:22	238:16	<b>frame</b> 71:3	151:17	44:3 148:24	<b>getting</b> 22:20	282:4 284:7
72:10 89:1	190:22	<b>formal</b>	95:19	156:14	<b>FY17</b> 5:4	24:23 25:3	284:11
91:16,19,23	<b>folder</b> 123:4,7	179:17	106:22	160:19	44:3 49:21	71:13 78:15	<b>gives</b> 15:10
91:24 92:7	<b>folk</b> 70:17	<b>formalized</b>	109:20	161:14,19	112:21,23	95:23 96:6	86:22
93:19	<b>folks</b> 17:8,8	281:22	<b>Frank</b> 17:23	162:12,13	147:5	98:15	202:10
112:20,24	31:18 77:23	<b>former</b>	68:23	162:17,24	<b>FY18</b> 49:21	104:16,18	237:11
119:5,6	144:1,10	234:23	<b>Franklin</b>	165:3	<b>FY19</b> 55:12	104:19	<b>giving</b> 86:23
122:18,22	196:10,12	244:6	168:24	171:11	<b>FY2016</b>	105:12	168:13
153:8	215:14	<b>formula</b>	195:11	177:3	161:20	113:12	213:15

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 14

<b>glad</b> 141:21	274:16	84:4,9,10	226:4,9	196:4	44:11,17,23	<b>growing</b>	57:7,18
<b>glass</b> 263:5	275:11	84:16,18,22	227:17	201:22,23	45:3,11	228:3	58:9,14,17
<b>GMA</b> 78:6,18	276:23	85:1,23	230:10,11	209:22	46:10 47:5	<b>grows</b> 124:3	59:1,4,9,18
283:8	281:17	89:9 91:10	230:19	212:9,18	47:8,11	<b>growth</b> 51:4	59:23 60:4
<b>GMAs</b>	286:3	91:14 92:2	232:10,15	216:5	72:19 110:9	223:18	60:14,17,22
265:23	<b>goal</b> 51:21	93:5 95:4	237:13,14	217:23	110:17	227:23	61:7 62:3
<b>go</b> 5:3 6:19	77:4 95:22	98:6 99:4	237:16	218:1	113:3,4	228:5,6	63:11 64:6
13:3 15:21	96:5 143:4	100:23,24	240:4,7,11	219:10	117:18	271:3	138:9
16:3 18:15	143:10	106:5	240:11,19	222:12	146:14,15	<b>guarantee</b>	<b>Gym's</b> 137:16
33:6 50:5	176:14,18	107:14	241:2,3,4	236:4	147:4,7,10	106:9	
50:18 55:5	178:5,13	108:17	241:13	240:16	147:17	<b>guess</b> 10:5,12	<b>H</b>
65:24 68:16	182:19	118:16,17	243:24	249:9	148:4,10,15	22:24 24:11	<b>habits</b> 135:14
70:2,6 71:7	184:12	118:21	245:1 249:8	254:16	149:1,7,23	24:20 36:5	<b>half</b> 70:22
72:5,23	185:16	121:10	249:15	256:21,22	150:9,13,18	40:13 56:6	79:21 94:23
79:11 80:22	186:2,6	125:4	253:21	261:21	150:21	57:7 63:19	98:20,22
81:21,22	212:16	126:10	254:14,23	277:15	151:3,20	65:3 101:19	99:24 170:7
88:21 92:19	216:23	127:8 129:3	255:6,9	282:12	152:4	114:20	215:4 255:5
94:7 96:11	236:9 241:2	130:17	256:1,2,6,8	286:13	<b>Green's</b>	131:5 134:5	284:19
101:20	<b>goals</b> 42:2	131:13	258:20	<b>gotten</b> 9:9	152:7	134:15,20	<b>hall</b> 1:5
102:19	216:23	135:11	259:9,10	119:14	<b>Greenlee</b> 1:11	135:17,18	152:24
133:4	<b>God</b> 101:14	138:14	260:7,16,19	216:12,18	21:23,24	137:2 151:5	245:3 287:5
145:21	<b>goes</b> 12:7	140:4 144:1	260:23	216:20	22:12 23:14	171:17	<b>hamstrings</b>
146:2,4	35:15,24	144:9 145:3	261:14	248:18,24	23:22 24:2	187:2	53:11
159:15	81:1 87:13	145:15	263:12	<b>government</b>	24:5,16,20	190:24	<b>hand</b> 19:20
160:19	88:9,10	148:14,16	264:20,22	49:12 52:20	25:1,6,10	201:16	<b>handle</b> 58:19
173:14	134:24	151:16,21	282:16	176:10	201:20,21	204:5	59:2 213:13
174:3	135:1,2,3	154:2	283:16	223:16	201:24	205:24	262:23
188:12,15	231:14	156:10	284:1 285:6	<b>governmen...</b>	202:17	207:7 208:2	263:1
190:10	<b>going</b> 2:3	159:7	286:14	269:14	203:5,8,14	213:4,11	268:11
194:23	12:10 13:5	160:14	<b>good</b> 2:2 4:2	<b>governments</b>	203:20	221:11	<b>handled</b>
195:13	13:6 15:12	161:11	4:3,5 6:14	52:18	204:1,4	248:19	242:22
203:18	15:15,21	165:14,23	11:6,7	<b>graciously</b>	205:7,23	265:23	<b>handling</b>
208:17	17:3 19:23	166:16,22	17:23 18:1	244:6	206:8,13,16	270:18	97:21
212:8 214:2	20:5 23:12	166:22	22:1 25:18	<b>Grays</b> 226:14	206:20,24	277:23	<b>hands</b> 118:22
214:14	26:5,14	173:11	25:19 36:15	<b>great</b> 42:6	207:11,23	280:7,22	<b>happen</b> 39:24
215:4	31:6 32:22	187:5,20	39:4 48:19	51:19	208:22	282:15	56:13 65:8
216:19	32:23 33:14	188:16	48:20 55:3	123:11	209:15	<b>guessing</b>	72:22 90:22
221:3 223:9	34:12,16,18	189:5,14	55:4 64:12	157:18	212:6	105:11	100:10
225:15	37:4 39:17	191:4 194:8	65:13 68:19	189:3 208:8	242:15,16	213:6	101:12
231:23	39:19 41:16	194:13,17	71:7 73:7	213:7	243:1,9,12	<b>guidelines</b>	108:6
232:1	43:12 45:5	194:21,22	73:24 74:1	243:17	243:17,23	4:18 222:6	166:23
241:15,16	46:6 50:18	195:1,4,5,8	77:23 79:5	244:1	<b>grocery</b> 84:10	<b>guy</b> 144:3	187:3 212:2
241:22	54:11 56:14	196:6	82:18 83:17	263:24	103:3	204:17	212:5
242:18	57:11 58:12	197:24	94:5,15	<b>greater</b>	<b>gross</b> 8:9	239:3	237:15
244:10	64:16 65:23	198:10,14	97:7,8	179:15	191:17	<b>guys</b> 31:21	264:6
252:6	68:10,12	199:4 201:8	118:18	<b>greatest</b>	<b>ground</b>	78:6 112:17	<b>happens</b> 9:21
253:20	70:2,16	201:8 202:5	128:15	137:6	193:14	163:13	11:10 23:20
254:5,10,14	74:10 76:11	204:11	136:10,15	<b>Greatly</b>	234:22	199:2 210:2	33:7 51:2
259:20	77:3 81:11	205:21	160:21,23	247:24	<b>group</b> 30:7	212:16	57:2,2,16
260:7 262:4	81:24 82:6	207:3 209:8	161:6	<b>Green</b> 1:11	185:12	214:7,17	237:21
267:12	82:8,16,19	217:7,8	162:10	40:23,24	<b>groups</b>	215:6	265:2
268:9	82:20 83:3	218:20	175:1,3	41:24 42:23	178:12	<b>Gym</b> 1:12	<b>happily</b> 61:5
273:15	83:20 84:2	225:13	194:5,15,15	43:8,20	<b>grow</b> 118:24	55:2,3,5	<b>happy</b> 6:11
							87:6 110:17

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 15

162:9 163:8	<b>Helen</b> 1:12	132:22	245:21	263:16,21	150:4	22:15	120:19
186:12	137:16	<b>Herb</b> 141:2	<b>homes</b> 273:19	285:24	<b>impacts</b>	182:19	171:1 185:8
249:13	<b>help</b> 44:10	<b>Herman</b>	<b>Homestead</b>	<b>hurdles</b> 69:8	34:23	183:1 207:8	185:9 273:8
<b>hard</b> 24:12	61:18 63:22	175:11	181:1,8	<b>hurt</b> 153:16	134:18	<b>improved</b>	278:13
72:6 93:14	64:3 88:15	<b>hey</b> 14:1	182:4,10		226:18	178:6,14	<b>income-based</b>
170:12	96:17	141:8	221:21	<b>I</b>	<b>imperative</b>	184:17	271:14
221:18	130:23	254:10	222:7,22	<b>i.e</b> 169:12	157:16	<b>improvement</b>	<b>incoming</b>
222:4	133:10	<b>hi</b> 13:12 61:1	223:1	187:3	<b>implement</b>	57:14	223:23
<b>harder</b>	162:15	102:16	244:14	<b>IAAO</b> 269:2	138:12	177:20	<b>inconsequ...</b>
268:16	181:2 194:2	120:18	245:17	<b>idea</b> 99:1	141:16	178:16,24	178:8
<b>Harrisburg</b>	217:12	154:10	246:4,17,21	156:13	144:13	184:15	<b>inconsisten...</b>
58:8 91:11	221:13	172:19	274:19,22	188:8	181:11	235:2	159:23
248:9	240:8,11	209:23	275:5	226:20	284:20	<b>improves</b>	<b>incorporati...</b>
<b>Hartford</b>	263:19	<b>hiding</b> 6:2	<b>honest</b> 84:8	227:5 228:7	<b>implementa...</b>	179:1	2:21
41:10	265:6 268:8	<b>high</b> 27:1	85:20,23	230:13	46:6 128:6	<b>improving</b>	<b>incorrect</b>
<b>hate</b> 96:16	276:1,9	65:19,21	199:17	231:5	168:8	162:4	179:12
189:11	281:11	89:8,18	200:16	262:10	180:18	<b>in-house</b>	193:17
<b>head</b> 21:1	<b>helped</b> 66:8,9	166:4 178:1	233:21	<b>ideas</b> 196:8	217:9	71:10	<b>increase</b> 5:8
63:6 75:2,9	66:22	258:12,13	<b>honor</b> 146:4	<b>identified</b>	<b>implemented</b>	<b>inaccuracies</b>	5:10,10
131:13	221:15	273:5	<b>hope</b> 133:3	99:16	9:3 60:9	228:17	16:24 41:21
<b>heads</b> 63:16	<b>helpful</b> 21:22	<b>higher</b> 75:21	165:22	120:24	67:9 78:24	<b>inaccurate</b>	41:22 42:5
63:16	47:24	75:24,24	200:15	<b>identify</b> 41:3	114:19	192:2	50:6 66:6
<b>health</b> 74:13	<b>helping</b>	134:20	206:9	45:23 99:11	128:14	<b>incentivized</b>	67:4 72:11
74:16 83:18	140:19	177:22	<b>hopefully</b>	103:3	<b>implementi...</b>	141:8	72:16 86:10
95:2 143:4	<b>helps</b> 65:21	182:23	129:13	115:10	131:1	<b>include</b> 16:22	87:24 88:18
143:11	124:21	241:21	135:24	<b>ignore</b> 93:19	185:20	129:23	88:24 89:2
<b>health-relat...</b>	207:16	<b>highlight</b>	282:4	<b>ignoring</b> 90:8	<b>implication</b>	176:7 185:6	89:3 111:18
154:16,23	<b>Henon</b> 1:12	162:1	<b>hoping</b> 136:6	90:11	285:12	246:2,3	113:6,20,21
155:2	31:4,5,14	<b>highly</b> 53:1	282:2	<b>illegal</b> 238:8	<b>importance</b>	269:7	113:21
<b>hear</b> 3:16	32:2,8,18	276:21	<b>hospital</b>	<b>imagine</b>	123:6	<b>included</b> 34:2	114:3,23
24:1,4,6	32:21 33:4	<b>hire</b> 212:7	176:10	39:24	<b>important</b>	146:20	161:19,21
37:9,10	33:11,24	<b>Hispanic</b> 7:21	<b>hospitality</b>	191:19	18:11 79:7	154:24	161:22
122:7	34:11,15,18	8:1,2	176:9	<b>immediately</b>	79:9 106:1	177:8	162:18,24
132:23	35:7,19	<b>historically</b>	<b>hot</b> 241:20	136:14	117:23	233:17,18	163:1,4,5
145:13	36:5,12	113:16	265:22	<b>Immigrant</b>	118:4	234:6	169:11
<b>heard</b> 46:13	37:3,6,12	114:1,7	<b>hotel</b> 200:12	60:7	121:15	238:17,19	180:15
100:6,15	38:17 39:18	<b>history</b> 130:8	<b>hotels</b> 184:21	<b>immune</b>	141:20	<b>includes</b> 5:6	233:1
137:18	39:22 40:7	130:9	<b>hotline</b>	269:17	143:6 211:4	154:14	<b>increased</b>
205:8 281:4	40:15,19	181:21	182:10	<b>impact</b> 9:9	223:13	168:8	25:24 71:12
<b>hearing</b> 2:4	64:7,8	<b>hold</b> 47:2	<b>hour</b> 155:8	32:23 33:14	235:20	176:11	90:5 127:4
3:9 30:13	123:19,20	169:24	<b>hours</b> 196:22	35:10 42:9	244:24	182:6	180:23
30:20 53:19	124:7,24	232:5	<b>house</b> 54:1	43:15 54:15	261:23	<b>including</b>	<b>increases</b>
76:23 123:3	125:12,17	<b>holes</b> 240:19	204:14	57:22 58:1	263:20	4:17 98:11	53:11
143:13	125:20	<b>home</b> 8:5	233:23	59:13 60:23	<b>impose</b>	165:2 166:2	124:16
194:14	126:10,16	271:20	244:7	66:4,11,15	139:16,17	181:23	134:16
212:9 287:6	126:21,24	273:15	<b>household</b>	93:10 106:5	173:7,8,20	196:13	181:3
<b>Hearings</b>	127:17,24	276:21	8:11	117:3	<b>imposed</b>	209:2	231:13
174:20	128:7,15	<b>homeowner</b>	<b>houses</b> 101:5	124:10	118:12	<b>inclusion</b> 49:1	<b>increasing</b>
<b>hears</b> 24:8	129:1,9,13	98:10	<b>huge</b> 214:24	134:16	<b>impossible</b>	<b>inclusive</b> 2:11	42:9
<b>heart</b> 85:12	129:15	<b>homeowners</b>	<b>hugely</b> 79:9	150:6	213:12	<b>income</b> 8:11	<b>Incremental</b>
141:11	130:1,18	98:13,14	<b>human</b>	<b>impacted</b>	<b>impression</b>	9:16 10:8,9	168:22
<b>heavy</b> 266:4	131:3,8,10	180:24	172:17	65:2 67:11	237:11	32:11,24	<b>incremental...</b>
<b>held</b> 196:7	131:15	181:14	<b>hundred</b>	97:11,16	<b>improve</b>	78:20	129:7
				<b>impactful</b>			

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 16

<b>indicate</b>	<b>informal</b>	<b>informative</b>	194:7,10	<b>interpretati...</b>	79:8 89:5	160:23	69:12,13,15
82:24	83:16 179:8	137:15	197:20	246:5	92:18 95:7	161:3,6,6,8	69:21 70:1
249:11	179:14	<b>informed</b>	<b>instituted</b>	<b>interrupting</b>	96:2 100:13	163:22	70:20 71:2
274:2,4	184:7	25:7 52:15	248:4	279:23	100:19	164:15	<b>juices</b> 34:5
285:21	<b>information</b>	<b>ingredient</b>	<b>instituting</b>	<b>introduce</b>	107:11	167:2,8,15	<b>July</b> 161:24
<b>indicated</b>	17:19 21:21	153:23	245:5	96:21,24	108:18	167:18	256:3
191:16	37:20 59:19	<b>inherent</b>	<b>institutiona...</b>	<b>introduced</b>	110:17	168:22	<b>jumped</b> 231:9
249:12	72:7 98:15	188:12	282:6	95:10	131:14	170:11,24	<b>jumps</b> 218:12
<b>indicates</b>	100:2 103:2	<b>initial</b> 41:1	<b>institutiona...</b>	<b>invaluable</b>	148:12	171:22	<b>June</b> 94:20
12:21 16:21	103:21	135:6,13	269:13	133:9	150:4 199:6	172:7,14	97:12 148:1
183:17	104:17	177:19	<b>institutiona...</b>	<b>inventory</b>	207:4 212:4	221:17	256:3
<b>indication</b>	105:10,23	179:4	266:13,22	217:4 267:8	222:3	225:24	<b>junior</b> 153:8
57:10	110:6,24	181:18	<b>institutions</b>	<b>invested</b>	248:17,21	226:1	<b>jurisdiction</b>
<b>indicators</b>	113:4	260:12	42:6 43:23	68:18	262:6	227:15	14:20
201:4	119:17	<b>initially</b> 97:14	<b>insurance</b>	<b>investment</b>	285:11	228:5,21	207:13
<b>individual</b>	121:15,16	97:16	74:14,16	28:10 56:10	<b>issued</b> 47:5	229:8,22	216:24
27:24 45:24	128:21	236:22	<b>intellectual</b>	56:21 171:8	53:18	230:18	264:16
81:7 99:10	129:21	237:7	279:12,16	213:20	<b>issues</b> 7:1 8:4	231:2,16	269:3
104:6	130:15	<b>initiative</b> 18:8	281:23	214:20	94:24 95:3	243:23,24	<b>jurisdictions</b>
229:19	131:19,20	19:2 43:1	<b>intense</b> 185:3	<b>investments</b>	95:23 96:15	244:8	10:21
273:2	132:15,17	177:9,11	<b>intent</b> 128:8	56:1 57:12	97:17 98:8	253:16,17	<b>jury</b> 189:14
281:22	146:19	180:18	242:3	124:22	101:14	253:20	<b>Justify</b>
<b>individually</b>	147:11,18	184:11	<b>interacting</b>	<b>investor</b>	141:12	254:8,13,17	276:10
22:22 61:12	148:5,8	226:6	269:24	162:5 214:6	149:5	254:20	<b>juxtapose</b>
<b>individuals</b>	149:11,14	<b>initiatives</b>	<b>interdepart...</b>	<b>invoice</b> 15:10	163:14	255:3 256:5	65:5
32:24 61:21	149:16,22	42:14 43:9	131:20	15:16 16:2	213:23	256:11,15	
226:17	150:2,15	86:20	<b>interest</b> 74:7	82:24	228:18	256:18,21	<b>K</b>
246:15	151:11,22	180:17	161:10	<b>invoices</b>	235:19	256:22	<b>K</b> 1:11
<b>industrial</b>	167:6 174:5	182:15	164:10,12	16:10,13,20	236:7 263:4	259:5	<b>Kathy</b> 172:19
176:10	182:3,5	<b>Inner</b> 226:15	164:13	17:5 18:18	268:3	260:10	172:19
183:6	186:18	<b>innovation</b>	165:21	18:19 19:14	<b>items</b> 60:10	262:17,20	173:2,19,22
184:20	191:13,18	133:1	169:12,16	20:9 82:23		271:4	174:11
274:21,22	191:23	185:24	169:17	<b>involve</b> 189:4	<b>J</b>	<b>Joining</b> 4:10	<b>Keene</b> 175:15
275:4	192:4 194:4	<b>input</b> 96:20	170:20,22	240:11	<b>J</b> 175:11	161:12	256:23,23
<b>industries</b>	196:23	<b>inquired</b>	171:5,9	266:22	<b>James</b> 175:10	<b>Jones</b> 1:13	259:13
121:17	197:1,4	283:17	200:19	<b>involved</b>	<b>JANNIE</b> 1:10	64:10,11,14	<b>keep</b> 25:5,7
<b>industry</b> 18:4	198:11,12	<b>insert</b> 133:11	<b>interested</b>	95:13 99:6	<b>January</b> 3:4	64:19 66:2	32:6 72:16
18:8 19:10	199:14,18	<b>instance</b>	53:19	131:24	<b>jar</b> 85:6	66:17,21,23	77:6 78:15
34:21,23	199:20	83:22	246:19	190:6	<b>JB</b> 10:14	67:10,14,19	81:5 86:17
35:9,12	200:13,16	188:21	<b>interesting</b>	203:21	<b>Jersey</b> 12:7	67:22 68:7	153:13
102:21	202:3,11	197:13	277:8	208:15	12:13 13:8	68:15,21	195:4
109:14	204:20	229:15	<b>intergovern...</b>	217:9	<b>jet</b> 11:21	70:4,12,15	212:23
114:23	207:20	252:5	2:24 3:2	233:21	<b>Jetro</b> 82:1,2	71:4,19,24	283:16
180:16	210:5	260:22	54:17 142:6	272:2	<b>job</b> 42:6	72:18 73:8	<b>keeping</b>
186:8 269:2	212:11	266:9	149:9	<b>irregardless</b>	117:23	73:12,16	86:23
<b>industry-ac...</b>	223:4 231:3	269:12	<b>internal</b>	79:7	118:4	76:7 110:24	<b>Kenyatta</b>
180:2	241:5	270:6 274:5	129:19	<b>IRS</b> 286:11	133:10	111:2,6	1:13 221:17
<b>inelastic</b> 65:8	244:20	275:22	282:20	<b>issue</b> 8:14	194:15	112:8 113:5	<b>Kevin</b> 175:15
<b>inequities</b>	247:13,21	<b>instances</b>	<b>internally</b>	10:12 14:14	213:13	205:15	256:23
177:17	261:24	180:22	278:19	22:6,7 23:4	240:6 259:3	<b>Jr</b> 1:13	<b>key</b> 226:15
228:16	272:8	184:2 190:3	279:6	48:24 52:18	<b>Joe</b> 205:14	175:10	<b>kick</b> 254:24
237:19	275:11,21	190:6 191:9	<b>internet</b>	53:12,22	<b>Johnson</b> 1:13	<b>judgments</b>	<b>kicking</b> 118:5
<b>info</b> 251:19	278:8	193:3,14,15	182:9	58:10 63:8	53:23,23	58:21 69:4	<b>kind</b> 20:1
					54:21		23:5,19,20

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 17

27:1 29:14	12:19 14:22	114:16,20	221:12,13	<b>L</b>	258:11	15:9 34:10	<b>liabilities</b>
31:8 32:6	15:14,16,18	116:7	223:14	<b>L</b> 1:9,10,14	269:3 283:9	40:16 43:15	180:24
32:23 37:22	15:20 16:2	118:11,15	226:7	<b>L&amp;I</b> 96:12	<b>larger</b> 70:2	95:10 96:21	<b>liability</b> 59:11
42:18 50:19	16:12 17:22	119:16	227:19	132:14	203:12	97:1 107:10	125:3
51:2,6 58:1	18:3 19:13	120:12	228:3,14	<b>labor</b> 173:9	205:13	107:16	<b>liable</b> 81:14
59:18 60:10	19:16,19	121:15,16	229:16	<b>lack</b> 10:10	<b>largest</b> 27:16	108:12,14	<b>license</b> 38:1
60:22 61:5	20:1,24	121:18	230:15	22:8 180:1	211:6 271:1	108:20	130:8
62:12 66:9	21:1,9 22:2	125:14	231:11	<b>lady</b> 155:18	<b>lastly</b> 271:8	154:14	145:24
69:11,23	22:4,6,20	126:12,13	232:6	244:4	<b>late</b> 81:15	157:5	146:5
73:1 79:1	22:21 23:7	126:18	236:10,15	<b>lag</b> 41:7	<b>Laughter</b>	221:14,21	280:16,17
79:23 86:19	24:7,13,17	127:2	237:9	230:6 261:5	64:18 107:1	246:6	280:19,21
91:15,17	28:13 31:15	131:23	239:16	<b>lags</b> 262:14	<b>law</b> 12:11,21	<b>legislative</b>	<b>licensed</b>
95:2,22	32:5 33:9	133:12	241:10,13	<b>land</b> 176:13	35:3 59:3,6	43:1 93:17	12:19 37:21
107:13	33:12 35:12	136:1,10,22	242:19,20	183:3,6,8	59:8 81:12	121:2 237:4	37:21 38:4
116:14	37:6,19,24	139:9	242:20,22	183:11	93:1 240:3	248:8	81:12,17,19
130:3	38:2,5,11	140:10	243:1	214:23	<b>lawsuit</b> 249:2	<b>legislators</b>	82:18
133:11	38:12,13,20	143:20,21	245:22	215:1 233:4	<b>lawsuits</b>	58:7 90:24	<b>lien</b> 77:10
141:18	38:21,22,22	149:7,18,20	246:15	234:13,22	58:20	<b>Lehigh</b> 283:8	<b>liened</b> 141:8
151:18	39:5,12	151:15	248:10,21	235:2	<b>lawyers</b> 212:7	283:12	<b>liens</b> 69:3
157:24	41:24 42:2	152:2 153:6	249:16,19	254:22	<b>lay</b> 157:13	284:2	70:21 71:1
166:20	42:18 43:12	155:9	253:6,9,22	255:21	<b>laying</b> 254:21	<b>lenient</b>	130:7 132:1
186:20	47:20 49:16	157:23	254:10	256:7 257:2	<b>layoff</b> 64:23	189:24	<b>lieu</b> 123:8
192:23	50:3 51:22	159:21	260:24	257:4,7,11	<b>lead</b> 100:15	<b>let's</b> 106:24	<b>life</b> 153:11
197:21	51:24 52:9	161:10	261:3,6,13	257:16	100:17,23	146:2	189:17
205:2,14	52:21 55:9	162:23	264:20	258:15,24	101:16	156:21	<b>light</b> 55:9
207:6	56:14,17,22	164:6,9	265:20	259:4,11,24	<b>leadership</b>	189:13	<b>likes</b> 156:13
216:18	57:4,5,11	165:4,12,21	267:5	260:1	138:11	276:23	<b>liking</b> 116:11
218:18	58:11 59:1	165:22	268:18,23	263:10,23	<b>lean</b> 278:22	<b>letting</b> 188:12	<b>limited</b> 62:17
228:14	61:11,20	167:6	270:21	275:14	<b>learn</b> 69:11	<b>level</b> 20:15	181:17
231:11	63:17 69:17	168:23	271:8	276:5,14	69:17 107:3	29:13 31:20	234:21
234:21	73:9 75:8,8	173:14	273:15,15	<b>land's</b> 183:13	223:19	39:16,17	<b>limiting</b>
237:9	75:14 79:14	187:19	275:7	<b>land-to-imp...</b>	<b>learned</b> 69:24	40:18 42:1	257:5,9
247:14	81:9 82:19	188:6	276:21	183:15	196:14	56:4 57:21	<b>limits</b> 52:23
248:18	82:20 83:15	189:15	278:16	184:3	<b>leave</b> 121:13	58:1 66:12	<b>line</b> 15:11,19
253:10	84:11,13	191:14,14	280:4,6	<b>landscape</b>	281:1,23	67:18	43:17 60:10
261:13	85:3 87:15	191:16	282:7,9,11	35:20	286:18	113:10,17	66:5,9
262:9	88:10 90:22	192:9,14	282:18	<b>lane</b> 249:19	<b>leaving</b>	113:23	83:14
267:18	91:5,13	193:10	283:19,20	<b>language</b>	279:15	114:1	118:13,16
274:2 282:8	93:11 94:16	194:2 195:9	283:20	60:8,23	<b>left</b> 139:4	176:15	141:5
285:2	94:23 95:1	196:6 198:6	284:24	63:14 64:1	175:14	178:6,14	195:14
<b>kinds</b> 52:23	95:5,6,8,15	198:14	285:1,3	137:17,20	216:15	179:9,12	225:4
<b>KING</b> 288:11	95:17 96:1	199:2,4,16	<b>knowledge</b>	137:23	278:16	183:2,10	255:14
<b>kitchen</b> 101:4	96:8,9,16	200:19	279:4	148:17	279:11,12	184:8 202:9	281:2
<b>knack</b> 267:18	97:14,15,17	202:9	281:11	154:14	<b>legal</b> 14:23	202:15,24	<b>lines</b> 146:4
<b>knew</b> 9:2	97:20 98:13	204:22	283:1	182:14	35:1,3	203:18	<b>link</b> 132:8
96:14 123:5	99:1,23	205:16	<b>known</b>	<b>LanguageL...</b>	46:13 59:5	206:22	141:3
151:16,18	100:5	206:9 207:6	178:21	61:13	69:2,2,6	267:11	<b>liquid</b> 53:1
151:21,23	105:11	207:18	217:18	<b>large</b> 10:13	80:24	281:5	<b>liquor</b> 36:22
156:1	106:1,3	208:3,5,19	<b>knows</b> 37:20	39:23 92:11	107:11,13	<b>levels</b> 31:14	37:1,2,15
192:18	108:1,11,16	209:9	199:17	135:13	121:13	180:15	80:21,23
198:5,10	109:2,5	214:23	215:21	176:8	144:18,20	<b>leveraging</b>	<b>list</b> 120:17,19
<b>know</b> 7:13	112:17	216:6,11	282:7	195:22	175:16,24	162:3	120:22
9:3 10:4	113:5	217:3 218:7	<b>kudos</b> 48:23	241:23	<b>legislation</b>	<b>levied</b> 31:12	121:2,9

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 18

136:20	185:7,14	235:1	260:21,24	205:23	29:14	175:8	157:7
137:1	258:6,22	237:17	261:14	207:21,21	<b>Madam</b>	210:24	<b>MARK</b> 1:16
274:20	<b>locally</b> 105:2	238:1,9,15	275:20	212:22	145:10	224:8 264:9	<b>market</b> 78:7
<b>listed</b> 195:14	<b>located</b> 15:3	239:17	278:3,5	213:22	146:15	<b>managers</b>	79:24 179:6
<b>Listen</b> 232:8	32:16 79:24	240:9,9	282:14	214:13	155:20	28:10,12	179:17
<b>listing</b> 175:21	176:20	241:8	<b>looks</b> 35:21	216:20	244:1	49:2,8	182:17
<b>literally</b>	<b>location</b> 82:8	249:24	56:7,9 87:4	229:14	<b>magic</b> 201:17	171:9	183:12,17
283:14	<b>locational</b>	250:2	103:22	234:12	<b>magnifying</b>	<b>manages</b> 45:7	183:18
<b>literature</b>	45:22	257:10,16	131:24	235:17	263:5	162:2	184:16
143:1	<b>long</b> 14:7	257:20	186:22	242:20	<b>MAI</b> 185:14	181:22	185:1,15
<b>litigation</b>	50:22 95:6	258:17	<b>looming</b>	243:14	<b>mailed</b>	<b>managing</b>	195:14,24
46:19	100:6	259:20,23	93:15,16	257:17	183:21	22:5 215:19	199:9
107:17,18	106:14,19	263:6 267:7	<b>LOOP</b>	258:16	<b>mailing</b>	282:22	257:24
108:14	108:10	273:2,7,13	181:12,17	259:19	172:10	<b>mandate</b> 60:9	258:22
132:2 144:6	120:10,11	273:17,17	222:8	260:1 265:1	<b>mailroom</b>	63:14,15	261:4 272:5
<b>little</b> 13:3,3	138:18	273:22,23	244:13	265:2,19	28:17	64:1 138:5	272:23
33:12 37:18	164:23	274:1,6	245:16	266:17	<b>main</b> 94:20	138:10	<b>marketing</b>
45:4 51:4	176:18	277:20	246:17,21	268:16	97:11 141:5	<b>Mann</b> 43:24	103:22
52:6,11	180:21	278:20	274:20	269:9,16,19	<b>maintain</b>	72:20,22	118:14
54:6 55:6	181:12,14	<b>looked</b> 9:3,4	<b>Lord</b> 101:3	270:18	33:1 236:19	<b>manner</b>	<b>markets</b>
56:19 66:19	208:9	26:23 46:15	<b>lose</b> 67:20	273:20	<b>maintains</b>	142:6	257:14
78:1 107:7	<b>longer</b> 109:24	60:11 83:20	189:6	276:12,15	49:13	175:23	<b>married</b>
108:17	248:13	112:19,21	193:20	276:18	<b>maintenance</b>	183:16	153:7
109:24	<b>look</b> 17:9	134:8,14,16	<b>losing</b> 56:11	278:1	180:9	<b>mansions</b>	<b>marrying</b>
111:19	18:19 19:13	182:19	187:6	<b>lots</b> 233:7,8,9	<b>major</b> 32:22	141:5	129:23
142:8 179:3	20:17 28:10	235:3	263:15	233:14	177:13	<b>manual</b>	<b>Mary</b> 205:15
191:15	28:11 33:6	248:11	<b>loss</b> 116:18	234:4	219:22	219:19	<b>Maryland</b>
192:8	51:2 55:13	<b>looking</b> 3:14	124:23	259:19	<b>majority</b>	221:2	12:5,7,14
216:15,19	55:14 57:1	15:13,13	190:10	272:7	97:13	<b>manually</b>	<b>mass</b> 175:14
222:16	59:10 78:24	16:16 17:9	270:8	<b>loud</b> 208:7	266:18	220:14	177:23
233:20	79:1 80:9	18:17 20:9	<b>losses</b> 67:9	<b>love</b> 91:3	<b>making</b> 29:1	<b>manufactur...</b>	180:2,6
238:5	83:13 84:24	28:6,9	158:12	92:14	36:14 40:2	32:13,14	207:16
248:18	85:4 87:20	41:13 42:13	159:1 194:1	136:22	51:7 64:22	80:13	<b>massive</b> 23:5
250:9	91:17	51:22 83:6	<b>lost</b> 193:16	232:9,12,19	71:15 95:4	120:20	<b>Master</b>
251:24	102:19	83:6,10	212:22	<b>low</b> 32:24	98:12 105:5	121:9	256:24
255:11	103:23	85:6 87:2	<b>lot</b> 8:8 9:10	50:10 65:18	126:4	<b>map</b> 226:24	<b>match</b> 87:13
261:15	105:10	91:21 93:12	24:6,9,9	69:16 84:14	128:20	227:3	<b>matching</b>
262:14	120:6 122:3	105:4 113:7	64:15,17,20	118:6 158:4	140:11	230:19	132:20
266:21	126:9	125:9 126:6	67:20 71:8	178:2 233:5	148:6	<b>maps</b> 229:17	<b>materials</b>
267:10	138:18	134:17	71:16 85:23	249:10	194:15	230:20	25:22 61:24
268:8,24	146:3	138:20	87:24 88:22	<b>lower</b> 9:16	202:21	233:19	<b>matter</b> 224:3
<b>live</b> 226:17	156:15	141:2 191:5	96:3 118:17	10:8,9	237:10	<b>March</b> 129:6	224:11,14
<b>lives</b> 68:7	158:9	197:9	123:6 136:1	50:14 65:14	<b>man</b> 242:19	166:10	255:4
<b>living</b> 88:18	165:14	198:20	159:16,19	65:15 76:16	<b>manage</b>	197:17	261:13
95:1,2	174:3 194:1	217:1,6	160:12	119:9,9	36:17 145:4	262:7	288:7
101:7	213:21	223:1	188:2	177:22	212:17	<b>margin</b> 84:13	<b>matters</b> 58:20
<b>lobby</b> 53:13	214:10,20	229:10,11	189:19	182:20	213:16	<b>Maria</b> 1:15	<b>Matthew</b>
140:19	214:20	233:3,15	192:4 193:3	205:4 230:2	<b>management</b>	84:9	161:13
252:24	224:10	234:3 236:9	196:10,12	<b>lowers</b> 65:22	4:20 58:18	<b>Marisa</b> 11:8	162:11
<b>local</b> 33:13	227:2 229:6	237:11	196:14	<b>lucky</b> 81:3,4	94:9,13	102:16	<b>matures</b>
57:20 66:16	229:24	240:17	201:9,11		95:16 97:7	120:18	220:6
87:13 104:2	230:4,6	254:2,3	204:18,20	<b>M</b>	162:15	128:11	<b>maturity</b>
184:16	231:8,10	255:7,12	205:20,21	<b>M</b> 288:11	167:16,20	154:10	165:19
				<b>M/W/DBE</b>			

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 19

<b>maximizing</b> 279:9	231:12 243:6 252:5	161:7 175:4 175:8	154:1 157:6 <b>million</b> 5:8,10	199:8 <b>mind</b> 77:6	<b>modernizing</b> 68:17	54:7 185:12 <b>Montgomery</b>	271:21 <b>multi-regio...</b>
<b>Mayor</b> 2:23 3:4 35:7 46:14 94:16 96:17 156:11	272:16 273:9 278:22 <b>meaning</b> 152:19	221:22 239:22 <b>members'</b> 136:8	5:13,20 7:16 15:20 25:23 26:1 27:3,14 41:15 49:16	153:14 196:16 218:8 <b>mine</b> 238:24 <b>miniscule</b>	<b>modification</b> 240:12 <b>modified</b> 222:15 <b>MOIMA</b> 61:4,15	69:15 70:18 141:17 145:22 <b>month</b> 29:12 69:23 129:12	258:19 <b>multiple</b> 218:6,10,22 219:6,9,13 220:5,19 225:18 244:11
<b>Mayor's</b> 47:16 285:5	220:5 <b>meaningful</b> 92:23	39:10 149:9 <b>memory</b> 111:19	49:20,21 50:13 67:15 68:4,18 70:7 72:15	88:17 <b>Minneapolis</b> 41:11	<b>MOIMA's</b> 62:6 <b>mold</b> 95:1 98:8	<b>months</b> 49:14 69:14 77:4 152:3,4 <b>Moody's</b>	244:11 <b>multiplicati...</b> 260:6 <b>municipal</b> 6:3
<b>Mazza</b> 160:24 161:13 162:10,11 165:17 166:8,14 169:15,20	<b>means</b> 7:22 13:12 199:23 239:6 288:17 <b>measure</b> 59:11	<b>mention</b> 120:13 263:8 <b>mentioned</b> 49:17 55:10 72:20 74:9 75:15 76:8	72:15 74:11 76:14 87:11 89:24 90:2 93:2 111:4 112:6 113:6 113:8,13,24 114:3,5 117:9,20,21 117:23 118:20 119:4 122:19 124:2,14,17 143:15,20 145:18 147:21 148:22 161:19 162:18,19 162:23 163:2,5,7 164:17 165:15,18 166:1 169:11,17 170:7 195:15,15 195:16,17 195:18,18 195:18,19 195:19,20 195:20 199:11,13 199:19 201:15 211:22 212:21,22 215:1 233:1 233:3,4 263:9,12,13 263:16,21 <b>million-dollar</b>	244:22 278:4 <b>mirror</b> 180:15 <b>missing</b> 179:13 <b>mission</b> 130:4 130:13 162:13 <b>mitigate</b> 180:21 181:2 <b>mixed</b> 50:19 246:19 271:12 <b>mixed-use</b> 246:1 271:10 <b>model</b> 143:22 257:8,8 258:3 276:16 <b>modeling</b> 183:7,9 255:10 256:19 257:2 259:22 275:13,15 275:17 276:4,22 277:16,21 278:4 <b>models</b> 258:9 260:6 261:20 <b>modern</b> 180:1 219:15 220:8	<b>mom</b> 85:8 <b>moment</b> 136:17 <b>momentarily</b> 243:20 <b>Monday</b> 22:23 182:11 208:1 <b>money</b> 6:2 43:6 46:8 67:1 70:7 70:23 76:11 86:11,12,21 89:24 90:18 91:13 92:2 92:11 93:4 94:11 100:22 110:16,21 110:22,22 112:1,15 118:16 119:21 127:3,3 130:22 159:17,20 168:20 170:21 189:19 201:11 205:21,24 206:3 209:14 272:22 282:16 <b>monitor</b> 83:21 85:2 170:15 171:6 <b>monitoring</b>	4:2,3,5 11:6 11:7 13:4 17:23 18:1 22:1,24 25:18,19 48:19,20 52:16 55:3 55:4 64:12 64:12,13 73:24 74:1 74:2 77:23 77:24 94:5 94:6 208:1 208:1 <b>mortgage</b> 164:8 <b>mother</b> 85:13 <b>move</b> 27:7,19 37:4 84:22 98:17 140:4 173:11,11 174:8 195:7 196:1 199:4 248:5 260:10 <b>moved</b> 5:24 35:15 69:19 171:8 <b>movie</b> 267:2 <b>moving</b> 5:14 5:21 36:11 54:9 117:7 142:3 227:8 253:22 254:23 280:2 <b>multi-family</b> 176:8 259:16	218:6,10,22 219:6,9,13 220:5,19 225:18 244:11 <b>municipalit...</b> 54:7 <b>municipality</b> 7:3 8:19 67:24 140:23 <b>Museum</b> 44:1 44:6 72:21 <b>Music</b> 43:24 <hr/> <b>N</b> <b>N</b> 288:1 <b>Nah</b> 110:1 116:13 <b>NAICS</b> 19:21 102:20 <b>name</b> 11:8 13:6 16:2 68:21 97:5 153:3 154:8 161:2 175:5 <b>national</b> 103:24 <b>nationally</b> 183:9 <b>natural</b> 171:2 <b>naturally</b> 34:5 <b>nature</b> 143:3 197:6 261:10 262:13 <b>nec</b> 190:2 <b>necessarily</b> 8:23 106:9 197:11 230:11 240:4,18 270:20 <b>necessary</b>

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 20

185:20	30:3 50:11	88:2 93:4	<b>northeast</b>	213:9 214:3	38:21 49:22	<b>officer</b> 5:15	92:14 93:23
<b>need</b> 12:19	50:14 62:12	113:23	268:9	214:3	112:3	5:22 175:6	100:7 104:8
20:1 23:7	62:15,23	138:4,5	<b>northwest</b>	220:16,17	114:10	175:9 224:1	104:24
27:10 43:5	64:3 133:7	149:13,13	244:2	220:20	124:3 134:7	224:11	105:8
54:2 61:15	209:11	163:16	<b>Notary</b>	224:21	248:11	281:15	106:21
61:18,20,23	282:10	164:1	288:12	232:1,2	265:21	<b>official</b>	110:7
63:3,5,17	<b>negative</b>	179:14	<b>note</b> 18:11	239:18,21	<b>occur</b> 171:21	220:17	115:22
70:24 72:1	54:15	184:11	54:14	243:7 247:1	173:18	<b>offline</b> 133:5	116:2
82:9,12	166:12	196:10	169:13	247:7	228:8	137:5	117:11
90:23 91:20	<b>negatively</b>	222:13,20	232:18	249:10	<b>occurring</b>	<b>offset</b> 55:19	120:16
92:4 96:1	65:2	222:20,20	247:2	263:11	35:13	<b>oh</b> 1:14 5:19	123:5,15
100:2 106:3	<b>negotiate</b>	228:12	<b>noted</b> 288:4	265:18	<b>October</b>	79:22 86:1	127:24
108:17	168:14	240:15	<b>notes</b> 288:6	266:2	275:1	86:2,5,21	130:1
114:10	170:8 173:9	246:1	<b>notice</b> 12:11	267:22	<b>odd</b> 151:6,10	87:9,17,20	137:13
118:5 121:3	173:19	264:17	12:17 13:24	275:2	<b>odds</b> 282:23	87:23 88:4	138:3,24
133:6,8	<b>negotiated</b>	265:19	24:17 44:1	<b>numbers</b> 29:7	<b>offer</b> 62:1	88:13,22	139:3,6,19
142:4 145:6	170:16	280:10	146:17	29:9 32:20	180:20	89:4,10,17	141:22
155:10,11	<b>negotiation</b>	283:14	184:10	51:23 56:22	182:2 213:4	89:19,23	143:19
184:15,19	187:15	<b>newer</b> 126:5	<b>notices</b> 22:21	76:5 99:19	265:7	90:14 91:2	144:16
190:10	<b>negotiations</b>	<b>night</b> 245:10	183:21	109:11	<b>offered</b>	91:7,22	145:9,18
191:7,24	173:18	<b>nine</b> 85:9,10	229:5 256:2	120:4	223:24	92:6,14,24	146:10,14
194:11,16	<b>neighborho...</b>	<b>non-commen...</b>	256:5,6,8	148:24	<b>offering</b>	93:13,23	148:4,10
199:11,21	35:22	183:5	262:6	151:15,22	181:4 224:7	111:21	149:7 150:9
199:23	183:10	<b>non-compli...</b>	<b>notify</b> 284:15	151:24	<b>offers</b> 98:12	122:4	150:13,21
200:14	260:19	146:8	<b>number</b> 4:24	166:10	<b>office</b> 4:9,14	222:11	151:3,20
208:18	277:11	<b>non-confide...</b>	9:7 15:1,4	187:20	4:15,22,23	<b>OIA</b> 60:20	152:5 154:4
212:17	<b>neighborho...</b>	128:17	19:19 20:24	197:17	5:15 22:16	<b>OIA's</b> 62:5	156:19
213:16,21	9:15,16	<b>non-credible</b>	23:5 27:23	202:12	24:8 29:3,5	<b>OIT</b> 206:23	157:22
214:18,21	10:8,10	203:4	30:9 37:23	214:24	29:22 44:19	209:6	160:11,16
230:2,5	182:22	<b>non-English</b>	41:7 42:1	261:22	45:6 46:23	<b>okay</b> 6:13 9:6	165:9
240:15	226:13	182:13	43:22 49:8	273:16	47:16 54:20	10:11 13:22	168:18
241:4	227:6	<b>non-profit</b>	70:11 72:1	281:17	60:5,7,18	14:5 19:22	169:22
245:15,21	241:17,21	142:22	75:9 76:16	<b>Nutter</b> 46:14	62:3 64:2	20:19 21:20	196:19
247:14	273:4	<b>non-represe...</b>	98:7 102:8		70:13 94:13	24:20 25:1	197:3
250:17,19	<b>neighbors</b>	172:4	102:18,20	<b>O</b>	127:17,19	25:6,11	201:19
255:18	9:14 277:18	<b>non-reps</b>	103:10	<b>O</b> 288:1	127:21	26:7 27:9	203:14
256:16	<b>neutral</b> 66:18	173:5	109:6,11	<b>o'clock</b>	128:1 130:2	27:21 30:14	205:7
260:22	67:1	<b>non-resident</b>	112:21	174:15	130:5	32:18 37:11	206:24
261:5,18,19	<b>never</b> 6:4	156:1	113:18	<b>obesity</b>	131:13,16	40:19 42:23	209:15
261:19,20	65:12 136:7	<b>nonexempt</b>	114:2,7	142:21,23	132:4	44:11,17	210:20
264:13	206:2 228:9	176:12	132:15	<b>obligation</b>	140:15	46:10,21	212:2 213:7
268:8 270:9	230:14	<b>nonprofit</b>	134:10	65:6 126:18	161:16	47:8,11,17	225:13,19
272:10	238:9	219:24	145:15	147:5	174:16,23	48:1 52:13	228:19
273:16	241:22	<b>nonprofits</b>	146:20	162:20	175:6 176:9	54:21 58:17	229:7
274:6 286:3	264:18	210:19	148:2,23	177:6	184:8,21	60:21 66:21	230:18
<b>needed</b> 47:20	266:1	<b>norm</b> 195:9	165:11,13	<b>obligations</b>	185:23,24	67:22 71:4	234:19
86:20	281:21	<b>normal</b> 20:7	165:17	5:9 15:2	186:4 197:5	73:16 74:17	244:3
128:18	<b>new</b> 5:14 12:7	169:19	166:3 179:6	50:6 90:5	200:12	75:11 76:3	247:16
235:4	12:13 13:8	231:13	179:16	161:20	214:5,8,11	76:18 80:3	249:7 250:4
268:17	18:24 41:8	<b>normally</b>	191:3	<b>obvious</b>	226:23,23	80:18 81:20	254:12
<b>needless</b>	52:17 63:13	17:17	194:13	101:14	235:17	82:4 87:17	255:3
114:12	63:15 66:24	<b>North</b> 21:15	201:17	<b>obviously</b>	236:1 282:7	87:23 89:10	256:15
<b>needs</b> 12:18	72:2,4 78:3	78:16 94:20	203:1,2	11:18 20:6	285:5	89:17 90:14	260:10
				23:24 24:3			



Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 21

261:16	135:18,23	108:7 133:9	<b>original</b>	<b>owned</b> 69:5	<b>paper</b> 38:20	245:11,20	246:3
263:3	136:11	138:8	118:3 188:4	219:21	174:7	246:11,23	<b>partially</b>
281:18	158:15,21	139:12	189:17	257:18	261:22	247:11,16	183:24
286:16	159:7	144:18	277:15	269:13,14	<b>paperwork</b>	247:20,24	<b>participation</b>
<b>old</b> 6:6,7 72:3	160:14	211:15	<b>ought</b> 121:16	<b>owner</b> 188:10	23:18	250:4	29:13
192:22	175:16,19	238:16	<b>ounces</b> 85:8	188:18	250:20	274:10,11	<b>particular</b>
197:8 261:3	175:23	278:14	85:11,14	204:19	252:12	275:10,17	11:15 18:12
261:3	176:14,18	<b>opinionated</b>	104:5	205:3,20	<b>parcel</b> 183:12	276:1,9,20	18:13 28:22
<b>older</b> 253:6	177:10	38:22	<b>outbound</b>	206:2,5	183:19	277:7,13	44:8 107:19
261:15	179:4,19	<b>opportunities</b>	71:15	222:20	266:7	278:15	131:8 132:6
<b>oldest</b> 153:8	180:14	125:8	<b>outcome</b>	271:23	<b>parcels</b> 176:1	279:22	132:13
<b>once</b> 13:23	181:6,10,17	281:16	46:18 54:8	272:9	176:6,20	280:22	137:3
69:24 132:6	182:17,19	<b>opportunity</b>	<b>outdo</b> 88:18	284:17,18	177:14	281:14	154:21
236:18	183:1,14	56:12	<b>outline</b> 7:5,6	285:18,20	182:21	282:2,18	159:22
237:15	184:5,11,18	186:10	<b>outlook</b> 162:4	<b>owner-occu...</b>	183:5,6	283:3	229:4 231:4
240:14,24	185:2,10,21	223:17	<b>outreach</b>	181:12	184:24	<b>parking</b>	231:7
241:1	186:1,23	279:2	181:23	<b>owner-occu...</b>	217:3	234:11,12	242:23
262:10	187:16,21	<b>oppose</b> 91:2	<b>outside</b> 10:22	181:4	226:10	267:1	254:1,14
267:11	188:3,3	<b>opposed</b>	32:17 67:24	<b>owners</b> 67:24	237:12	<b>parks</b> 118:24	259:12
<b>one-stop</b>	190:7 193:4	31:15 73:4	68:5 69:5	68:5 69:1	243:8	156:13	260:18
130:11	197:4	202:20	79:24 80:15	182:2,13	255:21	<b>part</b> 5:18	267:8
<b>One-third</b>	202:10	204:8	81:1,11	184:6	256:8 257:4	9:21 10:1	<b>particularly</b>
80:16	206:22	264:15	82:8,11	202:21	257:6,10,21	18:22 20:7	49:1 50:19
<b>one-time</b>	207:5	285:21	212:11	203:17	258:5,11	23:4 55:22	55:16 67:24
41:21,22	235:16	<b>optimize</b>	216:19,20	205:11	266:21	62:18 63:19	143:8 188:9
44:10	245:6,6	162:5	281:19	275:22	268:11	78:9 86:10	203:1,7,8
110:21,22	260:15	<b>option</b> 86:19	282:14,19	<b>owns</b> 68:8	<b>Pardon</b> 9:23	86:14 87:3	205:13
112:1,15	270:14	<b>options</b> 9:14	<b>outstanding</b>		24:2	87:15 91:15	216:4
<b>ones</b> 6:17	278:19	9:15,17	67:23	<b>P</b>	<b>Park</b> 226:18	92:6 113:15	223:11
24:1,1,4	<b>OPA's</b> 158:20	35:17 40:9	<b>overage</b>	<b>p.m</b> 174:18	257:17	130:21	227:12
75:1 102:22	179:24,24	83:17	171:4	174:20	<b>Parker</b> 1:14	131:1	245:4 253:6
143:14	181:16	<b>oranges</b> 7:12	<b>overall</b> 49:15	287:6	48:16,17,21	136:23	278:19
188:14,16	182:1 183:6	<b>order</b> 60:8	49:19 50:1	<b>PA</b> 82:9	49:6 51:8	145:7	<b>partly</b> 62:6
188:22	185:6	63:18,24	50:7 88:4	<b>Packer</b>	51:13 52:3	167:23	<b>parts</b> 129:8
197:13	<b>OPA-imple...</b>	70:24 93:6	119:2	226:18	52:13 54:11	173:17,23	254:3
220:7	188:22	98:4,17,17	178:17	<b>packet</b> 29:12	54:22 65:17	191:1	<b>pass</b> 39:17,19
230:16,22	<b>OPD</b> 206:22	99:10,17	181:22	<b>page</b> 41:14	136:13	193:23	39:19 40:5
259:2	209:6	125:2	183:18,24	42:23 43:21	140:1,2	205:6	<b>passed</b> 54:1
269:13,14	<b>open</b> 99:22	139:15	184:19	44:18 45:11	141:22	206:22	91:11 100:8
272:6 275:7	185:1 213:1	182:15	<b>overassessed</b>	147:7	142:11	207:14	115:4,13,20
<b>ongoing</b>	264:4	200:13	204:15	167:21	217:21,22	215:18	115:23
53:16 151:4	<b>opening</b> 28:3	212:17	<b>overburden...</b>	169:10	218:2,19	219:11	<b>passing</b> 38:23
151:7 177:1	<b>operate</b>	213:20	243:13	<b>pager</b> 120:2	219:3	220:22	<b>passion</b> 102:1
180:3,13,13	182:11	220:4 249:3	<b>overdue</b>	<b>paid</b> 10:16	220:10	226:8	<b>Paster</b> 4:11
182:18	<b>operating</b>	<b>ordinance</b>	180:21	15:8,19	221:11	227:10	<b>Patco</b> 81:8
228:20	2:15 3:12	2:10,12,14	<b>oversee</b> 28:7	16:17 18:21	223:3,8	246:10	<b>path</b> 41:6
237:22	4:10 73:3	3:3	<b>overseeing</b>	19:15 81:19	224:6,15,19	258:7	42:12
249:14	161:17	<b>organic</b> 249:5	4:16,19	82:6 83:1	225:2,9,12	260:12,13	<b>patience</b>
<b>online</b> 133:4	175:19	<b>organization</b>	<b>oversimplif...</b>	101:3 167:3	225:20	262:3	225:21
174:3	<b>operations</b>	142:22	23:15	170:13	231:20,21	264:22	<b>pay</b> 10:19
274:15	34:15 177:7	<b>organized</b>	<b>overview</b>	216:10	232:6 244:4	266:15	12:20 13:15
<b>OPA</b> 3:18	<b>opinion</b> 46:23	95:20	226:7	238:23	244:5,18,19	<b>partial</b>	14:2,11
22:8 127:23	47:4,5,23	<b>origin</b> 134:8	260:17	239:4	244:23	219:22	68:9 70:17
				<b>painful</b> 51:7			

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 22

70:19 82:13	132:1 247:3	207:5 212:6	<b>percentage---</b>	2:20 7:10	252:19	213:2	279:18,23
87:5,13,15	247:10,17	212:12	202:19	7:15,19 8:6	<b>physically</b>	215:11	280:11,23
90:3 100:14	<b>pennies</b>	221:23	204:6	8:9,11,20	15:3	218:1,11	281:13
101:2	168:24	222:4	<b>performance</b>	10:20 11:17	<b>PICA</b> 89:20	219:2,10	282:1,12
114:18	<b>Pennsylvania</b>	224:22	176:23	11:19,21,22	90:8,9	220:21	283:2,21
143:15	1:5 2:24	229:18	177:7	12:1,8,16	92:13,15	222:11	284:3,9,22
144:10	12:15 80:21	241:4,13	184:14	12:20 13:7	93:7,18	223:7 224:4	285:6
145:17	140:12	245:16	237:20	16:11 17:4	<b>pick</b> 50:23	224:12,18	286:19,21
162:14	238:7,14	249:12	<b>period</b> 156:2	28:1 29:14	81:22	224:24	<b>pipes</b> 101:2
165:23,24	280:15,20	250:14	167:3 197:9	30:9 34:16	<b>picked</b> 52:1	225:7,11,19	<b>place</b> 53:5,6
166:23	<b>pension</b> 29:6	252:10	197:10	35:10 38:1	211:20	227:9 228:1	65:20 66:10
167:23	90:4 93:3	253:6,6	<b>permission</b>	41:17 42:8	<b>picking</b>	228:6 229:1	71:1 76:10
170:6,12	124:8 126:6	266:3	38:18	68:1,9 69:1	206:17,18	229:10,23	89:1 90:13
199:10	162:16	267:22	<b>permits</b> 130:8	69:5 74:21	<b>picture</b> 83:16	230:20	90:18 128:4
201:17	<b>Pension's</b>	268:15	<b>person</b> 3:19	78:5,9,12	132:11	231:8 232:2	128:4 133:2
206:3,6	29:2,5	271:5	13:1 88:16	78:14 82:1	211:24	233:12	136:21
238:21	<b>pensions</b> 28:9	286:10	144:8	89:7,18	<b>pictures</b>	234:9,17,20	138:2,13
252:6	29:18 51:5	<b>people's</b> 88:5	196:21	101:8	141:2	235:24	192:23
261:23	74:16	<b>percent</b> 7:19	199:12	102:14	<b>piece</b> 174:1	236:4 237:6	193:24
<b>paying</b> 15:17	123:22	7:20,20,21	217:2	105:24	213:8	238:7	206:10
73:5 88:6	125:11	7:23,24 8:1	243:12	113:17	258:12,15	239:14,21	207:14
93:3 108:3	<b>penthouse</b>	8:1,2 26:19	251:12	140:13,23	<b>pieces</b> 247:13	242:13,24	222:13
118:17	214:24	29:10 36:8	256:19	141:5	257:18,18	243:6,11,15	227:1 228:7
121:8 144:6	<b>people</b> 9:13	49:14 52:7	258:20	152:19	258:3	243:19	253:22
164:11,12	16:19 21:14	52:8 75:16	268:11	175:22	<b>pile</b> 103:4,7	244:15,19	254:23,24
165:15	22:18 23:1	88:7,23	275:12	176:7	<b>pipe</b> 101:15	245:9,19,23	255:19
166:16,24	24:10,13	115:21	282:7,10	177:15	<b>Piper</b> 175:3,5	246:22	270:5
168:13	26:13 27:7	117:5 119:8	<b>personal</b>	180:19,24	187:8,22	247:10,12	<b>placed</b> 69:16
170:21	27:19 36:11	124:15,15	138:8 200:6	185:5	188:1,6	247:19,23	<b>places</b> 51:5
<b>payment</b>	61:20 79:8	134:12,23	<b>personally</b>	198:15	189:21	248:16	268:6
81:15 164:8	94:17,19	134:24	91:2 221:24	207:13	190:2,15,19	250:10,11	<b>placing</b> 69:12
<b>payments</b>	95:1,3	135:1,2,3,9	<b>personnel</b>	213:15	190:24	250:24	69:15,20
65:1 125:3	96:18 98:20	146:8	64:23	217:1	192:11,19	251:5,20	70:1
126:4	98:23	162:19	<b>perspective</b>	227:18	193:7,12	252:3,14,18	<b>plan</b> 2:19
169:12	100:22,24	163:1,3,6	41:18 43:3	239:22	196:4 198:4	252:23	3:14 22:3
<b>payout</b> 122:1	101:4,7,9	167:3	44:4 45:4	248:17	198:7,11,17	253:4,8,11	46:7 49:20
<b>payroll</b>	101:12	178:16	54:18 149:2	260:15,18	198:20	254:7,12,16	49:22 50:1
172:16	102:1 106:1	200:11	149:12	264:15	199:14	254:19	50:2,7,14
<b>pays</b> 144:2,4	114:19	210:23	151:6,7,8	266:16	201:2,6,12	255:2,4	51:4 55:9
<b>paystub</b>	116:9,23	211:1 212:1	152:1 276:5	269:4 281:9	201:23	256:7,14,16	55:14 72:10
174:7	117:7	212:20	<b>PGW</b> 162:15	<b>Philadelphi...</b>	202:15,22	256:20	72:17 76:9
<b>paystubs</b>	118:17	228:13,14	<b>phase</b> 45:18	183:4	203:7,10,15	260:21	76:24 77:2
172:9,15	120:10	228:14	129:5,9,18	<b>Philadelphi...</b>	203:24	263:1 264:3	89:14 90:6
173:1,22	126:3	240:5	177:8 179:4	37:8	204:3,9	265:9,11	90:8,11,15
174:4	135:14	251:12	226:5,20	<b>Philadelphi...</b>	205:18	266:6 267:2	91:12,19,23
<b>peak</b> 27:14	143:20	263:8	256:11,12	30:8	206:1,12,15	268:1,20	91:24 92:7
<b>Pedialyte</b>	146:7	280:13	259:9	<b>Philly</b> 7:15	206:19,21	271:21	92:10,10,15
153:2 155:1	155:10	285:24	<b>phases</b> 129:4	13:17 14:3	207:10,12	272:6,24	92:16,17,20
<b>penalties</b>	167:5 173:9	<b>percentage</b>	129:23	21:15 70:17	208:10,24	273:11,22	93:18,22
81:15 89:11	174:2,6	134:7 135:5	<b>phasing-in</b>	78:16	209:23	274:1 275:6	112:20,23
<b>pencils</b> 282:8	193:5	202:12	130:20	173:24	210:10,14	275:16,19	113:1
282:11	194:24	203:12	<b>Philadelphia</b>	<b>photocopy</b>	210:16,20	276:8,11	122:18
<b>pending</b>	196:3 199:1	218:16	1:1,5 2:18	250:24	211:13	277:4,12,23	126:5

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 23

137:24,24	142:21,24	156:16	12:3,24	136:2,5	253:12,15	<b>printed</b>	114:10
162:16	237:2	158:9	13:9,17,22	139:21,23	253:18,19	274:24	<b>problems</b>
173:11	249:20	<b>potential</b> 20:2	14:5,13,18	140:3 141:3	265:12,15	<b>printing</b>	55:12 95:16
241:24	284:23	35:1 107:13	16:9,18	142:12,13	265:16	172:9	101:13
<b>planned</b>	285:3	109:4	17:2,11,16	142:18	274:9,12	<b>prior</b> 86:7	207:4
56:15 126:3	<b>pools</b> 141:6	116:17	17:21 18:1	157:20,21	280:23	148:11	250:22
<b>planning</b>	<b>poor</b> 32:24	117:11	19:6,16,22	158:6,8,13	283:4,22	150:15,16	<b>proceedings</b>
45:17 46:5	142:23	163:16	20:11,19	158:19,24	284:4,10	150:21	288:4
156:18	144:3	168:19	21:2,5,9,20	159:4,9,15	285:4,9,15	201:5 209:8	<b>process</b> 6:23
<b>plans</b> 5:4	237:20	180:23	22:1 25:12	159:19	286:1,8,10	259:21	20:7 39:3
91:16 92:21	<b>pop</b> 81:7	181:3 234:8	25:13 26:11	160:5,10,16	286:16,20	<b>priorities</b>	46:9 62:16
248:3	<b>Popular</b>	234:9	28:2 29:21	160:21	286:22,23	264:14	68:17 69:6
<b>play</b> 51:23	283:22	<b>potentially</b>	31:1,2,6,7	161:1,4,7	<b>President's</b>	<b>prioritize</b>	69:9,11,17
177:16	<b>population</b>	33:14 52:4	36:13,14	163:10,13	25:21 70:13	229:14	69:20,22,23
<b>players</b> 258:6	7:18 32:5	54:14	38:17 40:20	167:9,14	140:15	<b>priority</b>	69:24 70:5
258:19,19	37:17 104:3	102:14	40:21 41:1	169:8,18,21	211:21	230:4	71:23 83:8
<b>please</b> 2:7 4:4	105:17	107:24	47:12,19,22	174:12,21	<b>pretty</b> 21:7	233:11,13	86:15 87:3
13:13 21:21	<b>portfolio</b> 53:1	<b>power</b> 157:2	48:13,18	175:1,4	61:24 99:3	<b>private</b>	90:16 93:14
30:18 96:17	263:7	242:19	54:23,24	186:14	107:14	171:12	93:17,18
161:1	<b>portion</b> 87:16	<b>practice</b>	72:1,8	187:18,23	118:5 140:4	210:21,22	96:11 97:3
251:24	89:20 90:9	193:24	73:17,18,22	188:2 189:7	206:13,14	223:15	98:4 99:9
283:23	93:7 105:16	<b>PRD</b> 177:21	73:23 77:18	189:22	210:15	257:20	114:14
284:4 285:8	108:13	177:24	85:22 86:3	190:12,16	211:12	278:21	126:11
<b>pleased</b> 4:8	159:10	<b>pre-AVI</b>	86:4 94:1	190:21	217:5	279:5,10	128:3,13
161:15	187:11	178:6,14	101:23	191:1 192:7	222:12,16	281:7,11,19	130:24
<b>pledge</b> 194:24	209:5 246:8	<b>predecessors</b>	102:3	192:12,20	256:24	<b>probably</b>	137:23
<b>plug</b> 240:19	<b>portions</b>	194:20	103:11,17	193:10	257:5	14:21 36:24	138:16
<b>PNC</b> 170:5	126:1	<b>predictive</b>	104:7,15,21	194:19	286:13	39:15 67:7	145:8 179:9
171:19	<b>position</b>	68:19 71:6	104:24	196:5 198:2	<b>previous</b> 42:3	75:1,9,21	179:14
<b>pockets</b> 88:5	102:11	<b>predictors</b>	105:8,15,21	198:5,8,16	127:1,2	100:9 103:6	180:10
<b>point</b> 31:16	109:1	65:9	106:14,18	198:19,23	<b>price</b> 33:7	105:17	181:7,17
40:10,11	115:14	<b>preK</b> 41:4	106:21	200:22	177:20	106:17	185:22
91:8,18	147:14	42:15	107:2,5,8	201:3,7,13	178:21	115:24	189:23
96:8 110:24	149:2 228:9	156:13	107:23	201:22	199:15	139:16	190:23
113:4	240:17	201:18	108:9,23	202:7	208:19	144:13	191:2
118:11	<b>positions</b> 61:9	<b>prep</b> 29:17	109:8,16,19	203:21	214:8	146:7 148:9	194:21
121:14	269:21	<b>prepare</b>	109:22	209:17,18	237:22	148:20	196:14,16
169:2,3	<b>positive</b> 57:4	91:12	110:1,7,13	209:22	<b>prices</b> 81:5	150:19	197:7 205:6
173:12	57:9 66:10	<b>prepared</b>	110:18	217:16,17	170:16	152:2 166:9	207:15
192:17,21	151:16,21	30:18 48:12	111:1,7,13	217:23	197:23,23	204:9	208:14,21
196:18	151:24	189:16	111:16,23	225:5,22	<b>primarily</b>	205:15,18	212:13
226:14	166:12,17	229:21	112:4,9,12	226:2	129:19	208:13	213:17
248:24	<b>possibility</b>	<b>prescription</b>	113:2 114:9	231:18,22	161:21	211:7	219:19
268:6	46:12	248:9	115:7,22	232:4,9,11	175:20	227:23	221:2
282:15	<b>possible</b>	<b>present</b> 1:8	116:2,6,13	232:18,20	<b>primary</b>	247:12	222:13
<b>pointed</b>	34:22 35:10	82:9 104:4	116:23	235:6,7,11	226:11	255:5 256:2	233:21
203:22	46:18 54:19	<b>President</b> 1:9	117:2,10,14	235:12	246:7	285:10	240:12
<b>points</b> 36:15	95:24 122:2	2:2 3:7,23	117:17	242:14,17	<b>principal</b>	<b>problem</b>	249:5
<b>police</b> 58:22	122:10	4:4,6 5:17	119:16	243:20	164:9,12	81:10 124:7	254:22
<b>policy</b> 4:18	166:5 222:9	6:1,5,9,13	123:8,15,17	250:5	165:16,19	211:16	255:6,11
57:20	242:6	6:16 7:9 9:6	123:21	251:22,23	165:21	247:23	259:22
118:23	<b>possibly</b>	9:23 10:3	133:18,22	252:16,21	166:17	267:7 272:6	261:11,12
133:11	98:18	11:7,14,24	133:23	253:2,5,9	<b>print</b> 173:1	<b>problematic</b>	281:9,12

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 24

<b>processing</b> 181:24	130:20 176:4	252:11,17 <b>proper</b> 242:9	44:19 45:6 67:3 69:1	275:4,9,22 276:12,15	230:19,20 231:4	205:22 206:6	11:10 14:13 16:5 20:20
<b>produce</b> 128:24	181:12,23 <b>program-b...</b>	250:20 <b>properties</b>	70:17 72:12 127:18,20	276:18 278:1,7,12	<b>provided</b> 47:9,16	<b>push</b> 172:1 <b>pushed</b> 39:12	24:21 25:21 26:5,14
129:16	99:6 <b>programs</b>	68:1 69:4 97:16 98:2	127:21 130:2,6,12	279:12,16 281:23	71:5 72:1,7 142:2	<b>put</b> 8:22 29:20 46:22	28:4 29:20 35:16 38:19
206:5	4:20 39:4 86:13	98:7 99:20 141:4,7,9	130:15 131:16,24	284:16,17 284:18	146:18 164:19	54:12 70:23 72:4 82:16	45:10 46:11 48:6 49:10
<b>produced</b> 47:3 255:8	156:10 180:20	160:1 177:23	132:4,11,13 132:18	285:18,20 <b>property's</b>	221:20 230:21	100:17 103:4,6	51:9 52:14 56:6 58:18
<b>producing</b> 273:9	222:14 <b>progress</b>	178:1,2 179:22	141:1 174:16,23	181:21 <b>proposal</b> 7:4	<b>providers</b> 83:4	110:21 111:24	60:5,15 63:19 72:18
<b>product</b> 9:11 9:18 10:4,6	22:14 24:22 25:8 65:13	184:1,20 187:7	175:7,21 176:2,3,4,6	33:1 125:22 125:24	<b>provides</b> 50:10	112:1 115:17	73:7 74:18 80:6 85:15
10:16 11:12	186:1 <b>project</b> 21:7	191:21 192:6	176:12 177:17	126:1 <b>proposals</b>	181:13,17 <b>providing</b>	118:8 128:3 129:4 136:8	89:8 106:3 106:4 110:8
12:4,6,9,14	45:7,19 52:10 132:6	195:10,23 197:15,24	178:12 180:8,12	206:11 209:7,10	2:17 131:20 176:1 226:3	137:13 140:18	114:15 118:3
13:2 15:7	135:9 230:8 233:17	198:17 200:5	181:3,15,19 182:2,3,13	<b>proposed</b> 2:21 3:12	<b>provision</b> 143:24	143:5 190:4 191:1,3	119:11 121:24
16:5,8,21	257:2 258:21	202:13,14 213:10,12	184:6,9,13 185:4,23	4:22 53:16 57:24 86:6	144:22 145:6,8	202:20 204:16	124:1 130:2 134:2
81:13 82:17	260:6 264:9 <b>projected</b>	218:5,9,17 219:5,8,12	186:4,19 188:10,18	161:18 175:18	<b>prudent</b> 191:8	206:11 209:11,12	136:19 137:4
83:14 84:18	115:3 119:21	220:18 223:6	189:1 193:9 196:21,22	<b>pros</b> 126:16 <b>prosecutor's</b>	<b>public</b> 2:4 3:9 30:4 38:22	211:2 228:11	145:14 155:22
116:9	147:22 <b>projecting</b>	226:12 227:8	198:10 199:8,9,15	189:12 <b>protect</b> 54:9	56:1,16 100:14	237:18 258:12,13	156:8,14 157:23,24
<b>productive</b> 215:5	143:16 <b>projection</b>	230:12,15 234:2 235:1	199:23 200:7,23	<b>protection</b> 54:6	287:6 288:12	260:2 263:5 266:3	158:14,22 164:1,3,5
<b>products</b> 10:2 10:11 19:18	105:6 <b>projections</b>	236:16 238:2,11,18	201:1,5 202:21	<b>protein</b> 153:11	<b>publications</b> 198:14	268:14 270:7	164:15 165:10
21:13 27:8	36:6,7 59:10	244:11,13 244:14	203:17,23 204:19	<b>protocol</b> 137:19	<b>publicly</b> 58:10 59:19	272:22 <b>puts</b> 93:2	167:14,19 168:5 169:9
27:20 33:15	103:12,14 115:12,18	245:24 246:2,20	205:3,11,20 206:2,5	138:1,13 <b>proud</b> 140:20	60:1 156:11 <b>pull</b> 18:5	196:22 <b>putting</b> 41:4	170:3 171:17
33:18 34:1	115:18,19 117:11	248:4 259:8 259:16,21	215:2 218:21	<b>provide</b> 4:8 12:12 28:5	54:17 154:8 <b>purchase</b>	89:19 93:4 137:23	172:2,3,8 172:14,16
34:1,8	148:21 <b>projects</b> 18:9	259:23 260:14	219:21 222:21	70:12 71:5 82:23	10:16 12:9 13:1 81:2	<b>Q</b> <b>qual</b> 270:15	172:21 173:3 187:2
35:15 36:3	55:8 72:24 119:2,4,15	262:24 263:2 266:8	224:8 226:11	105:13 106:6 120:1	<b>purchased</b> 13:1 38:6	<b>qualified</b> 240:1	189:8 195:7 196:4,17
81:3 84:16	234:6 <b>prolonged</b>	266:9,12,13 266:22	238:6,10,22 239:1,13	122:5 125:17	<b>purchases</b> 18:18,20	<b>qualify</b> 52:24 <b>quality</b> 270:4	218:15,18 219:10
102:15	107:18 <b>promote</b>	269:11 270:23	245:18 246:7,10	128:16,21 139:11	38:9 154:19	<b>quarter</b> 197:19,20	222:10 223:10
109:4,7	143:4 <b>promoting</b>	271:2 274:18,21	259:6,7 266:1,2	161:15 168:10	<b>purposes</b> 156:21	<b>quarterback</b> 236:20	224:15 229:3
116:24	142:22 <b>promotion</b>	274:22 275:2,18	267:14 271:24	170:18 174:5,7	157:8 210:1 <b>pursuant</b> 3:1	241:11 <b>query</b> 247:15	232:22 233:8 234:1
154:1,17,21	195:3 <b>proof</b> 250:19	277:4,5 278:3,6	272:16,17 272:21	221:15 226:23	<b>pursue</b> 184:12	22:24 208:1 <b>Queen</b> 268:5	234:20 237:1,2
154:23	251:2 <b>property</b>	273:6,9	273:6,9	227:4	185:3	<b>question</b>	243:18

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 25

244:17	110:5 140:5	124:12,14	202:12	257:24	193:23	<b>receiving</b>	48:23 49:4
245:14	140:9	124:20	210:8,12,18	258:16	196:2	67:1 221:3	68:22 118:1
250:9	225:17	126:18	211:4 212:6	268:7 276:6	198:22	222:7	132:19
254:16	231:23	132:16	215:18	276:13,19	227:11,12	244:13	139:2
260:12	244:10	134:6	217:19	277:8	229:5 230:8	246:16,21	142:19
261:7	274:13	137:12	224:7	278:17	230:10	274:19,21	143:6
274:17	<b>Quinones</b>	146:9 156:3	231:13	279:24	234:3	<b>recertificati...</b>	145:13
283:7 284:5	142:15	164:13	233:7	280:4,7	249:16	180:10	161:2 179:6
284:6,23	<b>Quinones-S...</b>	194:6 272:5	256:12	285:1	254:18	<b>recertifying</b>	179:16
285:9,16	1:15 77:21	275:24	280:18	<b>realm</b> 64:20	256:12	185:18	227:16
286:9	77:22 78:1	<b>rated</b> 162:6	<b>reality</b> 10:7	<b>reapplicatio...</b>	260:20	<b>recess</b> 287:2	228:22
<b>questioning</b>	78:13 79:2	<b>rates</b> 75:19	194:23	182:7	261:10	<b>recognized</b>	232:19
76:7 123:9	79:6,22	115:10	199:3	<b>reappraisal</b>	<b>reassessme...</b>	184:18	245:2 247:1
225:4	80:2,7,18	122:13,15	<b>realize</b>	217:10	159:10	<b>recognizes</b>	247:8
231:24	81:16,20	137:9 185:9	264:22	<b>reason</b> 15:11	177:1 180:4	25:15 31:4	278:17
281:2	82:4,14	185:10	<b>reallocating</b>	91:16 92:21	182:18	40:23 48:16	<b>Recorder</b>
<b>questionnai...</b>	83:2,11	214:1	62:24	111:12	207:20	55:2 64:10	198:13
200:15	84:7 85:18	<b>rating</b> 65:1,5	243:16	112:10	226:10	73:20 77:20	<b>recording</b>
<b>questions</b>	142:17	65:11 162:3	<b>reallocation</b>	143:7 155:3	228:8,20	86:1 94:3	4:20
6:12,21 9:7	143:19	162:7 165:7	256:10	156:8	236:8 237:8	117:15	<b>records</b> 185:6
27:23 31:8	144:16,24	<b>ratings</b> 65:21	<b>really</b> 18:4	169:14	250:1	123:19	253:7
41:1 49:8	145:9	<b>ratio</b> 178:18	28:1 29:8	205:8	253:21	133:20	<b>rectified</b> 22:9
55:6 58:19	<b>quite</b> 98:20	178:21	50:15,18,24	214:12	254:9	136:12	<b>red</b> 54:13
74:9,19	173:16	183:15	54:16 61:8	250:17	260:13	140:1	254:10
102:4,7	245:14	230:3	65:13 73:12	257:9	261:8,9,10	142:15	<b>redone</b>
118:1,7	266:19	268:22	78:22 85:2	267:21	<b>reassign</b>	167:11	230:22
127:9		<b>reachable</b>	86:17 92:19	271:13	243:7	201:20	<b>reduce</b> 59:12
133:14	<b>R</b>	241:2	92:23 98:16	<b>reasonable</b>	<b>rebuilding</b>	209:20	86:8 114:12
135:17,20	<b>R</b> 288:1	<b>reaches</b> 186:6	98:19 100:1	106:22	118:23	217:21	116:19
136:1,8	<b>Rainy</b> 51:11	<b>reaching</b>	100:10	259:3	<b>recall</b> 70:9,10	225:24	124:11
137:17	51:17	112:16	106:3	<b>reasonably</b>	130:10	231:20	<b>reduced</b>
152:7	<b>raise</b> 54:13	<b>reaction</b>	117:22,22	194:2	282:3	235:9	26:21 41:15
159:21	<b>raised</b> 22:2	205:16	118:4,5	<b>reasoning</b>	<b>receipt</b>	242:15	66:6 67:12
162:9 163:8	27:23 205:8	<b>reactions</b> 9:5	120:9,11	271:18	250:24	250:7	124:13,20
163:15	228:13	<b>read</b> 2:7 3:11	124:8	272:20	252:2,4,7	262:20	186:23
164:23	<b>raises</b> 161:23	5:5 142:19	131:23	<b>reasons</b> 28:2	<b>receipts</b>	265:13	187:11,14
174:14	<b>raising</b> 86:19	261:22	132:24	49:23 79:15	32:11	274:10	270:10
182:8,10	86:24	<b>reading</b> 38:20	143:1	154:16	120:20	<b>recommenc...</b>	<b>reduces</b>
186:13,15	<b>ramp</b> 71:5	78:2	159:12	160:8	250:15,18	174:20	124:18,23
194:22	<b>ran</b> 130:3	<b>readjust</b>	167:6 193:3	<b>reassess</b>	250:23	<b>recommend...</b>	<b>reducing</b> 42:8
199:5 226:4	141:10	243:4	211:10	238:12	<b>receivable</b>	185:11	117:21
262:22	279:13	<b>ready</b> 193:5	212:18	248:3	64:24 68:2	<b>recommend...</b>	122:11
283:6	<b>range</b> 9:4	<b>real</b> 9:12 68:8	213:16	<b>reassessed</b>	68:11	264:4	126:18
<b>quick</b> 6:17	29:10 33:18	68:9 75:15	214:18,22	227:8	<b>receivables</b>	<b>recommends</b>	<b>reduction</b>
20:20 38:19	<b>rapid</b> 227:22	76:14 77:8	217:11	230:16,17	67:23 72:6	49:12	26:19 36:8
74:19 102:3	228:5,6	77:11,11	218:14	233:9,10,13	<b>receive</b> 98:3	<b>reconvene</b>	88:12,14
134:1 169:9	<b>rapidly</b> 227:6	141:20	225:15	<b>reassessing</b>	149:14,15	174:15	110:19
216:7 283:5	231:5 268:7	175:21	236:17,22	233:4 236:9	172:6 219:3	287:4	113:9,12
<b>quicker</b> 71:13	<b>Rasheia</b>	176:1,2,4,6	241:12	<b>reassessment</b>	275:5	<b>reconvening</b>	114:6
207:21	53:23 161:6	184:16	245:15	159:12	<b>received</b>	174:22	115:21
232:7	161:8	185:15	246:19,23	160:4	44:12 69:2	<b>record</b> 6:24	116:3,8
<b>quickly</b> 50:18	<b>rate</b> 67:7 75:6	197:23	248:23	177:11,14	147:18	8:22 27:22	117:5,6,6,9
95:24 96:4	75:7,16	200:2,8	249:20	184:7,19	222:7	29:21 30:4	122:11
	76:1 115:10						

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 26

134:5,21	136:20	<b>reiterate</b>	<b>rely</b> 278:7	147:19	173:7,8,15	<b>RESOLUT...</b>	<b>responsible</b>
135:10,13	137:17	235:15	<b>relying</b> 100:1	148:12,13	<b>requires</b> 51:7	1:19	108:3 130:6
155:23	148:12	236:7	275:21,23	148:15	<b>resale</b> 13:13	<b>resolve</b> 95:18	175:20
156:2 158:1	149:4,10,16	<b>reiterating</b>	278:10,12	229:17	<b>research</b>	99:22	179:19
158:10,17	150:2,11,23	117:18	<b>remaining</b>	230:23	142:24	<b>resolved</b>	188:4
186:18	152:8	<b>relate</b> 58:21	97:18	<b>represent</b>	<b>reselling</b>	95:23 96:4	209:14
<b>reductions</b>	156:23	<b>related</b> 58:20	<b>remains</b>	21:10,16	13:20	139:18	213:11
88:3 89:14	182:3,6	59:19 63:8	238:4	72:22	<b>residence</b>	144:14	266:11
122:9	226:5,18	119:3 130:7	<b>remedy</b>	226:16	246:7	<b>resolving</b>	269:21
135:12	275:14	130:15	145:20	<b>representat...</b>	<b>residential</b>	97:13	275:13
187:9	280:5	140:24	179:16	58:4	176:7 178:9	<b>resource</b>	<b>responsiven...</b>
188:22	<b>regards</b> 29:1	159:2	<b>remember</b>	<b>representat...</b>	182:21	131:22	235:16
<b>reference</b> 7:2	29:4 36:15	176:21	30:7 44:7	4:13 5:1	183:4 192:5	265:8 279:9	<b>rest</b> 256:9
41:2,11	51:9 54:9	177:20	44:15 64:21	11:3 185:13	202:13	<b>resources</b>	280:14
44:24 46:12	172:15	179:12	68:6 141:2	<b>represented</b>	203:6,9,11	62:24 86:19	<b>Restate</b> 154:8
151:12,23	281:3	181:7	223:21	173:9	203:13	172:18	<b>restaurants</b>
<b>referred</b>	<b>region</b> 198:15	223:11	225:13	<b>represents</b>	204:8,11	213:15	21:17
271:4	<b>regional</b>	234:22	229:16	177:4	206:2 214:6	230:7	<b>restoration</b>
<b>referring</b>	72:19,24	<b>relates</b> 10:11	264:15	<b>reproduction</b>	214:9	236:12	56:4
252:18	103:24	49:1 149:21	274:17	288:17	226:12	237:19	<b>restore</b> 56:4
272:7	<b>regional-ba...</b>	158:3 187:1	286:6	<b>Republic</b>	227:11	239:18	<b>restriction</b>
<b>refinanced</b>	258:18	218:15	<b>reminded</b>	170:6	230:12	240:8,14	272:1
125:2,15	<b>register</b> 14:1	223:23	153:1	171:20	234:23,24	243:16	<b>restrictions</b>
<b>reflect</b> 27:22	<b>regressive</b>	<b>relating</b>	<b>remit</b> 83:7	<b>request</b> 25:24	235:1	261:14	272:13
182:16	143:3	185:7	<b>remitted</b> 38:8	44:6 62:14	238:18	266:3	<b>result</b> 36:10
184:21	<b>regular</b> 149:3	<b>relations</b>	<b>removing</b>	62:18	239:23	<b>respect</b> 2:22	59:13 178:3
187:10	150:10	162:5	177:16	110:15	240:20	108:24	180:23
228:12	151:4	<b>relationship</b>	<b>rent</b> 8:9	112:1,2	245:21	116:7	187:12,17
270:21	176:24	94:10,12	194:5	113:6	246:13	<b>respected</b>	207:18
<b>reflected</b>	182:18	178:20	271:24	121:22	257:7 258:5	183:9	<b>resulted</b>
198:9	184:12	183:11	272:4,12	146:22	259:3,8,15	<b>respects</b> 8:4	177:13
<b>reflecting</b>	193:23	236:5	<b>rental</b> 163:6	147:2,11	259:17	102:7	179:8
238:5	207:15,19	<b>relationships</b>	<b>reoccurring</b>	148:7,14	261:9	107:10,11	<b>resulting</b>
<b>reflective</b>	222:18	162:2	250:1	161:21	263:24	158:1	180:11
183:16	228:8,20,23	<b>relative</b> 178:2	<b>repair</b> 98:9	171:14	266:12,23	285:11	<b>results</b> 50:20
<b>reflects</b>	237:8	<b>relatively</b>	<b>repeat</b> 145:13	<b>requested</b>	269:8,11	<b>respond</b> 48:7	184:4
186:18	249:14,24	50:22 65:18	285:8	163:14	270:22	176:15	<b>retail</b> 10:13
188:8	253:21	66:18 178:8	<b>replace</b>	215:19	271:9	<b>responded</b>	18:20 144:1
<b>refunding</b>	254:9	246:1 283:9	172:12	<b>requesting</b>	275:15	245:9	144:5,7,10
125:8	260:13	<b>release</b> 98:3	<b>report</b> 29:13	177:2 186:5	276:5,14	<b>response</b> 7:6	145:23
<b>refundings</b>	272:4,5	121:6	30:10	<b>requests</b>	277:24	8:23 9:8	176:9
125:7	279:20	150:15	125:21	44:12,15	283:11	107:4,9	184:22
<b>refuse</b> 70:19	<b>regularly</b>	<b>released</b>	187:10	<b>require</b> 12:22	<b>residentials</b>	110:10	<b>retailer</b> 11:12
<b>regard</b> 84:10	23:9 150:2	150:16,20	197:2	172:11,22	204:10	154:6 176:1	12:8,12
95:16	151:1 254:2	<b>releasing</b>	<b>reported</b>	173:3 180:5	<b>residents</b>	274:23	20:8,23
183:13	<b>regulation</b>	47:17	30:15	217:8	97:10	<b>responsibili...</b>	31:15 39:7
185:4	154:15	<b>relevant</b> 8:4	<b>reporter</b>	258:24	202:20	181:6	81:11 82:7
232:23	155:4 157:8	<b>relief</b> 180:20	288:12,19	<b>required</b>	227:7 242:6	<b>responsibility</b>	106:10,12
<b>regarding</b> 2:5	157:11	<b>religious</b>	<b>reporting</b>	14:11 172:4	<b>residual</b>	19:24 99:14	107:21,24
25:22 46:18	<b>reinforce</b>	176:12	284:8	173:5 206:5	234:24	107:20	108:2,15
48:24 49:11	48:22	<b>relinquish</b>	<b>reports</b>	240:3 248:9	<b>resolution</b> 2:6	270:4	109:15,16
49:18 51:10	<b>reissuing</b>	20:21	128:17	280:14	2:8,16,16	284:14	114:21
117:19	180:11	<b>relook</b> 237:24	129:16	<b>requirement</b>	54:12 98:18	285:20	116:19

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 27

<b>retailers</b>	233:2	157:10,15	187:18	188:11,17	189:13	142:16	<b>scenario</b> 26:9
16:10,20	250:15	157:19	188:1	189:5,14	281:21	249:17	39:8 108:11
17:3 19:7,9	252:6,9	<b>Rich</b> 94:17	191:10	190:5,10	<b>running</b>	<b>Saskia</b> 45:6	146:1,3
19:17 20:3	263:15	<b>right</b> 6:1,9,16	192:7,11	<b>risking</b> 191:6	130:18	45:15	<b>schedule</b> 46:7
20:6,6	286:4,12	7:8 9:19	193:12,22	<b>risks</b> 65:23	168:9 282:6	131:12	164:21
36:16,19	<b>revenues</b>	11:14,18	194:3,4,19	<b>road</b> 196:6	<b>runs</b> 28:18	132:3	<b>school</b> 55:8
82:24 102:8	50:17 115:1	12:2,6 13:9	198:16,19	<b>Rob</b> 3:21 4:7		<b>save</b> 168:24	55:10 57:11
102:13,18	210:11	19:7 20:4	198:23	85:15	<b>S</b>	<b>saving</b> 168:16	57:22,24
102:20,24	<b>review</b> 176:15	21:19 22:11	201:2,6,17	123:23	<b>S</b> 1:11	169:3	66:8 146:22
103:7	179:9 184:8	24:5,14,18	203:18,20	139:22	<b>salaries</b> 213:4	<b>savings</b>	147:12
105:23	203:18	27:22 34:17	204:2,3,23	140:7	216:9	125:10	148:5 149:4
106:7	229:9 260:8	36:7 40:13	204:23,24	157:23	<b>salary</b> 213:6	167:24	149:11,19
108:12,16	<b>reviewed</b>	41:6 43:4	206:14	<b>robust</b> 180:1	<b>sale</b> 22:21	168:11,19	150:3,10,14
109:3,6	53:10	44:23 51:13	208:4 210:6	<b>role</b> 177:16	24:17 31:16	<b>saw</b> 177:19	150:23
116:19	<b>reviewing</b>	51:16 53:6	210:10	181:16	40:10,11	178:8	151:5 152:8
<b>retrospect</b>	260:4	53:8,24	211:13	197:17	178:21	274:20	152:9,19
66:4	<b>reviews</b> 202:9	56:24 61:13	221:10	224:1	199:15,22	<b>saying</b> 25:2	<b>schools</b> 42:15
<b>return</b> 124:12	202:24	65:10 70:10	222:11	<b>roles</b> 270:8	200:24	31:11 40:3	55:16 56:2
124:14	<b>revised</b> 2:18	74:21 75:22	226:12	<b>rolled</b> 237:7	237:21,22	47:14 57:8	56:3,10,16
235:22	183:18	81:21 84:4	228:6 230:5	<b>rolling</b>	237:23	83:22 92:3	56:21
<b>returns</b> 28:11	<b>revision</b>	85:9,19	232:14	164:21	238:5,9,11	92:24	<b>Schwartz</b>
<b>revenue</b> 11:1	176:16	87:12 89:22	236:18,24	<b>rolls</b> 164:24	238:13,15	108:10	168:1,1,4,5
11:3,9	179:18	90:19 93:10	239:11,15	<b>roof</b> 101:13	238:17	145:2	168:21
16:14 17:24	187:1	103:11	241:6	<b>room</b> 1:5	239:9	159:16	169:5
22:9 26:13	<b>revisions</b>	105:21	242:24	149:14	<b>sales</b> 12:15	189:10	<b>science</b> 191:3
26:21 28:15	180:22	107:6	244:22	191:15	13:11,13,15	192:20	<b>scope</b> 20:2
31:18 37:19	185:20	108:19,23	247:9,12	215:14	13:18,19	193:7	234:21
55:15,17	<b>revisit</b> 156:22	109:22	249:12	287:4	26:21 27:7	215:12	<b>Scott</b> 96:2
66:20,22,24	<b>revolution</b>	112:6 117:1	251:16	<b>rotation</b>	82:10 85:3	233:5	97:2,5,5,9
67:5 68:13	280:1	117:12	252:24	102:5	88:7,23	255:23	99:8 103:19
68:23 74:18	<b>Reynolds</b>	121:12	255:23,24	<b>roughly</b>	89:2 103:15	256:13	<b>screamed</b>
74:24 84:5	1:15 18:5	124:24	260:21	74:21 75:3	103:23,24	270:18	95:5
102:6	22:4 25:15	125:6	261:12	210:7,9,10	104:5,11,11	273:23	<b>seated</b> 175:10
103:12,14	25:17,20	126:22	262:6,7	<b>round</b> 63:12	105:4,4,11	274:3 277:1	175:13
115:9,10	26:7,15,18	128:6 130:3	267:2	225:6	105:16	281:14	<b>Seawert</b>
116:18	27:9,17,21	130:13	268:21	242:12,18	116:20,22	<b>says</b> 12:11	175:12
119:8 127:4	28:20,24	131:17	269:18	260:11	117:9	15:16,19	<b>second</b> 47:2
127:5,16,23	29:19,24	132:14,22	270:24	<b>roundabout</b>	159:24	81:12 82:17	63:12 164:5
128:3,12	30:6,14,17	134:22	271:7	231:23	176:21	84:14 87:4	167:23
129:20	30:22 35:6	135:7,16	273:24	<b>row</b> 11:22	185:8 197:9	107:16	172:2 177:8
136:24	136:12,15	136:3	274:7,18	276:21	197:18	108:13,20	195:16
140:8	137:10,14	138:15	275:10,16	<b>RPR</b> 288:11	257:8,17	115:3,11	225:6 226:5
141:23	138:3,7,17	139:2,20	276:8 277:6	<b>Rudd</b> 103:20	258:7,8	154:14	226:19
147:20	138:24	143:13,18	279:13	104:14,19	259:20	163:19	244:15
148:17	139:3,6,19	147:6	284:9 286:1	142:20,21	260:6	198:3	256:11,12
154:5,11	145:11,12	148:20	<b>rights</b> 47:13	143:10	261:20,21	199:19	259:9 285:7
169:13	145:17	156:7 157:1	<b>rise</b> 258:12	<b>rule</b> 52:17,23	262:15	204:14	<b>secret</b> 123:12
181:9,11,18	146:10,13	160:2,5,10	258:13	<b>rules</b> 194:5	273:13,14	221:7	217:19
181:22	152:6,18,21	166:9,17	<b>risk</b> 50:10	222:14,15	273:16,22	250:13	<b>section</b> 5:3
201:16	153:4,19	169:22	58:18 94:9	<b>ruling</b> 53:10	274:1,1,4	272:10	169:10
207:5	154:4,7,18	170:24	94:13 95:16	53:14,17,20	278:1,8,9	<b>scale</b> 10:13	<b>sector</b> 55:20
212:22	155:13,17	174:4,9	97:6 124:18	<b>run</b> 93:5	<b>sales-based</b>	39:23	56:5 210:22
218:4,13,14	156:20	175:10	124:23	120:10,11	<b>Sanchez</b>	141:18	210:23

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 28

223:15	119:23	87:2,8	<b>sevens</b> 166:4	250:18	<b>sit</b> 265:7	120:21	54:13,16
278:21	187:10	105:9 171:2	<b>severed</b> 34:19	<b>showroom</b>	<b>sites</b> 97:22	<b>sold</b> 15:7	62:22 97:12
279:5,10	<b>sees</b> 214:6	189:19	<b>share</b> 30:19	265:4	<b>sitting</b> 64:7	195:17	99:13
281:7,11,20	<b>select</b> 18:8	202:21	51:22 95:22	<b>shows</b> 12:8	145:11	199:9 214:4	107:15,15
<b>secure</b> 144:17	<b>selectively</b>	260:9 263:5	96:5 215:13	13:23 14:7	187:19	214:24	118:14
144:20	128:10	<b>sent</b> 94:16	276:17	166:21	<b>situation</b>	215:2 238:3	126:12
<b>securing</b>	<b>self</b> 101:21	163:13	<b>shared</b> 28:3	230:24	12:18	239:13	128:19
186:2	284:8	<b>separate</b>	167:7	<b>shy</b> 237:9	144:15	<b>solely</b> 59:4	129:16
<b>see</b> 5:3 15:16	<b>self-correcti...</b>	131:16,17	215:14	<b>side</b> 72:14	<b>six</b> 2:11 85:9	62:5	142:2,3
15:18 19:14	205:6	<b>separately</b>	<b>sharing</b>	111:11	93:19 136:7	<b>Solicitor</b>	196:10,18
20:10 23:1	<b>self-report</b>	30:16	131:19	145:22	245:7	14:22 46:17	204:13
38:4,7	286:12	<b>SEPTA</b> 87:10	216:6	212:3	<b>sizable</b> 68:2	46:20 47:3	205:5
43:22 49:24	<b>self-reporting</b>	87:14 122:1	<b>Sharon</b>	257:20	<b>size</b> 7:17	48:3 121:13	219:18
51:4 52:4	285:13	<b>series</b> 245:12	175:12	270:14	207:13	139:4	220:13,14
53:9 54:3,8	<b>self-service</b>	<b>seriously</b>	<b>sharpen</b>	280:7	<b>skin</b> 140:18	<b>Solicitor's</b>	231:22
55:11,24	174:2	93:15 110:3	282:8,11	<b>significant</b>	<b>skyrockets</b>	46:23	241:14
56:10,14,21	<b>sell</b> 10:20	<b>serve</b> 38:1	<b>She'll</b> 107:3	57:13,21	258:15	<b>solutions</b>	243:13
57:16 65:24	11:12 12:10	61:22	<b>shelf</b> 82:20	89:14	<b>slightly</b> 67:7	142:23	244:10
69:17 70:5	21:12,17,17	<b>served</b> 224:16	<b>sheriff</b> 22:20	186:22,24	178:3 179:1	156:16	245:5
72:10 76:9	37:21 103:5	<b>service</b> 87:14	24:17	189:20	202:7	<b>Solve</b> 207:11	247:17
77:2 79:4	103:7	102:23	<b>shift</b> 33:21	<b>significantly</b>	<b>slip</b> 23:21	<b>somebody</b>	248:5,8,11
80:3 83:21	108:16	119:7	107:19	86:7 283:13	<b>slips</b> 23:12	11:16 21:2	249:4
86:18 88:11	215:17	162:14	249:21	<b>signing</b> 98:3	<b>slots</b> 213:1	39:18 136:9	268:22
91:3 92:15	252:12	164:21	<b>shifting</b> 55:15	265:2	<b>slow</b> 13:4	199:7,9	269:1
115:24	271:15,15	165:17	<b>shifts</b> 107:20	<b>silos</b> 132:23	111:19	235:19	270:21
118:6	273:5	216:17	<b>shock</b> 249:18	<b>silos</b> 282:19	<b>slower</b> 13:3	258:21	274:19
123:11,14	<b>seller</b> 200:2	223:22	<b>Shoe</b> 103:5	<b>similar</b> 36:21	<b>small</b> 37:16	286:11	279:6
123:14,22	<b>seller's</b>	224:10,12	<b>shook</b> 67:2	37:14 54:5	74:24	<b>somewhat</b> 8:3	282:20
157:22	200:18	251:14	<b>shop</b> 10:15	78:19	118:17	88:15	284:23
173:14	<b>selling</b> 38:14	270:16	26:11	<b>similarities</b>	141:18	149:13	<b>sounds</b> 70:9
183:23	52:20 81:12	<b>serviced</b>	130:11	37:1	168:19,21	151:6	107:8 156:9
188:21,24	83:9 145:2	125:1	<b>shopping</b>	<b>similarity</b>	169:4,5	<b>soon</b> 98:18	166:24
203:16	184:24	<b>services</b>	184:23	38:10	257:20,23	99:3 133:4	206:14
204:12	<b>sells</b> 19:18	61:21 62:1	<b>short</b> 176:14	276:15	<b>smaller</b> 7:14	<b>sophisticated</b>	284:22
225:14	102:14,14	63:5 131:6	<b>show</b> 14:10	<b>simply</b> 29:20	32:4 35:22	180:6	<b>source</b> 103:19
229:4 235:3	106:9	132:12	16:6 30:2	48:5 184:2	41:9 84:14	<b>sorely</b> 264:13	<b>sources</b>
244:15	272:21	170:17	72:11 108:6	<b>single</b> 56:17	115:24	<b>sorry</b> 6:13 8:1	104:13
256:1 260:8	273:6	175:13	139:12	108:2 178:9	<b>snapshot</b>	10:14 17:18	<b>South</b> 195:12
261:24	<b>Senate</b> 54:1,3	224:7	145:23	271:20	126:14	26:4 27:11	<b>Southwest</b>
264:6	<b>send</b> 120:5	<b>serving</b> 71:14	158:2,3	272:18	195:21	37:3,5 45:9	13:7 14:3
265:21	164:19,20	<b>session</b>	164:14	273:6,14,19	220:15,18	60:14 113:2	226:14
271:22	200:15	116:16	166:6,19	273:20	223:6	115:6	<b>Sozi</b> 48:2
274:3 276:2	233:18	<b>set</b> 67:14	169:11	<b>Sinking</b> 3:18	<b>soda</b> 33:20	116:16	<b>space</b> 220:1
277:7	274:23	<b>sets</b> 143:7	208:19	160:19	34:4 85:5	124:6 154:5	284:14,19
280:23	<b>sending</b> 23:17	<b>settlement</b>	229:18	161:14	92:9 114:22	158:5,22	285:18,21
<b>seeing</b> 16:1	<b>sends</b> 251:11	95:5 98:5	232:9,12,19	162:12,13	116:11	172:21	<b>speak</b> 143:2
44:15 50:21	<b>senior</b> 175:8	98:12	272:12	162:17	118:9	206:18	179:3 212:3
55:17 56:12	175:16	<b>settlements</b>	<b>showed</b> 141:3	<b>sir</b> 3:24 73:19	119:14,20	228:2	218:14
227:22	215:15	58:21 159:2	273:12	112:8	157:3	279:22	236:1
<b>seek</b> 185:13	<b>seniors</b> 95:2	<b>seven</b> 92:21	<b>showing</b>	133:24	<b>sodas</b> 21:18	285:6	255:10
<b>seeking</b> 183:1	155:10	93:19 245:7	12:14 15:11	217:20	21:18	286:19	<b>speaking</b>
184:6	250:16	<b>seven-year</b>	56:23 72:14	243:18	<b>soft</b> 32:12	<b>sort</b> 45:22	182:13
<b>seen</b> 57:13	<b>sense</b> 19:3,11	92:20	112:22	253:19	80:12	53:5,17	<b>special</b> 244:7



Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 29

278:24	<b>Squilla</b> 1:16	252:22	212:24	<b>stores</b> 10:18	56:24 57:24	131:24	184:24
<b>specialty</b>	133:20,21	<b>stand</b> 190:18	237:10	21:11 78:20	58:24 59:24	132:24	185:24
269:23	134:1,13,19	193:15	242:11	103:4,5	60:24 61:24	133:24	186:24
270:20	135:4,16,22	194:12	<b>states</b> 104:6	<b>storm</b> 101:11	62:24 63:24	134:24	187:24
<b>specific</b> 9:10	135:24	287:2	238:12,13	<b>straight</b>	64:24 65:24	135:24	188:24
30:20 43:9	136:3	<b>standard</b>	<b>statewide</b>	94:19 126:2	66:24 67:24	136:24	189:24
44:6,12	221:18	186:9 269:3	66:15	<b>straighten</b>	68:24 69:24	137:24	190:24
49:7 51:9	232:8 235:9	<b>standardize</b>	<b>stating</b> 55:24	95:11	70:24 71:24	138:24	191:24
57:8 62:15	235:10,14	46:2	<b>statistic</b>	<b>straightened</b>	72:24 73:24	139:24	192:24
63:3 96:10	236:3,6	<b>standardized</b>	177:24	69:7	74:24 75:24	140:24	193:24
132:17	237:21	132:7	<b>statistical</b>	<b>straightfor...</b>	76:24 77:24	141:24	194:24
151:24	239:11,15	<b>standards</b>	180:7	204:13	78:24 79:24	142:24	195:24
182:9	241:3	180:16	<b>status</b> 149:16	<b>strange</b> 50:4	80:24 81:24	143:24	196:24
228:22	265:13,14	<b>standing</b>	150:3 247:5	<b>Strategic</b>	82:24 83:24	144:24	197:24
242:8	265:18	140:3	247:18	49:20	84:24 85:24	145:24	198:24
<b>specifically</b>	267:1,20	190:13,15	<b>statutorily</b>	<b>strategies</b>	86:24 87:24	146:24	199:24
11:15 43:12	268:2 271:7	<b>start</b> 2:3 19:4	219:23	118:14	88:24 89:24	147:24	200:24
61:3 68:11	272:3,15	31:6,10	<b>stay</b> 66:6	<b>strategy</b> 53:6	90:24 91:24	148:24	201:24
71:24 155:7	273:8,12,24	42:12 49:10	135:5 220:7	<b>stream</b>	92:24 93:24	149:24	202:24
226:13	274:7	50:8 65:3	<b>stayed</b> 66:17	278:13	94:24 95:24	150:24	203:24
227:19	<b>squirrels</b>	69:12 90:23	163:6	<b>street</b> 45:1,13	96:24 97:24	151:24	204:24
253:24	72:23	91:20,20	211:12	94:21	98:24 99:24	152:24	205:24
<b>spectacular</b>	<b>SRC</b> 58:4	116:11	<b>stays</b> 90:12	101:16	100:24	153:24	206:24
61:8	<b>stable</b> 66:6	161:4 218:2	<b>stenographic</b>	204:17	101:24	154:24	207:24
<b>speculative</b>	<b>staff</b> 16:14,24	248:2	288:6	215:2 239:4	102:24	155:24	208:24
114:17	17:3 19:24	255:19	<b>step</b> 38:3 98:6	<b>Strehlow</b> 1:23	103:24	156:24	209:24
<b>speed</b> 263:18	26:1,1,2,8	256:8	240:6	2:24 3:24	104:24	157:24	210:24
264:2	27:24 98:24	<b>started</b> 51:8	<b>stepped</b>	4:24 5:24	105:24	158:24	211:24
<b>spend</b> 86:11	98:24	69:9,13,14	243:20	6:24 7:24	106:24	159:24	212:24
210:23	186:12	186:16	274:14	8:24 9:24	107:24	160:24	213:24
<b>spending</b>	206:22	196:6 255:1	<b>stewards</b>	10:24 11:24	108:24	161:24	214:24
3:12 49:14	209:5	255:2	209:14	12:24 13:24	109:24	162:24	215:24
49:15	215:15	<b>starting</b> 52:4	<b>sticker</b>	14:24 15:24	110:24	163:24	216:24
205:21	216:3,10	69:10 129:7	249:18	16:24 17:24	111:24	164:24	217:24
211:1	239:21	230:6	<b>stills</b> 238:4	18:24 19:24	112:24	165:24	218:24
<b>spike</b> 49:24	250:13	259:21	<b>stipulate</b>	20:24 21:24	113:24	166:24	219:24
<b>spirit</b> 281:1	259:18	<b>starts</b> 104:8	25:23	22:24 23:24	114:24	167:24	220:24
<b>spite</b> 96:15	260:7 269:6	<b>state</b> 13:19	<b>Stitt</b> 2:7 3:8	24:24 25:24	115:24	168:24	221:24
198:24	279:19	57:2,16,21	3:19	26:24 27:24	116:24	169:24	222:24
<b>split</b> 32:15	<b>staffed</b>	58:1 66:13	<b>stood</b> 128:13	28:24 29:24	117:24	170:24	223:24
39:6 165:20	240:14	68:21 95:12	192:13	30:24 31:24	118:24	171:24	224:24
<b>spoke</b> 271:8	241:1	161:2	193:16	32:24 33:24	119:24	172:24	225:24
<b>spoken</b>	270:12,16	176:11	<b>stop</b> 64:17	34:24 35:24	120:24	173:24	226:24
185:12	<b>staffing</b> 61:9	240:2,3	116:24	36:24 37:24	121:24	174:24	227:24
264:5	180:15	244:6	<b>stopped</b>	38:24 39:24	122:24	175:24	228:24
<b>spotlight</b>	223:9	<b>stated</b> 113:5	153:1	40:24 41:24	123:24	176:24	229:24
211:2	225:16	156:24	<b>stops</b> 218:12	42:24 43:24	124:24	177:24	230:24
269:16	242:19	239:17	<b>store</b> 10:6,24	44:24 45:24	125:24	178:24	231:24
<b>spread</b> 84:9	<b>stage</b> 160:3	281:4	11:11,13	46:24 47:24	126:24	179:24	232:24
84:11	<b>stages</b> 128:5	<b>statement</b>	12:10 13:7	48:24 49:24	127:24	180:24	233:24
<b>square</b>	<b>stalled</b> 53:17	58:10 76:12	15:15 33:6	50:24 51:24	128:24	181:24	234:24
284:13	<b>stamp</b> 252:23	115:3	81:13 83:21	52:24 53:24	129:24	182:24	235:24
285:19	<b>stamped</b>	156:22	246:13	54:24 55:24	130:24	183:24	236:24

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 30

237:24	<b>strict</b> 246:20	<b>substantial</b>	129:7,10	155:9	76:13 95:20	174:18	282:13
238:24	<b>strictly</b> 278:8	50:10	<b>sunsets</b> 93:1	157:14	96:20	288:6	<b>targeted</b> 9:21
239:24	278:10	177:16,20	<b>supermarket</b>	160:8 161:3	127:21,22	<b>takes</b> 108:10	10:1
240:24	<b>strive</b> 268:21	186:1	15:14 78:21	166:18	129:20,21	138:10	<b>targets</b> 34:21
241:24	<b>stroll</b> 140:9	187:13	<b>supermark...</b>	171:6 187:8	132:18,23	193:24	<b>Taubenber...</b>
242:24	<b>structural</b>	202:24	103:3	187:20	138:1	196:21	1:16 117:15
243:24	98:8	203:2 209:5	<b>supervision</b>	191:5,7	167:16,20	261:17	117:16
244:24	<b>struggling</b>	216:24	288:19	193:3 196:8	168:9,9,16	262:9	119:12
245:24	277:19	<b>substantially</b>	<b>supervisor</b>	201:12	168:16	<b>talent</b> 281:19	120:6,16
246:24	<b>stuck</b> 252:13	184:17	224:9	203:24	173:23,24	<b>talk</b> 10:13	121:1,7,23
247:24	<b>students</b>	231:9	<b>supervisors</b>	207:22	180:3,5	27:10 28:16	122:6,14,21
248:24	42:10	<b>substitute</b>	269:7	210:4,14	185:22	29:15 31:18	122:24
249:24	<b>studies</b>	86:9	270:13	218:11	202:6 206:9	33:12 40:8	123:5,16
250:24	134:15	<b>subtract</b>	<b>supplied</b>	219:2 223:7	206:18	40:9 42:20	124:4
251:24	178:18	166:3	11:20	228:8	207:8,16,16	42:21 45:8	167:12,13
252:24	<b>stuff</b> 23:12	<b>success</b> 137:7	<b>supplier</b> 16:8	233:23	208:4,13	46:3 49:2	167:19
253:24	68:19 81:22	179:15	<b>support</b>	236:21,23	211:17,19	49:22 56:19	168:3,18,23
254:24	92:10	202:16	180:6	243:11,11	217:8	58:15 59:24	169:6
255:24	116:15	<b>suddenly</b>	215:13	243:19	219:15,16	60:12,16	232:16,17
256:24	212:15	92:1	216:7,18	244:21	220:9	61:4 73:10	232:21
257:24	215:7	<b>suffered</b>	217:13	245:19	236:14,15	73:12	234:7,15,19
258:24	229:14	99:12	269:21	247:6,19	240:10,16	121:12	235:5
259:24	267:4,18	<b>sugar</b> 6:20	<b>supporting</b>	251:20	241:1	151:1 159:7	<b>tax</b> 6:20,21
260:24	283:23	33:21 34:3	4:24	252:23	249:15	186:20	8:21 9:9
261:24	<b>style</b> 282:22	34:6 36:13	<b>supposed</b>	253:4,4,11	262:23	226:7,19	10:17,20
262:24	<b>styles</b> 277:2	36:16 46:15	14:8 15:17	256:20	264:17,18	227:17	12:15 13:11
263:24	<b>subdivisions</b>	88:20	48:14 80:23	262:1,5	276:22	286:2,6	13:14,16,18
264:24	269:22	114:15	100:21,22	263:2	<b>systems</b> 23:11	<b>talked</b> 96:3	13:18,19
265:24	<b>subject</b> 10:24	118:9 134:3	127:11	267:16	46:3 130:15	113:19	14:12 15:8
266:24	38:13 94:8	153:17	130:5 207:8	268:1 271:1	<b>T</b>	114:24	15:11,17
267:24	153:24	157:1	242:2 283:7	279:14	<b>T</b> 288:1,1	155:24	18:12,21,24
268:24	154:2 224:3	<b>sugar-sweet...</b>	<b>supposedly</b>	281:13	<b>table</b> 4:1,11	159:22	19:15 20:15
269:24	224:4,10,13	35:14,18	241:8	283:1,21	11:5 26:16	223:10	20:16 26:21
270:24	238:10	36:9 103:5	<b>suppress</b>	<b>survey</b> 78:8	102:9,12,17	236:20	27:7 31:11
271:24	<b>subjects</b>	103:8,15	136:7	<b>survive</b> 35:4	109:1,2,5	242:20	31:12 32:22
272:24	216:14	104:1	<b>sure</b> 16:16	139:8,12	111:11	266:14	34:21 35:10
273:24	<b>submit</b>	106:13	18:7 20:17	<b>survived</b>	136:9	285:10	35:23 38:3
274:24	136:23	<b>sugary</b> 19:18	21:4 23:8	141:15	160:20	286:4	38:5,7,13
275:24	251:9,10	21:13 26:20	28:18 29:1	<b>swankier</b>	174:24	<b>talking</b> 10:4	38:14,15
276:24	<b>submits</b>	31:8 36:16	30:23 43:6	277:13	<b>take</b> 59:9	21:13,15	46:16 66:3
277:24	251:6	102:15	47:16 50:2	<b>Swann</b>	78:18 83:16	40:13 65:17	66:7,15
278:24	<b>submitted</b>	109:4,6	52:14 87:19	175:12	86:10 87:20	83:18	67:3 68:1
279:24	2:23 161:11	156:23	87:21 90:12	<b>sway</b> 204:21	92:4 93:14	100:12	72:4,12
280:24	209:7	<b>suggest</b> 152:9	90:24 91:8	<b>sweet</b> 46:15	99:14	132:10	75:6 77:8,9
281:24	252:20	<b>suggesting</b>	111:9	116:15	106:15	154:17	77:10,12
282:24	<b>submitting</b>	189:23	117:13	<b>sweetened</b>	112:2 126:9	201:18	79:8 81:14
283:24	209:9	190:2	121:1,3	33:22 34:3	153:6 169:1	202:8	81:19 82:5
284:24	<b>subsequent</b>	<b>suits</b> 132:1	122:17	34:5 88:20	188:17	215:21	82:10,13
285:24	129:23	<b>summary</b>	128:20	<b>swimming</b>	190:4 199:7	218:13	83:1,7
286:24	<b>subsequently</b>	126:12	130:14	141:6	227:2 241:5	243:2 248:2	84:10 86:8
287:24	116:18	218:3	141:18	<b>swing</b> 113:8	258:20	264:9	86:9,10
288:23	<b>subsidies</b>	275:14	149:18	<b>switch</b> 126:5	270:5	279:24	88:2,9,14
<b>stresses</b> 50:4	272:1,4	<b>summer</b>	154:7 155:7	<b>system</b> 22:10	<b>taken</b> 59:12	280:4,8	88:17,23,23

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 31

89:1,2,3,7	<b>taxes</b> 8:5,17	<b>Tea</b> 85:11	176:14,18	<b>testing</b> 48:15	174:10,12	205:14	52:7 55:13
89:11,15,16	10:23 16:16	<b>teachable</b>	189:11	70:5 223:24	174:15	207:7 208:8	55:21 57:1
89:20 90:9	20:10 26:24	136:17	207:24	224:23	186:10,14	242:17	58:3,23
90:9 91:3,4	39:15 68:10	<b>team</b> 175:8	228:3	<b>tests</b> 224:9	192:2	249:12	59:3,6,8
91:10 92:9	70:18,19	<b>technical</b>	249:18	<b>thank</b> 3:7,23	201:21	253:1 267:5	61:14,18
92:13,15	72:2,3	232:13	<b>terminating</b>	6:17 21:22	205:3	277:24	63:4 65:20
93:6,8,12	74:20 75:4	<b>Technically</b>	221:5	21:24 25:11	209:15,17	<b>things</b> 15:5	67:6,14,17
107:20	75:20,24	178:19	<b>terminology</b>	25:12,13,17	209:18,21	21:18 22:18	67:17 68:4
108:4	76:7,10	<b>Technology</b>	84:21	30:5 31:1,2	217:14,14	23:7,20	70:16,22
114:18	86:24 88:1	185:24	<b>terms</b> 9:17	31:5 40:20	217:16,17	27:13 33:23	71:2,22
115:4,10,12	88:3,6,20	<b>tell</b> 10:14,15	31:13 56:9	40:21,24	217:19,22	35:17 43:4	72:6,19
116:22	89:9 93:4	30:12 49:24	61:9 62:8	47:11 48:15	217:24	43:11 52:11	73:8 74:10
117:9 118:9	116:18	85:13	62:12 80:19	48:17 49:5	225:20,22	55:21 58:6	74:23 75:20
118:9,12,18	121:8	100:24	80:24 83:11	54:22,24	226:1,2	65:16 71:7	75:23 76:19
119:14,20	122:10,12	139:16	98:15	60:4 64:6,8	229:22	71:8,13,17	76:23 77:1
121:10,18	124:2 130:7	156:8	114:17	64:11 73:16	231:16,18	72:9 74:15	77:14 78:23
121:20	136:20	169:14	137:8	73:18,21	231:21	81:15 84:24	79:6,19,20
122:18,19	137:2,6	214:19	165:20	77:16,17,18	232:18,20	85:7 93:5	83:12 87:4
129:20	141:1 143:3	219:7	168:10,11	77:22 86:2	235:5,6,7	96:1 101:12	87:12 88:13
134:3,9,9	144:3,4	220:21	188:7	86:4 93:24	235:10	101:14	88:15 89:7
137:3	155:23	223:20	190:22	94:1,4,17	242:14,16	103:6	90:10,22
139:17	163:6	232:1,10	199:22	97:4 101:22	243:18,22	115:17	91:15,17
141:4 144:7	176:16	246:11	202:15,16	101:23,24	244:5,8,18	119:15	92:16,20
153:17,24	179:18	247:8	218:16	102:2,8	250:5,8,10	123:6	95:22 97:13
154:3	181:3	258:17	224:21,22	110:7	251:21,22	127:10,12	99:19 102:5
169:12	210:12	275:3 276:3	234:1	117:12,16	253:12,14	154:13,15	106:4,15
176:2,3,4	211:23	276:10	255:11	121:23	253:17	157:7	107:12,22
176:16	283:11,12	278:17	256:17	123:16,17	262:17,19	192:22	108:7 110:8
178:7 179:1	283:16	<b>telling</b> 193:2	257:3	123:20	262:21	196:15	110:10
179:7,21	284:1	220:11	264:23	124:4	265:10,11	204:2 207:7	118:18
180:12,23	<b>taxing</b> 285:17	<b>tells</b> 84:2	269:8	133:16,17	265:14	223:14	119:23
181:13,20	285:17	284:19	279:18	133:18,21	274:7,11	229:13	121:11,11
182:18	<b>taxpayer</b>	<b>temporarily</b>	<b>terrible</b> 212:1	136:3	283:3,4	230:9	121:14
185:18	18:14 121:4	270:10	<b>terrifying</b>	139:21,21	286:16,17	240:13	122:19
187:1	179:16	<b>temporary</b>	153:15	139:23	286:17,21	262:11	123:12
201:14	181:2 189:2	220:3	<b>test</b> 224:7	140:2	286:23	279:18	125:10
203:1	190:8	<b>ten</b> 65:14	<b>testify</b> 3:19	141:21,22	287:1,5	<b>think</b> 9:8,13	126:3 128:5
207:18	191:13	181:13	175:18	142:7,9,11	<b>thanks</b> 156:7	11:1 20:4	128:7 130:9
249:20	192:3	230:17	186:11	142:13,17	156:19	21:14 22:18	131:12,17
284:12,20	193:13	245:2	<b>testimony</b>	145:10	169:7	23:4,6,19	131:18
<b>taxable</b> 27:8	209:14	279:20	3:16 4:9	146:15	235:24	24:7,9,10	133:7,7,8
27:13,20	221:3,7	<b>ten-year</b>	6:11 41:13	152:5,23	242:13	24:13,24	133:12
32:5 37:17	272:9	167:3	49:17	153:17	244:6	26:4,24	137:22
105:6 117:8	<b>taxpayers</b>	<b>tenant</b> 39:12	114:20,21	155:16,17	253:13	27:2,6,15	138:1,6,22
157:3	15:1 32:11	<b>tend</b> 8:15	136:24	155:20	<b>theater</b> 267:3	27:18 29:8	139:5,13,14
181:14	80:14	10:7,9	146:17,21	157:19,21	<b>thing</b> 20:14	29:9 30:22	142:8 143:6
184:1,4	120:20	258:19	161:5,11,15	160:17	61:10 77:6	31:23 33:5	144:23
218:18	179:10	278:1	162:8	163:10,12	81:9 83:17	33:9 35:4	145:7 146:6
266:20	183:23	<b>tends</b> 9:17	167:21	167:7,8,9	118:15	36:4,10	147:18,24
270:6,7	186:7	257:11	198:3 226:3	167:13	139:13	37:12 42:18	148:19
<b>taxation</b>	196:13	<b>tent</b> 190:22	226:5,9	168:3 169:8	161:24	44:5,7	151:14,17
269:17	<b>TD</b> 170:6	<b>term</b> 22:8	254:4	169:22	191:8	45:20 51:18	152:2,14,16
<b>taxed</b> 34:9	171:20	78:7 138:18	286:24	170:2 174:9	194:18	51:23 52:2	153:13,15

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 32

153:22	275:7 279:8	70:20	262:5 263:6	<b>topic</b> 42:21	181:6	40:1 41:3	174:15
155:23	283:8	<b>throw</b> 205:9	264:12,19	<b>torn</b> 257:23	<b>transitions</b>	42:11 46:1	187:5
156:12,14	<b>thinking</b>	<b>ti</b> 239:11	272:7	<b>total</b> 5:6	64:15	56:17 57:7	195:11
159:14	77:14	<b>TICs</b> 165:8	278:16	76:14 80:14	<b>translation</b>	79:9 85:19	197:8,11
163:13,20	125:13	<b>tie</b> 118:21	280:23,24	122:15,17	61:17,21,23	85:21 95:11	214:3
164:18,22	202:18	<b>tied</b> 107:17	282:12	162:16	<b>Treasurer</b>	95:14 99:14	226:23
165:20	224:21	108:14	287:4	164:7	3:18 53:22	104:16	228:23
167:5,6	245:17,20	253:23	<b>timeline</b>	165:16	53:24	111:8	262:12,15
172:15	282:9	<b>tight</b> 262:16	119:2 129:1	<b>totally</b> 82:7	160:18	112:10	267:10
188:8 194:1	<b>third</b> 32:16	<b>tightening</b>	131:10,12	208:6	161:9 168:2	131:22	279:18
196:10,12	<b>thirds</b> 32:17	240:23	131:14	<b>totals</b> 5:7	<b>Treasurer's</b>	132:5,20	283:5
204:14,15	<b>Thirty-one</b>	<b>till</b> 90:3 92:19	<b>timely</b> 180:11	161:19	161:16	152:12	<b>two-thirds</b>
204:15,24	120:15	135:18	207:17	<b>touched</b>	<b>Treasury</b>	156:15	80:15
208:7,11	<b>Thompson</b>	158:15	<b>times</b> 35:8	127:6	167:16,20	165:13	<b>type</b> 46:18,22
209:6,8,10	45:6,9,15	221:4	78:3 145:4	<b>tough</b> 64:22	<b>treat</b> 73:3	166:13	74:14
209:12,13	45:16	<b>time</b> 50:12,16	191:17	212:13	<b>treated</b> 239:7	189:18	106:10
213:14,19	131:13	50:19 51:6	207:4	213:13,17	<b>trend</b> 135:10	196:17	134:9,9
214:17,21	132:3,3	56:11,24	<b>timing</b> 149:21	<b>town</b> 195:11	<b>tried</b> 144:24	208:7,12,17	168:16
215:8,15	133:17	59:17 69:7	263:6,18	245:3	204:2	209:11	172:6 189:3
216:10,16	<b>thought</b> 6:2	71:3 76:20	<b>tips</b> 84:6	283:20	<b>trigger</b> 239:9	215:17	199:20
216:16,22	28:13,13	93:23 95:18	<b>title</b> 222:20	<b>track</b> 19:5	239:12	216:18	200:11
217:5 218:4	64:16 87:2	106:22	<b>titles</b> 2:7	29:15 30:11	<b>triggers</b>	218:20	231:14
218:9	87:8 113:22	108:10	<b>TMS</b> 167:17	211:18	222:19	224:22	234:13
220:22	115:8	109:20	168:6	219:17	237:23	230:1 232:8	237:13
221:14,24	137:18	111:9,10,14	<b>today</b> 3:9,16	220:4 221:1	<b>tripled</b>	249:22	239:1 267:5
222:2,3,12	159:9 282:5	111:17,18	4:11 22:16	<b>tracked</b> 82:22	181:15	268:14	267:13
222:15,17	284:7,11	111:22	44:22 47:14	<b>tradeoff</b>	<b>triplexes</b>	271:17	271:23
224:12	285:16	116:7 119:1	135:21,22	28:14	271:12	275:23	<b>types</b> 61:10
225:7,11	<b>thoughts</b>	119:8 123:9	135:23	<b>trained</b> 17:8	<b>tripling</b>	<b>Tuesday</b>	84:24
229:13	53:19	140:16,18	161:12	20:17 240:1	181:19	287:3	184:13
235:24	<b>threatening</b>	148:20	164:4 175:7	241:4	<b>trouble</b>	<b>tuition</b> 42:9	276:12,15
236:3	95:3	149:17	193:2 213:1	<b>training</b>	248:19,22	<b>Tulante</b>	277:3
237:14,16	<b>three</b> 23:9	161:10	214:16	117:24	<b>truck</b> 33:15	46:17 48:2	<b>typically</b>
237:19	35:23 56:16	165:24	232:9	118:4	<b>true</b> 205:19	48:3	200:4,17
239:16,21	65:11 100:1	171:14	261:16	223:12,19	277:12,23	<b>tune</b> 186:19	207:14
239:22	100:6	181:12,14	<b>told</b> 37:7	225:17	<b>truncated</b>	193:4	258:22
240:7,10,13	109:21	198:24	95:12 122:4	278:24	161:12	<b>turn</b> 21:23	259:14
240:16,22	129:4,5	200:24	152:15	<b>tran</b> 166:2,4	<b>try</b> 16:7	31:21 71:11	
240:24	162:7	201:9 208:9	155:8	169:12,16	54:12,20	<b>twelve</b> 77:4	<b>U</b>
241:1 242:3	191:17	208:12	215:23	169:16	77:4 93:22	<b>Twenty</b> 74:21	<b>U&amp;O</b> 39:11
242:5,7	197:8,11	215:18	<b>Tom</b> 175:15	<b>transactions</b>	102:21,24	<b>Twenty-five</b>	284:5,8
244:19,21	211:10	220:6 225:7	<b>tone</b> 281:2	253:7 262:2	136:9 170:9	74:22	285:1,2,10
245:9,16,17	212:19	225:10,12	<b>tool</b> 140:22	<b>transcript</b>	202:2 215:6	<b>Twenty-one</b>	285:11
249:15	213:24	233:22	141:20	288:8,16	215:19	52:6	<b>Uh-huh</b>
251:10	226:15	236:19,21	142:1 222:1	<b>transfer</b> 69:3	227:9	<b>twice</b> 144:10	150:18
254:19	227:5	238:1,12,20	<b>tools</b> 133:9	<b>transferred</b>	263:18	<b>two</b> 9:2 28:4	172:7
255:19,23	228:24	241:5,9,12	215:6	267:19	264:2	32:17 43:14	<b>ultimate</b>
258:4 263:4	261:3	241:13	<b>top</b> 21:1	279:5	267:15	49:14 57:3	11:13
264:8,11,24	262:12	242:8 245:4	65:14 75:1	<b>transfers</b>	268:19	97:23 99:24	<b>ultimately</b>
268:4,21	267:10	248:12	75:9 113:13	270:5	270:24	100:6	108:1
271:13	<b>threshold</b>	251:13,18	113:24	<b>transition</b>	<b>trying</b> 15:6	106:24	114:18
273:1,16	52:7	252:23	114:3	140:11	20:5 21:6	115:16	<b>unanswered</b>
274:2,6,24	<b>throttle</b> 70:6	260:8 261:2	246:13	<b>transitioned</b>	22:14,23	150:1	133:14
							<b>unbelievable</b>

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 33

98:20	<b>uniform</b>	207:24	182:4	269:18	<b>visiting</b> 97:22	94:7 96:24	242:18
<b>unbuildable</b>	204:18	219:16	278:11	<b>valuing</b>	209:2	97:1 102:6	263:4
257:21	239:5	234:5,8,10	<b>value</b> 8:5	175:21	<b>volume</b> 69:16	102:10	274:13
<b>uncomforta...</b>	248:10	234:13,23	99:14 158:3	231:15	<b>volumes</b> 70:2	115:18	<b>wants</b> 12:9
37:7	<b>uniformity</b>	246:3,9,20	158:6	<b>variation</b>	<b>vote</b> 192:16	118:9	91:9 156:12
<b>uncommon</b>	176:24	258:8	168:15	276:12,19	<b>voted</b> 192:14	119:19	163:19
18:24	177:22	260:16	177:9 178:2	277:9	<b>voters</b> 41:5	122:6	<b>ward</b> 242:22
<b>under-asses...</b>	178:12,18	265:1,8	179:6,17	<b>variations</b>		123:14	242:23
249:6	183:2	268:19	180:18	277:2	<b>W</b>	133:3 136:7	267:8
<b>underfundi...</b>	184:15	271:12	183:14,18	<b>varies</b> 18:4	<b>Wadsworth</b>	141:24	<b>warehouse</b>
114:7	228:17	275:14,17	183:24	61:19,24	277:1	155:11	127:11
<b>understand</b>	248:11,13	275:24	184:2	277:10	<b>wage</b> 88:14	160:11,12	<b>warehouse</b>
8:18 9:13	248:17,24	276:6	186:19	<b>variety</b>	88:17 89:15	164:8	127:13,15
9:19,24	<b>union</b> 173:10	277:16	187:6	104:12	89:20 90:9	166:19	127:23
23:1,3,4	173:18	279:9	188:13,19	<b>various</b> 4:13	91:3,4,9	173:13	128:1,2,12
24:19 43:20	<b>unions</b>	<b>useful</b> 131:18	189:1 190:8	16:20 43:23	93:7 122:18	190:3 195:4	128:23
44:23 56:18	173:14	<b>uses</b> 176:12	190:9 193:8	62:22	124:1	196:8 202:1	131:16
63:23 95:21	<b>unit</b> 183:7	197:5 214:4	195:14,24	130:14	155:23	202:6 210:1	176:10
99:5 111:8	216:5	<b>usually</b> 99:18	199:9 200:1	226:10	<b>wages</b> 161:23	210:4 211:1	<b>warehouses</b>
118:23	251:14	108:10	204:23	<b>vast</b> 97:13	<b>wait</b> 26:8	215:6	184:23
121:21	269:23	200:20	205:5 214:7	<b>vendor</b> 186:3	51:16 90:20	217:11	<b>wasn't</b> 15:8
141:11	270:12,16	203:17	214:13	206:18,19	135:18	223:9 225:3	87:7 112:2
143:2	<b>United</b> 170:5	221:6	215:1 226:6	264:8	139:17	225:15	112:13
159:18	171:19	222:19	231:14	<b>vendors</b>	144:13	226:2,20	156:18
188:11	<b>units</b> 5:23	246:12	238:16	99:17 209:3	158:15,20	227:5	192:17
197:23	270:20	251:12	241:21	209:3,10	160:17	231:23,24	198:8
211:3	<b>universities</b>	282:18	255:20	<b>verifies</b>	169:24	233:23	200:24
212:13,14	266:18	<b>utilized</b>	258:3,15	181:20	<b>waiting</b> 54:3	235:14,21	232:10
212:24	<b>university</b>	284:16	259:11	<b>verify</b> 261:20	263:15,20	235:22	<b>watch</b> 37:8
213:6	103:20		260:5 266:1	<b>Vernon</b>	<b>waive</b> 47:18	242:5	215:24
218:14	219:22	<b>V</b>	278:14	276:24	48:9,10	244:12	<b>water</b> 33:20
253:8	<b>unofficially</b>	<b>V-SAM</b>	<b>valued</b>	<b>version</b> 126:4	171:15	246:12	34:4 84:23
271:17	126:13	219:15	177:23	<b>versus</b> 80:10	<b>waiving</b>	250:2	85:14 94:20
286:9	<b>updating</b>	<b>vacancy</b>	178:1	202:13	47:13	252:12,12	96:12 97:11
<b>understand...</b>	185:6	185:8	<b>values</b> 67:13	231:13	<b>walk</b> 97:2	253:20,23	100:13,15
14:24 33:17	264:21	<b>vacant</b>	98:11	248:7	276:3	254:5	100:16,18
35:11 39:10	<b>upheld</b> 108:8	176:13	182:17	284:17	<b>walking</b>	278:17	100:23
61:11 111:3	<b>upper</b> 206:21	183:6 201:1	183:13	<b>veteran</b> 107:9	152:24	279:13	101:4,17
114:11	220:1	233:4,8,14	185:19	<b>Veterans</b>	<b>walks</b> 200:21	280:24	116:12,15
134:4	<b>ups</b> 6:18	234:4,12,21	192:13,24	250:16	<b>Wallace</b>	286:18	129:20
146:23	136:16	234:22	198:10	<b>vetted</b> 209:6	175:13	<b>wanted</b> 7:4	163:2 165:2
147:13	<b>usage</b> 8:16	255:20	210:7	<b>victimize</b>	<b>Walnut</b>	8:22 49:4	186:24
149:10	285:24	256:7 257:2	211:11	101:7	195:12	49:10 51:14	<b>Waxman</b>
170:19	<b>use</b> 8:14,18	257:4,11	212:19	<b>victimized</b>	215:2	55:5 60:17	11:6,8,18
231:12	86:12	259:19,24	213:23	101:18	<b>want</b> 6:19,23	63:12 74:8	12:2,6 13:5
236:8 246:5	105:20	260:1	214:2,23	<b>victims</b> 101:9	13:15 15:15	95:8 111:21	13:10,19,23
<b>understood</b>	127:14	276:14	228:11	<b>view</b> 136:17	15:21 19:2	112:5	14:6,16,21
155:14	129:17	<b>vacants</b> 233:7	231:9,13	166:18	19:3 30:23	113:12	16:12,22
<b>undone</b> 98:22	131:21,22	<b>validate</b>	238:3 255:8	<b>Village</b> 268:6	31:21 33:8	140:6,9	17:6,13,18
<b>unforeseen</b>	134:4,5	199:22	255:12,22	<b>violations</b>	48:22 55:24	142:19	18:17 27:4
99:21	148:16	<b>valuable</b>	257:15	132:2	57:1,15	143:5	32:10,19
<b>unfortunat...</b>	189:11	176:19	260:2,7,9	<b>Virginia</b>	65:3 73:12	145:13	34:7 80:9
174:6 205:4	199:20	<b>valuation</b>	263:10	10:17	77:6 78:14	188:3	80:12 81:6
		179:11			79:15 90:20		

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 34

82:5,21	49:20 51:18	<b>we've</b> 16:3	253:19	22:13 53:4	60:19 63:21	<b>Wyalusing</b>	55:14 56:17
83:5 84:5	52:10	22:2 28:12	265:17	84:20 85:1	90:24 97:19	94:22	57:3 67:4
102:16,16	100:16	50:20 55:10	<b>Wells</b> 170:5	96:8 106:2	98:16		72:10 87:10
103:14	215:9	65:12 69:16	171:19	155:24	127:22	<b>X</b>	90:3,23
104:11,18	246:22	69:19 71:8	<b>went</b> 27:12,13	<b>words</b> 92:8	140:16		91:16,19,23
104:23	262:11	71:11 80:4	66:19	203:16	162:5	<b>Y</b>	91:24 92:5
105:3,13,19	274:16	99:19	208:20	204:1	173:23	<b>yards</b> 257:21	92:7,21
106:6,16,20	275:6	193:16	214:1	220:23	174:8 245:5	<b>yeah</b> 6:15	93:2 97:12
106:24	<b>we're</b> 13:5	201:18	<b>weren't</b> 27:13	238:16	<b>workings</b>	12:2 21:8	99:4 110:11
107:7	15:6,12,12	243:2 275:8	130:17	249:5	91:9	23:3,14,22	110:14,16
120:18,18	15:13,21	<b>wealth</b> 8:8	141:7 193:2	285:23	<b>workload</b>	23:22 24:5	110:20,23
121:3,21	17:2 19:23	<b>wealthy</b>	195:23	<b>work</b> 22:22	265:20	31:23 39:14	111:5,6,14
128:11,11	22:22 24:8	88:14	228:16	23:11 28:14	268:12,14	40:17 41:20	111:21
128:16	39:19 40:3	<b>weapon</b>	255:13,24	39:7 41:3	<b>workloads</b>	44:5 51:19	112:20,20
129:3,11,14	40:3 45:18	217:19	<b>Westminster</b>	48:14 53:12	265:22	58:3 60:3	112:23,24
129:18	65:20 69:20	<b>website</b>	94:21	54:20 60:6	<b>works</b> 70:5	68:16 73:14	113:7,10,11
154:10,10	83:7,18	142:20	<b>Wetzel</b> 141:2	61:6,17	170:20,23	74:17 75:3	113:14,18
154:20	93:5 94:24	182:1	<b>whatsoever</b>	62:10,13,21	276:22	75:23 76:16	118:13,21
<b>way</b> 23:11	95:3 100:12	<b>Wednesday</b>	283:15	63:7 81:22	<b>world</b> 145:22	79:4 87:9	119:5
25:7 31:9	100:21	1:6	<b>wherewithal</b>	95:9,12,14	171:12	91:7,7 92:6	122:18
34:10 41:4	104:18	<b>weeds</b> 127:7	205:12	97:1,10	283:24	93:21 96:7	123:1 124:2
42:11 46:2	112:21	<b>week</b> 22:3	<b>whistles</b>	98:14 99:9	<b>worlds</b> 28:4	105:13	124:17,18
48:14 50:15	118:20	94:18 96:2	208:20	100:16	<b>worse</b> 83:19	109:17	130:22
65:4 67:22	121:6	97:20,23,24	<b>White</b> 7:19	142:5	<b>worst</b> 137:12	111:23	132:23,24
72:21 82:21	131:22	106:17,20	7:24	172:17	146:3	112:4,19	138:20,21
84:15 88:9	132:5,20	110:2	<b>wholesalers</b>	173:15	<b>worth</b> 189:1,2	116:23	138:23
96:20 132:8	142:3 144:9	114:20	38:11	181:10	199:13	119:12	143:15
166:12,12	145:15	150:20	<b>wholly</b> 55:19	196:23	204:14,16	121:22	146:19
170:8	152:12	151:2	<b>wide</b> 9:4	202:19	<b>wouldn't</b>	122:4,23	147:12,15
190:24	160:3	183:22	<b>widely</b> 61:24	204:2 210:1	58:12 117:2	125:23	147:15,22
191:9	166:24	196:21,24	<b>wider</b> 73:1	213:22	121:4	129:18	147:23
194:17	167:1	197:1	<b>WILLIAM</b>	215:10,24	144:15	134:14	148:1,2,18
208:16	173:24	249:18	1:11	223:22	171:2,2	136:5	148:18
211:16	190:15	256:9,10	<b>willing</b> 42:19	241:12	238:20	152:20	151:12,13
212:18	191:6 192:2	<b>weekly</b> 236:2	42:21	265:23	258:1	158:13,24	152:11
213:23	194:13	<b>weeks</b> 76:24	<b>willingly</b>	266:5 267:6	266:10	159:6	159:14
215:20	198:18	84:2 100:1	191:20	268:15	269:10	191:10	160:7
216:23	206:13	100:6	<b>wind</b> 101:12	270:19,19	279:8	228:2	161:16,18
219:17	211:23	109:21	205:21	276:4	<b>Wow</b> 114:9	234:18	162:17,20
221:9	216:21	148:9,11	<b>wish</b> 101:19	280:12	<b>writes</b> 197:2	243:10,16	162:21,22
238:13	217:5,6	<b>weigh</b> 57:19	208:10	<b>worked</b> 22:18	<b>writing</b> 257:1	245:10	164:11,22
240:13	230:10	58:5	286:11	140:13	<b>written</b> 34:10	251:2	165:15,18
242:7,21	233:15	<b>weight</b>	<b>withstand</b>	202:12	34:24 95:12	256:14,14	166:1,3
249:4 257:3	237:11,16	142:24	34:24 35:2	221:18	143:24	256:18	168:6
272:11	239:1,2	<b>weighted</b>	<b>Witness</b> 4:1	264:10	<b>wrong</b> 149:12	267:20	175:19
281:22	240:3 241:3	165:5,6	102:9	280:1	191:11	277:5 286:8	176:17
282:5,24	241:7,7	<b>welcome</b>	<b>witnesses</b>	<b>workers</b>	192:1,2	<b>year</b> 2:15,19	177:2,5,8
283:24	245:1	73:23	11:5 26:16	259:10	202:23	2:22 16:23	177:19
284:17	249:22	133:24	160:20	282:21	205:1 207:6	18:10 19:2	178:7,7
285:22	261:14,19	174:11	174:14,24	<b>workforce</b>	232:10	22:3 39:3	179:1,7,7
<b>ways</b> 62:23	262:5 264:9	232:22	<b>wondered</b>	279:17	255:17	41:20,23	179:21
169:4	264:13	235:13	94:23	<b>working</b> 23:8	<b>www.phila....</b>	43:5 44:6,9	181:5
<b>we'll</b> 17:8	275:21,22	250:11	<b>wondering</b>	25:5 42:10	182:1	49:19,22	182:18
						52:9 55:9	

Committee Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 35

183:1 185:2	189:15,16	<b>1.18</b> 161:19	263:7	<b>2</b> 88:23	2:20 3:13	55:24 56:24	130:24
185:18	196:7 197:8	<b>1.2</b> 187:24	<b>134-ish</b> 148:3	195:16,19	3:15 129:6	57:24 58:24	131:24
197:7,10	197:12	210:12,12	<b>135/140,000</b>	210:23	161:16,18	59:24 60:24	132:24
201:15	198:3 208:4	<b>1.3</b> 210:13	168:7	212:1 249:9	162:17	61:24 62:24	133:24
203:2	208:15	<b>1.4</b> 5:7 41:15	<b>14</b> 72:15	<b>2,500</b> 217:2	164:3,15	63:24 64:24	134:24
212:20,21	211:10	111:8 112:5	94:20 97:12	267:23	165:14,18	65:24 66:24	135:24
213:12	212:19	112:6	195:19	268:23	175:19	67:24 68:24	136:24
228:23	213:24	113:12,22	225:3 247:3	<b>2,851</b> 8:10	177:2	69:24 70:24	137:24
229:7,8,16	216:12	113:22	247:17	<b>2.7</b> 52:8	<b>2017-2022</b>	71:24 72:24	138:24
229:21	221:8 225:1	114:3,5,12	<b>14.1</b> 163:5	<b>2:22</b> 174:20	2:11	73:24 74:24	139:24
230:9,13,14	225:2	117:21	<b>143,000</b> 8:6	<b>20</b> 29:10 75:3	<b>2018</b> 185:18	75:24 76:24	140:24
230:23	228:24,24	<b>1.42</b> 178:9	<b>15</b> 42:23	76:9 134:24	<b>2021</b> 2:21	77:24 78:24	141:24
231:1,3	230:17	<b>1.5</b> 7:16 91:4	53:16 225:3	135:1	90:21 91:24	79:24 80:24	142:24
233:2 234:4	241:14	<b>1.8</b> 25:23	225:8,10,10	263:11	<b>2022</b> 3:15	81:24 82:24	143:24
236:9,10,11	245:2	26:1	233:4	<b>200</b> 42:24	90:21	83:24 84:24	144:24
236:11,14	248:19,20	<b>1.9</b> 158:10	247:17	85:6,8,11	<b>2023</b> 89:21	85:24 86:24	145:24
237:3,5,9	248:22	186:20	263:11	85:13	90:17,21	87:24 88:24	146:24
237:10,18	261:3	201:14	<b>15-minute</b>	<b>2000</b> 163:19	92:19 93:16	89:24 90:24	147:24
239:20	262:12,15	211:22	80:8	<b>2007</b> 163:23	<b>2037</b> 90:3	91:24 92:24	148:24
240:9,20	264:11	<b>1:21</b> 174:18	<b>150</b> 164:17	<b>2010</b> 177:12	93:3	93:24 94:24	149:24
241:9,19	267:4,11	<b>10</b> 7:24 8:2	<b>1513</b> 195:12	<b>2011</b> 197:19	<b>2046</b> 164:24	95:24 96:24	150:24
249:9	279:20	146:8	<b>1563-A</b> 3:5	<b>2012</b> 197:20	<b>207</b> 122:20	97:24 98:24	151:24
253:24,24	280:9	195:15,19	<b>16</b> 43:21	<b>2013</b> 140:9	<b>21</b> 49:24	99:24	152:24
260:16,23	281:10	211:8 215:1	151:19	140:21	51:16,24	100:24	153:24
261:17	283:13	247:3	162:20	197:17	52:5,12	101:24	154:24
262:9	286:3	<b>10:00</b> 287:3	166:1,3	<b>2014</b> 178:7	<b>214</b> 122:19	102:24	155:24
263:10,12	yesterday	<b>10:38</b> 1:6	233:3	178:15	<b>215</b> 1:24 2:24	103:24	156:24
263:14,16	22:5	<b>100</b> 263:13	<b>16-ounce</b>	179:7,21	3:24 4:24	104:24	157:24
263:17,21	yields 69:18	<b>100,000</b>	157:3	180:19	5:24 6:24	105:24	158:24
263:23	<b>York</b> 41:9	239:5	<b>160,000</b>	181:16	7:24 8:24	106:24	159:24
267:24	78:3 283:20	<b>101</b> 195:20	131:5	203:2 227:2	9:24 10:24	107:24	160:24
year's 122:10	young 155:11	<b>103</b> 210:8	<b>160170</b> 1:19	261:1	11:24 12:24	108:24	161:24
146:21	youngest 41:4	<b>104</b> 147:5	2:6,9	<b>2015</b> 148:2	13:24 14:24	109:24	162:24
233:17	153:7	<b>108</b> 212:22	<b>160171</b> 1:19	163:24	15:24 16:24	110:24	163:24
years 2:11,20		<b>11.4</b> 163:6	2:6,12	165:11	17:24 18:24	111:24	164:24
22:13 35:23	<b>Z</b>	<b>118,000</b> 7:16	<b>160172</b> 1:19	176:17	19:24 20:24	112:24	165:24
42:2 43:14	<b>ZIP</b> 233:11	<b>12</b> 7:21 287:3	2:6,14	177:13	21:24 22:24	113:24	166:24
51:3 55:18	233:13	<b>12,794,865</b>	<b>160180</b> 1:19	179:1 203:2	23:24 24:24	114:24	167:24
86:7 89:1	zoned 234:16	177:4	2:7,16	275:1	25:24 26:24	115:24	168:24
93:19	234:18	<b>12.85</b> 163:1	<b>17</b> 4:10 44:16	<b>2016</b> 1:6 2:22	27:24 28:24	116:24	169:24
113:18,20	zoning 130:8	<b>120</b> 147:22	49:14 70:23	91:23	29:24 30:24	117:24	170:24
114:2,8		<b>123</b> 213:10	72:14	161:24	31:24 32:24	118:24	171:24
118:10,22	<b>0</b>	<b>127</b> 50:13	148:24	165:13	33:24 34:24	119:24	172:24
119:5,6	<b>0.137</b> 179:1	<b>12th</b> 283:7,10	151:19	176:17	35:24 36:24	120:24	173:24
122:22	<b>0.139</b> 178:15	283:12,18	162:21	177:5,8	37:24 38:24	121:24	174:24
124:21	<b>0.150</b> 178:13	283:19	169:10	178:7	39:24 40:24	122:24	175:24
130:10	<b>0.275</b> 178:15	284:1	<b>175</b> 169:16	182:19	41:24 42:24	123:24	176:24
133:2	<b>0.90</b> 178:5	<b>13</b> 153:7	<b>17th</b> 195:12	186:3	43:24 44:24	124:24	177:24
146:20	<b>0.970</b> 178:6	225:3	<b>19</b> 8:1,1	206:10	45:24 46:24	125:24	178:24
153:8		<b>1336</b> 195:11	<b>19.7</b> 163:2	227:3 231:2	47:24 48:24	126:24	179:24
164:24	<b>1</b>	<b>134</b> 210:7	<b>1992</b> 3:4	245:11	49:24 50:24	127:24	180:24
181:13,20	<b>1</b> 134:12,23	211:5,9,11	<b>1st</b> 227:20	247:3 287:3	51:24 52:24	128:24	181:24
184:18	211:1	211:24		<b>2017</b> 2:13,15	53:24 54:24	129:24	182:24
	<b>1.037</b> 178:5,7		<b>2</b>				

Committe Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 36

183:24	236:24	<b>215)686-9200</b>	239:2,4	<b>49.5</b> 178:16	79:24 80:24	142:24	195:24
184:24	237:24	182:11	<b>31</b> 32:10	<b>490,281</b>	81:24 82:24	143:24	196:24
185:24	238:24	<b>22-34</b> 195:12	79:19,23	177:5	83:24 84:24	144:24	197:24
186:24	239:24	<b>22/'23</b> 92:1	80:12,14	<u>5</u>	85:24 86:24	145:24	198:24
187:24	240:24	<b>23</b> 118:10	83:3 120:17	<b>5</b> 124:17	87:24 88:24	146:24	199:24
188:24	241:24	<b>24</b> 166:10	143:13,17	211:8	89:24 90:24	147:24	200:24
189:24	242:24	<b>25</b> 189:16	143:21	228:13	91:24 92:24	148:24	201:24
190:24	243:24	208:15	145:16	<b>50</b> 167:3	93:24 94:24	149:24	202:24
191:24	244:24	<b>25,000</b>	197:17	189:15	95:24 96:24	150:24	203:24
192:24	245:24	179:20	262:7	263:13	97:24 98:24	151:24	204:24
193:24	246:24	<b>26</b> 195:15,18	<b>31.6</b> 162:23	<b>50,000</b> 179:8	99:24	152:24	205:24
194:24	247:24	199:8,13	<b>32</b> 120:13	<b>500</b> 43:22	100:24	153:24	206:24
195:24	248:24	201:15	<b>34</b> 94:19	165:15	101:24	154:24	207:24
196:24	249:24	<b>27</b> 211:22	97:18 98:21	<b>504-4622</b>	102:24	155:24	208:24
197:24	250:24	<b>27.99</b> 162:19	<b>35</b> 97:18	1:24 2:24	103:24	156:24	209:24
198:24	251:24	<b>270</b> 170:4	263:9	3:24 4:24	104:24	157:24	210:24
199:24	252:24	<b>28</b> 211:22	<b>350</b> 76:15	5:24 6:24	105:24	158:24	211:24
200:24	253:24	<b>29</b> 195:18	89:24 93:2	7:24 8:24	106:24	159:24	212:24
201:24	254:24	<b>2nd</b> 227:12	<b>36</b> 98:22	9:24 10:24	107:24	160:24	213:24
202:24	255:24	227:16,21	212:21	11:24 12:24	108:24	161:24	214:24
203:24	256:24	<u>3</u>	<b>37,400</b> 8:12	13:24 14:24	109:24	162:24	215:24
204:24	257:24	<b>3</b> 3:4 52:7	<b>38</b> 49:21	15:24 16:24	110:24	163:24	216:24
205:24	258:24	75:16 111:4	<u>4</u>	17:24 18:24	111:24	164:24	217:24
206:24	259:24	112:6 113:6	<b>4</b> 113:8	19:24 20:24	112:24	165:24	218:24
207:24	260:24	113:13,24	117:23	21:24 22:24	113:24	166:24	219:24
208:24	261:24	114:3,5	118:20	23:24 24:24	114:24	167:24	220:24
209:24	262:24	117:20	167:21	25:24 26:24	115:24	168:24	221:24
210:24	263:24	169:11	169:11	27:24 28:24	116:24	169:24	222:24
211:24	264:24	193:4	215:3	29:24 30:24	117:24	170:24	223:24
212:24	265:24	212:20	228:13	31:24 32:24	118:24	171:24	224:24
213:24	266:24	263:8	<b>4,000</b> 258:8	33:24 34:24	119:24	172:24	225:24
214:24	267:24	<b>3,000</b> 217:3	<b>4,707</b> 213:11	35:24 36:24	120:24	173:24	226:24
215:24	268:24	249:9	<b>4.167</b> 86:6	37:24 38:24	121:24	174:24	227:24
216:24	269:24	268:23	<b>4.64</b> 162:19	39:24 40:24	122:24	175:24	228:24
217:24	270:24	<b>3.1</b> 210:17	<b>4:13</b> 287:6	41:24 42:24	123:24	176:24	229:24
218:24	271:24	<b>3.2</b> 5:13	<b>40</b> 196:22	43:24 44:24	124:24	177:24	230:24
219:24	272:24	<b>3.3</b> 5:20	200:11	45:24 46:24	125:24	178:24	231:24
220:24	273:24	187:21	215:3 263:9	47:24 48:24	126:24	179:24	232:24
221:24	274:24	<b>3.8</b> 27:4,5,14	<b>40,000</b> 183:5	49:24 50:24	127:24	180:24	233:24
222:24	275:24	117:9	<b>40.7</b> 5:8	51:24 52:24	128:24	181:24	234:24
223:24	276:24	<b>30</b> 67:15	<b>400</b> 1:5	53:24 54:24	129:24	182:24	235:24
224:24	277:24	97:18 148:1	118:20	55:24 56:24	130:24	183:24	236:24
225:24	278:24	164:24	119:4 287:4	57:24 58:24	131:24	184:24	237:24
226:24	279:24	184:9	<b>41</b> 7:19	59:24 60:24	132:24	185:24	238:24
227:24	280:24	200:11	<b>42</b> 49:20	61:24 62:24	133:24	186:24	239:24
228:24	281:24	<b>30,000</b> 181:5	<b>43</b> 7:20	63:24 64:24	134:24	187:24	240:24
229:24	282:24	<b>30,000/35,0...</b>	<b>43.3</b> 72:13	65:24 66:24	135:24	188:24	241:24
230:24	283:24	233:15	<b>47</b> 161:23	67:24 68:24	136:24	189:24	242:24
231:24	284:24	<b>300</b> 68:4 70:7	<b>470,000</b>	69:24 70:24	137:24	190:24	243:24
232:24	285:24	233:1	183:4	71:24 72:24	138:24	191:24	244:24
233:24	286:24	<b>300,000</b>	<b>475,000</b>	73:24 74:24	139:24	192:24	245:24
234:24	287:24	238:22,23	183:20	75:24 76:24	140:24	193:24	246:24
235:24	288:24	238:23	<b>49</b> 5:10 74:11	77:24 78:24	141:24	194:24	247:24



Committe Of The Whole  
April 6, 2016

Page 37

248:24	<b>579,000</b>	<b>8.1</b> 163:24				
249:24	176:6	<b>8.7</b> 163:3				
250:24	177:14	<b>8.75</b> 124:20				
251:24	213:10	<b>8:30</b> 182:12				
252:24	237:12	<b>80</b> 147:21,24				
253:24	<b>59</b> 7:23	<b>80s</b> 148:1				
254:24	<b>5th</b> 227:22	<b>87</b> 126:5				
255:24		<b>88</b> 148:22				
256:24	<u>6</u>					
257:24	<b>6</b> 1:6 100:9	<u>9</u>				
258:24	124:2 163:7	<b>90</b> 74:4				
259:24	<b>6.3</b> 7:20	143:15,20				
260:24	<b>6/30/2015</b>	145:18				
261:24	166:8	195:17,20				
262:24	<b>6:00</b> 182:12	240:5				
263:24	<b>60</b> 87:10	251:12				
264:24	<b>60,000</b> 44:2	280:13				
265:24	<b>60/40</b> 165:20	<b>90s</b> 215:18				
266:24	<b>630.58</b>	<b>915</b> 8:10				
267:24	162:18	<b>92</b> 75:16				
268:24	<b>65</b> 87:11	<b>93</b> 140:21				
269:24	195:17	<b>971</b> 166:1				
270:24	199:9,11,13					
271:24	199:19					
272:24	<b>65,000</b> 8:12					
273:24	<b>67</b> 126:3,5					
274:24	<b>68,000</b> 215:2					
275:24	<b>69</b> 147:7					
276:24	<b>699</b> 49:16					
277:24	<b>6th</b> 100:8					
278:24						
279:24	<u>7</u>					
280:24	<b>7</b> 163:20					
281:24	228:14					
282:24	<b>7.1</b> 163:21					
283:24	<b>7.5</b> 124:15					
284:24	163:24					
285:24	<b>7.6</b> 166:21					
286:24	<b>7.7</b> 166:9					
287:24	<b>7.75</b> 124:20					
288:24	<b>7.8</b> 124:14,15					
<b>52nd</b> 94:21	<b>700</b> 76:13					
<b>536</b> 247:4	90:2					
<b>54,000</b>	<b>719,000</b> 8:7					
161:20	<b>75</b> 97:15					
<b>55</b> 26:19 36:8	98:21					
115:21	<b>750</b> 76:14					
117:5 135:2	<b>772</b> 247:3					
135:3,9	<b>78</b> 98:21,21					
<b>56</b> 44:18	<b>795</b> 165:18					
45:11						
<b>57</b> 41:14	<u>8</u>					
72:15	<b>8</b> 165:10					
	166:6					

# City of Philadelphia

## Recessed Hearing Notice

April 5, 2016

The **Committee of the Whole** of the Council of the City of Philadelphia held a Public Hearing on **Tuesday, April 5, 2016**, and recessed the public hearing until **Wednesday, April 6, 2016 at 10:00 AM**, in **Room 400, City Hall**, to hear further testimony on the following:

- 160170**            An Ordinance to adopt a Capital Program for the six Fiscal Years 2017-2022 inclusive.
- 160171**            An Ordinance to adopt a Fiscal 2017 Capital Budget.
- 160172**            An Ordinance adopting the Operating Budget for Fiscal Year 2017.
- 160180**            Resolution providing for the approval by the Council of the City of Philadelphia of a Revised Five Year Financial Plan for the City of Philadelphia covering Fiscal Years 2017 through 2021, and incorporating proposed changes with respect to Fiscal Year 2016, which is to be submitted by the Mayor to the Pennsylvania Intergovernmental Cooperation Authority (the "Authority") pursuant to the Intergovernmental Cooperation Agreement, authorized by an Ordinance of this Council approved by the Mayor on January 3, 1992 (Bill No. 1563-A), by and between the City and the Authority.

Immediately following the public hearing, a meeting of the Committee of the Whole, open to the public, will be held to consider the action to be taken on the above listed items.

Copies of the foregoing items are available in the Office of the Chief Clerk of the Council, Room 402, City Hall.

Michael Decker  
Chief Clerk



# City of Philadelphia

City Council  
Chief Clerk's Office  
402 City Hall  
Philadelphia, PA 19107

**BILL NO. 160172**

---

**Introduced March 3, 2016**

---

**Councilmember Henon  
for  
Council President Clarke**

---

**Referred to the  
Committee of the Whole**

---

## **AN ORDINANCE**

Adopting the Operating Budget for Fiscal Year 2017.

WHEREAS, The Mayor on March 3, 2016 submitted to Council his operating budget message and his estimate of revenues available for appropriations for Fiscal Year 2017 pursuant to Section 4-101 of the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter; therefore

*THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA HEREBY ORDAINS:*

SECTION 1. The following financial program is hereby adopted for the Fiscal Year 2017 and appropriations are hereby made from the various operating funds to the various offices, departments, boards and commissions as indicated in the following sections:

SECTION 2. Appropriations in the sum of four billion, one hundred sixty-seven million, seven hundred fifty-five thousand (4,167,755,000) dollars are hereby made from the GENERAL FUND, as follows:

### 2.1 TO THE COUNCIL

Personal Services .....	\$ 14,309,858
Purchase of Services .....	1,904,485
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	510,650
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....	100
Payments to Other Funds .....	100
Advances and Other Miscellaneous Payments .....	<u>100</u>

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Total .....\$ 16,725,293

## 2.2 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL

Personal Services .....\$ 1,390,611  
Purchase of Services .....272,975  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....5,225

Total .....\$ 1,668,811

## 2.3 TO THE MAYOR

Personal Services .....\$ 3,410,559  
Purchase of Services .....796,336  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....54,245

Total .....\$ 4,261,140

## 2.4 TO THE MAYOR – SCHOLARSHIPS

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....\$ 200,000

Total .....\$ 200,000

## 2.5 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF LABOR

Personal Services .....\$ 982,792  
Purchase of Services .....5,277  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....8,160

Total .....\$ 996,229

## 2.6 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY

Personal Services .....\$ 20,884,763  
Purchase of Services .....52,318,443  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....10,359,058

Total .....\$ 83,562,264



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

## 2.7 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

Purchase of Services .....\$ 2,865,000

Total .....\$ 2,865,000

## 2.8 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF ARTS AND CULTURE AND THE CREATIVE ECONOMY – MURAL ARTS PROGRAM

Personal Services .....\$ 490,401

Purchase of Services .....1,125,615

Total .....\$ 1,616,016

## 2.9 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF COMMUNITY EMPOWERMENT AND OPPORTUNITY

Personal Services .....\$ 90,000

Purchase of Services .....\$ 605,000

Total .....\$ 695,000

## 2.10 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF COMMUNITY SCHOOLS AND UNIVERSAL PRE-K

Personal Services .....\$ 1,302,500

Purchase of Services .....27,750,000

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....400,000

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....250,000

Total .....\$ 29,702,500

## 2.11 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF THE CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

Personal Services .....\$ 3,092,731

Purchase of Services .....1,521,049

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....15,665

Total .....\$ 4,629,445

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

## 2.12 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT

Personal Services .....	\$ 416,000
Purchase of Services .....	40,000
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	60,000
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....	<u>500,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 1,016,000

## 2.13 TO THE MANAGING DIRECTOR

Personal Services .....	\$ 18,710,832
Purchase of Services .....	18,920,901
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>665,279</u>
Total .....	\$ 38,297,012

## 2.14 TO THE MANAGING DIRECTOR – LEGAL SERVICES

Purchase of Services .....	\$ <u>44,695,131</u>
Total .....	\$ 44,695,131

## 2.15 TO THE MANAGING DIRECTOR – OFFICE OF FLEET MANAGEMENT

Personal Services .....	\$ 16,613,280
Purchase of Services .....	5,104,396
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>26,463,211</u>
Total .....	\$ 48,180,887

## 2.16 TO THE MANAGING DIRECTOR – OFFICE OF FLEET MANAGEMENT – VEHICLE PURCHASE

Purchase of Services .....	\$ 4,500,000
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>8,465,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 12,965,000

## 2.17 TO THE POLICE DEPARTMENT



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Personal Services .....	\$ 629,443,111
Purchase of Services .....	7,462,807
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>13,270,952</u>
Total .....	\$ 650,176,870

## 2.18 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF STREETS

Personal Services .....	\$ 22,414,754
Purchase of Services .....	8,426,338
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	2,201,750
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....	<u>5,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 33,047,842

## 2.19 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF STREETS – SANITATION DIVISION

Personal Services .....	\$ 50,292,850
Purchase of Services .....	40,563,117
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	1,608,212
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....	<u>48,171</u>
Total .....	\$ 92,512,350

## 2.20 TO THE FIRE DEPARTMENT

Personal Services .....	\$ 201,369,162
Purchase of Services .....	5,375,153
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	7,421,014
Payments to Other Funds .....	<u>7,647,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 221,812,329

## 2.21 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH

Personal Services .....	\$ 50,960,468
Purchase of Services .....	66,382,802
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	5,490,768
Payments to Other Funds .....	<u>500,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 123,334,038

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

## 2.22 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH – OFFICE OF BEHAVIORAL HEALTH AND INTELLECTUAL DISABILITY

Personal Services .....\$ 1,010,566  
Purchase of Services .....12,875,510

Total .....\$ 13,886,076

## 2.23 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

Personal Services .....\$ 43,386,251  
Purchase of Services .....9,294,525  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....2,673,805  
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....2,314,500

Total .....\$ 57,669,081

## 2.24 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF ARTS AND CULTURE AND THE CREATIVE ECONOMY – ART MUSEUM SUBSIDY

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....\$ 2,550,000

Total .....\$ 2,550,000

## 2.25 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF ARTS AND CULTURE AND THE CREATIVE ECONOMY – BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF ATWATER KENT MUSEUM

Personal Services .....\$ 244,817  
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....50,000

Total .....\$ 294,817

## 2.26 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC PROPERTY

Personal Services .....\$ 8,318,847  
Purchase of Services .....28,122,008  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....1,338,535  
Payments to Other Funds .....23,916,920

Total .....\$ 61,696,310



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

## 2.27 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC PROPERTY – CITY SUBSIDY FOR SEPTA

Purchase of Services .....\$ 79,720,000

Total .....\$ 79,720,000

## 2.28 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC PROPERTY – UTILITIES

Purchase of Services .....\$ 30,656,047

Total .....\$ 30,656,047

## 2.29 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC PROPERTY – SPACE RENTALS

Purchase of Services .....\$ 20,875,402

Total .....\$ 20,875,402

## 2.30 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES

Personal Services .....\$ 23,454,344

Purchase of Services .....78,896,204

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....868,952

Total .....\$ 103,219,500

## 2.31 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PRISONS

Personal Services .....\$ 147,301,168

Purchase of Services .....105,455,001

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....4,773,744

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....1,301,757

Total .....\$ 258,831,670

## 2.32 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES – OFFICE OF SUPPORTIVE HOUSING

Personal Services .....\$ 8,636,443

Purchase of Services .....37,044,215

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Materials, Supplies and Equipment ..... 344,127  
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes ..... 32,421

Total ..... \$ 46,057,206

## 2.33 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF LICENSES AND INSPECTIONS

Personal Services ..... \$ 21,594,751  
Purchase of Services ..... 10,730,904  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment ..... 1,286,464

Total ..... \$ 33,612,119

## 2.34 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF LICENSES AND INSPECTIONS – BOARD OF LICENSE AND INSPECTION REVIEW

Personal Services ..... \$ 159,201  
Purchase of Services ..... 10,436

Total ..... \$ 169,637

## 2.35 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF LICENSES AND INSPECTIONS – BOARD OF BUILDING STANDARDS

Personal Services ..... \$ 75,419

Total ..... \$ 75,419

## 2.36 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF LICENSES AND INSPECTIONS – ZONING BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT

Personal Services ..... \$ 337,749  
Purchase of Services ..... 34,541

Total ..... \$ 372,290

## 2.37 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF RECORDS

Personal Services ..... \$ 3,083,221  
Purchase of Services ..... 1,538,779  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment ..... 143,758  
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes ..... 1,456



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Total .....\$ 4,767,214

## 2.38 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC PROPERTY – PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

Personal Services.....\$ 429,943

Purchase of Services.....980

Materials, Supplies and Equipment.....809

Total .....\$ 431,732

## 2.39 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE

Personal Services.....\$ 6,911,556

Purchase of Services.....3,029,912

Materials, Supplies and Equipment.....103,109

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes.....2,350,000

Total .....\$ 12,394,577

## 2.40 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – FRINGE BENEFITS

Personal Services-Employee Benefits.....\$ 1,229,284,926

Total .....\$ 1,229,284,926

## 2.41 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – COMMUNITY COLLEGE OF PHILADELPHIA

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes.....\$ 28,909,207

Total .....\$ 28,909,207

## 2.42 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – HERO AWARD

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes.....\$ 25,000

Total .....\$ 25,000

## 2.43 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – REFUNDS

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....\$ 250,000

Total .....\$ 250,000

## 2.44 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – INDEMNITIES

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....\$ 40,675,000

Total .....\$ 40,675,000

## 2.45 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – WITNESS FEES

Purchase of Services .....\$ 171,518

Total .....\$ 171,518

## 2.46 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – CONTRIBUTION TO SCHOOL DISTRICT

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....\$ 104,263,617

Total .....\$ 104,263,617

## 2.47 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE

Personal Services .....\$ 22,142,214

Purchase of Services .....7,038,149

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....1,023,476

Total .....\$ 30,203,839

## 2.48 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE – SINKING FUND COMMISSION

Purchase of Services .....\$ 123,639,615

Debt Service .....153,950,119

Total .....\$ 277,589,734

## 2.49 TO THE PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT

Personal Services .....\$ 2,504,399



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Purchase of Services .....	2,316,267
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>49,054</u>

Total .....	\$ 4,869,720
-------------	--------------

## 2.50 TO THE CITY TREASURER

Personal Services .....	\$ 1,040,058
Purchase of Services .....	118,444
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>22,224</u>

Total .....	\$ 1,180,726
-------------	--------------

## 2.51 TO THE CITY REPRESENTATIVE

Personal Services .....	\$ 474,381
Purchase of Services .....	481,730
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>54,000</u>

Total .....	\$ 1,010,111
-------------	--------------

## 2.52 TO THE DIRECTOR OF COMMERCE

Personal Services .....	\$ 2,374,990
Purchase of Services .....	1,775,481
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	26,654
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....	<u>500,000</u>

Total .....	\$ 4,677,125
-------------	--------------

## 2.53 TO THE DIRECTOR OF COMMERCE – ECONOMIC STIMULUS

Purchase of Services .....	\$ <u>3,294,448</u>
----------------------------	---------------------

Total .....	\$ 3,294,448
-------------	--------------

## 2.54 TO THE DIRECTOR OF COMMERCE – CONVENTION CENTER SUBSIDY

Purchase of Services .....	\$ <u>15,000,000</u>
----------------------------	----------------------

Total .....	\$ 15,000,000
-------------	---------------

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

## 2.55 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF ARTS AND CULTURE AND THE CREATIVE ECONOMY

Personal Services .....	\$ 312,767
Purchase of Services .....	482,400
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	7,000
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....	<u>3,370,688</u>
Total .....	\$ 4,172,855

## 2.56 TO THE LAW DEPARTMENT

Personal Services .....	\$ 7,934,005
Purchase of Services .....	8,410,034
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>248,676</u>
Total .....	\$ 16,592,715

## 2.57 TO THE BOARD OF ETHICS

Personal Services .....	\$ 961,403
Purchase of Services .....	96,000
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>14,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 1,071,403

## 2.58 TO THE OFFICE OF SUSTAINABILITY

Personal Services .....	\$ 537,979
Purchase of Services .....	279,508
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>17,840</u>
Total .....	\$ 835,327

## 2.59 TO THE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

Personal Services .....	\$ 2,369,484
Purchase of Services .....	129,592
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>40,652</u>
Total .....	\$ 2,539,728



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

## 2.60 TO THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE FREE LIBRARY OF PHILADELPHIA

Personal Services .....	\$ 35,454,254
Purchase of Services .....	2,324,077
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>2,302,659</u>
Total .....	\$ 40,080,990

## 2.61 TO THE COMMISSION ON HUMAN RELATIONS

Personal Services .....	\$ 2,142,519
Purchase of Services .....	34,657
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>13,031</u>
Total .....	\$ 2,190,207

## 2.62 TO THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

Personal Services .....	\$ 148,882
Purchase of Services .....	29,500
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	1,094
Advances and Other Miscellaneous Payments .....	<u>10,000,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 10,179,476

## 2.63 TO THE OFFICE OF HUMAN RESOURCES

Personal Services .....	\$ 5,403,578
Purchase of Services .....	802,070
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>69,932</u>
Total .....	\$ 6,275,580

## 2.64 TO THE OFFICE OF PROPERTY ASSESSMENT

Personal Services .....	\$ 10,434,139
Purchase of Services .....	1,578,126
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>782,600</u>
Total .....	\$ 12,794,865

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

## 2.65 TO THE AUDITING DEPARTMENT

Personal Services .....	\$ 7,909,512
Purchase of Services .....	497,450
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>25,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 8,431,962

## 2.66 TO THE BOARD OF REVISION OF TAXES

Personal Services .....	\$ 819,627
Purchase of Services .....	20,200
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>15,727</u>
Total .....	\$ 855,554

## 2.67 TO THE REGISTER OF WILLS

Personal Services .....	\$ 3,563,499
Purchase of Services .....	75,486
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>33,210</u>
Total .....	\$ 3,672,195

## 2.68 TO THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY

Personal Services .....	\$ 33,303,525
Purchase of Services .....	2,467,172
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>525,021</u>
Total .....	\$ 36,295,718

## 2.69 TO THE SHERIFF

Personal Services .....	\$ 19,008,101
Purchase of Services .....	715,267
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>418,907</u>
Total .....	\$ 20,142,275

## 2.70 TO THE CITY COMMISSIONERS



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Personal Services .....	\$ 5,638,818
Purchase of Services .....	3,497,350
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>541,617</u>
Total .....	\$ 9,677,785

## 2.71 TO THE FIRST JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

Personal Services .....	\$ 97,254,698
Purchase of Services .....	10,656,574
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>2,391,868</u>
Total .....	\$ 110,303,140

SECTION 3. Appropriations in the sum of seven hundred sixty-nine million, one hundred eighty-five thousand (769,185,000) dollars are hereby made from the WATER FUND, as follows:

## 3.1 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY

Personal Services .....	\$ 6,316,852
Purchase of Services .....	14,050,511
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>2,045,628</u>
Total .....	\$ 22,412,991

## 3.2 TO THE MANAGING DIRECTOR

Personal Services .....	\$ <u>138,550</u>
Total .....	\$ 138,550

## 3.3 TO THE MANAGING DIRECTOR – OFFICE OF FLEET MANAGEMENT

Personal Services .....	\$ 2,969,317
Purchase of Services .....	1,489,000
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>4,274,640</u>
Total .....	\$ 8,732,957

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

## 3.4 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC PROPERTY

Purchase of Services .....\$ 4,042,633

Total .....\$ 4,042,633

## 3.5 TO THE WATER DEPARTMENT

Personal Services .....\$ 107,808,919

Purchase of Services .....160,565,792

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....48,537,569

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....501,000

Payments to Other Funds .....66,700,000

Total .....\$ 384,113,280

## 3.6 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – FRINGE BENEFITS

Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....\$ 113,965,262

Total .....\$ 113,965,262

## 3.7 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – INDEMNITIES

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....\$ 6,500,000

Total .....\$ 6,500,000

## 3.8 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE

Personal Services .....\$ 11,979,473

Purchase of Services .....5,072,174

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....1,434,199

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....5,000

Total .....\$ 18,490,846

## 3.9 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE – SINKING FUND COMMISSION

Debt Service .....\$ 207,371,679



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Total .....\$ 207,371,679

## 3.10 TO THE PROCUREMENT DEPARTMENT

Personal Services .....\$ 82,098

Total .....\$ 82,098

## 3.11 TO THE LAW DEPARTMENT

Personal Services .....\$ 2,506,206

Purchase of Services .....691,614

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....43,010

Total .....\$ 3,240,830

## 3.12 TO THE OFFICE OF SUSTAINABILITY

Personal Services .....\$ 63,874

Purchase of Services .....30,000

Total .....\$ 93,874

SECTION 4. Appropriations in the sum of thirty-four million, seven hundred twenty-four thousand (34,724,000) dollars are hereby made from the WATER RESIDUAL FUND, as follows:

## 4.1 TO THE WATER DEPARTMENT

Payments to Other Funds .....\$ 34,724,000

Total .....\$ 34,724,000

SECTION 5. Appropriations in the sum of four million, five hundred thousand (4,500,000) dollars are hereby made from the COUNTY LIQUID FUELS TAX FUND, as follows:

## 5.1 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF STREETS

Personal Services .....\$ 3,734,000

Purchase of Services .....747,330

Payments to Other Funds .....18,670

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Total .....\$ 4,500,000

SECTION 6. Appropriations in the sum of thirty-four million, seven hundred seventy thousand (34,770,000) dollars are hereby made from the SPECIAL GASOLINE TAX FUND, as follows:

## 6.1 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF STREETS

Personal Services .....\$ 4,057,500  
Purchase of Services .....16,590,335  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....13,102,165  
Payments to Other Funds .....20,000

Total .....\$ 33,770,000

## 6.2 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – FRINGE BENEFITS

Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....\$ 1,000,000

Total .....\$ 1,000,000

SECTION 7. Appropriations in the sum of one billion, three hundred two million, (1,302,000,000) dollars are hereby made from the HEALTHCHOICES BEHAVIORAL HEALTH REVENUE FUND, as follows:

## 7.1 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH – OFFICE OF BEHAVIORAL HEALTH AND INTELLECTUAL DISABILITY

Purchase of Services .....\$ 1,300,350,000  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....50,000  
Payments to Other Funds .....1,600,000

Total .....\$ 1,302,000,000

SECTION 8. Appropriations in the sum of sixty-three million, nine hundred fifty-four thousand (63,954,000) dollars are hereby made from the HOTEL ROOM RENTAL TAX FUND, as follows:

## 8.1 TO THE DIRECTOR OF COMMERCE

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....\$ 63,954,000



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Total .....\$ 63,954,000

SECTION 9. Appropriations in the sum of one billion, five hundred forty-one million, four hundred twenty-seven thousand (1,541,427,000) dollars are hereby made from the GRANTS REVENUE FUND, as follows:

## 9.1 TO THE MAYOR

Personal Services .....\$ 948,946  
Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....72,595  
Purchase of Services .....8,929  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....5,120

Total .....\$ 1,035,590

## 9.2 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY

Personal Services .....\$ 605,300  
Purchase of Services .....834,939  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....10,450  
Payments to Other Funds .....43,005,648

Total .....\$ 44,456,337

## 9.3 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

Purchase of Services .....\$ 116,180,000

Total .....\$ 116,180,000

## 9.4 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF COMMUNITY EMPOWERMENT AND OPPORTUNITY

Personal Services .....\$ 2,600,554  
Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....502,358  
Purchase of Services .....12,979,913  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....58,465

Total .....\$ 16,141,290

## 9.5 TO THE OFFICE OF SUSTAINABILITY

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Personal Services ..... 40,000

Total ..... \$ 40,000

## 9.6 TO THE MANAGING DIRECTOR

Personal Services ..... \$ 2,518,877

Purchase of Services ..... 5,862,479

Materials, Supplies and Equipment ..... 242,926

Total ..... \$ 8,624,282

## 9.7 TO THE POLICE DEPARTMENT

Personal Services ..... \$ 5,462,896

Personal Services-Employee Benefits ..... 730,910

Purchase of Services ..... 3,832,048

Materials, Supplies and Equipment ..... 10,889,084

Total ..... \$ 20,914,938

## 9.8 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF STREETS

Personal Services ..... \$ 1,035,000

Purchase of Services ..... 19,111,000

Materials, Supplies and Equipment ..... 4,604,000

Total ..... \$ 24,750,000

## 9.9 TO THE FIRE DEPARTMENT

Personal Services ..... \$ 12,006,223

Personal Services-Employee Benefits ..... 3,578,224

Purchase of Services ..... 6,300,019

Materials, Supplies and Equipment ..... 934,732

Total ..... \$ 22,819,198

## 9.10 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH

Personal Services ..... \$ 11,209,498



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....	4,262,956
Purchase of Services .....	65,216,029
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	2,229,209
Payments to Other Funds .....	<u>771,376</u>

Total .....	\$ 83,689,068
-------------	---------------

## 9.11 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH – OFFICE OF BEHAVIORAL HEALTH AND INTELLECTUAL DISABILITY

Personal Services .....	\$ 15,819,174
Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....	8,116,205
Purchase of Services .....	237,182,673
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	290,000
Payments to Other Funds .....	<u>79,010</u>

Total .....	\$ 261,487,062
-------------	----------------

## 9.12 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

Personal Services .....	\$ 3,143,901
Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....	520,298
Purchase of Services .....	1,627,045
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	6,846,240
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....	<u>100,000</u>

Total .....	\$ 12,237,484
-------------	---------------

## 9.13 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES

Personal Services .....	\$ 83,576,415
Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....	36,402,511
Purchase of Services .....	446,146,244
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>1,833,876</u>

Total .....	\$ 567,959,046
-------------	----------------

## 9.14 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PRISONS

Purchase of Services .....	\$ <u>30,000</u>
----------------------------	------------------

Total .....	\$ 30,000
-------------	-----------

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

## 9.15 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES – OFFICE OF SUPPORTIVE HOUSING

Personal Services .....	\$ 610,701
Purchase of Services .....	45,842,016
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	<u>1,000,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 47,452,717

## 9.16 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF LICENSES AND INSPECTIONS

Purchase of Services .....	\$ <u>4,500,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 4,500,000

## 9.17 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – PROVISION FOR OTHER GRANTS

Advances and Other Miscellaneous Payment .....	\$ <u>203,800,585</u>
Total .....	\$ 203,800,585

## 9.18 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE

Purchase of Services .....	\$ <u>21,425,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 21,425,000

## 9.19 TO THE DIRECTOR OF COMMERCE

Personal Services .....	\$ 49,814
Purchase of Services .....	<u>10,292,701</u>
Total .....	\$ 10,342,515

## 9.20 TO THE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

Personal Services .....	\$ 98,220
Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....	24,984
Purchase of Services .....	355,144
Payments to Other Funds .....	<u>400</u>



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Total .....\$ 478,748

## 9.21 TO THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE FREE LIBRARY OF PHILADELPHIA

Personal Services .....\$ 955,527

Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....197,434

Purchase of Services .....3,739,590

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....3,378,378

Total .....\$ 8,270,929

## 9.22 TO THE AUDITING DEPARTMENT

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....\$ 249,999

Total .....\$ 249,999

## 9.23 TO THE DISTRICT ATTORNEY

Personal Services .....\$ 14,404,628

Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....545,000

Purchase of Services .....1,020,850

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....61,550

Total .....\$ 16,032,028

## 9.24 TO THE CITY COMMISSIONERS

Personal Services .....\$ 100,000

Purchase of Services .....600,000

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....200,000

Total .....\$ 900,000

## 9.25 TO THE FIRST JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

Personal Services .....\$ 27,347,710

Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....14,321,479

Purchase of Services .....5,404,400

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....536,595

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Total .....\$ 47,610,184

SECTION 10. Appropriations in the sum of four hundred sixty-eight million, eight hundred seventy-two thousand (468,872,000) dollars are hereby made from the AVIATION FUND, as follows:

## 10.1 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY

Personal Services.....\$ 257,908  
Purchase of Services.....9,024,238  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment.....720,000

Total .....\$ 10,002,146

## 10.2 TO THE OFFICE SUSTAINABILITY

Personal Services.....\$ 63,873  
Purchase of Services.....30,000

Total .....\$ 93,873

## 10.3 TO THE MANAGING DIRECTOR – OFFICE OF FLEET MANAGEMENT

Personal Services.....\$ 1,364,188  
Purchase of Services.....588,000  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment.....1,493,000

Total .....\$ 3,445,188

## 10.4 TO THE MANAGING DIRECTOR – OFFICE OF FLEET MANAGEMENT-VEHICLE PURCHASE

Materials, Supplies and Equipment.....\$ 4,800,000

Total .....\$ 4,800,000

## 10.5 TO THE POLICE DEPARTMENT

Personal Services.....\$ 15,666,636  
Purchase of Services.....77,500



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Materials, Supplies and Equipment ..... 93,000

Total ..... \$ 15,837,136

## 10.6 TO THE FIRE DEPARTMENT

Personal Services ..... \$ 6,563,366

Purchase of Services ..... 15,000

Materials, Supplies and Equipment ..... 125,000

Payments to Other Funds ..... 23,000

Total ..... \$ 6,726,366

## 10.7 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC PROPERTY – UTILITIES

Purchase of Services ..... \$ 26,900,000

Total ..... \$ 26,900,000

## 10.8 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE

Purchase of Services ..... \$ 4,146,000

Total ..... \$ 4,146,000

## 10.9 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – FRINGE BENEFITS

Personal Services-Employee Benefits ..... \$ 59,194,271

Total ..... \$ 59,194,271

## 10.10 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – INDEMNITIES

Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes ..... \$ 2,512,000

Total ..... \$ 2,512,000

## 10.11 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE – SINKING FUND COMMISSION

Debt Service ..... \$ 139,626,331

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Total .....\$ 139,626,331

## 10.12 TO THE DIRECTOR OF COMMERCE

Personal Services .....\$ 47,716,649  
Purchase of Services .....103,125,441  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....13,896,000  
Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes .....4,205,000  
Payments to Other Funds .....24,625,000

Total .....\$ 193,568,090

## 10.13 TO THE LAW DEPARTMENT

Personal Services .....\$ 1,563,803  
Purchase of Services .....432,439  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....24,357

Total .....\$ 2,020,599

SECTION 11. Appropriations in the sum of ninety-two million, eight hundred four thousand (92,804,000) dollars are hereby made from the COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT FUND, as follows:

## 11.1 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

Personal Services .....\$ 4,395,140  
Purchase of Services .....56,430,419  
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....271,000  
Payments to Other Funds .....25,000

Total .....\$ 61,121,559

## 11.2 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF LICENSES AND INSPECTIONS

Personal Services .....\$ 514,818

Total .....\$ 514,818

## 11.3 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE-FRINGE BENEFITS



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....\$ 4,082,031

Total .....\$ 4,082,031

11.4 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – COMMUNITY  
DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT – TO BE ALLOCATED

Advances and Other Miscellaneous Payment .....\$ 20,000,000

Total .....\$ 20,000,000

11.5 TO THE DIRECTOR OF COMMERCE

Personal Services .....\$ 935,454

Purchase of Services .....5,707,501

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....8,000

Total .....\$ 6,650,955

11.6 TO THE LAW DEPARTMENT

Personal Services .....\$ 154,637

Total .....\$ 154,637

11.7 TO THE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

Personal Services .....\$ 280,000

Total .....\$ 280,000

SECTION 12. Appropriations in the sum of six million (6,000,000) dollars are hereby made from the CAR RENTAL TAX FUND, as follows:

12.1 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE – SINKING FUND  
COMMISSION

Purchase of Services .....\$ 6,000,000

Total .....\$ 6,000,000

# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

SECTION 13. There is hereby authorized nine million, nine hundred eight thousand (9,908,000) dollars to be paid from the MUNICIPAL PENSION FUND, the recurring costs of administering the functional activities of the Board of Pensions and Retirement. The Director of Finance is authorized to transfer these costs to the appropriate funds based on the appropriate allocation plan, as he/she shall determine:

## 13.1 TO THE BOARD OF PENSIONS AND RETIREMENT

Personal Services .....	\$ 3,750,000
Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....	3,420,000
Purchase of Services .....	2,475,000
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	138,000
Payments to Other Funds .....	<u>125,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 9,908,000

SECTION 14. Appropriations in the sum of twenty-three million, five hundred thousand (23,500,000) dollars are hereby made from the HOUSING TRUST FUND, as follows:

## 14.1 TO THE MAYOR – OFFICE OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

Personal Services .....	\$ 1,250,000
Purchase of Services .....	<u>22,250,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 23,500,000

SECTION 15. Appropriations in the sum of one hundred sixty million, one hundred thirty-six thousand (160,136,000) dollars are hereby made from the ACUTE CARE HOSPITAL FUND, as follows:

## 15.1 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH

Personal Services .....	\$ 3,992,653
Purchase of Services .....	5,174,083
Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....	81,000
Payments to Other Funds .....	<u>1,500,000</u>
Total .....	\$ 10,747,736

## 15.2 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH – STATE PAYMENT



# City of Philadelphia

BILL NO. 160172 continued

Purchase of Services .....\$ 149,000,000

Total .....\$ 149,000,000

## 15.3 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE

Personal Services .....\$ 75,000

Total .....\$ 75,000

## 15.4 TO THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – FRINGE BENEFITS

Personal Services-Employee Benefits .....\$ 268,264

Total .....\$ 268,264

## 15.5 TO THE DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE

Personal Services .....\$ 30,000

Materials, Supplies and Equipment .....15,000

Total .....\$ 45,000

## SECTION 16. General Provisions.

(1) The sums herein appropriated under Items 2.44, 3.7, and 10.10 “To the Director of Finance-Indemnities” shall be used for the purpose of settling claims against the City. Payments therefore shall be made by the Director of Finance only upon the authorization of the City Solicitor or his/her designated representative for this purpose.

(2) If any function is transferred from one office, department, board or commission to another office, department, board or commission, the Director of Finance may not, without Council approval by ordinance, transfer to the successor office, department, board or commission those portions of the appropriations which appertain to the function transferred.

(3) Whenever, pursuant to the provisions of Section 8-401 of the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter, employees of any office, department, board or commission are used by another office, department, board or commission, the compensation of such employees for the period of such use may, at the discretion of the Director of Finance, be charged against the applicable appropriations to the using office, department, board or



# City of Philadelphia

*BILL NO. 160172 continued*

commission. The Director of Finance shall notify the President of Council, the Chief Clerk of Council and the Chair of the Appropriations Committee at least two (2) days prior to making any such charge against appropriations.

(4) In respect to any grant received by the City under Sections 5, 6, 7 or 9 of this Ordinance, the Director of Finance may, upon written authorization by the grantor transfer non-City funds between and among classes. The authorizations for such transfers shall be transmitted by the Director of Finance to the Clerk of Council within two (2) working days of any such transfer, along with a statement explaining the reason for such transfer. Transfers between and among departments respecting grants of two hundred fifty thousand (250,000) dollars or greater shall not be made except with the prior approval of the Council by resolution or ordinance. Approval shall not be granted to any such transfer request submitted to Council unless it is accompanied by a copy of the grant proposal (and, if received, the grant award) which has caused the transfer request to be made. Transfers between and among departments respecting grants of less than two hundred fifty thousand (250,000) dollars shall be made upon written authorization of the Director of Finance; provided however, that such authorization, along with a full description of the grant affected is transmitted to the President of Council at least two (2) days before the effective date of such authorization.

In respect to funds from the Department of Housing and Urban Development's Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) appropriated under Section 11 of this Ordinance, the limitations set forth in the provisions of Chapter 21-1100 of The Philadelphia Code shall govern any transfer of CDBG funds between and among classes, departments and elements (grants).

(5) In respect to the appropriation made in Item 11.4 of this Ordinance "To the Director of Finance-Community Development Block Grant-To be Allocated", the sums shall not be construed as being available for commitment prior to the adoption of any ordinance appropriating moneys to be made available by the Department of Housing and Urban Development for the Fiscal Year 2016.

(6) The Director of Finance may make adjustments for obligations incurred in Fiscal Year 2016 and prior years. These may be made out of the appropriations therefore to the respective offices, departments, boards, commissions and agencies for Fiscal Year 2017. Within one week of taking any action authorized by this subsection (6), the Director of Finance shall provide written notice to the President and all members of the Council, with a copy to the Chief Clerk of Council, detailing such action.

(7) Except as otherwise provided by this Ordinance, special funds heretofore established pursuant to ordinance or statute, shall continue to be utilized in Fiscal Year



# City of Philadelphia

*BILL NO. 160172 continued*

2017 for the purposes and in the manner prescribed by such ordinance or statutes to the extent that they are consistent with the provisions of the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter.

When under the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter an appropriation is a prerequisite to payments of money from such special funds, this paragraph should be construed as an appropriation of the full receipts of such funds for the purpose heretofore authorized by such ordinance or statutes, except that this paragraph shall not be construed as an appropriation of any funds contained in the Housing Trust Fund created under Chapter 21-1600 of The Philadelphia Code, and expenditures from the Housing Trust Fund shall be made only pursuant to appropriations made in Section 14 of this Ordinance. The provisions in the prior sentence relating to the Housing Trust Fund are not severable from the remainder of that sentence or from any of the other provisions of this subsection (7), but are essentially and inseparably connected with those provisions, it being Council's intent that no portion of this subsection (7) would have been enacted if it did not also contain the provisions relating to the Housing Trust Fund.

The Director of Finance is authorized and directed to impound the balance of any special fund with respect to which he/she finds that the purposes for which the fund is being expended were intended by ordinance or law to be funded by an appropriation made in other Sections of this Ordinance.

(8) The City Treasurer is authorized and directed to make temporary advances in such amounts as the Director of Finance shall specify between any of the operating funds receiving appropriations in this Ordinance or between any operating fund and the Capital Projects Fund, and the Industrial and Commercial Development Fund, in anticipation of the collection of revenues or other receipts which are estimated to be receivable during the Fiscal Year 2017. Such advances shall bear interest at such rates as the City Treasurer, upon approval of the Director of Finance, shall determine.

(9) The amounts herein appropriated for Purchase of Services; Materials, Supplies and Equipment; Contributions, Indemnities and Taxes; and Debt Service shall be deemed to be available for encumbrance upon the effective date of this Ordinance, to the extent necessary to facilitate the operations of the various offices, departments, boards and commissions for Fiscal Year 2017; provided, that no service shall be rendered prior to July 1, 2016 and no materials, supplies or equipment acquired shall be used in Fiscal Year 2016 except to the extent required to prepare for Fiscal Year 2017.

Such portions of the appropriations herein made for debt service to the Sinking Fund Commission may be paid over to the City's fiscal agent prior to July 1, 2016 as in the judgment of the Director of Finance is necessary to meet interest and principal on the debt of the City due on July 1, 2016.



# City of Philadelphia

*BILL NO. 160172 continued*

(10) The Director of Finance is authorized to charge or credit fund balances available for appropriations as of June 30, 2016 to record properly actual charges for Interfund Services for the Fiscal Year 2016.

(11) The Director of Finance is authorized to charge to fund balance payment of any obligation properly incurred in Fiscal Year 2016 or in any prior year, provided that at the time such obligation was incurred an appropriation was available against which it could have been charged, but that such appropriation shall have ceased to exist due to merger into surplus. It is further provided that the payment of any such obligation be in the same manner and subject to the same controls as would have been followed had the obligation been paid in a timely manner. Within one week of taking any action authorized by this subsection (11), the Director of Finance shall provide written notice to the President and all members of Council, with a copy to the Chief Clerk of Council, detailing such action.

(12) Provided that the appropriation contained in Sections 7, 9 and 11 of this Ordinance shall be made available for encumbrances and/or expenditure only when the Director of Finance has certified that he/she has been responsibly advised that funds necessary to finance such appropriation or portion thereof have been received or are to be forthcoming from another government or from a nongovernmental source.

In such event the Director of Finance is authorized to accept the award for the City and to provide for the appropriation as may be required to execute the program covered by the award.

(13) The Director of Finance is authorized and directed to restore any deficiency in any Sinking Fund Reserve established pursuant to a revenue bond general ordinance, when such deficiency results from a decline in the market value of its investments, by charging the amount of the deficiency against available loan balances, or in the absence of available loan balances, against the appropriate operating fund balance. Within one week of taking any action authorized by this subsection (13), the Director of Finance shall provide written notice to the President and all members of Council, with a copy to the Chief Clerk of Council, detailing such action.

(14) None of the appropriations herein provided in Section 11 shall be encumbered against or expended out of the forty second (42nd) entitlement grant prior to the formal award thereof: Provided, that pending the receipt of all or a portion of the aforesaid grant award the Director of Finance is authorized to finance the appropriations herein provided from balances of prior entitlement grants awards. The authorization for such financing shall be transmitted by the Director of Finance to the Clerk of Council within two (2) working days of any such authorizations.



# City of Philadelphia

*BILL NO. 160172 continued*

(15) In respect to the authorization amounts as set forth in Section 13 for purposes of operating the Board of Pensions and Retirement, the Director of Finance may increase each class amount by an amount not to exceed fifteen percent (15%) of the total budget for the fund for Fiscal Year 2017. The authorization for such increases shall be transmitted by the Director of Finance to the Clerk of Council within two (2) working days of any such increases.

(16) The appropriation contained in Section 9.3 of this Ordinance shall only be made available for obligation upon certification by the Director of Finance that Community Development Block Grant unexpended funds are available for Interim and Construction Assistance and that the amounts to be made available are guaranteed by an irrevocable Letter of Credit or similar security. At such time the Director of Finance may authorize amounts to be provided from his/her appropriation, which amounts shall be financed by Community Development Block Grant revenues. Amounts which are repaid shall be credited as program income to finance Community Development Fund activities.

The Director of Finance and the Director of Housing, in accordance with the regulations of the Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), are authorized and directed to draw funds in a single lump sum from HUD's Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) to the City of Philadelphia for the appropriation contained in Section 11.1 of this Ordinance to establish a rehabilitation fund in one or more private institutions for the purpose of financing the rehabilitation of privately owned properties as part of the City's CDBG program. Funds drawn down from HUD, pursuant to this authorization, may be deposited in any private financial institution as defined by the applicable HUD regulations notwithstanding the limitations on the placement of City deposits set forth in Chapter 19-200 of The Philadelphia Code.

(17) The Director of Finance, with the concurrence of the U. S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), shall as of June 30 of the fiscal period preceding the start of this Operating Budget Ordinance, transfer all unobligated encumbrances and other available balances from the oldest Community Development Program Year not previously closed out to the next oldest Program Year as of July 1. Further, any questioned cost items from the closed out Program Year which are determined by HUD to be ineligible costs shall be transferred to the oldest open Program Year after such costs are removed. Program regulations governing such transferred funds shall be determined by HUD. The Director of Finance shall notify the Clerk of Council periodically concerning Program Year close outs and transfers.

(18) The Director of Finance is hereby authorized, at his/her discretion, to transfer the amount of the authorization and/or the obligations in respect to indemnities, advertising, insurance, telephone, postage, rental, leases, vehicle purchases, utilities, employer's share of fringe benefits and data processing services from the appropriations

# City of Philadelphia

*BILL NO. 160172 continued*

herein made to the appropriate offices, departments, boards, commissions or other agencies of the City.



**OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE  
FISCAL YEAR 2017 BUDGET TESTIMONY  
April 6, 2016**

---

Introduction

Good morning, President Clarke and Members of City Council. I am Rob Dubow, Director of Finance. I am pleased to provide testimony on the Office of the Director of Finance's Fiscal Year 2017 operating budget. Joining me at the table today is Catherine Paster, First Deputy Director of Finance. Also, representatives from all of the divisions of Finance are available here to answer questions that you may have.

Department Mission

The Office of the Director of Finance is charged with overseeing the City's financial, accounting and budgetary functions, including establishing fiscal policy guidelines; overseeing the City's budget and financial management programs; and recording and accounting all City financial activities. The proposed budget for the Office of the Director of Finance supports a number of departmental divisions, including: Executive Direction, which is comprised of the Administrative Services Center, the Mayor's Office of Grants, and the Administrative Systems Modernization project (OnePhilly); the Office of Budget and Program Evaluation; the Accounting Bureau; Risk Management; and the Office of Property Data.

Plans for Fiscal Year 2017

Finance plans the following for fiscal year 2017:

- Work with agencies throughout the government to carefully monitor expenses and revenues to ensure positive cash flow, maintain the City's fiscal stability and increase its financial strength despite the uneven economic recovery, the City's relatively high level of fixed costs, and the City's large unfunded pension liability. The relatively narrow fund balances in the Five Year Plan will limit the City's financial flexibility and require an added emphasis on cash management.
- The Budget Office will continue implementation efforts around the new budgeting system and plans to begin a program-based budgeting process in FY17, with plans for broader implementation for FY18.
- The Grants Office will focus efforts on securing new resources to advance the Administration's priorities, including education, health and safety of Philadelphia's children and families; comprehensive neighborhood strategies for public safety, community engagement and health in underserved communities; workforce development and career pathways for Philadelphia's young adults; and diversity and inclusion in new funding opportunities.
- The One Philly team will continue the effort to replace the current Human Resources, Payroll, Time & Attendance, Benefits, and Pensions systems with one integrated system, allowing for more efficient operation and improving services for employees.
- The Office of Property Data will continue its work with the Office of Property Assessment to implement a Computer Assisted Mass Appraisal System and to implement recommendations from a recently-completed report related to improved address management across various City departments.
- Risk Management, through its Property Damage Subrogation Program and the Employee Disability Program, will continue efforts to recover costs from insured losses, reimbursed property damage or unfounded work related injury claims.

**OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE  
BUDGET SUMMARY AND OTHER BUDGET DRIVERS**

**Staff Demographics Summary (as of January 2016)**

	Total	Minority	White	Female
Full-Time Staff	141	90	51	93
Executive Staff	30	11	19	20
Average Salary - Full-Time Staff	\$61,966	\$51,981	\$79,010	\$58,431
Average Salary - Executive Staff	\$103,553	\$91,047	\$110,793	\$100,956
Median Salary - Full-Time Staff	\$49,196	\$43,680	\$75,104	\$45,088
Median Salary - Executive Staff	\$101,563	\$89,010	\$103,988	\$98,090

**Employment Levels (as of January 2016)**

	Budgeted	Approved	Filled
Full-Time Positions	151	151	141
Part-Time Positions	1	1	1
Executive Positions	30	30	30
Overall Average Salary	\$57,129	\$57,129	\$61,966
Overall Median Salary	\$48,887	\$48,887	\$49,196

**Financial Summary by Class - General Fund**

	Fiscal 2015 Actual Obligations	Fiscal 2016 Original Appropriations	Fiscal 2016 Estimated Obligations	Fiscal 2017 Proposed Appropriations	Difference FY17-FY16
Class 100 - Employee Compensation	\$1,110,058,399	\$1,180,984,315	\$1,189,032,993	\$1,236,196,482	\$47,163,489
Class 200 - Purchase of Services	\$4,988,026	\$4,542,479	\$4,542,479	\$3,201,430	(\$1,341,049)
Class 300 - Materials and Supplies	\$86,988	\$95,158	\$95,158	\$87,493	(\$7,665)
Class 400 - Equipment	\$12,118	\$15,616	\$15,616	\$15,616	\$0
Class 500 - Contributions	\$102,873,876	\$152,143,880	\$181,543,880	\$176,472,824	(\$5,071,056)
Class 700 - Debt Service	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$
Class 800 - Payment to Other Funds	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$
Class 900 - Advances/Misc. Payments	\$	\$	\$	\$	\$
<b>TOTAL</b>	\$1,218,019,407	\$1,337,781,448	\$1,375,230,126	\$1,415,973,845	\$40,743,719

**Contracts Summary (as of December 2015)**

	FY11	FY12	FY13	FY14	FY15	FY16*
Total amount of contracts	\$12,921,223	\$13,931,823	\$27,067,370	\$16,732,149	\$14,387,548	\$15,186,210
Total amount to M/W/DBE	\$5,229,801	\$5,037,804	\$7,683,758	\$4,156,525	\$4,309,020	\$4,764,753
Participation Rate	40%	36%	28%	25%	30%	31%

\* as of December 2015

## OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE PROPOSED BUDGET OVERVIEW

---

### Proposed Funding Request

The FY2017 budget, as proposed, provides the necessary funding for the Office of the Director of Finance to accomplish its objectives.

The FY2017 general fund budget, as proposed for the Office of the Director of Finance, totals \$1,415,973,845 an increase of \$40.7 million over FY2016 estimated obligation levels. That increase is caused by a \$49.1 million increase in fringe benefit costs, including a \$20.3 million increase in pension costs and an increase of \$28.8 million in other fringe benefit costs; a decrease of \$1.9 million in other Class 100 costs; a decrease of \$1.34 million in Class 200 costs; and a decrease of \$5 million in Class 500 costs. Direct general fund appropriations proposed for the Finance Department's core budget are \$10,044,580, a decrease of \$3,239,075 over FY16 estimated obligation levels in Class 100 and Class 200 as mentioned above. The Finance Department's proposed budget includes:

- \$1,236,196,482 in Class 100 funds, an increase of \$47.2 million over estimated FY16 obligation levels. This funding will compensate 116 full-time Finance Department employees and fund fringe benefits for all City of Philadelphia General Fund employees. The \$47.2 million increase is a result of a \$20.3 million increase in Pension costs, a \$28.8 million increase in other fringe benefit costs, and a \$1.9 decrease from \$8.8 million to \$6.9 million in Finance's core Class 100 budget due to the transfer of the Bureau of Administrative Adjudication, the Office of Administrative Review and the Contracting Unit to the Office of the Chief Administrative Officer.
- \$3.2 million in Class 200 funds, a decrease of \$1.3 million from the FY2016 estimated obligation level. This \$1.3 million decrease is mainly related to the transfer of Office of Administrative Review's collections contract to the Office of the Chief Administrative Officer.
- \$103,109 in Class 300/400 funding for materials, supplies and equipment, a decrease of \$7,665 that has been transferred to the Office of the Chief Administrative Officer for Office of Administrative Review expenses.
- \$176.5 million in Class 500 funds for contributions, a decrease of \$5.1 million. This includes the City's \$104.3 million contribution to the School District, an increase of \$78,944 over the FY2016 level; \$28.9 million for Community College of Philadelphia, a decrease of \$1.4 million over a one-time increase in FY 2016; \$2.4 million to fund City contributions, a decrease of \$4.3 million from the FY16 level; and \$40.7 million to fund indemnities, an increase of 575,000 over the FY2016 obligation level.

### Staffing Levels

The Office of the Director of Finance is sufficiently staffed to carry out its mission. Charts in my testimony include demographic information, broken down by gender and race, for all departmental staff, as well as for senior staff only; gender and race of new departmental hires in fiscal year 2016; and information on the number of bilingual employees in the department.

**OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE  
PERFORMANCE, CHALLENGES AND INITIATIVES**

**DEPARTMENT PERFORMANCE (OPERATIONS)**

Performance Measures		FY15 Actual	FY16 YTD (as of 12/31/15)	FY17 Target
Departments with formal safety and health goals		80%	83%	80%
Number of employee injuries		3,028	1,452	2,865



# OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE - CONTRACTING EXPERIENCE

The Office of the Director of Finance is committed to supporting the Administration's fiscal year 2017 goal of 35 percent minority, woman, and disabled-owned business (M/W/DSBE) participation in City contracting. For fiscal year 2016 to date, the Finance Department has an overall 31.38 percent participation rate in contracting opportunities for minority and female-owned businesses. Based on the availability of funding for contracting opportunities, the Office of the Director of Finance has a fiscal year 2017 participation goal of 35 percent.

Included in this testimony is information regarding historical M/W/DBE participation, as well as participation rate information on the largest fiscal year 2016 contracts in the Department's budget, whether those contracts were awarded through a RFP, and if the service providers are local businesses and in compliance with the living wage requirements.

M/W/DSBE Participation on Large Contracts FY16 Contracts										
Vendor	Service Provided	Amount of Contract	RFP Issue Date	Contract Start Date	Ranges in RFP	% of M/W/DSBE Participation Achieved	\$ Value of M/W/DSBE Participation	Total % and \$ Value Participation - All DSBEs	Local Business	Living Wage Compliant?
Comp Services Inc.	Medical health care & claims and litigation management services	\$6,150,000	1/27/14	7/1/14	MBE: 15-17% WBE: 10-12% DSBE: Best efforts	23% 0% 0%	\$1,414,500 \$0 \$0	23% \$1,414,500	Yes	Yes
XEROX State & Local Solutions	Administer & collect code violation & alarm fees.	\$1,412,500	12/15/12	1/1/14	MBE: 20-25% WBE: 20-25% DSBE: Best efforts	20% 0% 0%	\$282,500 \$0 \$0	20% \$282,500	Yes	Yes
CGI Technologies	Budget Formulation System	\$888,036	2/21/13	3/17/14	MBE and/or WBE: 15-20% DSBE: Best efforts	0% 0%	\$0 \$0	0% \$0	No	Yes
Lawton Associates	Insurance and Risk Management Services	\$850,000	3/7/14	7/1/14	MBE and/or WBE: 25-30% DSBE: Best efforts	100% 0%	\$850,000 \$0	100% \$850,000	Yes	Yes
Various	Legal services related to City's Employee Disability/Worker's	\$4,000,000	3/20/13	7/6/13	MBE and/or WBE: 15-20% DSBE: Best efforts	38% 0%	\$1,500,000 \$0	38% \$1,500,000	Yes	Yes (8 of 8 firms)

# OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE – EMPLOYEE DATA

Staff Demographics (as of January 2016)

Full-Time Staff				Executive Staff				New Hires - FY2016			
		Male		Female		Male		Female		Male	
		African-American	Hispanic	White	Other	African-American	Hispanic	White	Other	African-American	Hispanic
Total		19	5	30	1	3	1	12	0	2	0
% of Total		13.5%	3.5%	21.3%	0.7%	10.0%	3.3%	40.0%	0%	20.0%	0%
Average Salary		\$63,645	\$45,042	\$76,294	\$43,690	\$111,474	\$74,520	\$112,669	\$38,667	\$44,290	\$61,314
Median Salary		\$59,171	\$43,569	\$67,495	\$47,110	\$103,360	\$74,795	\$95,000	\$38,667	\$37,842	\$61,314
		Total		Total		Total		Total		Total	
% of Total		14.9%	3.5%	21.3%	0.7%	23.3%	3.3%	40.0%	0%	10.0%	0%
Average Salary		\$82,892	\$76,294	\$76,294	\$76,294	\$107,577	\$112,669	\$112,669	\$90,168	\$90,168	\$64,170
Median Salary		\$78,000	\$67,495	\$67,495	\$67,495	\$103,988	\$110,500	\$110,500	\$90,168	\$90,168	\$64,170
		Total		Total		Total		Total		Total	
% of Total		1.4%	3.5%	21.3%	0.7%	0%	3.3%	40.0%	0%	10.0%	0%
Average Salary		\$32,797	\$45,042	\$76,294	\$43,690	N/A	\$74,520	\$112,669	N/A	N/A	N/A
Median Salary		\$32,797	\$45,088	\$67,495	\$47,110	N/A	\$74,520	\$110,500	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Total		Total		Total		Total		Total	
% of Total		3.5%	4.3%	6.4%	7.1%	0%	6.7%	10.0%	0%	20.0%	20.0%
Average Salary		\$48,781	\$64,529	\$76,294	\$76,294	N/A	\$105,037	\$105,037	\$38,667	\$38,667	\$61,314
Median Salary		\$43,942	\$52,951	\$67,495	\$47,110	N/A	\$105,037	\$105,037	\$38,667	\$38,667	\$61,314
		Total		Total		Total		Total		Total	
% of Total		0.7%	0.7%	0.7%	0.7%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%
Average Salary		\$45,094	\$43,690	\$43,690	\$43,690	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Median Salary		\$45,094	\$43,690	\$43,690	\$43,690	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
		Total		Total		Total		Total		Total	
% of Total		6.4%	7.1%	7.1%	7.1%	3.3%	10.0%	10.0%	3.3%	20.0%	10.0%
Average Salary		\$49,676	\$77,915	\$77,915	\$77,915	\$78,000	\$94,865	\$94,865	\$38,677	\$38,677	\$95,000
Median Salary		\$43,942	\$47,110	\$47,110	\$47,110	\$78,000	\$95,000	\$95,000	\$38,677	\$38,677	\$95,000
		Total		Total		Total		Total		Total	
% of Total		34.0%	66.0%	66.0%	66.0%	33.3%	66.7%	66.7%	50.0%	50.0%	50.0%
Average Salary		\$68,816	\$58,431	\$58,431	\$58,431	\$108,746	\$100,956	\$100,956	\$51,220	\$51,220	\$52,496
Median Salary		\$60,952	\$45,088	\$45,088	\$45,088	\$103,674	\$101,179	\$101,179	\$43,942	\$43,942	\$42,272

OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF FINANCE  
APPENDIX (Other Relevant Data and Charts)

Number of Bilingual Employees (as of January 2016)

	Spanish	Greek	Tagalog	Arabic	Mandarin	Hindi	Gujarati	Cantonese	Punjabi	Akan	Pampango	Urdu
Risk Management	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Bureau of Administrative Adjudication	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Accounting Bureau	1	0	2	1	1	4	3	1	1	1	1	1
Office of Administrative Review	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Budget Bureau	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Mayor's Office of Grants	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total - All Divisions	7	1	2	2	2	4	3	1	1	1	1	1
Total - # of Bilingual Employees		19										
Total - # of Languages Spoken		12										

**OFFICE OF THE CITY TREASURER  
FISCAL YEAR 2017 BUDGET TESTIMONY  
APRIL 6, 2016**

---

**INTRODUCTION**

Good morning, President Clarke and Members of City Council. I am Rasheia Johnson, City Treasurer. Joining me today are Christian Dunbar, Deputy City Treasurer-Debt Management, Christopher Schwartz, Deputy City-Treasurer Banking and Investments and Matthew Mazza, Executive Director of the Sinking Fund Commission. I am pleased to provide testimony on The City Treasurer's Office for Fiscal Year 2017 operating budget.

**DEPARTMENT MISSION:**

The Office of the City Treasurer (CTO) manages new and outstanding City debt in accordance with the City's Debt Management Policies, maximizes the value received from new financings and minimizes interest and transaction costs. CTO also works to maintain and improve the City's credit ratings. CTO manages the custodial banking of all City funds by encouraging standards and practices consistent with safeguarding City funds, aims to maximize the amount of cash available for investment, and invests those funds that are in excess of the amount needed to meet daily cash requirements. CTO serves as the disbursing agent for checks and electronic payments from the City.

**CITY TREASURER OFFICE  
BUDGET SUMMARY AND OTHER BUDGET DRIVERS**

**Staff Demographics Summary (as of January 2016)**

	<b>Total</b>	<b>Minority</b>	<b>White</b>	<b>Female</b>
Full-Time Staff	16	9	7	6
Executive Staff	4	2	2	1
Average Salary - Full-Time Staff	\$61,605.00	\$63,658.00	\$83,526.00	\$56,822.00
Average Salary - Executive Staff	\$105,375.00	\$114,000.00	\$96,750.00	\$133,000.00
Median Salary - Full-Time Staff	\$51,915.00	\$48,830	\$90,000.00	\$42,389.00
Median Salary - Executive Staff	\$99,250.00	\$114,000	\$84,635.00	\$133,000.00

**Employment Levels (as of January 2016)**

	<b>Budgeted</b>	<b>Approved</b>	<b>Filled</b>
Full-Time Positions	16	16	16
Part-Time Positions	0	0	0
Executive Positions	4	4	4
Overall Average Salary	61,605	\$61,605	61,605
Overall Median Salary	51,915	\$51,915	51,915

**Financial Summary by Class - General Fund**

	<b>Fiscal 2015 Actual Obligations</b>	<b>Fiscal 2016 Original Appropriations</b>	<b>Fiscal 2016 Estimated Obligations</b>	<b>Fiscal 2017 Proposed Appropriations</b>	<b>Difference FY17-FY16</b>
Class 100 - Employee Compensation	\$802,019	\$985,689	\$985,689	\$1,040,058	\$54,369
Class 200 - Purchase of Services	\$101,477	\$118,444	\$118,444	\$118,444	\$0
Class 300 - Materials and Supplies	\$17,127	\$21,224	\$21,224	\$21,224	\$0
Class 400 - Equipment	\$4,253	\$1000	\$1000	\$1000	\$0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$924,876</b>	<b>\$1,126,357</b>	<b>\$1,126,357</b>	<b>\$1,180,726</b>	<b>\$54,369</b>

**(2017 M/W/DBE Participation Goal 30%)**

	<b>FY11</b>	<b>FY12</b>	<b>FY13</b>	<b>FY14</b>	<b>FY15</b>	<b>FY16*</b>
Total amount of contracts	\$848,085	\$2,488,601	\$1,841,517	\$2,292,640	\$2,584,452	\$2,937,537
Total amount to M/W/DBE	\$205,773	\$696,030	\$598,456	\$513,886	\$627,050	\$691,406
Participation Rate	24%	28%	32%	22%	24%	24%

\*as of March 2016



## DEPARTMENT PLANS & INITIATIVES FOR 2017:

**Debt Management:** Maximize the value received from new financings while reducing the City's debt service payments. CTO plans to issue debt through 3 to 4 transactions in FY17, including refundings to reduce debt service. While the level of savings will depend on market conditions, it is likely that refundings during FY17 will save substantial amounts for the General Fund, Water Department, and PGW.

### FY 2016 & 2017 Proposed Debt Transactions:

June 2016 – PGW Refunding

July 2016 – Water Department Refunding

August 2016 – General Fund-Tax and Revenue Anticipation Note (TRAN)

August 2016 – General Fund-General Obligation Refunding

FY 2017 – Rebuilding Community Infrastructure

FY 2017 – Energy Authority

**Vendor Selection Process:** The existing pools of underwriters for the City and its Enterprise Funds will expire in June, and CTO will issue an RFQ for the selection of new pools in the coming weeks. Other expiring vendor arrangements include those with the City's General Obligation financial advisors, PGW and PWD bond counsel. CTO, along with other City Departments, will create a selection committee to evaluate and select a new pool for financial advisors and bond counsel.

**Rating Agency Relations:** The CTO manages the City's relationship with rating agencies, leveraging the City's improving economic and fiscal outlook, and working to optimize investor relations. Currently, the City is rated in the "A" category by all three rating agencies (Moody's "A2"; Standard & Poor's "A+"; Fitch "A-").

**Investor Relations Conference:** CTO plans to host the City's second Investor Conference in the fall of 2016 to better inform bankers and investors about the City and its goals and projects. Based on prior experience, we believe improved relationships and understanding can result in lower interest costs for the City's bonds. The rate the City pays on General Obligation (GO) bonds has been steadily reduced by approximately 94 basis points over the past few years, reducing the premium the City pays over the "AAA" Municipal Market Data (MMD) rate. Most recently, a City transaction priced 81 basis points over the "AAA" MMD, marking the best pricing the City has achieved in the many years.

**Municipal Continuing Disclosure Cooperation ("MCDC"):** In 2010 the Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC) approved amendments to Rule 15c2-12 under the Securities and Exchange Act of 1934. In general, the Rule includes provisions regarding what an underwriter must do in connection with a primary offering of municipal securities and what provision must be included in an issuer's continuing disclosure agreement. Over the past 6 years, CTO, the Sinking Fund Commission, the City's underwriters, many City departments and a number of internal and external legal counsels have determined that the City had no material non-disclosures in the reporting of a reportable event. The City continues to be in compliance in all material respects with its continuing disclosure obligations related to its outstanding debt. In FY15, CTO overhauled the City's financial disclosure process to ensure the City's continued compliance with increasingly stringent regulation. CTO plans to continue the regular review, update and implementation of the new policies and procedures to ensure the City's continued compliance with all SEC and IRS regulations.

**Payroll Card Program Expansion:** In early FY16 the CTO, in collaboration with the Office of Human Resources and OIT, rolled out the first phase of the City's Debit Card Payroll Program. The first phase of the program was introduced to all the City's non-represented and exempt employees who were receiving bi-weekly payroll via a paper check. Overall the first phase of the program has been successful, with no major issues or negative feedback from employees enrolled in the program. In FY17, the City intends to begin offering the Pay card program as an option to all other employee classes outside of the City's non-represented and exempt employees as an alternative to paper based checks.

**Treasury Management System (TMS):** The CTO would like to implement a Treasury Management System (TMS), which is being considered as part of the City's prioritization process for smaller IT projects. In the short term a TMS would provide the CTO with the ability to automate and add more control around key cash management processes that are highly manual and spreadsheet dependent. Another key benefit of the TMS would be a centralized, secured and standardized system for administering approximately 300 bank and investment accounts that the City holds. This would ensure that authorized users of accounts are routinely updated and monitored, and would also allow the CTO to provide a more in depth review of commercial banking fees, ensuring that the City is being provided services at beneficial prices and also allowing a timely audit of fees actually charged versus negotiated fees.

**CITY TREASURER OFFICE  
PROPOSED BUDGET OVERVIEW**

---

PROPOSED FUNDING REQUEST

The proposed Fiscal Year 2017 general fund budget totals \$1,180,726 an increase of \$54,369 over Fiscal Year 2016 estimated obligation levels. This increase is primarily due to a request for an additional accountant.

The proposed budget includes:

- \$1,040,058 in Class 100, represents a \$54,369 increase over FY16. The additional funding will cover the \$11,369 increase in wages from the DC 47 raises beginning in July 2016, and \$43,000 will fund an additional accountant for the CTO accounting team.
- \$118,444 in Class 200, no change over FY16.
- \$21,224 in Class 300, no change over FY16.
- \$1,000 in Class 400, no change over FY16.

STAFFING LEVELS

- The following is a summary of the CTO's staffing levels as of March 2016:
  - Budgeted: 16
  - Approved: 16
  - Filled: 16
- FY16 Staffing Changes from July 2015 through March 2016:
  - New Hires: 4 (2 African American Females)  
(2 African American Males)
- See appendix for Bilingual Employees Chart



**CITY TREASURER OFFICE  
PERFORMANCE, CHALLENGES AND INITIATIVES**

---

DEPARTMENT PERFORMANCE (OPERATIONS)

- Monitor City debt portfolio to maximize debt service savings through refunding transactions.
- Expand investor outreach to increase demand for City bonds and lower borrowing costs.
- Continue to maintain or improve credit quality to optimize the City's spread to AAA MMD.
- Continue to reduce the number of paper checks printed and distributed for Payroll and General Disbursement payments.
- Meet or exceed the investment returns of established investment portfolio benchmarks.

**CITY TREASURER OFFICE  
OTHER BUDGETARY IMPACTS**

---

FEDERAL AND STATE (WHERE APPLICABLE)

Not applicable.

CITY TREASURER OFFICE – CONTRACTING EXPERIENCE

Vendor	Service Provided	Amount of Contract	RFP Issue Date	Contract Start Date	Ranges in RFP	% of M/W/DSBE Participation Achieved	\$ Value of M/W/DSBE Participation	Total % and \$ Value Participation - All DSBEs	Local Business	Living Wage Compliant ?
Econsult Solutions INC	Lending Report - Authorized City Depositories	\$46,340	9/3/14	12/15/14	MBE: 20-25% WBE: 20-25% DSBE: 0%	50% 0% 0%	\$23,170 \$0 \$0	50% \$23,170	Yes	Yes
PFM Asset Management	Arbitrage Rebate Services	\$24,000	8/29/11	7/1/12	MBE: 10-15% WBE: 10-15% DSBE: 0%	0% 0% 0%	\$0 \$0 \$0	0% \$0	Yes	Yes
Swap Financial Group	Swap Advisor	\$15,000	7/2/12	1/1/13	MBE: 0% WBE: 0% DSBE: 0%	0% 0% 0%	\$0 \$0 \$0	0% \$0	Yes	Yes
SS&C Technologies Inc	Debt Management Software	\$9,415	7/2/12	12/1/12	MBE: 10-15% WBE: 10-15% DSBE: 0%	0% 0% 0%	\$0 \$0 \$0	0% \$0	Yes	Yes
Digital Assurance Certification	Dissemination Agent	\$3,500	9/3/2014	1/1/2015	MBE: 0% WBE: 0% DSBE: 0%	0% 100% 0%	\$0 \$3,500 \$0	100% \$3,500	Yes	Yes

CITY TREASURER OFFICE – EMPLOYEE DATA

**Staff Demographics (as of January 2016)**

<i>Full-Time Staff</i>				<i>Executive Staff</i>			
<b>Male</b>		<b>Female</b>		<b>Male</b>		<b>Female</b>	
	African-American		African-American		African-American		African-American
<i>Total</i>	3		3	<i>Total</i>	1		1
<i>% of Total</i>	18.8%		18.8%	<i>% of Total</i>	25.0%		25.0%
<i>Average Salary</i>	\$67,166		\$72,478	<i>Average Salary</i>	\$95,000		\$133,000
<i>Median Salary</i>	\$65,000		\$47,000	<i>Median Salary</i>	\$95,000		\$133,000
	White		White		White		White
<i>Total</i>	4		3	<i>Total</i>	2		0
<i>% of Total</i>	25.0%		18.8%	<i>% of Total</i>	50.0%		0.0%
<i>Average Salary</i>	\$90,657		\$39,202	<i>Average Salary</i>	\$96,750		N/A
<i>Median Salary</i>	\$90,020.00		\$48,260	<i>Median Salary</i>	\$96,750		N/A
	Hispanic		Hispanic		Hispanic		Hispanic
<i>Total</i>	1		0	<i>Total</i>	0		0
<i>% of Total</i>	6.3%		0%	<i>% of Total</i>	0%		%
<i>Average Salary</i>	\$55,000		N/A	<i>Average Salary</i>	N/A		N/A
<i>Median Salary</i>	\$55,000		N/A	<i>Median Salary</i>	N/A		N/A
	Asian		Asian		Asian		Asian
<i>Total</i>	2		0	<i>Total</i>	0		0
<i>% of Total</i>	12.5%		0%	<i>% of Total</i>	0%		0%
<i>Average Salary</i>	\$40,050		N/A	<i>Average Salary</i>	N/A		N/A
<i>Median Salary</i>	\$49,354		N/A	<i>Median Salary</i>	N/A		N/A
	Other		Other		Other		Other
<i>Total</i>	0		0	<i>Total</i>	0		0
<i>% of Total</i>	0%		0%	<i>% of Total</i>	0%		0%
<i>Average Salary</i>	N/A		N/A	<i>Average Salary</i>	N/A		N/A
<i>Median Salary</i>	N/A		N/A	<i>Median Salary</i>	N/A		N/A
	Bi-lingual		Bi-lingual		Bi-lingual		Bi-lingual
<i>Total</i>	4		0	<i>Total</i>	0		0
<i>% of Total</i>	25.0%		0%	<i>% of Total</i>	0%		0%
<i>Average Salary</i>	\$60,525		N/A	<i>Average Salary</i>	N/A		N/A
<i>Median Salary</i>	\$ 51,915		N/A	<i>Median Salary</i>	N/A		N/A
	Male		Female		Male		Female
<i>Total</i>	10		6	<i>Total</i>	3		1
<i>% of Total</i>	62.5%		37.5%	<i>% of Total</i>	75.0%		25.0%
<i>Average Salary</i>	\$70,946		\$56,822	<i>Average Salary</i>	\$ 96,167		\$133,000
<i>Median Salary</i>	\$72,044		\$42,389	<i>Median Salary</i>	\$95,000		\$133,000

**CITY TREASURER OFFICE**  
**APPENDIX (Other Relevant Data and Charts)**

**Number of Bilingual Employees (as of March 2016)**

	Spanish	Hindi	Gujarati	Urdu	French
Debt Management	1	0	0	0	1
Banking and Investment	0	1	1	1	0
Administration	0	1	1	0	0
Total - All Divisions	1	2	2	1	1
Total - # of Bilingual Employees		4			
Total - # of Languages Spoken		5			



Sinking Fund Commission  
FISCAL YEAR 2017 BUDGET TESTIMONY  
4/6/2016

---

INTRODUCTION

Good morning, President Clarke and Members of City Council. I am Matthew Mazza, Executive Director of the Sinking Fund. I am pleased to provide testimony on Sinking Fund's Fiscal Year 2017 operating budget.

DEPARTMENT MISSION/PLANS

**Mission:** To efficiently pay appropriate debt service and bills for the City of Philadelphia Treasurer's Department and to lower the fees in relation to investment management on the PGW Pension Plan.

**Plans for Fiscal Year 2017:** To effectively pay debt service and related costs for the City of Philadelphia. To pay pensioner benefits for the PGW Pension plan on time and to help lower investment management fees for the plan.

**Sinking Fund Commission**  
**BUDGET SUMMARY AND OTHER BUDGET DRIVERS**

Financial Summary by Class  
(Sinking Fund currently has no contracts outstanding)

	Fiscal 2015 Actual Obligations	Fiscal 2016 Original Appropriations	Fiscal 2016 Estimated Obligations	Fiscal 2017 Proposed Appropriations	Difference FY17 - FY16
<b>Class 100</b> Employee Compensation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
<b>Class 200</b> Purchase of Services	\$112,420,541	\$110,546,913	\$110,546,913	\$129,639,615	\$19,092,702
<b>Class 300</b> Materials and Supplies	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
<b>Class 400</b> Equipment	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
<b>Class 500</b> Contributions	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
<b>Class 700</b> Debt Service	\$460,815,872	\$492,042,677	\$492,042,677	\$500,948,129	\$8,905,452
<b>Class 800</b> Payment to Other Funds	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
<b>Class 900</b> Advances/Misc. Payments	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
<b>TOTAL</b>	\$573,236,413	\$602,589,590	\$602,589,590	\$630,587,744	\$27,998,154

## Sinking Fund Commission PROPOSED BUDGET OVERVIEW

### PROPOSED FUNDING REQUEST

#### **HIGHLIGHTS**

The Commission oversees the timely repayment of bond principal and interest (P&I) on City-related debt, service agreements and lease obligations. The City currently has \$7.7 billion of debt outstanding inclusive of the General Fund, Aviation, Water, PGW, PICA, and TRAN; the City's G.O. bond ratings are A2/A+/A-, the most recent upgrade in December of 2013.

The highlights of the debt service budget are as follows:

- The total budget is \$630.58 million which is an increase of \$27.99 million or 4.64% over the estimated obligations for Fiscal Year 2016.
- The Fiscal Year 2017 budget for each of the funds and the change from last year are as follows:

	Budget (In millions)	Increase (In millions)
General	\$277.58	\$ 31.6 + 12.85%
Water	207.37	(19.7) -8.7%
Aviation	139.62	14.1 +11.4%
Car Rental Tax	6.00	-- -- %
Total	\$ 630.58	\$27.9 +4.64%

The highlights for each fund are discussed below.

#### **GENERAL FUND**

The General Fund portion of this request totals for FY17 is \$277 million, comprised of two classes: Class 200 for city service agreement obligation and lease payments and Class 700 for debt service.

The Class 200 request of \$123.6 million reflects a \$19 million increase from FY16 estimates due mainly to the anticipated new PMA debt issue for the public safety building, as well as \$5.5 million for two of the Mayor's strategic initiatives (\$3.75 million for Rebuilding Community Infrastructure and \$1.75 million for the Energy Authority)

The Class 700 request of \$153.95 million is mainly for debt service on the City's general obligations. This is \$17.46 million more than FY16 estimates due mainly to an increase in estimates for interest on new issues as well as increases in interest on variable rate debt.

#### **WATER FUND**

The Commission's request for the Water Fund for FY17 totals \$207.37 million, all in Class 700, for payment of debt service on Water and Wastewater bonds. This represents a \$20.8 million decrease over FY16 due mainly to there being no interest on new issues in FY17.

#### **AVIATION FUND**

The Commission's request for the Aviation Fund for FY17 is \$139.62 million, all Class 700. This amount is an increase of \$14.1 million over FY16. This increase is due to interest on new revenue bonds for \$17.5 million.



**CAR RENTAL TAX FUND**

The Commission's request of \$6 million in the Car Rental Tax fund is to provide for lease revenue bond payments on the sports stadiums from vehicle rental tax revenues.

This concludes the written portion of my testimony. I would be glad to answer any questions the Council may have relative to this budget either now or at Council's convenience.

**OFFICE OF PROPERTY ASSESSMENT  
FISCAL YEAR 2017 BUDGET TESTIMONY  
April 6, 2016**

---

INTRODUCTION

Good morning, President Clarke and Members of City Council. I am Michael Piper, Chief Assessment Officer. Joining me today are 9 members of my senior management team. They are Deputy Chief Assessment Officer James Aros, Jr.; Deputy Administrators Jaye Divine, Herman Siewert, Joseph Solomon, and Sharon Swann; Administrative Services Director Delicsha Wilds; Administrator of Mass Appraisal Analysis Kevin Keene; IT Director Tom Dougherty; and Senior Attorney Drew Aldinger. I am pleased to provide testimony on the Office of Property Assessment's Fiscal Year 2017 operating budget.

DEPARTMENT MISSION/PLANS

The OPA is primarily responsible for discovering, listing, and valuing all real property in the City of Philadelphia, in a fair and equitable manner.

Additionally, the OPA is charged with establishing legal addresses for all parcels, providing a response to real property tax appeal cases, applying real property tax exemptions, and administering the Real Property Tax Abatement Program.

There are currently approximately 579,000 parcels of real property in the city of Philadelphia. These include residential, condominium, multi-family, large apartment complexes, retail, hospitality, office, industrial, warehouse, hospital, government (city, state, and federal), religious, exempt, and non-exempt property uses, and vacant land.

As a short-term goal, OPA will continue to respond to any outstanding First Level Reviews and Board of Revision of Taxes appeals for tax year 2015 and 2016 that have been filed.

Office of Property Assessment  
BUDGET SUMMARY AND OTHER BUDGET DRIVERS

Staff Demographics Summary (as of January 2016)

	Total	Minority	White	Female
Full-Time Staff	178	83	95	108
Executive Staff	9	5	4	3
Average Salary - FTE	\$51,121	\$48,373	\$54,725	\$51,179
Average Salary - ES	\$105,706	\$106,316	\$104,945	\$86,649
Median Salary - FTE	\$50,051	\$46,715	\$53,382	\$50,051
Median Salary - ES	\$94,418	\$94,418	\$100,182	\$93,484

Employment Levels (as of January 2016)

	Budgeted	Approved	Filled
Full-Time Positions	207	207	178
Part-Time Positions	0	0	0
Executive Positions	10	10	9
Overall Average Salary	\$50,516	\$50,516	\$51,668
Overall Median Salary	\$50,051	\$50,051	\$50,051

Financial Summary by Class - General Fund

	Fiscal 2015 Actual Obligations	Fiscal 2016 Original Appropriations	Fiscal 2016 Estimated Obligations	Fiscal 2017 Proposed Appropriations	Difference FY17-FY16
Class 100 - Employee Compensation	\$10,683,762	\$10,424,420	\$10,424,420	\$10,434,139	\$9,719
Class 200 - Purchase of Services	\$1,526,249	\$2,078,126	\$2,078,126	\$1,578,126	(\$500,000)
Class 300 - Materials and Supplies	\$178,925	\$716,600	\$716,600	\$716,600	\$0
Class 400 - Equipment	\$181,339	\$66,000	\$66,000	\$66,000	\$0
Class 500 - Contributions	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Class 700 - Debt Service	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Class 800 - Payment to Other Funds	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Class 900 - Advances/Misc. Payments	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$12,570,275</b>	<b>\$13,285,146</b>	<b>\$13,285,146</b>	<b>\$12,794,865</b>	<b>(\$490,281)</b>

Contracts Summary (as of December 2015)

	FY11	FY12	FY13	FY14	FY15	FY16*
Total amount of contracts	\$89,400	\$349,240	\$2,978,796	\$784,577	\$914,690	\$545,378
Total amount to M/W/DBE	\$20,000	\$77,000	\$2,220,000	\$122,100	\$520,000	\$248,378
Participation Rate	22%	22%	75%	16%	57%	46%

OPA's FY17 contract participation goal for M/W/DBE is 35% .

**Office of Property Assessment  
PROPOSED BUDGET OVERVIEW**

---

**PLANS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2017**

OPA will continue to pursue its goal of regular reassessments, focusing on areas or property types where standard assessment performance measures for accuracy and/or uniformity are in need of some improvement. As the local market for commercial real estate has improved substantially over the past 4 years, the OPA has recognized the need for an overall reassessment focused on commercial and industrial properties so that assessments reflect what hotels, office buildings, apartment buildings, retail shopping centers, warehouses and other commercial parcels are selling for in the open market.

During the coming fiscal year, OPA will pursue an intense data gathering effort with regard to all commercial property within Philadelphia. This effort will focus on updating OPA's records to include current data relating to local commercial sales, income and expense data, vacancy rates, and appropriate income capitalization rates. Additionally, the OPA will, at the recommendation of City Council and the AVI Monitoring Group, seek to contract with M.A.I. professionals experienced in the local commercial real-estate market to assist in this data gathering effort. Our goal is to carefully examine the accuracy of each assessment for Tax Year 2018, recertifying the existing values where appropriate, but implementing revisions where necessary.

Additionally, OPA has gone forward with the process of acquiring a CAMA system. Together with the Office of Property Data and the Office of Innovation and Technology, OPA has made substantial progress toward securing a contract with a CAMA vendor by mid-2016.

**PROPOSED FUNDING REQUEST**

The proposed Fiscal Year 2017 general fund budget totals \$12,794,865, a decrease of \$490,281 from the Fiscal Year 2016 estimated obligation levels. This decrease is primarily due to a decrease in professional appraisal services.

The proposed budget includes:

- \$10,434,139 in Class 100, a \$9,719 increase over FY16. This funding will support the full staffing target of 210 employees for the Office of Property Assessment.
- \$1,578,126 in Class 200, a \$500,000 decrease over FY16. This funding will provide the necessary resources to purchase services and maintain the required professional licenses of the staff.
- \$716,600 in Class 300, level funding compared to FY16. This funding will primarily cover the expenditures associated with printing and mailing.
- \$66,000 in Class 400, level funding compared to FY16. This funding will cover the cost of equipment and furniture that may require maintenance or replacement.
- OPA does not have expenditures in Class 500 and Class 600.

**Office of Property Assessment  
PROPOSED BUDGET OVERVIEW**

---

**STAFFING LEVELS**

- Current Staffing Level – 187
  - Chief Assessment Officer -1
  - Senior Staff – 8
  - HR and Administrative Support - 7
  - Real Property Evaluation Staff –123
  - Real Property Evaluation Support – 48
- Proposed Staffing Level – 210
  - Chief Assessment Officer -1
  - Senior Staff – 10
  - HR and Administrative Support - 7
  - Real Property Evaluation Staff – 142
  - Real Property Evaluation Support – 50
- New Hires – (January 2015 – Present)
  - Caucasian – 1
  - African American – 4
  - Hispanic - 0
  - Asian – 2
  - Other – 1

(All New Hires were additions to the Real Property Evaluation Staff)
- See appendix for Bilingual Employees Chart

Office of Property Assessment  
PERFORMANCE, CHALLENGES AND INITIATIVES

DEPARTMENT PERFORMANCE (OPERATIONS)

**Department Performance (Operations)**

FY 2016 included the second phase of the Actual Value Initiative ("AVI"), during which the OPA completed the first complete, citywide reassessment. The initiative, which began in 2010 and continued through 2015 resulted in the first major reassessment of all 579,000 parcels in the City of Philadelphia in several decades, and will play a substantial role in removing the inequities in property assessment in the city. The initial year of AVI saw a substantial improvement in the Price Related Differential (PRD - which is used to measure uniformity between lower and higher valued properties). In mass appraisal, the PRD is a statistic for measuring the extent to which high value properties are assessed relative to low value properties. A result closer to, or slightly above 1 is considered desirable. That measurement, for which the goal is .980 - 1.037, improved from a pre-AVI level of .970 to 1.037 in 2014. Last year (tax year 2016) saw a relatively inconsequential change to 1.42 for single family residential.

Additionally, the citywide Coefficient of Dispersion (COD), which measures uniformity between different property groups (and for which the goal is less than .150) also improved from a pre-AVI level of .275 to .139 for 2014, an improvement of 49.5%. The COD is the most commonly used measure of overall uniformity in assessment ratio studies. Technically, it measures the extent to which the relationship between the assessment and sale price (the assessment ratio) deviate from the median. In general, a decrease in the deviation is considered an improvement in the COD. That measure improved slightly in tax year 2015, to .137.

**Department Challenges**

After completing the initial phase of AVI, the OPA is still dealing with the after effects of the record number of market value appeals filed for tax year 2014.

The first year of AVI resulted in over 50,000 informal appeals or FLRs (First Level Reviews), a process that allows taxpayers to contest an assessment due to valuation-based assertions related to an incorrect amount or level of assessment, or missing exemption. While the new informal appeal process was a success in that it facilitated greater access to taxpayer remedy, a record number of formal market value appeals were still filed with the Board of Revision of Taxes. OPA evaluators have been responsible for answering over 25,000 BRT appeals filed for Tax Year 2014 alone, and are still, for some commercial properties, addressing these appeals.

Among OPA's most daunting challenge continues to be its lack of a modern, robust, industry-accepted Computer Assisted Mass Appraisal (CAMA) system. Ongoing comprehensive, citywide reassessments will require a CAMA system that will allow and support sophisticated mass appraisal methodology and statistical analysis as well as detailed property characteristic maintenance, and facilitate a much more efficient assessment recertification process, resulting in the timely reissuing of property tax bills.



## **ACCOMPLISHMENTS & INITIATIVES**

In conjunction with the Actual Value Initiative implementation that began in 2014, the City of Philadelphia continues to offer relief programs that mitigate the effects of long-overdue assessment revisions that, in many instances, result in the potential for increased tax liabilities for Philadelphia homeowners. The Homestead Exemption was created to help mitigate taxpayer concerns over potential increases in annual property taxes by offering owner-occupiers an exemption of up to \$30,000. During the past year, the OPA has transitioned the responsibilities related to the application process of the Homestead Exemption to the Department of Revenue.

Additionally, the OPA continues to work with the Department of Revenue to implement the Longtime Owner Occupants Program (LOOP), which provides 10 years of tax discounts to certain longtime homeowners whose taxable property assessments more than tripled in 2014. However, the OPA's role is fairly limited in the LOOP process: OPA provides Revenue with the initial assessment data for any property that experienced a tripling between tax years and then verifies a property's abatement history, if any. The Department of Revenue manages the overall program, including outreach, application processing, approval or denial, etc.

The OPA's website—[www.phila.gov/OPA](http://www.phila.gov/OPA)—continues to offer property owners information regarding their property valuation data, in addition to the Homestead Exemption. The available information includes applications, assistance regarding denials and reapplication, and answers to frequently asked questions. For those without Internet access or more specific questions, the Homestead Hotline—215-686-9200—continues to operate Monday through Friday, 8:30am – 6pm. Non-English speaking property owners can conduct their call in any language.

## **Current Initiatives**

In order to continue to have assessments closely reflect actual market values, OPA is committed to regular, ongoing reassessments. For tax year 2016, OPA looked to further improve its goal of lower Coefficients of Dispersion city wide for residential parcels, but with a focus on those neighborhoods where our measurements of dispersion were higher than the city wide average.

This year, OPA is seeking to improve the level of accuracy and uniformity of the assessment of the land component of the City of Philadelphia's over 470,000 residential parcels, and on the 40,000 non-commercial/industrial vacant land parcels. OPA's modeling unit, with the assistance of experts from the City's Land Bank as well as a nationally respected modeling consultant have, at the neighborhood level, closely examined the relationship of the land component of each parcel to existing market values with regard to the land's contributory value. Where appropriate, OPA has adjusted the land to improvement ratio in a manner that is more reflective of what the market indicates it should be, and in some cases revised the overall market value of the parcel itself.

Approximately 475,000 Change of Assessment notices will be mailed within the next week to taxpayers who may see a change in the overall assessed value or (for partially abated properties) a change in the taxable assessed value, or (in most instances) simply a change in the land-to-improvement allocation that results in no change in the taxable assessment. OPA will continue to allow property owners seeking to challenge a reassessment to file an informal appeal, or First Level Review directly with the Office of Property Assessment within 30 days of the Change of Assessment notice date.

Office of Property Assessment  
OTHER BUDGETARY IMPACTS

FEDERAL AND STATE (WHERE APPLICABLE)

N/A

Office of Property Assessment – CONTRACTING EXPERIENCE

M/W/DSBE Participation on Large Contracts  
FY16 Contracts

Vendor	Service Provided	Amount of Contract	RFP Issue Date	Contract Start Date	Ranges in RFP	% of M/W/DSBE Participation Achieved	\$ Value of M/W/DSBE Participation	Total % and \$ Value Participation - All DSBes	Local Business	Living Wage Compliant?
Linebarger	FLR/Abatement Application Processing	\$228,378	6/4/12	7/1/15	MBE: 15-20%	0%	\$0	100% \$228,378	Y	Y
					WBE: 10-15%	100%	\$228,378			
					DSBE:	0%	\$0			
Vanguard Direct	Customer Service & Application Processing	\$190,000	6/4/12	9/1/15	MBE: 15-20%	15%	\$28,500	25% \$47,500	Y	Y
					WBE: 10-15%	10%	\$19,000			
					DSBE:	0%	\$0			



# Office of Property Assessment – EMPLOYEE DATA

## Staff Demographics (as of January 2016)

Full-Time Staff				Executive Staff			
		Male	Female			Male	Female
		African-American	African-American			African-American	African-American
Total		22	48	Total		2	3
% of Total		12.4%	27.0%	% of Total		22.2%	33.3%
Average Salary		\$51,910	\$47,363	Average Salary		\$135,816	\$86,649
Median Salary		\$50,051	\$46,715	Median Salary		\$135,816	\$93,484
		White	White			White	White
Total		43	52	Total		4	0
% of Total		24.2%	29.2%	% of Total		44.4%	0%
Average Salary		\$58,453	\$51,715	Average Salary		\$104,945	N/A
Median Salary		\$53,382	\$49,105	Median Salary		\$100,182	N/A
		Hispanic	Hispanic			Hispanic	Hispanic
Total		1	5	Total		0	0
% of Total		0.6%	2.8%	% of Total		0%	0%
Average Salary		\$50,051	\$55,106	Average Salary		N/A	N/A
Median Salary		\$50,051	\$50,361	Median Salary		N/A	N/A
		Asian	Asian			Asian	Asian
Total		4	3	Total		0	0
% of Total		2.2%	1.7%	% of Total		0%	0%
Average Salary		\$52,249	\$52,264	Average Salary		N/A	N/A
Median Salary		\$46,715	\$52,264	Median Salary		N/A	N/A
		Other	Other			Other	Other
Total		0	0	Total		0	0
% of Total		0%	0%	% of Total		0%	0%
Average Salary		N/A	N/A	Average Salary		N/A	N/A
Median Salary		N/A	N/A	Median Salary		N/A	N/A
		Bi-lingual	Bi-lingual			Bi-lingual	Bi-lingual
Total		5	8	Total		0	0
% of Total		2.8%	4.5%	% of Total		0%	0%
Average Salary		\$50,741	\$49,999	Average Salary		N/A	N/A
Median Salary		\$50,051	\$52,177	Median Salary		N/A	N/A
		Male	Female			Male	Female
Total		70	108	Total		6	3
% of Total		39.3%	60.7%	% of Total		66.7%	33.3%
Average Salary		\$53,696	\$51,179	Average Salary		\$115,235	\$86,649
Median Salary		\$50,051	\$50,051	Median Salary		\$112,485	\$93,484

Office of Property Assessment  
APPENDIX (Other Relevant Data and Charts)

Number of Bilingual Employees (as of January 2016)

	Spanish	French	Lithuanian	Russian	Malayalam	Hindi	Creole	Mongolian	Bengali
01-Management and Support	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
02-Real Property	2	1	1	1	3	2	0	1	0
03-Assessment Support Staff	1	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
Total - All Divisions	3	2	1	1	3	3	1	1	1
Total - # of Bilingual Employees		13							
Total - # of Languages Spoken		9							