



Budget Office

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

June 2, 2022

The Honorable Darrell Clarke
City Council President
City Hall, Room 490
Philadelphia, PA 19107

Dear Council President Clarke,

This letter is in response to questions raised by Councilmembers during the FY23 Council Budget Hearings scheduled for the Streets Department. At the hearing, the following questions were asked:

- **Councilmember Gauthier: How much would it cost for Streets to have a policy that brought more traffic calming to our neighborhoods? How much are we allocating for traffic Calming resources; specifically, staff and equipment amounts going to this effort in the FY23 budget?**

The Department monitors expenditures for staff activities and all public works contracts that include traffic calming scope. In response to this request, we have provided a summary of budgeted spending for this effort in both our operating and capital budgets. Please see Appendix A titled “Vision Zero-Total Operating & Capital Spend-FY23”. The attachment shows that we have budgeted approximately \$11 million in operating and \$17 million in Capital program amounts respectively for FY23.

- **Councilmember Gauthier: What is the process to collect illegally dumped tires and the cost?**

Streets Crew Chiefs are responsible for reviewing and evaluating work performed by collection crews along their respective assigned routes. This includes spot-checking locations on collection day for rubbish and/or recycling collection compliance as well as any tire piles that may be accumulating along any of the routes. Any illegally dumped tires found are subsequently evaluated based on whether or not they are located on private property. Tires that are not located on private property are collected by Streets’ illegal dumping collections crew. The Department contacts CLIP and L&I for tires located on private property for processing and abatement. The cost to dispose tires is \$95/ton and the Department budgets approximately \$180,000 per year for contract disposal of tires.

- **Councilmember Bass: What is the fiscal cost to the City for delayed trash pickup?**

The minimum approximate daily overtime cost per one crew for delayed collections is \$537. Juxtaposing this over an entire year, the cost for delaying one crew each workday is, at minimum, about \$140,000 per year. With over 200 collections crews working daily, for every 10% delay in overall collections in the city during a full year, the cost is about \$2.8 million. It is important to point out however, the advent of the second collections crew will significantly mitigate, and potentially eliminate overtime costs because of delayed collections.



Budget Office

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

- **Councilmember Bass: What would be the cost of adding a second trash pick-up day per week?**

In August of 2002, a study was conducted to calculate the cost and efficacy of a second-day collections operation, which, at that time, had been in existence in certain areas of North Philadelphia for many years. The study concluded that households in the twice-a-week collection areas of North Philadelphia set out about the same amount of rubbish per week as the rest of the city, and that it contributed to more litter problems in those areas compared the rest of the city because of more opportunities for loose trash dispersing on streets and sidewalks. The Department thereafter eliminated second-day collections and, accordingly, recommends against reestablishing it in the future.

However, if we were to add a second collection day to areas where it would be the most effective, the additional labor cost would be approximately \$4.8 million. Juxtaposing this to a city-wide second collections day operations would result in approximately \$30 million in implementation and operating costs.

- **Councilmember Oh: Major projects for restructuring roads - how much money is spent for this.**

Below is a list of major street reconstruction projects let by the Streets Department in the past five years.

American Street TIGER 7:	MPMS# 70243 Bid# 3835ECMS	Let: 9/14/17	Low Bid: \$26,397,414.31
Lincoln Drive Rehabilitation:	MPMS# 57901 Bid# 3831ECMS	Let: 9/15/17	Low Bid: \$12,124,124.00
2017 Historic Streets Restoration - Phillip St:	Bid# 3847	Let: 6/19/18	Low Bid: \$558,578.00
Thomas Paine Historic Recon:	MPMS# 110781 Bid# 3881ECMS	Let: 10/22/20	Low Bid: \$783,783.00

It is important to note that road reconstruction consists of replacing the entire base layer of the roadway, adding a top layer of asphalt, installing linestriping and the construction of ADA ramps at crosswalks. Cost per square yard is \$240 per square yard for reconstruction. Regular paving, by contrast, consists of removing the top few inches of existing asphalt and coating with a new layer of asphalt. Line-striping and ADA ramps at crosswalks are also included. Cost per square yard for paving is only \$45 square yard.

- **Councilmember Jones: How much would it cost to put a pole in an alley where a pole does not exist?**

Below is a table of the costs to install new alley lighting. Price is based on a contractor to install (4) new alley lights on the same alley or alley on adjacent blocks, including concrete pole restoration, UF cable and material for the PECO electric tap. Also assumes the City to purchase materials under City supplies contracts, including pole, bracket arm, luminaire, and photo control. Two types of alley installations are estimated: one for drivable alleys and one for the narrow walk-thru alleys. For the narrow walk-thru alleys this cost assumes no trash or debris removal is needed to access the alley.



Budget Office

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

The total cost for an alley with truck access is \$17,684 and for a narrow walk-thru alley is \$26,020. Cost breakdown shown in table below. Please be aware that these costs do not include various on-going maintenance support or energy costs.

Cost Estimate to install 4 new alley lights			
	Alleys with Truck Access:		Narrow Walk Thru Alleys (no vehicle access):
Contractor Installation Cost			
Remove & replace concrete around new pole install. Install new pole, arm and luminaire.	\$2050 x 4 poles=\$8200		\$2965 x 4 poles=\$11,860
Install aerial 12-2 UF cable with bucket truck (to next pole or to PECO service location)	\$10 x 500 LF alley=\$5000	\$15,460	\$18 x 500 LF alley=\$9000
Perform PECO taps with bucket truck or ladder (cost is for complete connection of 12-2 UF to PECO)	\$565 x 4 poles=\$2260 (bucket truck)		\$565 x 4 poles=\$2260 (on ladder)
Streets Material Cost			
Material Purchases: Direct Bury 17' pole - \$266 LED Luminaire - \$118 Arm Bracket - \$60 Photocell- \$11.75 Incidental hardware - \$100.00	\$556 x 4 poles=\$2224	\$2224	\$735 x 4 poles=\$2940
Total Cost per Alley (4 new alley lights):		\$17,684	\$26,020

- **Councilmember Jones: How much would it cost to repave a driveway?**

There is no database of common driveways in Philadelphia, but it is estimated that there are approximately 1,000 blocks in the City that contain them. Condition assessments do not exist, but a substantial number are at or near the end of their expected 75-year life cycle.

Costs range from \$70,000 to provide an asphalt overlay to \$150,000 to remove and replace existing concrete driveways. A typical access driveway is about 16 feet wide by 500 feet long or 900 square yards.

- **Councilmember Gilmore-Richardson: Workplace heat Standards - how is Streets looking at this standard around heat exposure for workers; how are you evaluating these new policies: and working with DC33.**

Each year, before extreme weather seasons, the Department takes proactive steps to inform employees of best practices and health and safety techniques to protect against the effects of extreme heat or extreme cold. During high-temperature seasons, Streets also ensures industrial ice machines are in operation at each Sanitation yard and that crew chiefs are equipped with water coolers with which they offer water to employees during the workday. Managers and supervisors are responsible for assessing the condition of employees and to remove them from assignments if they exhibit heat-stress symptoms. The Department will further evaluate whether any overall heat precaution improvements should be implemented for employees and will collaborate with the union on this assessment.

- **Councilmember Gilmore-Richardson: 1. What is Streets doing to decrease contamination in the recycling stream and improve resident education on what is recyclable and how to properly recycle? What additional resources are needed to grow the Recycling Office to meet these goals?**



Budget Office

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

2. The Waste Management contract should be coming up for a yearly renewal after the initial 4 years of the contract. How is the Streets Department measuring success or challenges of that contract and how are they transparently making decisions for renewal?
 - a. We know there are a lot of environmental justice concerns regarding this contract, especially considering the use of the Covanta incinerator in Chester. Can you please explain how you plan to address these concerns directly in the next contract process?
3. Last fall, Delaware County put out an RFP to hire a zero-waste consultant to conduct the next revision of its state-mandated waste-management plan. The RFP included the following: be a guide to the county's transition to sustainable methods of materials management using Zero Waste practices and following the Zero Waste Hierarchy; review the effectiveness of county's recycling programs, and examine market development for recyclables and the feasibility of collecting organics and compostable materials for inclusion in our recycling program; focus on resource conservation and protecting the public health, safety, and welfare for both the short and long-term, especially in relation to transportation, processing, treatment, storage, and disposal of municipal waste; evaluate how Zero Waste solutions can help meet other county goals for cost savings and other efficiencies across programs; include resident engagement.
 - a. Has the Streets Department considered engaging in this type of zero waste master planning with a zero waste consultant? If not, why?
 - b. In 2018, the Streets Department completed an organics diversion feasibility study.
 - i. Were the results of the study ever finalized and published? If so, please provide a direct link to where they are publicly available.
 - ii. What is the next step for addressing organics diversion?
 - iii. How much do you estimate it would cost to bring back a municipal composting program?

Response:

1. The Streets Department is currently engaged in a bin to bin, door to door campaign in areas of low diversion to educate residents on how/why to recycle and encourage residents to recycle. In addition to ongoing social media posts, video is available on Streets channels and Link Kiosks, inside and in visitor areas of the Philadelphia Prison system, and Streets has arranged with the Courts to share recycling education with awaiting jurors. Streets Teams and our Recycling Director continue to attend multiple community events along with our mascot where appropriate, to encourage residents of all ages to recycle and engage residents on questions. Targeted email and social media campaigns begin late Spring/early Summer and continue through the year. New avenues for advertising including billboards and cable TV are under investigation.

Currently, the Recycling Office is rebuilding staff, adding a City Planner and Clerk soon. Short-term, an additional 1-2 City Planners would create a more robust and efficient office considering the recent events including the pandemic, construction boom, and other demands on recycling.
2. Successes are measured in operational efficiency, introduction of new and more sustainable technologies, and cost of services. Streets involves waste management professionals along with OEO, Commerce, and others in the evaluation process.
 - a. Waste disposed with Covanta is processed at the Chester and Plymouth Meeting facilities. While negotiating the current contract, Streets reached out to the City of Chester to understand their position and the Mayor of Chester shared a letter of support for the Covanta plant, passed on to City Council. We understand the environmental



Budget Office

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

justice concerns and are in touch with Covanta management should emissions levels exceed EPA standards.

3.
 - a. The Streets Department has consistently and increasingly endeavored to operate with environmental sustainability and the EPA's Waste Hierarchy at the forefront. Since 2019, Streets has put 34 Compressed Natural Gas (CNG) Compactor Trucks into service, replacing 'retired' bio-diesel engine trucks. Route maps are laid out using GPS technology based on fuel efficiency, which impacts emissions. Installations of electric charging stations at all Sanitation Depots has expanded access for refueling a growing fleet of electric vehicles, and Streets continues to test large alternative fuel vehicles for service, exploring different fuel types and truck configurations to build our fleet of hybrid/electric/alternative fuel vehicles. Collaborating with the Office of Sustainability, we continue to update the Philadelphia-based Recycling & Donation Resources Finder with sustainable disposal options and are utilizing the PA Resources Council Circular Merchant tool for larger for recycling opportunities that can be used for regional/statewide materials. We also continue to research new technologies to perform Streets Operations with greater efficiency and less of a carbon footprint. In addition, The Department has been working closely with the Office of Sustainability to develop strategies for achieving zero waste and has a consultant that initially conducted an operations optimization study which is nearly complete. This consultant has also completed a zero waste benchmarking assessment and is identifying approaches that have worked in other cities and could be implemented in Philadelphia. Since the Commercial sector generates well over half the waste generated, our consultant is conducting an analysis to help identify zero waste strategies for this portion of the waste stream. Plus, our consultant is also conducting a comprehensive waste composition analysis of City collected waste and recycling to more effectively target City collected materials for recycling.
 - b.
 - i. This information has not been but will be posted to the website and is attached with this response.
 - ii. Streets has proposed organics diversion via extraction of organics from the MSW stream, which would divert organics without significant additions to fleet, emissions, staffing, and our overall carbon footprint. The process involves utilizing wastewater treatment equipment, in our case via PWD, to blend the organic into the digester system, resulting in methane gas and enriched fertilizer for sales. Streets continues to research the prospect with PWD.
 - iii. The cost estimate is \$35 million in Capital Program costs and \$14.3 million in operating costs.



Budget Office

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

- **Councilmember Squilla: Sidewalk Coordinator - is this something you are looking at?**

The Department has not contemplated appointing a Sidewalk Coordinator to assess liabilities and responsibilities arising from sidewalk complaints. We continue to handle sidewalk issues on a case-by-case basis.

OTIS commissioned a study to explore options for the implementation of a complete sidewalk replacement program for Philadelphia property owners. This study was completed by Toole Design Group in June 2018 and estimated a phased in program. The exorbitant cost estimated, and the legal liabilities proposed to transfer from property owners to City by this study prohibited the Department from moving further on implementation.

The Department has provided a copy of the study for your review. Please see the “TCDI Sidewalk Study” [here](#).

Please contact my office for further information.

Thank you,

Carlton Williams
Commissioner
Streets Department

Appendix A

FY23 VISION ZERO-RELATED BUDGET

Below represents the approximate budgeted FY23 operating and Capital Program funds dedicated by Streets for Vision Zero-related initiatives.

Streets has budgeted approximately **\$11 million in operating funds and \$17 million in Capital Program funding towards Vision Zero-related initiatives for FY23**. The operating budget fund amounts are inclusive of \$7.1 million from projects budgeted and funded through Act 89 Title Registration Fee revenues, approximately \$1.7 million in dedicated operating funds towards Streets' Traffic Engineering/Construction staff, and approximately \$2.2 million in dedicated operating funds towards Streets' Vision Zero crew staffing, materials and equipment, all totaling a combined \$11 million. The Capital Budget Program's Vision Zero line item includes \$1 million of programmed City obligations, as well as \$8 million of leveraged matching federal and state grants at a 20% (City)/80% (state-federal) rate, for a total Capital Program budget amount of \$9 million. It also includes the more recent state funded Capital Program line items for City Automated Speed Enforcement (CASE) and Automated Red Light Enforcement (ARLE) at \$5 million and \$3 million respectively. Total overall FY23 budgeted/programmed funds, including operating and Capital Program funds is \$28 million.

Calculation of Operating Funds:

Act 89 Title Registration Fee	\$7.1 million
Traffic Engineering Staff	\$1.7 million
Vision Zero Crew Staff, Materials & Equipment	\$2.2 million (All \$2.2M of this is funded via SGT funds)
TOTAL	\$11 million

Calculation of Capital Program Funds:

FY23 City Vision Zero Capital Funds	\$1 million
FY23 Potential Fed/State Matching Funds	\$8 million
FY23 CASE State Funds	\$5 million
FY23 ARLE State Funds	\$3 million
TOTAL	\$17 million

Disclaimer:

One other important factor to point out. While the information described above focuses on Streets' funds primarily dedicated to Vision Zero initiatives, other operating and Capital Program funds go towards initiatives and projects related to and/or ancillary to Vision Zero. Many of our bridge projects for example encompass Vision Zero elements, and our resurfacing program will benefit overall roadway safety. For this reason, the amounts above represent a conservative estimate and are not inclusive of these related initiatives.



Budget Office

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

June 2, 2022

The Honorable Darrell Clarke
City Council President
City Hall, Room 490
Philadelphia, PA 19107

Dear Council President Clarke,

This letter is in response to questions raised by Councilmembers during the FY23 Council Budget Hearings scheduled for the Philadelphia Fire Department. At the hearing, the following questions were asked:

- **CM Gilmore-Richardson: Do you know how many applicants have used the Randolph School three-point preference for the firefighter testing process?**

According to our partners in the Office of Human Resources, one applicant successfully received three points on the last firefighter test conducted in CY2021 (for the current list). There are other conditions or applicant characteristics that would give an applicant three additional points. For more information, we invite City Council to share those specific inquiries with the Office of Human Resources, because the Philadelphia Fire Department does not have access to that information.

- **CM Bass: Can you provide a breakdown by district of smoke alarms that need to be installed?**

As mentioned during the testimony, this list fluctuates daily as 311 receives requests and as our members install smoke alarms. Members install alarms when possible, meaning in between responding to a daily average of 1,000 fire and EMS incidents as well as other critical daily operational tasks. Further, we do not track smoke alarm requests by Council district but attempt to track by zip code. Of note, callers requesting smoke alarms through 311 do not have to provide a zip code; instead, when readily available, the PFD has added information on zip codes to have more complete data. A list of CY2022 requests and installations by zip code as of June 1, 2022, is provided on the next page.

With respect to the number of requests, it is difficult to eliminate duplicates. Different callers from the same address may provide slightly different information rendering it difficult to identify two or more requests as duplicates until confirmed by a company completing the installation. With respect to smoke alarms installed, note that the numbers below represent unique residences; however, each residence may receive one to four smoke alarms depending on the size and configuration of the residence.



Budget Office

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Smoke Alarm Requests and Installations, CY2022 only

Zip Code	Requests	Installations
19101	0	0
19102	0	0
19103	1	5
19104	65	30
19105	0	0
19106	7	3
19107	2	10
19108	0	0
19109	0	0
19111	148	57
19114	56	25
19115	58	11
19116	26	28
19118	0	3
19119	139	12
19120	339	69
19121	126	43
19122	46	26
19123	28	12
19124	268	136
19125	63	23
19126	90	32
19127	2	5
19128	53	22
19129	41	20
19130	25	20

Zip Code	Requests	Installations
19131	268	55
19132	363	71
19133	151	31
19134	261	121
19135	150	29
19136	88	26
19137	41	7
19138	289	58
19139	311	58
19140	436	91
19141	233	38
19142	205	9
19143	486	96
19144	199	64
19145	155	72
19146	86	73
19147	57	42
19148	112	62
19149	186	76
19150	258	15
19151	213	54
19152	71	17
19153	40	24
19154	52	46
Unassigned zip code		1500
Total	6294	3327



Budget Office

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

- **CM Domb: Can you send the breakdown of response by incident type from 2018-2022?**

The following is a summary breakdown of incidents by incident type from 2018-2022 for fire suppression and first responder companies.¹ Codes are the summary code systems used for the National Fire Incident Reporting System.

Code	Incident Type	2018	2019	2020 ²	2021 ³	2018-2021
100	Fires	7,877	7,333	7,642	7,450	30,302
200	Overpressure, Rupture, Explosion, Overheat	149	119	129	95	492
300	Emergency Medical Service (EMS) and Rescue	65,454	57,752	28,903	41,976	194,085
400	Hazardous Materials	5,839	5,192	5,188	4,834	21,053
500	Service Call ⁴	5,621	4,506	4,057	4,371	18,555
600	Good Intent Call ⁵	15,050	14,869	11,246	14,152	55,317
700	False/Unwanted Alarm and False Call	21,692	21,593	20,861	21,809	85,955
800	Severe Weather and Natural Disaster	27	54	59	29	169
900	Special Incident Type ⁶	89	11	7	94	201
Total		121,798	111,429	78,092	94,810	406,129

Code	Incident Type	2022 ⁷
100	Fires	2,351
200	Overpressure, Rupture, Explosion, Overheat	35
300	Emergency Medical Service (EMS) and Rescue	11,643
400	Hazardous Materials	1,631
500	Service Call	1,339
600	Good Intent Call	4,596
700	False/Unwanted Alarm and False Call	7,447
800	Severe Weather and Natural Disaster	
900	Special Incident Type	22
Total		29,064

¹ First responder companies exclude EMS units.

² CY2020 affected by nine months of COVID-19 pandemic.

³ CY2021 affected by twelve months of COVID-19 pandemic.

⁴ Service calls include but are not limited to calls involving persons in distress, water-related problems, requests to assist other government agencies, and animal problems.

⁵ Good intent calls include but are not limited to dispatched units that are recalled prior to arrival, incorrect addresses, no apparent incident, authorized controlled burning, steam or vapors mistaken for smoke.

⁶ Special incident type includes but is not limited to incidents that do not fall into preceding categories and training exercises.

⁷ Year to date (as of 5/25/22) reporting. Only based on incidents that as of 5/25/22 had an identified incident type.



Budget Office

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Below are the total number of incidents as well as number of responses (runs). Note that runs are higher than the number of incidents since some fire and/or EMS incidents require the response of 2-12 individual PFD units.

Number of Incidents	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022 YTD	Total
Total	327,914	320,429	307,949	323,183	122,369	1,401,844

Number of Runs ⁸	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022 YTD	Total
Total	548,714	524,607	463,852	507,549	194,412	2,239,134

Please contact my office for further information.

In service,

Adam K. Thiel
Fire Commissioner
Philadelphia Fire Department

⁸ Preliminary information that the PFD was able to collate in the time frame given.

Appendix A

Installs by Zip Code

2022 Year to Date as of May 4th, 2022

	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
Totals	516	6130	5269	2057	772	1566
19101	0	0	0	0	0	0
19102	0	0	2	0	0	1
19103	4	3	6	0	0	4
19104	9	203	124	40	38	63
19105	0	0	0	0	0	0
19106	1	1	5	0	0	6
19107	9	27	23	3	0	10
19108	0	0	0	0	0	0
19109	0	0	0	0	0	0
19111	15	252	174	80	15	72
19114	2	132	148	39	3	27
19115	4	160	103	46	6	16
19116	0	104	106	23	10	19
19118	0	53	12	7	1	1
19119	10	127	108	13	4	10
19120	50	165	185	74	31	40
19121	10	132	176	56	31	70
19122	5	40	29	28	5	12
19123	3	40	13	9	1	20
19124	21	184	222	140	20	66
19125	1	34	49	23	3	7
19126	13	175	42	25	6	31
19127	1	14	7	1	4	1
19128	15	180	215	36	13	13
19129	0	33	29	6	1	19
19130	5	19	27	6	16	9
19131	12	162	193	148	48	63
19132	22	211	170	70	19	97
19133	4	155	105	42	10	19
19134	17	182	133	79	24	39
19135	11	131	136	59	1	30
19136	26	159	191	83	6	29
19137	2	82	49	6	4	9
19138	28	263	164	46	13	42
19139	7	292	178	84	92	87
19140	8	319	206	70	53	58

19141	17	170	105	38	13	22
19142	6	132	161	54	9	19
19143	66	277	319	134	96	98
19144	8	127	157	56	20	46
19145	26	210	86	54	28	63
19146	13	203	75	29	14	41
19147	3	72	112	29	9	39
19148	24	222	270	59	51	59
19149	4	144	124	62	5	45
19150	8	100	127	31	8	8
19151	12	129	130	77	27	49
19152	5	108	74	42	3	19
19153	2	62	75	28	9	17
19154	7	140	124	22	2	51